Journal of Transdisciplinary Studies

Epiphany

EPIPHANY: JOURNAL OF TRANSDISCIPLINARY STUDIES

TABLE OF CONTENTS

A QUALITATIVE STUDY REVEALING THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN CULTURAL INDICATORS AND ATTITUDES TOWARD THE ADS

Emine Sahin[*]

Abstract

The companies, in International markets, are required to examine the attitudes and the behaviours to recognize the consumer to be able to make their products preferable under constantly growing competitive conditions. Therefore, it is of great importance to know cultural values of the customers in the country's where global brands compete and to shape ads which is one of the marketing communication tools in this direction. In this respect, knowing the cultural similarities or differences of the countries where the ads are used (such as that country's religion, language, norms and cultural values) gains importance. The consumer attitudes towards the ads change in accordance with their cultural similarities or dissimilarities and this attitude change determines the tendency of shopping. According to Geert Hofstede, social anthropologist who analyzes the cultural levels and the relationships among them the basic elements of the culture consists of symbols, heroes, rituals and values underlying them. Thorough symbols, a number of cultural values are conveyed to ads. The problem of this study which was carried out in order to determine attitude change towards the ads including cultural differences is "Is there a difference in the attitudes towards the ads including different cultural symbols? How it is distributed according to gender differences?" In this study, a qualitative research method was applied and interviewed with 20 test subject. 20 students studying in one of the universities in Turkey were selected with formal sampling, they were asked questions, and it was tried to determine the difference between the ad of Doğuş Çay-a tea brand which uses the symbols and local accent of Black sea region in Turkey in its ads- and the ad of Lipton which is an international British tea brand. At the end of the study, it was found out that sample's the attitude was positive towards ad of Doğuş Çay, not Lipton.

Keywords: Attitudes; Cultural Values; Hofstede; Different Cultural Symbols

[*] Corresponding author: Emine Sahin, Research assistant at the Gumushane University and PhD Candidate, Turkey; e-mail: esahin@gumushane.edu.tr

INTRODUCTION

Foreign companies started to emerge in Turkey as well with disappearance of national boundaries after worldwide developments in marketing in 1980s. Companies have to know consumers and analyse their attitudes and behaviours to come to a place in which they can be known and preferred in international markets. In this respect, knowing cultural values of consumers in the target country's market and using advertisements gain importance. Cultural differences and factors such as religion, language and cultural values of the countries in which advertisements are published become important. On the other hand, Turkish companies entered into competition with foreign companies and started similar works to protect their place both in Turkish market and in the world market. Advertisement messages used to increase brand awareness must be parallel with values of the target country. Advertisement strategies are defined accordingly. Basic method to put forward Turkish identity is created by benefiting factors reflecting Turkish culture. In this respect, values which are belong to Turkish culture, language, life style, traditions and religious practices gain importance.

Factors which shouldn't be forgotten in international companies such as country's economic situation, target audiences' demographic and socio-cultural situation influence advertisers. Also, messages should be arranged according to these factors. Perhaps, the most important variable among these is culture. While culture, which have been defined countless, is defined by Turkish communicator Mutlu as "everything reflecting to codes, dressing styles, lifestyle and beliefs of a society (Mutlu, 2008:194), it is defined as purification of

civilization and mind by Hofstede and he points out that this purification can be realized by literature, art and education (Hofstede, 1997:5).

Cultural differences are important factors for global advertisement's messages to be understood. Commercial films in Turkey give partially foreign and Turkish brands' demonstrations. In this respect, advertisements gain importance in cultural harmony because giving messages in advertisement based on a language and communication tools (Schütteve Ciarlante, 1998). The closer the language and the fictional scenes used in advertisement to the society, the more people understand it. Speaking the same language with the target audience, benefiting from the same sensibility and components such as names, images, behaviour patterns influence attitudes both for advertisements and companies.

Studies done on culture makes several definitions to reveal diversity of culture based on the fact that culture differs in each country. While Edward Hall defines cultural diversity according to "Information Systems Model", Hofstede explains it according to "Cultural Dimensions Model" and Kuluckhohn and Strodbeck explains it according to "Value Tendency Model" (Kartari, 2001). When Hosftede expresses cultural diversity, he claims that culture is not only different in economical and judiciary terms but also in management system. He divides countries into two groups according to their similarities and differences and he separates these two groups by criteria that he defines as cultural dimensions.

Literature Review

Advertisement, which is a marketing tool for companies in global market, is entitled as glocal advertisement and global advertisement (Elden, Erişimtarihi: 10.08.2012). While glocal advertisements have the same messages for all the countries that the advertisement is published, global advertisements have messages including cultural differences. Also, there are national advertisements including cultural values of local company's target audiences.

When glocal or international advertisements ignore country's cultural values, they get reaction from society and in the upcoming days it can even be removed because of the fact that it does not comply with publication principles. For example, in several Arabic countries using holy symbols such as cross, Mecca and using alcohol and naked women pictures unless it is obvious that she is western is forbidden. In a recognized tea company advertisement, the actor was using his left hand and Saudi Arabian people had negative attitude for the brand because of this (Dereli, 2002:95-96). Çaykur commercial film in which, Müslüm Gürses played sparked a debate. In the days when he was struggling for life after his by-pass, this commercial film was being published frequently. This situation got a big reaction in social media (http://www.haber7.com/televizyon/haber/999572-muslum-gursesin-reklami-yayindan-kaldirildi). After claims that the company takes advantage of his fans, the commercial film is removed.

Culture defining brands' advertisement and message strategies is the most extensive subject of social sciences and a fact that is defined and explained countless. Every researcher studying in an area

of culture explains it based either on ethnic or humane or social classes (Lull, 2001:97).

Culture is transferring symbols, behavioural patterns, social lows, moral principles and religious views belong to the society to future generations by individuals. Society's values explain experiences in addition to learned behaviours (Giddens, 2010:30).

Anthropologist Malinowski makes a definition of culture which is in the anthropology's area of investigation in this way; Culture is a basic complement which is composed of usage and consumption items, groups' rights and duties, people's thoughts, abilities, beliefs and habits (Malinowski,cited byYaylagülveKorkmaz, 2008:188). Individuals' thoughts and beliefs lead their habits and these habits become their lifestyles. In culture's definition which Hofstede summarizes as "unwritten rules of a social play" individual's complying with general structure of his society (Giddens, 2010:35). Unwritten norms are valid for general individuals and force them to obey these rules. These rules can vary not only among societies but also within these societies. Therefore, Culture is a total of symbols and behavioural patterns of society's laws, moral principles, traditions and religious beliefs. It consists of concrete and moral components. Accordingly, concrete components include art, theatre, literature, music, language, dressing, architecture, food, history, climate, and geography. Moral components include ideas, behaviours, ideals, norms, values, beliefs and habits (Ügeöz, 2003:21)

While Giddens states that people attribute a meaning to objects, relations and ideas by means of symbols (Giddens, 2010:34), Hofstede likens culture to an onion and classify cultural elements as:

symbols, heroes/leaders, rituals and values (Ügeöz, 2003:21; Soydaş, 2010:56). He based this classification on his definition. The elements that he defines as culture components come from the culture's meaning "Unwritten rules of the play". He supports that culture come in existence in four ways as symbols, heroes, rituals and values in "Cultural Onion". Each layer affects the other and demonstrates itself as a symbol in the final stage. According to Hofstede what differentiates people from other people and other societies is how they interpret and code these cultural values (Soydaş, 2010:56).

There are numerous studies about culture in multi-cultural countries such as United States of America and Canada. Graham (2005) made a research by e-mail questionnaire to find out effects of advertisements using English as a first language and Spanish as a second language on acculturation in the States which has a lot of immigrants from Mexico. It is found out that Americans of Spanish origin have positive attitude towards the advertisements in Spanish and they prefer Spanish in the advertisements. Caillat and Mullar (1996) made a research on American and British accents and found out that direct statements are more effective in commercial films using American accent and indirect statements are more effective in the ones using British accent. Moreover, Cheng and Scweitzen (1996) made a research on commercial films published in primetime in China which is not an American and a Western country and found out that while symbolic values are given more importance in the country, daily life values are given more importance in the States. Also, Han and Shavitt (1994) put forward that American and Korean advertisements have differences. Hofstede reveals that American

advertisements include individualism and Korean ones includecollectivism. According to him while American society is individualistic, Korean society is a collective society.

Garcia (2004) in his study revealing culture's effects in fashion advertisement on Mexican immigrant students living in the States and American students found out that nation is not the only variable in cultural differences. In addition, it is revealed that while students of both nations like advertisements including reasonable sexuality, they do not like the ones including high level of sexuality.

Cultural differences play an important role in international marketing as well as in international advertisements. Therefore, there is obvious link between culture and language. Understanding culture without understanding the language spoken is impossible but language is not the only determiner. Individual manners among the values are determiners of brand choosing.

One of the values determining consumers' behaviours is attitude, but of course it is not the only one. Attitude is a tendency to react either in a negative or in a positive way to objects, beliefs and environment that people have (OdabaşıveBarış, 2010:157). There are numerous attitude studies in the field of social sciences but attitude first enter this field as an analysis tool by Thomas and Florian Znanienki's (1927) studies. They define attitude as an "individual consciousness process" (Mutlu, 2008:285).

Attitudes are determiners of behaviours. Therefore, attitude researches gain importance in the fields of communication, marketing, sociology and psychology. There are a lot of attitude

analyses of advertisements in literature. Because attitude alteration realized by persuasion come forward as behaviour alteration.

The most cited study in this field is Bauer and Greyer's study. These researchers contribute to the field by the first study revealing people's attitudes for advertisements and they used in-depth interview method (İspir and Suher, 2009:7). The study reveals that there are many positive attitudes to advertisements but there is also respondents' doubt in advertisements' persuasiveness. Also, Alwitt's and Praphaker's study (1992) and Andrew's study (1989) put forward that persuasiveness of advertisement messages is low (Shavittve ark.1998:8).

Lutz (1985) supports that there are five processors and there are advertisement persuasiveness, advertisement perception, attitude for advertisers, general attitude for advertising and mood (Durvasulaakt, Onay, 2013:55). However, it is seen that culture is ignored in these processors. In attitude studies, La Tour and Henthorne's study (1994) is an outstanding one as well. In China, Tai (1999) made an attitude research for sexual appeals and he found out that negative attitude was developed for the advertisements and brands using high level of sex appeal. It is observed that there is a positive attitude towards the advertisement having medium level of sex appeal.

In Turkey, Ödül (2008) made a research to analyses attitudes for Turkish and foreign advertisements. He applied a questionnaire to Turkish students. MA students say that foreign advertisements do not convince them to buy their products and they do not lean to standards

in advertisements. Moreover, they say that they frequently encounter the concept of family unity in Turkish advertisements. They think that foreign ones do not appeal to every education level in Turkey. Undergraduate students find foreign advertisements more creative. In Şener's research (2007) related to the advertisements about sexual appeals, he made high and medium levels of attitude analyses related to the advertisements of two national brands on students. The result is that the attitude towards the brand that uses high level of sexual appeal is positive; while, the attitude is negative towards the same brand. Women's negative attitude turned out to be low level.

Bergman (2006) and Dursun (1997) deal with demographic elements in their studies done in two different countries. In his study, Bergman finds out that gender is not important in consumption behavior. Old consumers look for information about production in advertisements, and also individuals having low education level give importance to information in advertisements. In Dursun's research, it is revealed that women have more positive attitude in terms of advertisement's economical effect and men have powerful positive attitude in terms of advertisement's social effect (Onay, 2013:56-57). As it can be seen both culture and attitude studies vary. Especially, international and global companies inevitably have to take these analyses into account to remain in the market. Professor Gray and Dr. Run made a research in 2005 to benefit from it in multiculturalism and multi-ethnicity studies. They found out that Iban, Chinese and Malay societies have differences in their attitudes towards advertisements (Grey ve Run, 2005:14-18).

Problem

Are there any differences in attitudes towards advertisements including different cultural symbols? What is the contribution of gender to attitudes?

Purpose

The purpose of study is to prove that cultural values, which constitute the last layer, are represented differently by symbols as Hofstede says and explain differences in attitudes towards two different commercial films –one of them is an advertisement of Doğuş Çay which is produced in the Eastern Black Sea Region and the other is an advertisement of international brand Doğuş Çay - .

Limitations

In addition to limitations stemming from qualitative study, this study is restricted to 20 students studying in the Department of Communication in University of Gumushane. 10 of them were born and lived in the area in which local values are symbolized and national tea company make production. Other 10 of them were born and raised in different parts of the country. 14 of the students are males and 6 of them are females. Other variables restricted the study are statements expressing cultural differences in the commercial films and gender.

Research Method

Method gains importance after literature review of the study and conception explanations is done. In-depth interview method was used in the study. Formal sample was chosen. 20 students who are

nearly in the same ages were interviewed. Thus, age and profession factors are ignored and only the places they had lived before they came to the university became important. Interviews are carried out one-to-one in different rooms far away from the images which can affect their concentration.

Each interview was recorded and the participants were given this information beforehand. They were also told that this is voluntary and all the information was going to be secret. Therefore, false names were used instead of their real names and findings were represented in Table-1.

Table 1-Participants' features

Participants	Nickname	Gender	Dateofbirth	Vocation	Residence	income
1.	Tuncay	Male	1991	Student	Trabzon	800 tl
2.	Abdullah	Male	1991	Student	Trabzon	350 tl
3.	Esra	Female	1991	Student	Artvin	500 tl
4.	Erdal	Male	1991	Student	Trabzon	500 tl
5.	Gülcan	Female	1989	Student	Trabzon	300 tl
6.	Sümeyye	Female	1992	Student	Trabzon	350 tl
7.	Murat	Male	1992	Student	Trabzon	500 tl
8.	Emre	Male	1990	Student	Trabzon	300 tl
9.	Elif	Female	1988	Student	Trabzon	500 tl
10.	Ayça	Female	1992	Student	Rize	300 tl
11.	Gözde	Female	1990	Student	Tokat	280 tl
12.	Halit	Male	1992	Student	Erzurum	400 tl
13.	Can	Male	1990	Student	Adana	350 tl
14.	Orhan	Male	1990	Student	Uşak	-
15.	Özkan	Male	1991	Student	Tokat	400 tl
16.	Ali	Male	1991	Student	Çorum	600 tl
17.	Yavuz	Male	1992	Student	İstanbul	400 tl
18.	Ahmet	Male	1992	Student	Tokat	300 tl
19.	Ercan	Male	1988	Student	Iğdır	800 tl
20.	Mahmut	Male	1993	Student	Gümüşhane	220 tl

Before interview, two advertisements were analyzed according to Hofstede's "Cultural Onion". Advertisements analysis as follows:

Doğuş Çay: (Figure 1) In the advertisement of national brand Doğuş Çay, which is produced in the Eastern Black Sea Region, "yazma" a kind of scarf is used. However, "yazma" which belongs to the Black Sea Region, is a scarf that women use traditionally rather than religiously. Also, actress in the commercial film is wearing a "peştemal". This is a cloth that is used only in the Black Sea Region. "Peştemal" is not worn in daily life; it is worn in weddings in rural parts of the region. On the other hand, the film is recorded in a tea garden. The actress is speaking in a Black Sea accent. She is using local statements like "daldurma, yerinkulavardur, ha buçay".

Lipton Çay: (Figure 2) Lipton took its place in Turkish market in 1986 with its factory in Pazar, in Rize after tea sector's being privatized. Contrary to DoğuşÇay's commercial films, a woman blonde with short hair and having European appearance (probably, her role is a business woman) plays in Lipton's commercial films. Even though, it is emphasized that the production place of tea is the Black Sea Region, the place where the film is recorded is a kitchen having the most developed kitchen tools. Moreover, voice-over is speaking in İstanbul accent.

As it can be seen, both films have differences in performers, accent and the place that they are recorded. Both of the brands are produced in the Eastern Black Sea Region and have the same taste but they are presented in different ways.

Findings

While attitudes of the participants towards the advertisements were expected "positive, negative and indecisive", their attitudes were only positive or negative. Positive attitude means "approving the commercial film, enjoying it and finding no missing", negative attitude means "not approving it, not enjoying it, and finding some missing".

Findings consist of answers of questions regard two scales used in La Tour, Henthorne and Nataraajan's researches. The questions are such as "How do you evaluate advertisement in general terms?", "Which advertisement is a good one, which one is interesting?", "If s/he likes/doesn't like, the ways s/he likes/doesn't like", "Which advertisement/brand is closer to you in terms of culture?".

Table 2: Attitudes of respondents to advertisement

Participants	Nickname	Attitude towards the ad of DoğuşÇay	Attitude towards the ad Lipton Çay
1.	Tuncay	Positive	Negative
2.	Abdullah	Positive	Negative
3.	Esra	Positive	Negative
4.	Erdal	Positive	Negative
5.	Gülcan	Positive	Negative
6.	Sümeyye	Positive	Negative
7.	Murat	Positive	Negative
8.	Emre	Positive	Negative
9.	Elif	Positive	Negative
10.	Ayça	Positive	Negative
11.	Gözde	Positive	Negative
12.	Halit	Positive	Negative
13.	Can	Positive	Negative
14.	Orhan	Positive	Negative
15.	Özkan	Negative	Positive
16.	Ali	Positive	Negative
17.	Yavuz	Positive	Negative
18.	Ahmet	Negative	Positive

19.	Ercan	Positive	Negative
20.	Mahmut	Negative	Positive

As a result of in-depth interview all of 6 female respondents (5 of them are coming from the cities in the Eastern Black Sea Region) and 11 out of 14 male respondents like DoğuşÇay's advertisement. 3 of males (Ahmet, Özkan and Mahmut) like Lipton Çay's advertisement. Ahmet and Özkanare from Tokat and Mahmut is from a place which is far away from the Eastern Black Sea Region. The first question of the research is that whether attitudes are positive towards advertisements including local culture. The symbols and the language used in DoğuşÇay's advertisements make respondents feel the brand closer to them. The second question of the research is that whether gender has any effects on attitudes. It is answered as no, because 6 of the females like DoğuşÇay's advertisement.

As it can be understood from the table above, only one of 14 males (he is from Trabzon), 4 of 6 females (four of them from Eastern Black Sea Region) do not like Lipton brand. In total, 4 females and 13 males like Lipton brand. The facts that 5 of the respondents have Lipton Çay in their houses and 8 of them have difficulty in remembering advertisement are among the additional information.

Abdullah, one of the participants, described DoğuşÇay as "marvellous".

He says: "It tells of our area". However, he said that he likes Lipton more as a brand.

Erdal also thinks the same: "It tells of our area. Clothes and the dialog among them and tea gardens are from our area. However, in terms of in formativeness, I prefer Lipton.

Tuncay and Murat like the advertisement of Doğuş Çay; however, they find clothes and language exaggerated.

Emre stated that the accent of Black Sea region makes the advertisement more attractive and he likes the advertisement. However, he finds the advertisement of Lipton sufficient as it states the importance of hygiene and it is pure in terms of information content.

Elif, one of the participants from Trabzon, likes the advertisement of DoğuşÇay and she adds: "The advertisement of Lipton is chillier; the characters are European and snob. The woman from the advertisement and the environment in which she acts seem chilly to me. Whereas, DoğuşÇay, costumes, the wasp wasted tea cup and plateaus are closer to us".

Ayça also finds the advertisement of Lipton chilly and she claims: "It is more elite, I think it does not tell something that belongs to us. It does not tell about Turkey, it is like a tea of another place".

Ali, on the other hand, likes Doğuş Çay more and emphasizes the phrase of "daldurmaçay" and then says that the advertisement hits the target.

Ahmet, on the other hand, says that he likes the advertisement of Lipton more and thinks it is natural but he finds the advertisement of DoğuşÇay artificial. Ercan says: "I am on the side of localness, If Lipton came up with a local advertising campaign, it would be more successful. I look to localness; however, the one that I am satisfied when I drink is Lipton".

Results

Although evaluating attitudes towards advertisements depending on one or several variables limits the research it reveals how culture is effective on attitudes. Besides 10 people living in the Eastern Black Sea Region, other 7 (total 17) people develop positive attitudes towards the advertisement using local language, clothes and place. This inference shows that nationalism as well as localness gain importance. It is revealed by researches that attitudes influence shopping behaviours. However, as an answer of additional questions participants told that 3 of them had DoğuşÇay and 6 of them had Lipton Çay in their houses. This situation necessitates a new research centred on "Brand image" which can develop a new point of view for researches. The result is that cultural differences and cultural symbols used in advertisements is a very important factor, but it is not the only one.

Figure 1

Figure 2

References

Barış, G. ve Odabaşı, Y. 2010. *Tüketici Davranışları*. MediaCat, İstanbul

Caillat, Z. ve Muller, B. 1996. "The Influence of Culture on American and British Advertising: An Exploratory Comparison of Beer Advertising." *Journal of Advertising Research*, 36(3), 79-87.

Cheng, H. Ve Schweitzer, J. C. 1996. "Cultural Value Reflected in Chinese and U. S Television Commercials." *Journal of Advertising Research*, 36(39), 27-45.

Dereli, A. 2002. Uluslar Arası Reklamlarda Farklı Kültürlerin Etkileri, Marmara Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Yayınlanmamış Yüksek Lisans Tezi, İstanbul.

Elden, M. 2005. Glokal Reklam Kampanyalarında Yaratıcılığın Önemi**,** *Bilig*, S.32, ss 65-82. Available at: http://www.yesevi.edu.tr/bilig/biligTur/pdf/32/65-82.pdf (10 Aralık 2012).

Garciya, E. 2004. *The Effects of Cultural Values On International Advertising Effectiveness: A Study of Sex Appeals in Fashion Advertising*. The University of Texas at El Paso, Unpublished Master Thesis, Texas.

Giddens, A. 2010. Sosyoloji Başlangıç Okumaları, Say yayınları, İstanbul.

Graham, K. W., 2005. *Direct Mail Advertising to Hispanic*. Unpublished Master's Thesis, Oklahama University, Oklahama.

Han, S. And Shavitt, S. 1994. "Persuasion and Culture: Advertising Appeals in İndividualistic and Collective Societies." *Journal of Experimentalsocial Psychology*. 30, 326-350.

Hofstede, G. 1997. *Cultures and Organization, Software of the Mind*. McGraw-Hill, New York.

İspir, B. N, Suher, K. H. 2009."SMS Reklamlarına Yönelik Tüketici Tutumları", Selçuk İletişim, Cilt 5, Sayı 4, (Erişim Tarihi: 12.05.2013).

Kartari, A. 2001. *Farklılıklarla Yaşamak*, Ürün Yayınları, Ankara.

Korkmaz, N. Ve Yaylagül L., 2008. Medya Popüler Kültür Ve İdeoloji, Dipnot Yayınları, 1. Cilt, Ankara.

Lull, J. 2001. Medya İletişim Kültür, (Çev: Güngör N.), Vadi Yayınları, Ankara.

Mutlu, E. 2008. İletişim Sözlüğü, Ayıraç Yayınları, Ankara

Onay, A. 2012. Reklamlara Yönelik Tutumlar: Nitel Bir Araştırma, e-gifder, www.e-gifder.gumushane.edu.tr., Cilt:1, Sayı:4, 51-66

Ödül, D., 2008. Uluslararası Kültürel Farklılıkların Reklamlar Üzerine yansıması ve bir Uygulama, İstanbul Üniversitesi SBE, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, İstanbul.

Run, C. Ve Grey, B., 2005. "Attitude Towards the Ad: Assessing Measurement Invariance in Cross-Ethnic Research." In *Marketing in International and Cross-Cultural Environments*, 14-20, 2005 (Anadolu Üniversitesi Veri Tabanından 22 Nisan'da Ulaşılmıştır.).

Schütte, H. Ve Ciarlante, D. 1998. Consumer Behaviour In Asia, New York University Press, (5 Eylül 2012).

Soydaş, A.U. 2010. Kültürlerarası İletişim: Farklı Kültürel Ortamlarda Çalışma Ve İletişim, Parşömen Yayıncılık, İstanbul.

Shavitt, S.,Lowrey, P., ve Heafney, J. 1998. "Public Attitudes Toward Advertising: More Favorable Than You Might Think", *Journal of Advertising Research*, July/August, 7-22.

Şener, G., 2007. "Reklamlarda Cinsel Çekicilerin İletişim Etkisi ile Ahlaki Değerlendirmesine Yönelik Tutum Araştırması", Anadolu Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Yüksek Lisans Tezi, www.Belgeler.com.

Tai, H. C. S., 1999. "Advertising Ethics: The Use of Sexual Appeal in Chinese advertising." *Teaching Business Ethics*, 3(1), 87-100

Ügeöz, P. 2003. Kültürlerarası İletişim, İstanbul Üniversitesi Yayınları, İstanbul.

How is Culture used as a Tool for Dissuasion of Conflict and Consensus: A Case of Sarajevo (1992-1995)

Jelena Hadžiosmanović*

Abstract

Within cities, culture and creativity have often been used as successful tools for dissuasion of conflict and consensus. Using the case study of the cultural scene in the city of Sarajevo – chiefly focusing on the period of the 1992-95 siege of the city – this paper argues that culture is an arena for creativity and resistance, but generally not an effective tool to end the conflict. I suggest that the role of arts in peace building and reaching consensus within Bosnia and Herzegovina is rather modest and its primary role is simply the artists' need to confront Beckettian "nothing to be done" while, in a truly Lafebvreian manner they, as citizens, are thus expressing their right to the city. To illustrate this, I will start with a short explanation of the history and the complexity of ethnic and cultural structure of Sarajevo. The main part of this paper will explore various examples of art forms produced in the besieged city – all examples of socially engaged art created in candlelit basements and cold, heavily damaged buildings, followed by its more peace-building role in the period after the end of the war. After providing several examples of art during the siege, I explain what might have been the reasons for such a rich cultural production during the war, using some of the theories about identity, loss of common memories and urbicide. Finally, I discuss the purpose of culture during the war and that only in a less complex conflict arts and culture could be used as tools for dissuasion of conflict and consensus. In general, the paper argues for the affirmative power of cultural production and consumption for a community, which cannot always change the reality of a situation, but provides mental relief and a symbolic performance of unity and togetherness.

Keywords: Identity; Culture; Memory; History; Urbicide.

---

* Jelena Hadžiosmanović, Goldsmiths, University of London; email: jelenainsarajevo@yahoo.com

Each place has a potential to develop creativity and one can argue that the more complex a place is, the higher creative potential emerges. Florida (2005) claims that cities "have long been the vehicles for mobilizing, concentrating, and channelling human creative energy" (p. 1). Moreover, within cities, culture and creativity have often been used as successful tools for dissuasion of conflict and consensus. Nonetheless, Yudice (2003) raises a question, prompted by the September 11 attacks upon the United States: "does culture have the power to remake community when the world is thrown into crisis?" (p. 8).

Using the case study of cultural scene in the city of Sarajevo – chiefly focusing on the period of the 1992-1995 siege of the city – this paper argues that culture is an arena for creativity and resistance, but generally not an effective tool to end the conflict, as some – quite naively – believe. Defining art and culture is diverse depending on concepts used in different social sciences – sociology, anthropology, etc. Having in mind the difficulty of daily struggles for survival, for people in Sarajevo the closest one is probably the anthropological definition of "culture as a whole way of life" (Mayo, 2000, p. 13), but in this paper I will mostly analyse art forms created during the war.

I suggest that the role of arts in peace building and reaching the consensus within Bosnia and Herzegovina is rather modest and its primary role is simply the artists' need to confront Beckettian "nothing to be done." They needed to achieve a catharsis in order to reduce psychological stress as well as offer their stance against violence and absurdity of war. Similar to what Hayden explains in her exploration of the story of Los Angeles, in Sarajevo "each project

deals with bitter memories […] but shows how citizens survived and persevered to make an urban life for themselves, their families, and communities" (Hayden, 1995, p. xiv). For Sarajevo artists, creating art was the only way to gain freedom from oppression and confirm their connection and affiliation with the city. Their art, at the same time, provided a strong message to the rest of the world: "don't let them kill us", as was written on a banner held by contestants of the 1992 *Miss of the Besieged Sarajevo* beauty contest (Figure 1).

To illustrate this, I will start with a short explanation of the history and the complexity of ethnic and cultural structure of Sarajevo. The main part of this paper will explore various examples of art forms produced in the besieged city – the establishment of a film festival, numerous exhibitions, musical concerts, theatre plays – all examples of socially engaged art created in candlelit basements and heavily damaged cold buildings. The artists' collective memory still does not allow them to deviate from conflict-related topics, which is seen in films they direct, plays they write and other activities they take part in after the end of the war – when arts and culture take on a peace building role.

Each city and its people are famous for something. War Sarajevo stands as a symbol of immense and stubborn human resistance and its people wanted to prove that the city belonged to them. As if, while creating more, the artists agreed with the theory that "the city is everywhere and in everything" (Amin & Thrift, 2002, p. 1) and more art would create more of a city to defy and proudly stand against the enemy. Therefore, I argue for the affirmative power of cultural production and consumption for a community, which

cannot always change the reality of a situation, but provides mental relief and a symbolic performance of unity and togetherness.

As a non-sociologist, I must emphasize that this is solely an attempt to rationalize why things happened they way they did, while drawing parallels with theories about the city, identity and memories. At the same time, this is an intimate experience of living through the events from more than a decade ago. For me, a citizen of Sarajevo, it is my own cathartic journey.

Figure 1: Miss Besieged Sarajevo

"Great cities have always been melting pots of races and cultures" (Park, 1925 cited in Florida, 2005, p. 27), and before the fall of Tito's Yugoslavia, Sarajevo was for many one of such great cities famous for its ethnic, cultural and religious diversity. The urban landscape of Sarajevo has always been extremely complex: the groups were firstly differentiated by different religious backgrounds, but "in the previous century the differences were created among main national groups" (Donia, 2006, p. 2): Bosniaks, Croats and Serbs, which was usually accordingly linked to their religious identities –

Muslims, Roman Catholics and Eastern Orthodox, respectively. Although some people considered Sarajevo to be "an ideal of pluralism" (Sontag, 2003, p. 316), and often called it "Jerusalem of the Balkans," its once lauded multi-ethnicity and interculturalism developed into a burden to be borne by its war-troubled citizens.

The siege started in April 1992, with nationalist Serb forces bombing the city ordered not to stop "until [people] are on the edge of madness" (Bell in introduction to *Edge of Madness*, 1997). Suffering the longest siege of a capital city in modern history, lasting 1,395 days, the city's destiny was a perfect example of a modern war and dreadful ethnic cleansing. The number of civilians who lost their lives reached around 10,000, and the once great city became a synonym for a wasteland spreading on two sides of the Miljacka River.

And yet, those who were surviving and those who succeeded to survive until the end of the war showed unmeasured spiritual resistance and "a determination to preserve trappings of normal urban life" (Donia, 2006, p. 317). Among them, as a special community determined not to give up were Sarajevo artists. It is known that in times of political crises "[c]onflicts, as in Belfast, Beirut or Sarajevo, can sometimes create incidental innovations" (Landry, 2000, p. 148). What happened in Sarajevo certainly was not anything similar to a carefully planned rich urban solution for a project within an urban environment. It was a spontaneous and unplanned acting and rise of creativity during a crisis.

First such example is definitely the creation of the Sarajevo Film Festival. Today, it is the biggest Balkan film festival, and, additionally, a very significant film festival in Europe, with over 200

screenings, 17 programs and over 100,000 visitors last year (information collected from Sarajevo Film Festival website). Kevin Spacey, Steve Buscemi, Michael Moore, Mickey Rourke, Morgan Freeman, Wim Wenders, Angelina Jolie and Brad Pitt are just few names from an enviably successful list of Festival's guests over the years. However, it certainly was not always like this and the Festival's founders have not thought that it could become such a huge event primarily because they were not sure if they would still be alive by the end of the first screening.

When the war broke out, electricity supply was cut, and, furthermore, it was too risky to gather in larger numbers and consequently become a better target for shelling. These were the main reasons for all movie theatres to close when the siege started. Susan Sontag (2003) described: "Outside a boarded-up movie theatre next to the Chamber Theatre is a sun-bleached poster for *The Silence of the Lambs* with a diagonal strip across it that says DANAS (today), which was April 6, 1992, the day moviegoing stopped" (p. 302).

However, as *Dani* Magazine reports (Seksan and Hadzovic, 2002), after the first shock, people started organizing various cultural events and two cinemas opened: *Apollo* in 1993 and *Radnik* in 1994. They played what they had, usually films from private collections, later retrospections or even newer films brought by foreign journalists. "Obala" Open Stage continued with activities during the war in cooperation with Sarajevo's Academy of Performing Arts, and *Dani* Magazine, and organized screenings in *Apollo*. Screenings were operated through a generator; ticket – one German mark or one cigarette, and it was always full. It is said *Basic Instinct* was amongst

the most popular films, as "everyone wondered if you could really see *it*" (Seksan & Hadzovic, 2002). A visitor to this film explains: "I was scared to death, running all the way with my cousin. It was very dangerous, but we did it" (Turan, 2002, p. 90).

The first Sarajevo Film Festival opened as a logical sequel of the previously organized screenings, on 25 October 1995 – near the end of the war – with today's jailed Iranian film director Jafar Panahi's film *White Balloon*. Film directors Milcho Manchevski (Macedonia) and Leos Carax (France) were Festival's guests and dragged 40 kg of film rolls over the Mount Igman – the only way they could access Sarajevo. The foundation of the festival was only a continuation of all other efforts filmmakers and filmgoers did prior to it, and festival director Mirsad Purivatra recalls it was done "under extremely difficult conditions but with incredible enthusiasm and a dream of freedom" (Purivatra cited in Zuvela, 2011). The creation of a film festival during the war "could have seemed more like a bizarre act of resistance than a real film festival" (People Building Peace website). Nevertheless, it was real. Thirty-seven films were shown, some on VHS, some on film, and every day the screenings were packed with cineastes – 15,000 in total. One of the main organizers Haris Pasovic explains:

> there are many things you can live without, food, etc., but you need film or arts for the magic. In the war it was particularly powerful to be watching films and be able to be transported to another world and also release emotions through the film (as many kept them bottled up during the war) (Zelizer, 2003, p. 69).

Musicians ceaselessly appeared in public. Sarajevo String Quartet never stopped performing or rehearsing. Concerts were usually held during the day because of the curfew and lack of

electricity. During the siege the members kept changing because some left the city and some lost their lives. The quartet's leader Dzevad Sabanagic admits he never thought about leaving the city: "It's unthinkable for me. It would be like leaving a sick parent or child. I never even think about it [...] My country is crying now. It carries a heavy burden. Can you imagine abandoning a sick child?" (CNN World, 1995) he explains.

The rehearsals were held wherever they had a chance to meet – usually at someone's apartment and later, from 1993, when they started the official cooperation with the Chamber Theatre and were then called "Chamber Theatre 55 String Quartet", they could practice at the theatre's premises (information collected from Sarajevo String Quartet website). During the siege, they held over 250 concerts, always playing, avoiding shells and pieces of shrapnel; never giving up.

> I still remember well a concert we held in a church in New Sarajevo Municipality in 1993. Outside it was around -17^0C and inside of the church -20^0C. After the service we held a concert; people sat in furs, coats, and no one moved – they asked from us to play encore several times (Seksan & Hadzovic, 2002).

Figure 2: Vedran Smajlovic performing surrounded with ruins of the burned City Hall building

Even when people got scared during heavy shelling and would start leaving, the quartet never stopped playing. UN's Peacekeeper Anne Marie du Preez Bezdrob, recalls in her book *Sarajevo Roses: War Memoir of a Peacekeeper* a visit to a concert by the quartet in 1993. She was impressed by these intrepid people, both performers and the audience, and felt somewhat guilty for shaking under her flak vest (which no one else had). She writes:

> Serb shells were ripping apart their city and their lives, but their souls were their own […] As an intensity of the bombing increased, small groups started leaving. The quartet kept playing as though nothing was amiss; their faces calm and composed, their practiced hands unwavering (du Preez Bezdrob, 2004, pp. 162-63).

Photo by Roger Richards/DVreporter.com

Figure 3: Vedran Smajlovic performing at a Sarajevo cemetery

Another musician Vedran Smajlovic (who played for Sarajevo String Quartet as well as for the National Theatre, Sarajevo Opera, the Sarajevo Philharmonic Orchestra and the Symphony Orchestra of RTV Sarajevo), also known as "The Cellist of Sarajevo," became a symbol of moral undefeatedness all over the world. When a mortar hit a breadline in May 1992, it killed 22 civilians, the cellist's close neighbours and friends. Smajlovic, wearing his concert dress, decided to mourn and honour the innocent by playing for 22 consecutive days on different city locations – usually the ruins, the streets or cemeteries

of Sarajevo (Figures 2 and 3). "Smajlovic's quixotic requiem became an irresistible symbol of European civilization under siege" (The Daily Beast, 1993), and his performance of Albinoni's Adagio in G Minor filled the air in the midst of the battle and made a stand against war and violence.

Two smaller theatres remained open throughout the war: Youth Theatre and Chamber Theatre 55, and during the war SARTR or Sarajevo War Theatre (*Sarajevski ratni teatar*) was founded in 1992. Actors and associates of the existing professional theatres in Sarajevo gathered around SARTR and gave around 2000 performances during the siege (information collected form SARTR website). Among many other titles, Youth Theatre produced a premiere of Samuel Beckett's *Waiting for Godot*, directed by Susan Sontag, who visited Sarajevo on several occasions during the war, and staged the play in 1993.

When asked why she had chosen that particular play Sontag replied: "Beckett's play, written over forty years ago, seems written for, and about, Sarajevo" (Sontag, 2003, p. 300). Classical tragedies usually have a social purpose. This play might not have as strong anti-war message of the *Theatre of the Oppressed* where authors like "Brecht aimed to provoke precisely such reflections – as the prelude to action for social change, rather than simply wanting to inspire empathy with his characters" (Mayo, 2000, p. 104). Sontag unassumingly wanted to do a small contribution and make the actors and the audience feel normal, at least for the duration of the performance.

Figure 4: Pasovic, Sontag and Grebo during one of Sontag's visits to Sarajevo

Figure 5: The cast of Susan Sontag's production of *Waiting for Godot*, 1993

Sontag describes how the entire group was struggling during rehearsals without heating and light, they lacked appropriate props, the actors were malnourished and could not memorise the lines easily and would get tired quickly. Nevertheless, the play premiered with twelve candles on the stage, and actors of all ethnic and religious groups delivered the lines without problem. They acted as friends, fellow citizens.

"In Sarajevo, as anywhere else, there are more than a few people who feel strengthened and consoled by having their sense of reality affirmed and transfigured by art" (Sontag, 2003, pp. 301-302). To list all artistic creations would be impossible, and the above mentioned examples serve here just as an illustration of a vast quantity of events during the siege: poetry days, Eurovision song contest, documentaries and feature films made by SAGA production house, International Festival 'Sarajevo Winter', chess competitions, football matches between B&H and UNPROFOR forces, children plays and costume parties, etc.

And that was not all. Each and every citizen contributed to the city's spirit never to be defeated. Sarajevans kept their humour – many jokes from the war are still told, most of them in the famous

black humour style (for example, they were joking that Americans did not send the air raid but at least they could have sent a pigeon since it could be cooked and eaten). A group of people contributed to FAMA's publication of *Sarajevo Survival Guide* – with inventive solutions for survival in a besieged city, including a list of recipes mostly explaining how to make something out of nothing (with a warning to use the cookbook at your own peril). Even the members of the Bosnian army showed their ingenuity when "borrowing" four tanks from the Sarajevo museum and returning them at the end of the war with a note they were very useful and they had no complains while using them (Donia, 2006, p. 311). Such are Sarajevans, never losing their high spirits, even during the hardest times.

After becoming acquainted with the quantity of cultural production during the siege of Sarajevo, one cannot but wonder: what makes you want to go to a film screening or a performance of a theatre play when your basic human needs are cut: you live without water, food, electricity, medical supplies or connection with the rest of the world? Moreover, what makes you create culture, when the whole cityscape around you seems to be falling to pieces?

Figure 6: Destruction of Sarajevo's cityscape

"Social scientists and psychologists have noted that preserving a sense of normalcy is a common response to violence" (Maček, 2000, cited in Donia, 2006, p. 318). Artists' primary role within a society is to create art, which was, according to this theory, the most "normal" reaction to the war around them. Additionally, Hayden believes that "when the urban landscape is battered, important collective memories are obliterated" (Hayden, 1995, p. 9), so in order to protect their memories and the memories of their city from disappearance and destruction, the artists simply decided to create more than ever – in order for their works to outlive them, and memories to be preserved. "A cityscape is not made of flesh" (Sontag, 2004, p. 8) but destroyed buildings could almost be added to the number of casualties in Sarajevo (Figure 6). The people of Sarajevo made it clear that the enemy could crumble the entire cityscape, but not its people – the core of the city. After all, city is "a living organism, not a machine" (Landry, 2000, p. 8).

Significantly, it seems the enemy was thinking similarly in terms of the importance of collective memories and identity. As Donia (2006) explains in his book on Sarajevo, during several first months, The Army of the Bosnian Serb Republic did not target most populated places, or places which were strategically and artillery-wise significant for Sarajevan inhabitants. They turned their focus on all most visible manifestations of culture and religion and thus the first major victims of the heavy shelling from the surrounding hills were places like the National and University Library of Bosnia and Herzegovina situated in the old City Hall building *Vijećnica* (which was the home for around 3 million books – proofs of mutual co-

existence of the peoples in Bosnia and Herzegovina), the Olympic Museum, the Oriental Institute, the main daily newspapers (*Oslobodjenje*) building as well as churches, mosques and the old synagogue. Landry (2000) explains how "[c]ultural heritage is the sum of our past creativities and the results of creativity is what keeps society going and moving forward" (p. 6). All these buildings, burned to ashes, were cultural symbols of the city and by destroying these symbolic values a part of the city's significant history of co-existence and common memories would be deleted, which would prevent it to advance and prosper. In a way, as historian Robert Donia explains, it was a true "memoricide" (Donia, 2006, p. 314).

Besides it being a "memoricide", Martin Coward 'revives' the term "urbicide" relating it to the 1992-1995 War in Bosnia, and describes it as the "widespread and deliberate destruction of the urban environment" (Coward, 2008, p. xii). He focuses primarily on the city of Mostar and the destruction of the Old Bridge (*Stari most*), built during the Ottoman time and heavily shelled until it collapsed into the river of Neretva. Coward argues that from an anthropocentric perspective it is difficult to give such importance to destruction of buildings, but one has to understand that it was the integral part of the destruction of cultural property to perform the ethnic cleansing process. The attachment to and importance of the space and place is clear from a Croatian writer Slavenka Drakulic's 'obituary' she dedicated to the Old Bridge in Mostar, when describing her reaction to photographs of a Bosnian woman with a cut throat and the image of the destroyed bridge. The answer reads:

> Why do I feel more pain looking at the image of the destroyed bridge than the image of the woman? Perhaps it is because I see my own

mortality in the collapse of the bridge, not in the death of the woman […] A dead woman is one of us – but the bridge is all of us. (Drakulic, 1993, cited in Coward, 2008, p. 11)

Similarly, Michael A. Sells describes in his book *The Bridge Betrayed: Religion and Genocide in Bosnia* a comparable reaction by a Sarajevan woman who lived there during the war and saw the cityscape destruction as well as numerous casualties in a hospital. Sells notices that

the burning of the library struck her with special horror. In the fire of the National Library, she realized that what she was experiencing was not only war but also something else. The centuries of culture that fell back in ash onto the besieged city revealed a secret. (Sell, 1996, cited in Coward, 2008, p. 1)

Figure 7: The City Hall (Vijećnica) burning after heavy shelling in 1992

One of the highest achievements of Bosnian and Herzegovinian culture was disappearing in fire and together with it shared history and memories of co-existence. That hurt some people more than the injuries on their bodies – which could eventually heal. So, to come back to the artistic creation during the war – it must be that, stimulated by the destruction of the collective memories of the city, the citizens answered with a creative endeavour taking them to creation of new memories.

And which were the memories that the citizens were trying to

protect? Which identity, and whose city was it? A nation has been defined as a society that "occupies a particular territory and includes a common identity, history and destiny (Johnson, 1995, p. 188). In that sense, due to the complex ethnic structure, the articulation of national or ethnic identity was quite difficult and problematic for people in Bosnia and Herzegovina, especially for those coming from mixed marriages – many of whom lived in the capital. Some of them simply declared only their Yugoslav identity (and, absurdly, some still do). Just as in the case of Cieszyn Lutherans in Poland described in Marian Kempny's study about their locality, in war Sarajevo "national identification ceased to be a decisive factor in the process of identity construction" (Kempny, 2002, p. 66). Communities based on ethnicity, religion, age or social statuses were not the primary ones. Of course, there were "connections arising out of shared experiences, relationships, histories, territories and practices" (Ibid., p. 15). Nevertheless, the people of Sarajevo created a new community based on shared locality, i.e. the city, but at the same time they shared same interests and experience. As Popple (2003) nicely explains, "communities of interest can be based upon people sharing a common condition or problem" (p. 39). Community was never precisely defined, but here it is worth noting Anthony P. Cohen's (2002) observation that "[it] has become a way of designating that *some*thing is shared among a group of people at a time when no longer assume that *anything* is necessarily shared" (p. 169, original italics). The sameness of the people of Sarajevo was the war oppression. Thus, no matter how much the issue of identity was problematic for Sarajevans before the war, they all agreed in one – that was their city and they

belonged to it, regardless of them being Bosniaks, Croats or Serbs, since there were surely members of all three major ethnic groups defending it – on the front lines, or, as previously mentioned artists, by creating new city culture and memories. Their primary important aspect of identity was that they were citizens of Sarajevo – the city as it used to be before the destruction. Sarajevo as a place became extremely important for all those people who remained there and created strong social bonds between themselves and the city.

We can see this in the example of *The Cellist of Sarajevo*. In an interview for *New York Times* Smajlovic said: "My mother is a Muslim and my father is a Muslim, but I don't care. I am a Sarajevan, I am a cosmopolitan, I am a pacifist. I am nothing special, I am a musician, I am a part of the town. Like everyone else, I do what I can" (People Building Peace website).

Of course, here one has to clarify that "citizen" as a term used in the text above relates to an inhabitant of a city and not member of a state, and professor Painter affirms "that there is no simple correspondence between citizenship and national identity" (Painter, 2005, p. 6). He furthermore explains how "[g]eographies of citizenship have become increasingly dislocated from those of national belonging" (ibid), which coincides with the priority given to this particular definition of "citizen" in this case, due to the complexity of national identity. It might be that the people of Sarajevo linked citizenship with the city specifically because that identity was the safest one for all entity groups.

Another link among the people was their cultural identity. There are different ways to define cultural identity according to Hall, and the

> first position defines 'cultural identity' in terms of one, shared culture, a sort of collective 'one true self', hiding inside the many other, more superficial or artificial imposed 'selves', which people with a shared history and ancestry hold in common. (Hall, 1994, p. 393)
> The second one
> recognises that, as well as the many points of similarity, there are also critical points of deep and significant *difference* which constitute 'what we really are'; or rather – since history has intervened – 'what we have become' […] Cultural identity, in this second sense, is a matter of 'becoming' as well as 'being'. (Ibid., p. 394, original italics)

One can say that, during the war, Sarajevans who kept many different identities within themselves developed the 'collective self' beyond the differences among them and transformed their identity to a common one. One way or another, they were all extremely shaped by the cultural legacy of their ancestors and found the "common language" to unite them in their difference. "For some, culture represents a protective 'shield' to guard them against unwelcome change, for others it represents a 'backbone' with which to face the future" (Landry, 2000, p. 39). In Sarajevo's case, it might have been both – culture guarded the citizens from the horrors around them as well as gave them some hope that one day – hopefully soon – this will all be in the past. In the end, what mattered most to them was not so much what they were, but what they were not – enemies, "them", "others".

Another forced identity to which Sarajevo citizens were thrown to was the Balkan identity. Trying to remove the popular tag

"the bloody Balkans", when organizing events like, for example, Sarajevo Film Festival during the siege, the citizens of Sarajevo saw it as "a way of reminding the world that this city fought a war because it believed it had earned a place in that cosmopolitan artistic cosmos" (Turan, 2002, p. 107). Feeling abandoned by the rest of the (mostly Western) world, they wanted to revive their European identity, or, even broader, be part of the bigger world again.

Finally, after explaining various reasons which triggered heightened culture productivity during the war in Sarajevo, we come back to the question from the beginning of this essay: "What is the role of culture in times of ongoing crisis, as has been the case in Bosnia and Colombia?" (Yudice, 2003, p. 338). Can culture ease the conflict? Does it have the power to stop the war?

The Oxford English Dictionary, among other definitions, describes *war* as "any kind of active hostility or contention between living beings, or of conflict between opposing forces or principles" (The Oxford English Dictionary – Vol. XII, 1933, p. 80), and *warfare* as "the act or state of conflict" (Ibid., p. 97) which defines 'war' and 'warfare' as a type of conflict. Looking back at history and knowing what happened in the case of Sarajevo, one knows that, no matter how strong it was, cultural activity did not stop the conflict, it did not stop the war. Why did it fail, and should we call it a failure?

I believe it did not fail, because its purpose was not to accomplish any bigger impact than it was. Arts are often used as a tool for conflict resolution and reconciliation. However, once the conflict is brought to an extreme, as in the case of Sarajevo war, we can only talk about arts helping the community keep sanity, show

resistance and serve as a confirmation of people's city identity. Once the escalated violence and conflict is kept under control, arts take on another role and help peacekeeping and reconciliation. Of course, the example of Sarajevo is not sui generis. Any severe catastrophe – war, or a natural disaster, would have similar results. It might be that the case of Sarajevo is simply extremely complex, as filmmaker Srdjan Karanovic puts in plain words: "Here history is very complicated, there is conflict and remembrance from every period" (Karanovic cited in Turan, 2002, p. 91). Nevertheless, it used to be something extremely positive in past, and Sarajevo-born theatre director Haris Pasovic tried to explain to Susan Sontag while they worked on *Waiting for Godot* together: "You can't imagine what it used to be like here. It was paradise" (Pasovic cited in Sontag, 2003, p. 316). Even foreigners understood the city's uniqueness and, to use the words of film director Paul Alden Robinson "[b]efore the war it was the one place where people got along, a combination of small town openness and warmth and big city sophistication; it was the best vision we have of ourselves" (Turan, 2002, p. 93). Remembering this almost idealised picture of the city possibly motivated artists even more in their struggle to keep the city's former spirit alive.

Many journalists and war photographers hope that showing the rest of the world the horrors of war would make a significant change. But the photograph "The Napalm Girl" by Nick Ut did not end the Vietnam War. Susan Sontag' play did not help end the war in Sarajevo, as well as all the activities of Jews during the WW2 did not have any conflict resolution aim. Jean Baudrillard wrote:

> The people of Sarajevo are not bothered by such questions. Being where they are, they are in the absolute need to do what they do, to

> do the right thing. They harbour no illusion about the outcome and do not indulge in self-pity. This is what it means to be really existing, to exist within reality […] This is why they are alive, while we are dead. (Baudrillard, 1994)

All creative solutions within arts and culture section during the war were not there to solve problems and were not catalysts for change. But later, they did and still do play a significant role in peacekeeping and reconciliation processes.

Since the war ended, Sarajevo Film Festival is dedicating a special part of their program to children, "which started when director Purivatra realized that the four-year siege meant that a generation of children hadn't had the opportunity to see the movies on the big screen" (Turan, 2002, p. 108). Buses bring children from all over Bosnia and Herzegovina – both entities – to children matinee program, similar to the later constructed idea of Kids' Festival organized every year since 2004. Sarajevo Film Festival brings some of its program outside of the capital too, to areas where people might not even have a cinema to visit – all having "a special role to play in binding the wounds of wars, advancing regional cooperation and reconciliation, and promoting peace and human rights" (People Building Peace website).

Some projects exist so that the horrors of war do not fall into oblivion. Young actress Zana Marjanovic leads a project in the last couple of years, where actors and ordinary citizens take part in a performance where they count the number of victims of the Srebrenica massacre. Artists still carry memories which need to be told. This might be the main reason why they mostly reflect the war in their work. Most of the post-war films are about the war or

consequences of war. An example could be the recent film by contemporary artist Sejla Kameric *1395 Days without Red,* in which the main character, played by Spanish actress Maribel Verdú, is reliving the experience of the trauma of the siege. It is her individual journey through the collective memory of the city.

"Cities have always been, and will always be, places of heterogeneity" (Bridge & Watson, 2000, p. 255). In this paper, I tried to illustrate the complexity of Sarajevo's heterogeneity and the search of its war troubled citizens for identity within the city. In a truly Lafebvreian manner, the citizens expressed their right to the city and I argue that exactly because of the strength of the urbicidal affects, Sarajevo's citizens, and especially artists, were fighting against this war with strong cultural production in the besieged city.

After providing several examples of art during the siege, I explained what might have been the reasons for such a rich cultural production during the war, using some of the theories about identity, loss of common memories and urbicide. Finally, I discussed the purpose of culture during the war and that only in a less complex conflicts arts and culture could be used as tools for dissuasion of conflict and consensus.

Sometimes it seems culture in Sarajevo is struggling more today than it did during the siege – due to the lack of budget, many institutions might close their doors to public, many artists left the city, and those who are still there, in these times of social poverty and more global problems, are hoping for affectionate audience as was in the time of the city's siege. On one occasion, actor and director of Sarajevo's Youth Theatre Nermin Tulic, who himself became a

paraplegic as an early victim of the war, declared that he missed the war because then we were all better people (Seksan and Hadzovic, 2002). Anyhow, it is certain that "[c]ulture helps us to adapt to change by anchoring our sense of being; it shows that we come from somewhere and have a story to tell; it can provide us with confidence and security to face the future" (Landry, 2000, p. 39), which was exactly the role of culture during the siege in Sarajevo. Thus, Wilde's belief that "all art is quite useless" does not hold ground. As described in *People Building Piece II*,

> It is doubtful whether Vedran Smailovic managed to save a single life, shorten the Bosnian war, or speed the end of the siege of Sarajevo by even one day. Almost certainly, his brave actions made little impression on the Serb gunners who continued their merciless shelling of Sarajevo from the hilltops surrounding the city; if they were aware of his existence at all. He did not see himself as a peacebuilder. Yet his story has been often repeated and his actions have been held up to the world as a symbol of inspiring courage and nonviolent resistance in the face of horrible violence and human suffering (People Building Peace website).

The time to grasp the entirety of purposes and consequences of artistic production during the war in Sarajevo has not yet ended and as long as there are such inspiring people as those described in this essay it gives hope in the brighter future of this "crazy but charismatic town" (Purivatra cited in Turan, 2002, p. 93).

Figure 8: (photographer – Tom Stoddart) Burnt UNIS towers seen through the shattered windows of the Holiday Inn hotel – the towers were called "Momo" and "Uzeir", and these typical Bosniak and Serbian names were another proof of ethnic and cultural coexistence

References

Amin A. and Thrift N. 2002. *Cities: Reimagining the urban*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Andreas, P. 2008. Blue helmets and black markets: the business of survival in the siege of Sarajevo. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

Baudrillard, J. (2004). 'No Reprieve For Sarajevo' Liberation, 8 January. Retrieved from:

http://www.uta.edu/english/apt/collab/texts/reprieve.html   (Accessed: 22 December 2011)

Bridge G. and Watson S. 2003. 'City Differences' in Bridge G. and Watson S. (Eds.) *A companion to the city*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers Ltd.

Cohen, A. 2002. Epilogue. In: Amit, V. (ed.) 2002. *Realizing community: concepts, social relationships and sentiments*. London: Routledge. Ch.9.

Coward M. 2009. Urbicide – the politics of urban destruction. New York: Taylor and Francis Group, Routledge, retrieved from URL http://www.ewidgetsonline.com/dxreader/Reader.aspx?token=v+PpHsyYi WdiGCmc2vu0Vw%3d%3d&rand=1838137898&buyNowLink=&page= &chapter=

Donia, Robert J. 2006. *Sarajevo, a biography*. London: Hurst & Company.

du Preez Bezdrob, A. M. 2006. *Sarajevo roses: war memoir of a peacekeeper.* Johannesburg: Struik Publishers.

Florida, R. 2004. *The rise of the creative class and how it's transforming work, leisure, community and everyday life*. New York: Basic Books.

Florida, R. 2005. *Cities and the creative class*. New York: Routledge.

Hall, S. 1994. 'Cultural Identity and Diaspora' in Williams P. and Chrisman L. (Eds.) *Colonial discourse and post-colonial theory, a reader*. London: Pearson Education Limited.

Hayden, D. 1995. *The power of place: urban landscapes as public history*. Cambridge: MIT Press.

Jenks, C. 1993. *Culture*. London: Routledge.

Johnson, A. 1995. *The Blackwell dictionary of sociology*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Kempny, M. 2002. Cultural islands in the globalising world: community-cum-locality of the cieszyn silesian lutherans. In: Amit, V. (ed.) (2002). *Realizing community: concepts, social relationships and sentiments*. London: Routledge. Ch.4.

Landry, C. 2000. *The creative city: a toolkit for urban innovators*. London: Earthscan.

Malcolm, N. 1994. *Bosnia, a short history*. London: Pan Books.

Mayo, M. 2000. *Cultures, communities, identities: cultural strategies for participation and empowerment*. New York: Plagrave

Murray, J. et al. (Eds.) 1933. *The Oxford English dictionary* Vol. 12: V-Z. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Seksan V. and Hadzovic S. 2002. 'Trijumf volje' Dani Magazine (no. 251), 5 April. Retrieved from:

    http://www.bhdani.com/arhiva/251/t25124.shtml (Accessed: 21 December 2011).

Sells, Michael A. 1996. *The bridge betrayed: religion and genocide in Bosnia*. London: University of California Press.

Sontag, S. 2003. *Where the stress falls*. London: Vintage.

Sontag, S. 2004. *Regarding the pain of others*. New York: Picador.

Stoddart, T. 1997. *Edge of madness: Sarajevo, a city and its people under siege / photographs by Tom Stoddart and Alastair Thain*. London: South Bank Centre

Turan, K. 2002. *Sundance to Sarajevo: film festivals and the world they made.* London: University of California Press, Ltd.

Yudice, G. 2003. *The expediency of culture: uses of culture in the global era.* London: Duke University Press.

Zelizer, C. 2003. The role of artistic processes in peace-building in Bosnia-Herzegovina. In: *Peace and conflict studies*, volume 10, 2. Fall 2003 (pp. 62-75). Retrieved from: http://shss.nova.edu/pcs/journalsPDF/V10N2.pdf (Accessed: 22 December 2011)

Zuvela, M. 2011. 'Sarajevo Film Festival awards jailed Iranian director' Reuters, U.S Edition, 22 July. Retrieved from: http://www.reuters.com/article/2011/07/23/us-bosnia-festival-idUSTRE76M07520110723 (Accessed: 22 December 2011)

The Prospects of Intercultural Education in Bosnia and Herzegovina

Elvira Islamović＊
Nermina Blažević

Abstract

Throughout history, education has not only been a carrier of culture, but also an integral part of communication between different cultures. Challenges faced by educational and cultural institutions in most modern pluralistic societies are higher than in earlier societies. The legacy of ethnic conflict in the war in Bosnia and Herzegovina, in which traditional value of multicultural and multi-religious life was undermined, had immediate implications for social, cultural and educational policies. Educational policy, based on the assumption of a national culture that promotes national exclusivity through textbooks and educational practice, should overcome in recognition of cultural diversity and dialogue in a globalized world where differences should be considered an advantage and not deemed an obstacle to common life and cooperation. The paper highlights the importance of introducing interculturalism as an important component of the overall educational practice. Teaching the value of diversity, the affirmation of universal values that underlie a democratic society, a sense of responsibility to themselves and to each other, the rejection of exclusion and differentiation of others on any basis, solidarity and cooperation, are current issues of the modern pedagogical and sociological discourse. These concerns must receive a stronger affirmation and application in the educational process of Bosnia and Herzegovina.

Keywords: Cultural Diversity; Bosnian Society; Intercultural Education

＊ Corresponding authors: Elvira Islamović and Nermina Blažević; Masaryk University; e-mail: nermina_blazevic@yahoo.com

Introduction

Many countries, not just today but also in the past were culturally pluralistic and socially divided. Changes taking place in the modern globalized world developed into the different cultures and societies which became much more interconnected and interdependent. One of the most important problems of these contemporary times is to build mutual trust, cooperation, solidarity, respect for others, and the reduction of social prejudices and stereotypes, such as nationalism, racism, sexism, homophobia, etc. Often highlighted humanistic values such as the protection and promotion of human rights and the values of pluralist democracy, show that their nature is characterized as more declarative, then applied in „real world.“ Many countries are concerned because of the appearance of violence, racism, xenophobia and an aggressive nationalism that threatens the integration and stability of many societies.

It is generally known that the education and upbringing can cause an increase or reduction of social exclusion and prejudices towards others who are different. Education is an important part of communication that shapes the patterns of behavior between different cultures and enables the development of society and the individual. Challenges faced by educational and cultural institutions, in most modern pluralistic societies, are higher than in earlier societies. The school plays a decisive role in the process of socialization. The society seeks to develop certain

values and traits for children emphasizing on them in schools through education.

Cultural Differences: Multicultural or Intercultural Education

Multiculturalism can be described as a way of applying democratic rights in this contemporary diverse world, it is a way of expressing diversities in the society. Cultural diversity and multicultural citizenship can be considered as one of the preconditions for the integration of all in a democratic society. Multiculturalism as a term is used to denote a cultural policy that seeks equal coexistence of cultures and respect of other people's cultures, customs and values. Multicultural public policies seek to improve the social and economic position of minorities of all kinds. In a specific case of Bosnia and Herzegovina multiculturalism could be considered as a key solution for the joint existence of this heterogeneous and multiethnic country. However, such policy implies that multiculturalism also relies on the ethnosocial disparities, ethnic tensions and conflicts (Kukić, 1995, 79).

Multiculturalism as a cultural policy, therefore, arises as a reaction to this fact in order to ensure conditions for the survival of culture in these confronted situations (Kukić, 1995, 79). In particular, it relates to ethnic and racial minorities and Indigenous peoples who have historically been the target of harsh discrimination, oppression and injustice. Multiculturalism, by

definition, means life next to each other. Multiculturalism is, according to sociologist Kukić, the lowest level of connection between ethnicities which, without disturbing each other, live and coexist in the same territory. The situation is different in the case of inter-culturalism, a cultural policy whose essence is reciprocity, equal and full-fledged exchange, expansion and connectivity among different cultures in a society. Therefore, it is important to highlight that interculturalism rather than multiculturalism is a form of cultural life in multinational and multicultural environments, which has no adequate alternative.

In modern democratic societies, understanding and acceptance of members of different cultures is becoming one of the important and basic roles of the educational system. According to the Brian Barry (2006), a researcher of multicultural process, the term "multicultural education" includes two educational policies that are contrary to its origins and implications. The first assumes that all children should have equal application, regardless of race or ethnicity, gender or sexual orientation, religious beliefs or any other characteristic. The program should be multicultural and inclusive, taking into account the past and present and the position of all the group. Another approach excludes the joint program and advocates for various programs at the school with a "separate clientele." "Normal kids", "normal students" will then live in small closed communities as a rule within the school and school district surrounded by those who for whatever reason are defined as different (p. 285).

The Council of Europe advocates in the last fifteen years the intercultural education because of the multicultural composition of European countries. The term "intercultural education" is associated with the European tradition of education, as opposed to the "multicultural education," a term which is mainly associated with the Anglo-Saxon countries (Britain, Canada, USA). Although the two terms are often used interchangeably, it is important to distinguish between *interculturalism* which means interactive links between cultures, dynamic / qualitative dimension of the interactive relationship between cultures and *multiculturalism*, which indicates the simultaneous existence of multiple cultures in an area, it means "static quantitative dimension of multiculturalism; condition, not a relationship" (Puzić, 2008). The first studies of the Council of Europe on intercultural education were focused on the education of immigrant populations in European schools. At the same time the focus was on learning the language, which was not so emphasized because of the lack of prior education and specific experiences of socialization. However, such programs for "culturally different," served as a means of segregation and stigmatization; not taking into account the relationship between the culture from which they came and the culture of the country of origin. Later, in the 1980s as a major task of intercultural education was provided help to students to acquire a positive self-image and self-respect. Until the 1990s, the focus was on the issue

of relations between cultural groups, there was a need to engage in intercultural education and the majority of the children.

White Paper (Council of Europe) on Intercultural Dialogue (2008) argues that one of the five approaches for the promotion of the intercultural dialogue are learning and teaching intercultural competences (in all levels of education) through a various subjects, religion, non-formal and formal education, teacher education and family environment.

Intercultural education includes and assumes:

- Education for empathy - you need to learn to understand others and empathize with them;
- Education for solidarity - requires greater sensitivity to the problems of inequality and social marginalization;
- Education for recognition and respect for diversity - it is necessary to respect different lifestyles as well as personal and social wealth;
- Education against ethnocentrism, nationalism, racism and other factors of discrimination - it is necessary to encourage the development of intercultural sensitivity and awareness of self and others (Piršl, 2008).

Intercultural education involves a holistic and lifelong learning process and focuses on the development of competence and intercultural communication. The presence of the idea of interculturalism in education can be seen in three ways:

1) The declaratory affirmation of the principles and objectives of interculturalism in the law and regulations of education fields;
2) Through a declarative representation of the principles and objectives of interculturalism in the school documentsl;
3) The practical application of these principles and objectives in the schools - the school can be considered as a fertile environment together with teachers with the intercultural competencies (Piršl, 2008).

Work in an intercultural school environment enables the students and the teachers to feel important, valued and unique; they enjoy their own independent behavior; develop empathy, friendship and respect for each other, encouraging cooperation and individuality of the labor to create the conditions for understanding themselves and communicate their ideas and feelings about themselves and others (Piršl, 2008). Intercultural education based on these settings should result in the development of intercultural identity ("open identity") (Lukic, 2010, 59-75). For most modern contemporary cultural complex societies, it is necessary to develop their own democratic and pluralistic model. Therefore, the establishment of a form of intercultural education for diversity in society is formed for learning and accepting diversities as something valuable. Cultural Pluralism implies mutual understanding, tolerance and dialogue, intertwining all different cultural traits (Spajić-Vrkaš, 2004). According to Spajić-Vrkaš (2004) notion of interculturalism includes interactive links between cultures, and appeared as a result of having a need to organize multicultural societies according to the principles of cultural pluralism and social dialogue. "It will be valid not only to learn together, but also to live together, what excludes any institutional separation." The co-existence will have to avoid the classic segregationist policies which Bosnian society experience today in our so-called "unified" school system. Therefore the secular schools have to try, at least within the compulsory education, to take into account the diversity of students in

heterogeneous groups. Students are different, but the goals must be shared, and the basic one is dealing with diversity without exclusion and without separation. Dual society produces dual school. But the dual school is not a school of moral and social education. On the other hand, the "intellectual" coexistence must be strengthened by active common living in joint projects (Legrand, 1995, 61-62).

Education and training institutions are important agents of socialization and therefore stand out as an important factor of the formation and elimination of prejudice and social exclusion. Some courses at the school in particular, can contribute to the creation of social prejudice and irrational interpretations, such as national history, national literature and others, especially if they are relying on legends and myths rather than on the facts. Schools are often accused of not respecting enough diversity. They must show sufficient flexibility between individual and group differences, and also have to bring together individuals around common rules. In order to achieve this, it is important to emphasize the importance of the introduction of interculturalism as an important component of the overall educational practice. Respect for pluralism in education, the recognition of cultural diversity and equality, and the question of maintaining a balance between the necessary integration, while respecting and preserving their own identity, are the questions that encourage many discussions.

Intercultural Education in Bosnian Context

Socio-cultural milieu of Bosnia and Herzegovina is marked with interculturalism for centuries. The historical experience of living together in Bosnia and Herzegovina, confirms that it is possible to live together and make the preservation of ethnic and cultural characteristics of each group individually. The nationalist discourse formed during the breakup of Yugoslavia, sought to permanently delete and destroy this longstanding cohabitation among religious and ethnic groups in Bosnia and Herzegovina. Destruction, nationalism and the establishment of ethnic displacement, were aimed at destroying of the collective memory and cultural traditions. The war wanted to destroy all rules which were built in order to make relations with those who are different ethnically. These issues have direct implications in the social, cultural and educational policies even today in Bosnia and Herzegovina.

In the post-socialist and post-war Bosnia and Herzegovina, the key problem of educational systems is their pronounced ethnic nationalist dimension and divisions. Ethnic divisions are an integral part of education, and the implications of the strongest divisions and exclusion are visible through the so-called national group of subjects: language and literature, history, geography and religious education (all of these subjects are named differently depending on ethnic affiliation). "Since the end of communist rule, there are three periods of renewal of curricula: 1990-1992, when the curriculum was nationalized by the three main ethnic

groups; then in 1992 and by the end of the war in the 1995, when three totally new plans were developed, and post-war period through which three separated curricula were consolidated in education systems. Three types of curricula determine future of education of Bosnian citizens. Firstly, it has to be emphasized that every of these curriculas are national in the sense that they focus on language, culture and history of only their own ethnic group. Positioning of education towards ideological and concealing veil of the ruling parties in order to manipulate, always moves away education systems from its true mission, meaning of the true human emancipation. "What is not successfully carried out during the war, continues to be carried out in these contemporary times through ethnic nationalist separation in the educational system. These "different" education systems promote a particular ideological and political objectives of a certain ethnic group" (Kapo, 2012, 144). "Education is often abused in practice, giving students different interpretations of the same facts," and "often schools divide students on the basis of their ethnic identity, language and religion" (Pasalic-Kreso, 1999, 7). These disorders are common in places where minority refugees took place and where the education is organized for the purpose of the majority of the population. There were some cases when students and teachers who belong to a minority group were banned and could not even enter the school building because the school curriculum completely ignores the cultural identity of these minority ethnic groups, on the other hand; minority boycotted the majority school

system and established a parallel one to members of their own ethnic group (Pasalic-Kreso, 2004 , 9-10).

The so-called "two schools under one roof" were formed for the purposes of national homogeneity, segregation and design of exclusively ethnic identity. Educational policy based on the assumption of a national culture, homogenization and ethnic mobilization around cultural symbols and beliefs, which manipulate etnocracy aimed at further separation and segregation of social relations. Two schools under one roof are far away from the social and educational appreciation of ethnic diversity in a globalized world in which differences should be considered as an advantage, not a hindrance to cohabitation and cooperation. Promoting national exclusiveness through textbooks, denying cultural differences, lack of dialogue and mutual cooperation is aimed at raising awareness of ethnicity in order to manipulate ethnic identities for various nationalist projects. Even Bosnia and Herzegovina has reduced the number of segregated schools, however, continue education systems continue to suffer from institutional separation of children by ethnicity and the presence of mono-ethnic schools. National dichotomy is inadequately developed for the multiculturalism and tolerance, which are so necessary for Bosnian society. Building a democratic school that educates the citizen instead of members of the nation or religion should be one of the basic aims for whole Bosnia and Herzegovina. Extracted potentiation on differences as a basic value, exclusivity and manipulation feeling of endangerment of

others, have long been the only form of policy. Decades behind us left deep wounds for the whole Bosnian society. Bosnia and Herzegovina still confront with the question how to re-learn to live together and to encourage the transformation of public discourse about others.

Political and ideological constraints and exclusivity in Bosnian society during and after the war, did not bypass the educational systems which are supposed to design and to produce cultural uniformity. The education systems in Bosnia and Herzegovina have to be transformed, through the integration of intercultural components in the curricula which has to be unified. With regard to religious, ethnic and cultural diversity that is present in Bosnia and Herzegovina, the question of establishing an intercultural, multilingual education model, which develops integration and democratic connectivity, promotes the tolerance, unity and understanding, stands the question of the survival of Bosnian society. "Schools have the role to explain to young people all the historical, cultural and religious backgrounds of the various ideologies that are scrambling for their attention in a society that surrounds them, or in the school and classroom" (Delors, 1998, 63). Globalized world in which we live, seeks not only to understand the variability of our social position, but to understand the world around us, people and culture that we have and that is different and varies from the interaction. It is essential that school systems and other institutions of education and culture, develop forms of work that will prevent exclusion, nationalism,

anti-civilization and anti-democratic tendencies, and to promote democratic values, common life and cooperation. Educational institutions must be saved from daily abuse and ideological manipulation. They must be the place where universal human values, human rights and dignities, the value of a pluralistic and democratic society are kept and applied. This educational concept represents an ethical imperative for a society in which the memory of the "ethnic cleansing" is still fresh, and the ominous political message about the impossibility of co-existence of people of different ethnic backgrounds, is still present, unfortunately. The state in which nationalist ideologies teach children and young people cannot live together with each other and the existence of "two schools under one roof" won the important role of education for pluralism, which is based on an understanding and appreciation of other cultures and helps in winning the trust and cooperation. In a democratic society, diversity is seen as an asset, not as a reason for bias or divisions in society.

Because of these reasons, the purpose of education is to prepare individuals not only to shape their own cultural identity and understand their culture, but also to accept, understand and respect other cultures. Discussions on current issues such as multilingual education, the content of school textbooks of history and literature in a multicultural society, are current in Bosnia and Herzegovina which had more effectively the issues of ethnic and national, religious, cultural and linguistic diversity. Already advocated intercultural education could be the approach to this

problem and could be considered as the best solution. The exit from this Bosnian complex maze requires a greater sensitivity and understanding of ethnic diversity within the educational field, the recognition and appreciation of another, of different children and young people who have to be trained in intercultural communication and action. Indicating the need of shaping public education system that does not suppress the national cultural, linguistic and other characteristics and identities, but only foster civic culture which is common to everyone is the access to educational and cultural aspects of the current Bosnian problem. However, that among other things, requires a change in the political process in the country, but also the change of the education system and the media presentation of different social groups in order to reduce the negative effects of ethnocentrism. It goes without saying, that this is a long social process. Multiculturalism is a complex social phenomenon, often accompanied by tensions and misunderstandings that highlight the differences between certain collectives within society. These conditions represent a growing challenge to the educational and cultural policy.

Conclusion

      Both in the past and today, education enjoys its special role as the main carrier of the culture. Therefore, education has a major role in the dialogue between cultures. It should help to perceive existing social contradictions in a new light, find a way

out of ethnic exclusion in order to create a pluralistic and democratic civil society. In this sense, it is expected that the educational policies contribute to improved understanding, solidarity and tolerance among individuals, ethnic, social, cultural and religious groups, with the affirmation of knowledge, values, attitudes and skills that lead to human rights and an active commitment to defend those rights. Educational institutions at all levels should encourage reflection, critical distance, intercultural communication and action. Doing so, education institutions may allow the development of sociability and solidarity. For this reason, it is extremely important that schools in Bosnia and Herzegovina as one of the basic educational tasks, encourage the development and awareness of the importance all human rights, intercultural learning and its competence which is necessary to respect cultural differences and pluralism in a multicultural environment. Education should enable the harmonious development of personality with respect to its individuality, social and cultural identity. Equal rights and equal opportunities for optimal development for all students, regardless of their social origin, nationality, religion, the right to education in their mother tongue, the right to choose schools, freedom to choose their individual educational programs, language learning, teaching religious education, a fundamental principle of education must be strongly emphasized in the educational system of Bosnia and Herzegovina.

References

Bauman, Z. 1995. *Life in Fragments*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Barry, B. 2006. *Kultura i jednakost. Egalitarna kritika multikulturalizma*. Zagreb: Naklada Jesenski i Turk.

Delors, J. (ur.) 1998. *Učenje: blago u nama: Izvješće UNESCO-u Međunarodnog povjerenstva za razvoj obrazovanja za 21. stoljeće.* Zagreb: Educa.

Kapo, M. 2012. *Nacionalizam i obrazovanje: Studija slučaja Bosne i Hercegovine.* Sarajevo: Program podrške obrazovanju. Fond otvoreno društvo Bosna i Hercegovina.

Kukić, S. 1995. *Sociologija*. Mostar: HKD Napredak.

Legrand, L. 1995. *Moralna izobrazba danas, Ima li to smisla?* Zagreb: Educa.

Lukić, N. 2010. *Identitetni i interkulturalni odgoj i obrazovanje u Hrvatskoj*. U: Obrazovanje mladih za ljudska prava i demokratsko građanstvo. Mreža mladih Hrvatske. Studiji o mladima i za mlade. Zagreb: Nacionalna zaklada za razvoj civilnoga društva, 59-75.

Pašalić-Kreso, A. 2003. *Geneza sazrijevanja ideje inkluzije ili inkluzija u funkciji smanjivanja neravnopravnosti u obrazovanju*. U: Pašalić-Kreso, A., Bevanda, M. et al. (ur.), Inkluzija u školstvu Bosne i Hercegovine. Put prevazilaženja neravnopravnosti u odgoju i obrazovanju. Zbornik radova. Sarajevo: TEPD - Teacher Education and Professional Development i Odsjek za pedagogiju FF u Sarajevu.

Piršl, E. 2008. *Interkulturalni odgoj i obrazovanje.* Pula: Sveučilište Jurja Dobrile. www.ffpu.hr/fileadmin/Dokumenti/Interkulturalni_odgoj.ppt (20. 9. 2012.).

Puzić, S. 2008. *Intercultural education in the European Contex: Analysis of selected European Curricula.* Metodika, 15: 390-407.

Spajić-Vrkaš, V. 2004. *The emergence of multiculturalism in education: From ignorance to seperation through recognition*. U: Mesić, M. (ur.) *Experience and Perspectives of Multiculturalism: Croatia in Comparison to Other Multicultural Societies*. Zagreb: FFPress i Croation Commission for UNESCO, 87-101.

THE IMPACT OF INTERNET AND SOCIAL MEDIA ON KIDS' AND PARENTS' GAME HABITS

Mustafa Akdag

Mustafa Cingi[*]

Abstract

Internet, already a part of our lives far surpassing its limits as a means of communication, seems to have shaped most fields in human life and changed most of our daily habits and as a consequence the digital natives are observed to be completely living in Internet culture. One of the reflections of this culture and arenas in the Internet, social media has substantial impacts on gaming habits of digital natives. Up to the period in which Internet has interfered in man's life, the games played by parents were passed from older generations to the new ones as a tradition, so generations used to play the same games; when the children of a previous era became parents they described the games they used to play to their kids thus paving the way to the sustainability of this game tradition. While different generations used to play the same games, today with the dissemination of Internet and social media caused a change of format in the traditionally played games and street games started to give their places to those played on the computers. Therefore, children started to play games on the Internet, an endless space whether negative or positive. The fact that parents are alienated from this arena, enabled the children to play violent games without any boundaries and to take place in social media arenas that could have negative impact on children's worldly and spiritual well-being. The study is highly important in the sense that it clarifies the extent to which Internet and social media, which is actually the agent of change in children's gaming habits, environments changed parents' gaming habits among themselves and with their children. Surveys are conducted to the parents of primary school students as a field work to identify the changes originating from Internet and social media. According to research results, social media and Internet are found to be altering gaming habits of parents with their children. It is identified that parents keep themselves away from online environments in which their kids take place thus possibly breaking off the communication relationships between kids and parents.

Keywords: Traditional Games; Digital Games; Internet; Social Media; Parents; Digital Natives

---

[*] Corresponding authors: Mustafa Akdag and Mustafa Cingi, Erciyes University Faculty of Communication; e-mail: **mcingi@erciyes.edu.tr**

Introduction

Game, which is considered to be an amusing activity without any long-term goal or satisfaction, (TDK, 2013), is defined as a recreational activity with its own set of rules (www.buyukturkcesozluk.net, 2013). Game, an activity which has always co-existed in human life, is treated as the most appropriate "language" for a child to communicate his love, dreams, opinions, happiness, enmity, internal conflicts and to learn about the world outside (http://bote.hacettepe.edu.tr, 2013). Whether it's an infant, or a kid, adolescent or an adult, there are lots of answers to the question why a person plays a game. We can gather these reasons under two titles (Duran, 2013): The first, draining the energy from the inside, the second one is helping the communication and sustainability of personal behaviors for a long time. Some examples of this might be the girls playing with a doll pretending a mother or boys playing with pot lids imitation the steering wheel in the hands of a driver.

It is possible to analyze kid's games, which are also called traditional games, in two main categories like "open-air games" and "in-house games". Lots of other groups of games might be listed such as those played with papers and pencils, sportive games, musical games. While these game groups are called kids games, people from all ages might be playing games like football, basketball or skittles.

Such games, which emerge traditionally and passed from one generation to another, have evolved since the stepping of

Internet and especially social media into our lives and their format is continuously changing. While in traditional games the individual becomes a social being, in Internet and social media games this social aspect is brought to a different dimension. Although they have the same names, their type of playing, rules and similar changes are submitted to the pleasure of new generations and most of them approve of such a new style. A game named Farmville provides the kids a chance to plough and harvest the farm, milk the cow and collect eggs with one click not even having any idea of what these are in real life. Unfortunately, the parents who are supposed to rescue for such a generation which get to know animals in their new formatted visions, took their place in this new world of change. Parents, who couldn't transfer their gaming habits to new generations and couldn't keep up with the new era, now cannot take their kids out of Internet and social media arena and stay indifferent to their traditional habits.

This study aims to observe to what extent the Internet and social media, the agent of change in playing habits of kids, have changed the habits of parents to play with their children. Surveys are conducted on parents who have kids in primary schools under the scope of field work and Internet and social media sourced changes are put forth.

Conceptual Framework

No matter what era or culture it is, wherever is a child, there is a game. Like love, game is one of the most fundamental

needs of a child. Game, a means of understanding and trying the life for children, not only prepares them for life, but also reflects their experiences, feelings and desires. The children try to understand life, make empathy through games thus shaping identity through the roles they take. The knowledge they get through gaming is much effective and long-lasting. For children, game is thinking through trials and they gain experience through gaming (Eşsizer, 2013). They learn knowledge, skills and experiences for life in games by themselves. Therefore, the most influential way of educating children is through gaming. Games form the first step in children's learning by fun.

Games are also useful for kids to manage their feelings. According to psychologists, it is possible to relieve the fear from doctor by making the children play with doctor equipments and similarly to comfort a child in fear of ghosts by playing with him in ghost costume. For this reason, it is important to let the children play their games. Children should be encouraged to play with all types of toys freely (Gencer, 2006).

15-20 year ago, streets were very convenient for children to play, but now this is not the case. As a result of rapid and wide-scale urbanization policies, people now have to live in flats and with roads full of cars rather than the peaceful houses with large fields; this resulted in limitations on children's playgrounds. This leads children to play games on the computer, Internet and social media.

Having its stamp on the 21ˢᵗ Century, providing the world with a network of communication, reporting, education, broadcasting, entertainment, the Internet has already become an alternative means for individuals to discuss, negotiate, chat, learn and shop whenever and wherever they want (Akgül, 1999:2). It's particularly a matter of concern when it comes to its wide-spread use among children and youth, (Ülger, 2012:286) the main group who are the most worried being the parents.

The opinions and behaviors of parents are of high importance when it comes to the use of each technology, not just the Internet (Odabaşı ve vd., 2007:71). In a research on parent's opinions about Internet use, it is found that families don't have any information on security, but they see this medium as a necessity of economical and modern life (Odabaşı, 2005:43). Among the results of this research, is the fact that the society does not have sufficient knowledge about the dangers of Internet.

Parallel to the advancement of Internet technologies, social media has become so popular being one of the mostly invaded fields by children and nearly the most enthusiastic arenas of game for them. Social media is defined as web based applications providing participants to create and share videos, words and audios along with applications, actions and behaviors developed to share information and opinions through interactive media (Peltekoğlu, 2012:4).

People, who lived in a rapid transformation of computer technology, the Internet and social media, can now make friends,

share their photos, opinions and videos with those who they have never met or known but who have the same ideas, hobbies and fields of interests. They can make their voices heard simultaneously by everybody in the world; they can play games interactively, do shopping and work together in professional office environments. It is one of the most important responsibilities of parents to monitor how their kids communicate with whom and over which sites. This is important for their worldly and spiritual well-being and to ensure that they develop positive attitudes and behaviors (Güvenç, 1997:28).

It's crucially important that parents develop positive attitudes towards growing-up their children for the kids to improve their behaviors, form their personal identity and self-respect, and identify their goals for the future and to have their decisive skills matured (Özyürek ve Şahin, 2010:38). Parents are the first source of interaction for children. The children of families in which tolerance is dominant, mutual feelings of love and respect are demonstrated, decisions are taken together, opening and discussing about their problems from time to time, avoiding from violent fights and quarrels, will surely complete their social and spiritual development more comfortably and in compliance with the needs of society (Çetinkaya, 2010:80). However advanced the technology might be, the children of those families with such a communicative environment will have a high level of self-respect and dependence and they will themselves much more valuable.

Recently emerging communication environments and changes in habits in parallel with technological advancements have played crucial roles in the perception of childhood and the interaction between parents and kids with respect to its conclusions for family and social structures. By 1950, the increase in the variety of in house media caused the house environment, the source of happiness as the coral point of love, privacy, morality, freedom and etc., to have two types of changes. While the first change commenced with the introduction of various elements of entertainment into our households, the second alteration was seen in the free use of these entertainment elements by all family members in the house (Ülger, 2012:295).

It is possible to provide an example for the first alteration as the parents wanted to have their kids play inside home looking at the dangers on the streets (Hill ve Tisdall, 2007:178). Parents in fear of their kids getting into bad habits like drug addiction, gambling etc. and a bad environment outside can't be regarded as unjust in their desires. In addition, the scaling down of play grounds and increase in the number of vehicles on the roads justify parents in their worries about the security of their kids. The transformation causing children to prefer games at home particularly computer and Internet games rather than street games, triggered the second transformation environment at home and opened the way for privatization and personalization of entertainment means which were previously for common use at home (Livingstone, 2002:166). The privatization of entertainment

accounts for a change in the place of entertainment devices such as television and computer from common places like living rooms and salons to private individual places like bedrooms or kids rooms. There was almost one TV for each room and this was the case with computers, as well. Today computer and Internet use is no longer a recreational niche, but an integral part of our colloquial lives. As a consequence of this privatization, the children could go to their rooms and use their computers and televisions for hours without any control from the parents side, entering to whatever sites they prefer and get to know so many people they don't know before without thinking who they actually are on the social media.

However, children can encounter so many harmful content and challenges for their cognitive and psychological well being on the Internet and social media from sexuality to terrorism, addiction, pirating, gambling and fraudulence. Leaving their kids alone on this arena without any control might lead their kids to contact with malevolent people out of curiosity and excitement or even exposure of their children to physical violence or death (Özsoy, 2010:263). Particularly parents in Turkey have to be very cautious about this (Özsoy, 2010:35). We are doubtful as to how children will complete their spiritual development upon watching this undesired and harmful content in front of their computers. According to a different research conducted in Ankara, the mostly preferred games on the Internet are Counter-Strike, Knight

Online, Call of Duty, Warcraft, GTA, Age of Empires, Half-Life which are full of bloody scenes (Binark vd., 2009:214)

This is the case with social media environment. According to a report, dated 5th of June 2013 containing data on Facebook for Turkey, the list for mostly preferred games on social media goes like daily life games such as "Farmville 2" and "Pet Rescue Saga" chance games like "Okey" and "Okey Plus, MyNet Çanak Okey" and gambling games like "Texas HoldEm Poker" (MetricsMonk, 2013). According to the same report, the first line of Facebook applications is occupied by "Your daily horoscope" full of harmful content like fortune telling and videos that are harmful to children's cognitive development in "İzlesene" and "Mynet" apps. Social media actually works like a casino and gaming house when it comes to games. Parents, who cannot tolerate their kids spending time in such places in real life, might remain indifferent to their kids' existence in such virtual environments.

It is up to parents and educators to protect kids from the harmful content on Internet and social media. It is up to the parents at home and educators at school to decide and check what is useful and convenient or not for kids. Below are some measures to be taken against harmful and inconvenient content which are likely to provide ease and help parents and educators (Odabaşı, 1999:321):

- A filtering program might be applied to let them enter educational sites but not those with harmful and unwanted content.
- As families teach their kids how to cope with unexpected negative behaviors in life, they should do this for the Internet, as well.

- Schools or Internet cafes should inform the children to get out when they enter an inconvenient site or else they will clearly have some kind of sanctions.
- Site builders shouldn't forget that there are kids among users and filter their content in a way to make sure that kids are kept away from harmful content and materials.
- When educators take a child to an Internet café, they should have them sit in groups of three. By this way the screen control might be ensured. On the other hand, their behaviors and dialogues between themselves might give an idea on what they might be doing!
- The teacher might want to give the key words for a research to be conducted by students on the Internet on any subject to make sure which sites could come up in the search.

In addition, a time should be allocated for gaming between the parents and their kids, for 10-15 minutes not to keep parents for long. The children should be given the chance to choose what game will be played, the children should be observed carefully in a way that they can realize that they are given so much care, and their good acts and words should be rewarded with "well done" or similar phrases. No questions should be asked in order to let them direct themselves and inclusion in the game should be up to them and not intervening in the game structure (http://www.makaleler.com, 2013).

When parents cannot educate and raise their children well, they shouldn't find the problem in computer or Internet games, but themselves (Tarhan, 2011, s. 92). When accurate methods are used computer games might be useful for time management, accurate message perception, critical thinking, improving visual skills and cognitive capacity, keeping cool in stress times. We should teach how to use computer games in a beneficial way rather than just restricting them. Getting your children to use the

Internet in a careful way is highly crucial; however, this is also the case between the spouses. Online friendship sites and chatting rooms might be harmful for their relationships. Similarly, the researches conducted by the General Directorate of Family and Social Research (SAGEM), indicate that the Internet could be harmful for families particularly for children when enough care is not given (Sagem, 1998).

Methodology

The study aims to clarify the differences between generations, the parents and digital natives who were born to a world of Internet and social media, on the scale of Kayseri through comparative relational analysis on dependent and independent variables. Therefore, the study is limited to the scale of Kayseri, instead of taking the whole Turkey as universe, thus paving the way for a micro level detailed analysis. The reason to apply such a method is rather than having a macro level study devoid of necessary details with a focus on general, a study method is chosen which enables us to make healthy and satisfactory generalizations with a specific focus.

In order to prove the transformation the Internet has caused in gaming habits of children and their parents on the scale of social media, data were gathered on the basis of socio-demographical characteristics of research participants and a subsequent field study was conducted on parents of 4th and 5th graders at primary schools on the scale of Kayseri.

The surveys are applied to the parents of primary school students from randomly selected 15 schools (from different provinces under Kayseri Ministry of Education) in a way to reflect the whole central Kayseri. Both parent groups, 25 from 4th graders and 25 from 5th, were applied a preliminary test to identify the intelligibility and convenience to prospective analyses before the conduction of survey form on the field. The final shape of the survey is given once the ambiguous and mistaken places are eliminated. Then the survey is applied to 650 people, to the parents of 4th and 5th graders in primary schools, throughout Kayseri by random sampling method. After the elimination of mistaken and ambiguous answers, 566 healthy surveys were left for analysis.

In the data analysis, the study uses some statistically descriptive methods like frequency breakdown and central tendency to identify the data respectively on socio-demographical characteristics of research participants, their game preferences in their childhoods and the times they spent for games, their relationships with their friends, which games their kids play today, whether they prefer street games or digital games, their use of computers, Internet and social media; their game preferences on Internet and social media; Internet connection methods; time they spend on games on social media; social media games which they play most; their reasons for choosing social media games; their preferences on game friendships. And chi-square method is

applied to measure the difference among games in terms of socio*demographical characteristics.

The research objective

The main aim of the study is to identify whether the gaming habits of parents among themselves or with their kids have changed along with the expansion of Internet and social media use, whether their kids play the games they used to play, to what extent they play digital games, whether they spend more time on street games or digital games and whether they choose to play social media games or traditional street games. In addition, the study aims to observe the effects of social media on gaming along with its impacts on other habits.

Research Variables

Independent variables include gender, education, job and games.

Dependent variables: 1) Having a computer and Internet; 2) Frequency of traditional game and Internet and social media gaming ; 3) Use of new communication technologies.

Research Assumptions

Assumption 1: Kids do not play the games which their parents used to play when they were kids.

Assumption 2: Parents do not play games on the Internet.

Assumption 3: Parents prefer digital games to street games.

Assumption 4: Parents who play games on the Internet play these games to pass time.

Research Limitations

The fact that such a wide-scale issue about what kinds of games parents play with their kids is analyzed in such a limited

time brought about some limitations to research content and scope. The first limitation of the research is the fact that the research is based on the parents of 4th and 5th graders at primary schools, leaving those in other classes and ages out of scope.

Another limitation of the study originates from the content scope of the research. The concept of "gaming habits" including a rather vast scope is analyzed over the ownership of new communication technologies such as social media and whether the games are played over them or not leaving the psychological and sociological aspects out of analysis. The inductive reasoning method is applied in the research.

Research Universe and Samples

The research is conducted in Kayseri on the parents of 4th and 5th graders primary school students in Kayseri. It is essential that the sample represents the universe in research sampling. Sampling groups include the parents of students who get education in 15 primary schools in Kocasinan, Melikgazi and Talas districts with upper, middle and low economy. When it comes to socio-demographical characteristics of research participants, 58,2% are women and 41,8% are men (in valid percent).

Findings and Comments

Socio-Demographical Characteristics

Of 650 parents participating in the research, 566's data are found convenient for analysis. 58% of participants are mothers, 41,7% are fathers with 0,4% unstated gender.

Average age of mothers is 34,9, and that of fathers is 39,5. 89,9% of mothers are housewives and 84,5% of fathers are self-employed. The educational background of mothers can be listed as 48,5% primary school, 22,6% high school, 20,1% secondary school and 4,1% university graduates. 4,7% of them are uneducated. Whereas, fathers education levels are 35,1% high school graduates, 30,6% primary school, 19,2% secondary school, 13,7% university and 0,5% post-graduate levels. 0,9% of fathers haven't attended any education institutions (Table 1.).

Table 1. Demographical characteristic of parents

Demographical characteristics of participants		Frequency	Valid percent %
Gender	Male	236	41,8
	Female	328	58,2
	Unstated	2	
	Total	566	100
Age	25-34	202	36,1
	35-44	290	51,9
	45-54	65	11,6
	55-64	2	0,4
	65 and over	0	0
	Unstated	7	
	Total	566	100
Education	Uneducated	17	3,1
	Primary	223	41,4
	Secondary	106	19,7
	High School	149	27,6
	University	43	8,0
	Post-graduate	1	0,2
	Unstated	27	
	Total	566	100
Job	Housewife	287	52,2
	Teacher	14	2,6
	Self-employed	222	40,4
	Civil Servants	25	4,6
	Engineer	1	0,2
	Unstated	17	
	Total	566	100

What games parents used to play in their childhood?

According to the research, parents used to lots of games including play hide and seek, skittles, ball games and playing house (Table 2). The most preferred ones were respectively hide and seek and skittles while to least are chess and checkers under the category of "Other".

Table 2. The most preferred games that parents used to play in their childhood

Most preferred games in childhood	Frequency	Valid percent (%)
Hide and seek	85	15
Skittles	78	13,8
Playing house	56	9,9
Ball games	42	7,4
Most of the above	298	52,7
Other	7	1,2
Total	566	100

When the relationship between gender and the games played is analyzed 72,6% of those who used to play hide and seek and 96,4% of those who played playing house are women and 81% of fathers used to play ball games (Table 3). There is a significant difference between the type of game played and gender (P<0,05).

Table 3. Gender differences among games played during childhood

| Mostly preferred games during childhood | Gender | | P |
	Girl (n=328)	Boy (n=236)	
Hide and seek	72,6	27,4	
Skittles	47,4	52,6	

Playing house	96,4	3,6	<0,05
Ball games	19,0	81,0	
Most of the above	55,6	44,4	
Other	42,9	57,1	

According to the research data nearly half of parents used to play games for 2-4 hours a day (Table 4). Average period of playing is 3,1 hours.

Table 4. Time allocated to playing by parents in their childhood

Time allocated to game	Frequency	Valid percent (%)
Up to 1 hour	100	18,2
Up to 2 hours	162	29,4
Up to 4 hours	171	31,0
Up to 6 hours	91	16,5
6 hours and over	27	4,9
Unstated	15	
Total	566	100

According to the results, with respect to gaming friendship, parents used to have more friends then their children do now (Table 5). The rate of those without any friends in their childhood is ‰5.

Table 5. The number of friends parents used to have in their childhood

The number of friends	Frequency	Valid percent (%)
Many friends	374	66,5
There were some but not many	186	33,0
No friends at all	3	0,5
Unstated	3	
Total	566	100

Almost all of the children play the games their parents used to play in their childhoods (Table 6). In the line of mostly preferred games, ball games like football and basketball come first notwithstanding what parents think, the second in the line are hide and seek and playing house. 43,4% of the kids play most of the other games as well as those stated above. Today's children don't play games like chess and checkers under "Other" category as mush as their parents did. The eye-catching point here is the fact that some of the kids never played the games their parents did whether they are in minor rate like 1%.

Table 6. The games which kids play and their parents used to play

The games which kids play and their parents used to play	Frequency	Valid percent (%)
Hide and seek	107	19,2
Skittles (met)	8	1,4
Playing House	54	9,7
Ball games	136	24,4
Most of the above	242	43,4
Other	5	0,9
None	6	1,0
Unstated	8	
Total	566	100

According to the above results the assumption numbered 1 wasn't verified stating *"Kids do not play the games which their parents used to play when they were kids"*.

Digital Game Preferences of Parents

Parents prefer to play street games in spite of technological developments and their increasingly intense daily schedules

(Table 7). Those who prefer to play digital games account for 25% of the total number. Those who do not want to play games are 9,8%.

Table 7. Parents' preferences about street games and digital games

Parents' game preferences (Street games / Digital Games)	Frequency	Valid percent (%)
I prefer playing street games to digital games.	290	51,8
I prefer digital games rather than street games.	75	13,4
I prefer to play both.	140	25,0
I prefer neither one.	55	9,8
Unstated	6	
Total	566	100

According to the research data, today parents use computer with a rate of 50% and 57,5% of these group prefer not to use Internet (Table 8). They reflect their negative attitude against social media use with a rate of 65,9%. They refuse to play Internet games with a rate of 82,2% and social media games with 82,1% (Table 9). Given their kids are addicted to computers games, are always online, even they form profiles on social media showing their ages more than normal and sharing private information about themselves and on the other hand, there are always fraudsters and malevolent people and violent and immoral games on this arenas; the fact that parents do not use these arenas will bring serious problems for communication in the family.

Table 8. Parents use of computer, Internet and Social Media

Computer, Internet	Yes	No

and Social Media use of Parents	Frequency	Valid percent(%)	Frequency	Valid percent(%)
Do you use computer?	282	50,0	282	50,0
Do you get connected to the Internet?	240	42,5	325	57,5
Do you spend time on Social media?	131	34,1	369	65,9

Table 9. Parent's choice of Internet or social media games

Parent's choice of Internet or social media games	Yes		No	
	Frequency	Valid percent(%)	Frequency	Valid percent(%)
Do you choose to play games on the Internet?	100	17,8	463	82,2
Do you choose to play games on social media?	99	17,9	455	82,1

According to this the second assumption is verified which states *"Parents do not play games on the Internet"*.

Parents mostly prefer to get connected to the Internet at their homes, the second source of connection being smart phones and the third form of connection is Internet café. Those who go to their neighbors, relatives and shopping centers indicated their prefences under the category of "Other" (Table 10).

Table 10. How do parents connect to the Internet

Internet connection preferences	Frequency	Valid percent (%)
Home	211	42,2
Mobile phone	60	12,0
Internet cafe	37	7,4
Work	27	5,4
Other	21	4,2
I don't get connected	144	28,8
Unstated	66	
Total	566	100

Facebook is by far the most preferred social media by parents who get connected to Internet with some 31 million members in Turkey (http://www.sabah.com.tr, 2013), while the global number is more than one billion (http://www.sabah.com.tr/2, 2013) (Table 11). Twitter comes next after Facebook. While MySpace, Bebo and "Other"s like Linkedin, YouTube, Instagram, WhatsApp are used by parents with close rates, 44% of them choose not to exist in social media.

Table 11. Preferences of parents on social media

Social media preferences	Frequency	Valid percent (%)
Facebook	201	45,4
Twitter	13	2,9
MySpace	3	0,7
Bebo	2	0,5
Other	29	6,5
I am not on social media	195	44,0
Unstated	123	
Total	566	100

While 81,6% of parents using social media choose not to play games over this medium, 69,2% of those who prefer to play spend up to 1 hour and 26,9% spend up to 2 hours (Table 12).

Table 12. Time spent by parents playing social media games

Time spent playing on social media games	Frequency	Valid percent (%)
Up to 1 hour	72	69,2
Up to 2 hours	28	26,9
Up to 3 hours	3	2,9
Up to 5 hours	1	1,0
Those not playing	462	
Total	566	100

Parents who state that they play games on social media are found to play "backgammon" and "okey" most (Table 13). These games are followed by daily life games like "Farmville" and "Bizim Çiftlik". Next come sports games like football and F1 racing; mind games like chess and war games.

Table 13. Games mostly played on social media by parents

Mostly preferred games on social media	Frequency	Valid percent (%)
Backgammon - Okey	45	51,1
Daily life games	21	23,9
Sports games	11	12,5
Mind games	7	8,0
War games	4	4,5
Total	88	100

Parents indicated their reasons to pass time on social media as to pass time (%48,5) and entertainment (%39,8). Other reasons are competing with their friends, and getting frightened and worried under the category "Other" (Table 14). Therefore, it can be said that the fourth assumption stating that *"Parents who play games on the Internet play these games to pass time"* is verified.

Table 14. Parents' reasons for choosing social media to play games

Reasons for choosing social media to play games	Frequency	Valid percent (%)
To pass time	50	48,5
Enjoy oneself	41	39,8
Competing (with friends)	8	7,8
Other	4	3,9
Total	103	100

The parents who choose to play digital games with a high rate, find the friendships on the street much more sincere (95,9%) with respect to ones in digital environments (%95,9) and believe that digital environments are virtual and do not reflect reality (Table 15).

Table 15. Parents' preferences on game friendship

Game friendship preference	Frequency	Valid percent (%)
I find friendships in street games more sincere	444	82,8
I find friendships in digital games more sincere	17	3,2
The Internet, in which digital games are played, is virtual, I don't think it represents the reality	70	13,1
The Internet, in which digital games are played, is real, I have a faith in friendships there	5	0,9
Unstated	30	
Total	566	100

Particularly the third assumption stating that "*Parents prefer digital games to street games*" wasn't verified. This assumption has its origins in the idea that parents would direct their kids towards digital media games thinking that the streets are insecure now. Parents prefer the street games and friendships there with a very high rate.

Evaluation and Conclusion

The parents of primary schools students at 4th and 5th grades participating in the research have played street games with their

friends for so long hours in their childhoods. Today, the children of those who then played these traditional games spend a large amount of time playing these games even if their gaming preferences have changed a lot.

While the number of parents preferring street games is much higher than those preferring digital games, those who want to play both of these game types or just the digital games are at a really high rate.

It seems important that parent's time with their children online maybe playing games in order to prevent them from behaving in an uncontrolled way on the Internet and social media; and to maintain a system of control on their kids in order to take their hands off from those sites with negative and harmful content. Experts provide similar recommendations for the sake of communication inside the family. However, research results indicate that parents do not take their places on the Internet and social media and the significantly high rates prove that they don't want to change their attitudes.

Parents spending time in the social media mostly stay logged on to Facebook. Social media user parents prefer to play games over this medium. 51,1% of social media users play games like okay game or backgammon. Parents might seem to stick to experts' recommendations to be with their kids checking and monitoring them, however they indeed represent a bad sample to their kids playing such games on their online visits. All the same,

it is good to see that parents don't spend time on gambling and similar sites with immoral content.

Most of the parents today, 95,9% of them, prefer those friendships they had on the streets of their times to the digital friendships of today. In terms of game friendship, given the online fraudulences and abuses, perhaps the most sagacious attitude of parents would be to choose the friendships of their times. Still, the existence of a 4.1% of people finding online friendships sincere and secure might be a reflection of an optimist point of view and enthusiasm towards Internet and technology.

In conclusion, even if the parents participating in the research want to keep away from Internet and social media, it seems adversely inconvenient for them to leave their children alone in this arena let alone encouraging them. One of the most important responsibilities of today's parents is to raise their children in a healthy way from worldly and spiritual respect as the society needs such generations.

Today it is very important for each child to make use of online media facilities, however the fact that they can reach all kinds of negative content without boundaries makes it necessary that parents take their place in these environments with their children in a controlled way. As today's generation, who live in a digital world, complain about, the only way to understand, evaluate and communicate with them is to dominate this arena. It may only be possible to ensure communication inside family by this way.

References

Akgül, M. 1999. *İnternet Sunucu Araçları ve Yönetimi.* Ankara: Bilkent Üniversitesi Yayınları

Binark, M., Sütçü, G. B., & Buçakcı, F. 2009. Türkiye'de İnternet Kafelerde Dijital Oyuncular-Yeni Medya Okuryazarlığı Neden Gerekli. M. Binark, G. B. Sütçü, & I. B. Fidaner içinde, *Dijital Oyun Rehberi oyun tasarımı türler ve oyuncu* (s. 187-224). İstanbul: Kalkedon.

Çetinkaya, B. 2010. *Ruhsal Açıdan Sağlıklı Aile Sağlıklı Çocuk.* Ankara: Empati Yayınları.

Duran, Ş. 2013, April 16. *http://seymaduran.wordpress.com/2012/03/26/egitsel-oyun-nedir/.* http://seymaduran.wordpress.com/2012/03/26/egitsel-oyun-nedir/.

Eşsizer, Ö. 2013, April 24. http://www.onceanneyim.com/cocuklar-oyun-oynarken-ogrenmeyi-ogrenir.html.

Gencer, B. M. 2006. *Parents Dergisi Aralık Sayısı* , 50-62.

Güvenç, B. 1997. Çocuk ve Kültür. *Çocuk Kültürü, 1. Ulusal Çocuk Kültürü Kongresi Bildiriler Kitabı* (s.15-31). İçinde Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi Çocuk Kültürü Araştırma ve Uygulama Merkezi Yayınları NO:1

Hill, M., & Tisdall, K. 2007. *Children And Society.* London: Prentice Hall.

http://tdkterim.gov.tr. 2013, April 11.

http://tdkterim.gov.tr/?kelime=oyun&kategori= terim&hng=md.

http://bote.hacettepe.edu.tr. 2013, April 14. http://bote.hacettepe.edu.tr/wiki/index.php/Oyun_Tabanl%C4%B1_%C3%96%C4%9Frenme.

http://www.buyukturkcesozluk.net. 2013, April 11. http://www.buyukturkcesozluk.net/arama.php?kelime=.

http://www.makaleler.com. 2013, May 14. http://www.makaleler.com/aile-makaleleri/oyun-deyip-gecmeyin.htm

http://www.rtukcocuk.org.tr. 2013, June 4. http://www.rtukcocuk.org.tr/oyunlar.php.

http://www.sabah.com.tr. 2013, May 19. http://www.sabah.com.tr/Teknoloji/Haber/2012/01/27/facebookta-avrupa-lideriyiz.

M. Akdag&M. Cingi   *The Impact of Internet and Social Media on game habits*

http://www.sabah.com.tr/2. 2013, May 19.
http://www.sabah.com.tr/Teknoloji/Haber/2012/10/04/facebookun-nufusu-1-milyar.

http://www.webrazzi.com. 2013, June 7.
http://www.webrazzi.com/2013/06/07/turkiye-facebook-oyun-ve-uygulama-istatistikleri-haziran-2013/.

http://zynga.com. 2013, May 17. http://zynga.com/game/farmville-two

Livingstone, S. 2002. *Young People and New Media: Childhood and the Changing Media Environment.* London: Sage Publications Ltd.

MetricsMonk. 2013, June 10. http://sosyalmedya-tr.com/sosyalmedya/facebook-2/facebook-oyun-istatistikleri.html.

Odabaşı, F. 1999. İnternet Erişimi ve Çocuklar. *İletişim Ortamlarında Çocuk Birey Sempozyumu Bildiriler Kitabı* (s. 317-323). içinde Eskişehir: Anadolu Üniversitesi İletişim Bilimleri Fakültesi Yayınları.

Odabaşı,F. 2005. Parent's Views on Internet Use. *The Turkish Online Journal of Education Technology – TOJET, Volume 4, Issue 1, Article 5,* s.38-45

Odabaşı, F., Kabakçı, I.,& Çoklar, A.N. 2007. *İnternet, Çocuk ve Aile.* Ankara: Nobel Yayınları

Özsoy, O. 2010. *İnternetin Kararttığı Hayatlar.* İstanbul: Pozitif Yayınları.

Özyürek, A., & Şahin, F. T. 2010. Anne-Baba Olmak ve Anne Babaların Çocuk Yetiştirme Tutumları. T. Güler içinde, *Anne Baba Eğitimi* (s. 35-49). Ankara: Pegem Akademi Yayınları.

Peltekoğlu, F. B. 2012. Sosyal Medya Sosyal Değişim. T. Kara, & E. Özgen içinde, *Sosyal Medya / Akademi* (s. 3-9). İstanbul: Beta Ofset.

Sagem. 1998. *İnternet Kullanımı ve Aile Araştırması.* Ankara: Sagem - Başbakanlık Aile ve Sosyal Araştırmalar Genel Müdürlüğü.

Tarhan, N. 2011. *Aile Okulu.* İstanbul: Timaş Yayınları.

TDK 2013. *Türk Dil Kurumu Büyük Türkçe Sözlük.*
http://tdkterim.gov.tr/?kelime=oyun&kategori= terim&hng=md

Ülger, G. 2012. Siberalemde Çocukluğun Yeniden Üretimi. T. Kara, & E. ÖZGEN içinde, *Sosyal Medya / Akademi* (s. 285-329). İstanbul: Beta Yayınları.

The Western Balkans Geopolitics and Russian Energy Politics

Muhidin Mulalić
Mirsad Karić[*]

Abstract

The Energy politics is today at the center of the Russian and the Western Balkans relations. It is widely known that Russia has been playing significant role in world energy supply. Therefore, Russian energy companies have taken a leading role in the promotion of their businesses in the Western Balkans. The Western Balkans region has become geostrategic partner as a transit route for the integration of Russia into the global energy world market. With regards to the transportation of gas Western Balkans as a transit route is determined to fully realize *South Stream* project. In contrast to "a buffer zone" role, in the past few decades the Western Balkans gained an attention from Russia and became an important geopolitical bridge towards Western Europe. Such geopolitical and geostrategic planning of Russia is apparent with regards to gas and oil. Due to Russian *South Stream* gas pipeline project the Western Balkans became an important European energy transforming center. These new geostrategic games over the pipeline have also revived the Russian historical interests in the Balkans. This paper aims to analyze Russian-Western Balkans relations with special emphasis on energy politics and geopolitical and geostrategic interdependence of Russia and the Western Balkans.

Keywords: Russia; Western Balkans; Energy Politics; Geopolitics

[*] Corresponding authors: Muhidin Mulalić & Mirsad Karić, International University of Sarajevo, e-mail: mmulalic@ius.edu.ba, mkaric@ius.edu.ba

The Russian Foreign Policy

Foreign policy is often defined as the strategy of actions chosen and taken beyond the boundaries of the state to achieve certain goals and objectives in relations with other powers in the international system (Russett et. al., 2000, p. 117; Hudson, 2008, p. 12). Such relations are often conducted in very complex, dynamic and ever-changing domestic and international environments. This also contributes to the decision-making process, which results from the work of coalitions of interested domestic, regional and global or international actors and groups. In the light of this foreign policy definition it is obvious that the goal of each state in the international system is to protect and to promote its national interest in terms of country's security, autonomy, welfare, status and prestige.

Throughout the history Russia and the Western Balkans have been interconnected and interrelated. The Russian foreign policy towards the Western Balkans was marked throughout the history by the cultural and spiritual closeness. At times such relationship was exaggerated and used to get a mythological character. At the same time often the Slavic-Orthodox solidarity was rarely a deciding factor of Russian policy in the Western Balkans. Since the eighteenth century, the Russian involvement in the Balkans was largely based on a friendship. For instance, during the 1770s, Russia supported the Montenegrin uprisings against the Ottoman rule. Then, in the nineteenth century the national liberation movements of the Western Balkans gained

significant support on the ethnic and religious basis. The Russian foreign policy was greatly based on an idea of pan-Slavism. Actually pan-Slavism was used as a tool against the Ottomans by the Slavic and Orthodox nations in the Western Balkans (Levine, 1914, pp. 664-686). The Russian Empire fought for dominance in the Western Balkans and definitely had strategic interests in the region during the World Wars.

During the Cold War, and especially in the 1950s and 1960s, other great powers feared that the Soviet Union would surpass the United States as the world's leading power. The Soviet Union had the world's largest territory, third largest population and second largest economy and it produced more oil and gas than Saudi Arabia. It possessed nearly one-half the world's nuclear weapons, had more men under arms than the United States and had the highest number of people employed in research and development. In terms of soft power, during the period following the World War II the communist ideology was attractive in Europe because of its resistance to fascism and in the Third World because of its identification with the popular movement toward decolonization (Nye, 2011, pp. 168-169).

Due to the triumph of the West and the collapse of the Soviet Union, Russia significantly shrunken in territory (76% of the Soviet Union), population (50% of the Soviet Union), economy (45% of the Soviet Union) and military personnel (33% of the Soviet Union). Moreover, the soft power of the communist ideology virtually disappeared (Ibid., p. 169). Therefore, after the

fall of the Berlin Wall and the collapse of the communist system Russia has experienced the economic, social and political crisis. Such quick collapse had a strong influence on Russian foreign policy too. With the fall of communist regimes in Eastern Europe and the withdrawal of Soviet military forces Russian foreign policy had also diminished. There consequently followed the Western expansion to the post-communist East. In this regard, there was a tendency that Russia will seek ways of stabilizing internal situation without taking too much care about foreign policy and the world politics. Russia was preoccupied with its internal affairs, particularly with the consolidation and development of the country's economy. This so-called Romantic Period in the Russian foreign policy under Andrei Kozyrev was characterized by liberal internationalism that was even ideally seeking the unification with the West (Beom-Shih, 2009, pp. 1-24).

Not willing to renounce its imperialistic ambitions, Russia faced very big challenge such as establishment and self-creation of a new cultural, social, economic and political identity. As a result of this there has been a fundamental reassessment of the interests of Russia, basic goals of its foreign policy, the means of achieving these goals and the policy process (Beasley, et. al., 2002, p. 109). Therefore, different forces in Russia, beginning from Evgeny Primakov, began increasingly to seek Russian position in the world politics and more dynamic and realist foreign policy that will strengthen Russian interests. In this

context the main premise of Russian foreign policy as one of the most important tools to ensure steady development of a country and guarantee its competiveness in the globalizing world under any government has been based on a realistic assessment of the country's interest which has to ensure the national security, preserve and strengthen its sovereignty and territorial integrity and secure its high standing in the international community as one of the influential and competitive poles of the modern world. In 1999, with the coming of Vladimir Putin another strong change in Russian foreign policy began (Lo, 2002, 5-9). Since then Russian foreign policy and strategy were aimed at stabilization of Russian internal affairs, using of oil and gas as diplomatic tools and return of Russia as a great power. Actually, due to stunning economic growth Russia again began to challenge the United States in the global political arena. For instance, average per capita gross domestic product (GDP) in Russia has grown from $1,312 in 1999 to $8,842 in 2007 (Oliker, et. al., 2009, 1).

Geopolitics has been taken as the guiding principle for Russian foreign policy objectives and interests. For example, Russian new geopolitical approach towards so-called 'southern periphery of Russia' changed to 'the Russian sphere of interest'. Therefore, Russia started to position itself as returning power to the international arena but with different objective than in the past whereby ideology was replaced with the common interest. Russian geopolitical strategists, politicians and diplomats also began highlighting strategic and economic interest of Russia in

relation to neighboring countries that were previously part of the Soviet Union. Russia didn't do away with her superpower role, especially in her neighborhood. For instance, in order to prevent NATO expansion in the Balkans Russia also made a strategic partnership with Beijing based on the idea of multi-polar world (Selezneva, 10; Mankoff, 2009, 199). Then, shaping of new Russian foreign policy was greatly affected by world energy crisis. Due to world gas demand and its relatively high prices Russia managed to undertake significant economic stabilization. Actually Russia transformed itself into an energy superpower, which contributed to Moscow's much stronger international position and at the same time Moscow managed to rebuild the foundations of the national power by using energy revenues. Therefore, Russian foreign policy is greatly related to the domestic policy by strengthening economic resurgence and ensuring sustenance of the international prestige and the security interests (Mankoff, 2009, 31; Oliker, et. al., 2009, 6).

Geopolitics, Russia and the Western Balkans

According to Holdar (1992) the term geopolitics was coined in 1899 by Rudolf Kjellin, Swedish political scientist. Throughout the history this term has had various connotations. At the beginning of the 20th century term geopolitics was a useful word to describe the geographical base of the state, its natural endowment and resources, which many claimed determined its power potential. With Hitler's rise to power the term was

associated with expansionist Nazi foreign policy, and during the Cold War the word was used to describe the global contest between the Soviet Union and the United States for influence over the states and strategic resources of the world (Hanhimaki, 2004; Hepple, 1986, pp. 21-36). Furthermore, the Cold War scholars of international relations described that the main goal of geopolitics was the competitive zero-sum game played by nation-states in their pursuit of power and security. In such circumstances countries were primarily concerned about gains from trade, investment and military action relative to other national competitors. Greater territory and resources for one party necessarily crate a loss for others. However, since then the geopolitics has become a much broader concept referring to the influence of geographic, cultural, demographic, economic and technological factors on the political discourse among actors in the international sphere (Victor, et. al., 2006, pp. 4-5). Based on this it might be said that relative gains do matter but so do joint gains from interdependence which prevails in the world today and possible and necessary cooperation among the states.

In Russian foreign policy Balkans has been a significant area of a steady geostrategic interest. Thanks to the cultural, religious and political affiliations, the Western Balkans is the closest part of Russia towards Europe. On the other hand, this region has been actively used as a ground for the suppression of Turkish and European interests. After the First and Second World Wars the Balkans represented a clearly identified group of six

countries: Albania, Greece, Bulgaria, Romania, Yugoslavia and Turkey. During the Cold War the subsequent six countries were divided into so-called 2+2+2 groups. NATO members included Greece and Turkey, a member of the Warsaw Pact included Bulgaria and Romania and the non-aligned and independent blocs included Yugoslavia and Albania. After the fall of the Berlin Wall and the disintegration of Yugoslavia several new states were founded (Mitrovic, 2011, pp. 99-106).

After the end of the Cold War, Russia lost its military, economic, political, ideological and geostrategic importance in the world. Consequently, after being a major world power since the end of the WWII Russia was forced to accept a 'second class status' in the international system. However, a new scenario was unacceptable for Russia which tried to find a place in promoting its international status and reputation. Russian foreign policy decision-makers have realized that traditional military and political alliances cannot anymore protect against all the existing trans-border challenges and threats. Therefore, the bloc-based approach in addressing international issues has been gradually replaced by a 'multi-vector' foreign policy and 'network diplomacy' based on flexible participation and diversified approach towards every country in the international system in terms bilateral and economic relations. Russia's principal objectives in the area of international economic relations which are consistent with its priorities include strengthening its strategic partnership with major producers of energy resources while

actively promoting dialogue with consumers and transit countries, based on the assumption that measures to ensure the security of energy supplies should be consistently complemented with reciprocal measures to ensure stable energy demand and reliable transit. Imperialistic and hegemonic ideas of Russia have become very current again especially over the past decade as Russia's economic position significantly improved, inter alia through large revenues acquired from gas production. Rapid economic growth has encouraged further Russian investment overseas including the Balkans and increased Russia's confidence and activates on the international scene.

In Russian geopolitics the Western Balkans remains a link between Russia with Europe, whereby Russia has been taking advantage of this geopolitical and strategic relationship. More active engagement of the EU and the U.S. in the Western Balkans, as a result of the breakup of Yugoslavia, was seen by Russia as negative as these influences, according to Russians, affected the disintegration of Yugoslavia and the creation of independent state of Kosovo. With Slovenian and Croatian joining of the NATO the political and strategic interests of Russia were greatly limited. In both Slovenia and Croatia strong and organized Serbian minorities do not exist which greatly reduced a chance of Russia to built stronger pro-Russian policy based on Orthodoxy. Therefore, because of these limitations the main attention of Russian foreign policy has been directed towards Serbia, which is believed to be the only Eastern European ally. Russia used historical relationship

to keep Serbia outside NATO and in return Russia has been helping Serbia in the domain of economic, political and military aspects. Therefore, Serbia is considered as the headquarters of the Russian policy in the Balkans in tackling NATO member countries and the spreading of Turkish influence in the Western Balkans.

Russian foreign policy toward the Western Balkans is threefold. The first and most important instrument of the Russian presence in the region is "energy policy," which is coupled with the "identity politics" and "security policy." With the majority of countries in the region, Russia share common Slavic origin or Orthodox religion which stimulates dialogue in the humanitarian field and encourages mutual cooperation. Common traditional and cultural values again after the Soviet collapse became the foundation for dialogue at a high political level between Russia and the Western Balkans leaders (Lo, 2002, 15-17). Frequently, at meetings the heads of diplomatic missions from the Western Balkans use to acknowledge a special historical significance and spiritual-cultural heritage that unites Slavic nations and underscore the importance of their mutual cooperation in the new world order. Russia and the Western Balkans have been searching a way for mutual economic and political cooperation. Russia and the Western Balkans states must re-develop their own strategic and political interests and emphasize on modernization and sustainable development. The third pillar of Russia's involvement in the Western Balkans is a "security policy." Russia is a

permanent member of the UN Security Council, which has been involved in a major security issues, especially related to the Western Balkans. This policy is often seen as a continuation of "identity politics" in the sense of solidarity with the Serbs. In addition to these three dimensions, the Western Balkans has the potential for trade, economic and military cooperation with Russia, taking into account the traditional ties that bind Russia and the Western Balkans states. Russian President Putin made it clear that

> "the [gas] pipelines are our legacy from the Soviet Union. We intend to retain state control over the gas transportation system and over Gazprom. We are not going to divide Gazprom. The European Commission had better forget about its illusions. As far as the gas is concerned, they will have to deal with the Russian state" (Rosner, 2006, p. 1).

There are three "pillars" of Russian influence in the Western Balkans. Russia has privileged position as a permanent member of the UN Security Council and blocks all processes run by the United Nations in the Balkans if they oppose Russian political interests and objectives. Then, Russia has the historical, cultural and political relationship with the Balkans there is the growing economic importance of Russia for the Balkans nations. Russian veto has its utility value in organizations such as the OSCE and Russian voice has great significance in other international bodies. The three pillars of Russian influences are most evident in Serbia. Russian privileged position in the UN Security Council brings Russia political capital in bilateral

political relations between her country and the Western Balkans. Then, Russian historical, cultural and political relationship with the Balkans increased the understanding of Russia's priorities in international relations. Sometimes, as in the case of Serbia, Russian electorate request cooperation with Russia, because of the historical and cultural relations.

Russian Energy and Foreign Policy

Energy has become an integral part of the foreign policy agenda as it guarantees national security. States now desire energy security in the same sense that they desire military and economic security. Therefore, according to Kalicki (2005) energy security may be understood as "assurance of the ability to access the energy resources required for the continued development of national power… and adequate infrastructure to deliver these supplies to market" (p. 9). Following this definition it seems that energy security means different things to different actors in international relations. For the majority of importer states, energy security means security of supply, in which the consistent delivery of affordable energy sources is vital. On the other hand, for exporter states such as Russia, security of demand requires access to a developed and reliable market for the long-term sale of energy products. Following this, states have economic and political concerns. Former concerns are related to maintaining supply and demand between exporters and importers respectively in order to minimize any energy disruption or shortages on the

premises that such energy shocks might undermine their economic wellbeing. Political concerns are more about the potential leverage exercised by exporter states over both final consumer and transit states due simply to their dominant position as energy suppliers (Hadfield, 2008, pp. 323-324). So as to avoid having problems and obstructions in delivering the energy to the final destination, exporter countries look for various options to minimize the monopoly of countries across whose territory energy is transported. This has been very obvious since the dissolution of the Soviet Union which was of crucial importance in realizing the potential of energy in one country's foreign policy.

Russia's "geopolitics of gas" has both, economic and political implications. Yes, it brings more investment and extra revenues to the countries involved but it also requires actions of governments, investors and other key actors who decide on the routes to be followed, projects to be built, how the gains will be allocated and how the risks of dependence on international gas trading will be managed. It is widely known that almost half of Russian GDP, two-thirds of export profits and half of government revenues comes from the energy sector. Energy companies have become the center of the promotion of Russian business in the Balkans and allow Russia to maintain a position in the foreign trade. Energy interests also define a platform for politicians and policy allowing the Russian energy business to benefit.

The main goal of Russian foreign energy policy is formulated in the *Energy Strategy of Russia for the Period till*

2030. Russia aims at a maximum efficient use of Russian energy potential for full integration into the global energy market and strengthening its position in achieving the highest possible benefits for the national economy. In this regard, the Balkan region has become a strategy for Russian integration into the global energy market, which is an important transit route and significant market. As a transit route Balkans is the final phase of the Russian supplies of oil and gas. Russia is interested to continue negotiations on the sale of gas and the use of transport options to the Balkans. Russian gas sales to the Balkans are dominated by "Gazprom." Russia is a leading player in total exports, resulting in a share of more than 95 % in some Balkan countries that are dependent on Russian supplies. Russian companies are determined to increase gas exports to the Balkans and there are plans to develop the gas network in Macedonia and expand a gas pipeline to Albania, southern Serbia and Kosovo. Therefore, "Russia is determined to exercise, through political and economic means, a sphere of influence in its "Near Abroad," especially by manipulating energy supplies and prices" (Oliker, et. al., 2009, 5).

As for the sale of oil, Russia's presence in the Balkans is primarily made through Russian giant 'Lukoil'. As far as transport options, primarily for transport of gas, transit potential Balkans intended to be used throughout the project *South Stream* pipeline 900 km long, that needs to open in 2015. This pipeline will connect Russia to the Balkans, where the route is then split north

to Austria and south to Italy. This project has so far joined Austria, Croatia, Italy, Slovenia, Bulgaria, Serbia, Hungary, Greece and Turkey. Connection deliberately bypasses Ukraine to avoid repetition of disputes over gas supplies that prevented the Russian delivery to Europe in the last four years. In the case of oil, Russia has proposed the pipeline, which transported the Russian and Caspian oil from the Bulgarian Black Sea port to Greece bypassing the Bosphorus and the Dardanelles. However, Bulgaria has recently rejected the project on environmental grounds after a referendum held in the region through which the pipeline would run, which is the perspective of the project remains unclear. Russia is also interested to build underground reservoirs of gas in a number of Balkan countries. The electricity sector is another area in which Russia looks for cooperation. One of the most important projects in this field is the synchronization of the energy systems of Western, Central and Southern Europe with the energy systems of the former Soviet Union and the Baltic states.

There is a growing involvement of Russia in the European integration process of the Balkans countries, whereby Russia bases her relations on cooperation with the European Union. Russian energy policy is in convergence with EU policies in this area because all the Balkan countries, either through membership in the EU or through the signing of the Stabilization and Association Agreement follow EU energy regulations. Due to

such cooperation with the Balkan countries Russia de facto becomes integrated into the EU internal energy market.

The Balkans and Russian Energy

Since the end of the Cold War the Balkans has been undergoing uncertain transition which created a source of regional instability. Hence, the Balkan countries had to look for a new political framework which will provide peace, create new security architecture and bring economic prosperity to the region. In such political turmoil, interests of the countries in the region have been interwoven with the goals and objectives of the major powers, mainly the EU and the United States. However, gradual decline of the USA leadership in the Balkans and financial crisis that affected the EU for the last few years created a political vacuum which has been exploited by other active powers such as Turkey, China and even Israel, but above all Russia.

Among all big powers in the world, only Russia does not need to import important energy sources such as oil and gas. At the moment and in the coming twenty years it has enough energy for its domestic consumption and to export too. On the other hand US has to import more than half of its oil consumption and some amount of gas; EU, from its own resources currently covers only about 25% of oil and just over half of gas needs. By the year 2030, countries that make the EU today will be able to cover just 20% and 40% of oil and gas needs respectively. Russia is able to export more than two thirds of its oil production and in the case of

gas capacities are very significant as well (Petrovic, 2013, pp. 8-11). Since the dissolution of former Soviet Union Russia has remained a superpower in the field of gas and other natural resources available in Russia today.

For sometime Moscow has tried to convert the Balkan region into a strategic hub and a preferential entry point to the Western economic zone. In such undertakings Russia has always had zero-sum equations in its approach towards the Balkans and especially after the NATO and EU enlargement eastward, unresolved the Kosovo crisis and the permanent post-Dayton instability in Bosnia and Herzegovina. This policy has been driven by *kto kogo* (who wins over who) style resulting in the fact that "for every winner there must be a loser" (Lo, 2002). Moscow has seen the Balkans as its predominant sphere of influence and the buffer zone where the Russian economic and geopolitical interests have to be given priority over the EU and USA.

Russia's main goal in the Balkans has been to provide stability, security and peace as conflicts and wars in the Balkans have not brought any good to Russia throughout the history. On the contrary, conflict in the Balkans has always been something bad for Russia. Last wars after the dissolution of Yugoslavia showed that Russia could not have a significant influence on the aftermath of those wars since USA and NATO prevailed at the end. Therefore, Russia is ready to use all capacities at its disposal to preserve the ideas of sovereignty, to get prevent the spread of the

Western ideas that have prevailed in the West since 1991 that it is legitimate to use force to solve international problems, the most specifically to solve domestic problems in the countries concerned. What is nonetheless important for Russia in the Balkans is obviously energy aspect. Hence, Russia has been investing in the infrastructure of some Balkan countries which have the role of providing a route for Russian gas to get to Western Europe.

Serbia has been Russian strategic partner in the Balkans throughout the history. Hence, since the dissolution of the former Yugoslavia the key issue in Serbian politics has been whether to be closer to the West or Russia. Almost all political parties in Serbia and people of all backgrounds have faced this dilemma. Since the end of the Cold War Russian political elites have tried to facilitate its relations with Serbia and thus to attract Serbian political elites and people to accept Russia as their strategic partner which is of crucial importance in Serbia's regional and international relations (Halilovic, 2012, pp. 195-197). Thus, in 2009 Serbia and Russia signed the visa-free regime which envisaged that citizens from one country may enter the territory of the other one and stay there for one month.

Serbia has always been enjoying a strong Russian support and on the other hand Serbia has shown among all the Eastern European countries signs of friendship to Russia. Besides historical ties, Orthodoxy and economic relations Russia is actually trying to stop the penetration of NATO in the Balkans by

using Serbia as a proxy power. Serbia has thus played a significant role in an international setting of new Russian foreign policy. Russia is quite aware of the value of Serbia in the Balkans as a country with a bad experience with NATO. Serbia also has been dealing with the problems related to Kosovo independence. Due to these problems Russia could strongly count on Serbia as its strong and long-term ally. Then, Russian policy is consistent against the recognition of Kosovo's independence, which was forcefully separated and took a legitimate part of Serbian territory. Russia along with China is able to block the UN Security Council and the admission of Kosovo into worldwide international organizations. In the case of Russian-American relations Serbia and Kosovo could be traded in for much higher Russian strategic goals. In the case of NATO, Serbia wants to be a neutral country as to count on Russian support. On the economic front, Russia seeks to use its position in the Serbian capital. Russian gas and oil are important energy which is supplied to Serbia. For instance, a controversial agreement was signed between Gazprom Neft and the Oil Industry of Serbia (NIS) for a price that many in Belgrade considered too low and many consider it as some kind of debt to Russia for the support for Kosovo (Oldberg, 2010, p. 52).

Pipeline systems that carry out expensive fuels to consumers are certainly very important and their network is being updated constantly. Thus, the construction of *South Stream* gas pipeline which implies investment of approximately EURO 1.925 billion to Serbia will make the Balkans in general and Serbia in

particular a regional energy hub. According to the Serbian Prime Minister Ivica Dacic, the beginning of construction of *South Stream* pipeline is one of the most valuable investments in Serbia in recent decades. This project, which is considered to be the Gazprom biggest project in Europe, is of special importance for the Serbian geopolitical position in international politics, geopolitical concerns and energy security. Consequently, it gives Serbia a status of an important factor not only in the Balkan region but in the whole of Europe. Therefore, construction of the South Stream pipeline brings multiple benefits of exceptional importance for Serbia.

Conclusion

In Russian foreign policy, the Western Balkans has been seen as a natural and traditional sphere of Russian influence. Unlike with other parts of Eastern Europe, where historical and cultural ties were much weaker, the Western Balkans is perceived as an area where there is Orthodoxy as one of the most important links. Then, there is a common Russian and the Balkans historical struggle against different influences. There is also a close geographic proximity, which allows the realization of common economic projects. Therefore, Russia has been making significant efforts throughout history to keep influence on the Western Balkans.

Russian influence in the Western Balkans and the growing economic importance of Russia, which is reflected both in the

energy sector as well as increasing investment and trade potential of Russia in the Western Balkans, enable Russia, through the peculiar bilateral negotiations, to achieve favorable arrangements for their national companies. Russia has taken an active role in a variety of industries in the Western Balkans. Apart from the energy sector, Russian economic and investment interests were directed towards metallurgy, chemical and petrochemical industry as well as agriculture and military sectors. Some Western Balkan companies made joint ventures with Russian companies mainly in industries like pharmaceuticals, food, and light industry, machine and construction industry.

South Stream pipeline provides safe, continuous and uninterrupted supply of gas what is very important taking into consideration interruption and restriction in the distribution of Russian gas for several times in the last few years. With this pipeline Serbia gains additional importance in international politics, as it would cease to be the only receiver of energy via pipelines from other countries, and becomes one of the very transit states of this energy source to the Central and Western Europe. Besides Serbia, one offshoot of the pipeline goes to Bosnia and Herzegovina, entity of Republic of Srpska. This further strengthens the entity of Republic of Srpska, its relations with Serbia and Russia. Construction of this pipeline consolidates the position and role of Russia in the whole Balkan region especially towards Serbia as its long-time ally in international affairs. In relation to Bosnia and Herzegovina, Russian policy is

quite clear helping by all means the Republic of Serbs and entering the plea for its existence, and at the same time helping Belgrade in order to retain the belief that the Serbian territories are preserved in Bosnia and Herzegovina with strong autonomy and a possibility of succession. This approach enables Russia to have a direct control of all processes taking place in the Western Balkan countries and indirect impact on the EU and NATO policies with regards to their possible expansion in the region.

References

Beasley, K. Ryan, et.al. (Eds). 2002. *Foreign Policy in Comparative Perspectives: Domestic and International Influences on State Behavior*, Washington: CQ Press.

Beom-Shih, Shih. 2009. "Russia's Perspectives on International Politics A Comparison of Liberalist, Realist and Geopolitical Paradigms." *Acta Slavica Laponica*. No. 26. pp. 1-24

Hadfield, Amelia. 2008. "Energy and Foreign Policy: EU-Russia Energy Dynamic." In Steve Smith, et. al. (Eds). *Foreign Policy: Theories, Actors, Cases*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Hanhimaki J. 2004. *The Flawed Architect: Henry Kissinger and American Foreign Policy*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Halilovic, Enver. 2012. *Postsovjetski geopoliticki prostor i Balkan*. Sarajevo: Dobra Knjiga.

Hepple, L. 1986. "The Revival of Geopolitics." *Political Geography Quarterly.* 1986, Vol. 5, pp. 21-36.

Holdar S. 1992. "The Ideal State and the Power of Geography: The Life-Work of Rudolph Kjellen." *Political Geography.* Vol. 11, pp. 307-324.

Hudson, M. Valerie. 2008. "The History and Evolution of Foreign Policy Analysis." In Steve Smith, et. al. (Eds). *Foreign Policy: Theories, Actors and Cases.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Kalicki J. H. and Goldwyn D. A. 2005. *Energy and Security: Towards a New Foreign Policy Strategy*. Washington: Woodrow Wilson Centre Press.

Levine Louis. 1914. "Pan-Slavism and European Politics." *Political Science Quarterly.* Vol. 29, pp. 664-686

Lo Bobo. 2002. *Russian Foreign Policy in the Post-Soviet Era*: *Reality, Illusion and Mythmaking*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Mankoff, Jeffrey. 2009. *Russian Foreign Policy: The Return of Great Power Politics*. New York: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers.

Mitrovic, R. Ljubisa. 2011. "The Geopolitics in the Balkans in the 19th and 20th Centuries." *Law and Politics.* Vol. 9, pp. 99-107.

Oldberg Ingmar. 2010. "Aims and Means in Russian Foreign Policy." In Kanet E. Roger, (Ed). *Russian Foreign Policy in the 21st Century*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Oliker Olga, et. al., (Eds). 2009. *Russian Foreign Policy: Sources and Implications*. Pittsburgh: Rand Corporation.

Petrovic Dragan. 2013. "Napad na srspko-ruski energetski sporazum." [Attack on Serbian-Russian Energy Agreement]. *Geopolitika*. Vol. 67, pp. 8-11.

Rosner Kevin. 2006. *Gazprom and the Russian State*. London: GMB Publishing Ltd.

Russett Bruce, et. al. 2008. "*World Politics: The Menu for Choice."* In Laura Neack. *The New Foreign Policy: Power Seeking in a Globalized Era* (2nd ed.), Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield Publisher.

Selezneva Ludmilla. 2003. "Post-Soviet Russian Foreign Policy: Between Doctrine and Pragmatism." In Rick Fawn (Ed). *Realignments in Russian Foreign Policy*. London: Frank Cass.

Victor, G. David, et. al. (Eds). 2006. *Natural Gas and Geopolitics from 1974 to 2040.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Transit Migration in North Cyprus (TRNC)

Yılmaz Çolak[*]
H. Hüseyin Tekin[*]
Recai Aydin[*]

Abstract

This study aims at exploring the flows of transit migration to North Cyprus by type: whether or not it is labour, refugee or asylum. To determine that, the question of which push factors lay behind transit migration in the origin country tries to be answered. Also this study seeks to analyze origins, routes and destinations of transit migrants in TRNC from 2004 to 2008. In addition, the paper analyzes what kind of measures TRNC government was taking to deal with illegal transit migrants, human trafficking and smuggling through its borders, and how non-state institutions in TRNC considered and dealt with transit migrants and especially refugees.

Keywords: Illegal Migration; Refugees; Asylum Seekers; Human Trafficking and Smuggling.

[*] Yılmaz Çolak, Faculty of Security Studies, Turkish National Police Academy;
[*] H. Hüseyin Tekin, Faculty of Security Studies, Turkish National Police Academy;
[*] Recai Aydin, Faculty of Security Studies, Turkish National Police Academy; e-mail:raydin77027@yahoo.com

Introduction

The Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus (TRNC) has been attracting the flow of transit migrants in recent times. Since 2004 the number of those transit migrants has increased in a relatively massive scale. The last wave of migration in its nature is a totally new form. In the past, majority of migrants came from Turkey, Great Britain and Bulgaria to North Cyprus and some Turkish Cypriots migrated to other countries, following the partition of the island in 1974 Turkish intervention. However the situation is rather different today. By 2004, when the Republic of Cyprus (RoC) joined to the European Union, the Green Line, cease-fire line that separates the island into two parts (RoC and TRNC), began to serve as the border of EU. Thus, the existing status of North Cyprus makes it one of the most favourite routes for irregular transit migrants. This fact finds its clear expression in the words of Baldwin-Edwards (2005) "For the new EU members, such as Malta and Cyprus, inclusion in the EU regime has made them attractive for illegal migrants and/or asylum-seekers not so much in their own right, but as transit stages to northern Europe." TRNC became a transit country where people from many countries try to migrate to EU countries, first to the RoC, illegally as labour migrants, refugee or asylum seekers (İçduygu, 2005, p. 2). Since 2000 TRNC has received many "illegal" transit migrants from Syria, Iraq, Iran, Georgia and other Asian and African countries.

This study aims at exploring the flows of (irregular) transit migration to North Cyprus by type: whether or not it is labour, refugee or asylum. To determine that, the question of which push factors lay behind transit migration in the origin country tries to be answered. In parallel to that, this study seeks to analyze origins, routes and destinations of transit migrants in TRNC from 2004 to 2008. Moreover, it tries to analyze what kind of measures TRNC government was taking to deal with illegal transit migrants, human trafficking and smuggling through its borders, and how non-state institutions (United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) and human rights organization) in TRNC considered and dealt with transit migrants and especially refugees. And then it is argued that TRNC government had a several difficulties in combating and handling the problems aroused from illegal, transit migration because of its internationally unrecognized position.

Migration, Illegal Migration, Transit Migration

Migration can simply be defined as people's act of leaving their homeland for another location with a specific purpose. In other words, an individual or a community travels from one region, state or country to another one. In this context migration requires experiencing a life style that is intensified by horizontal mobility. Migration can be the result of natural, political, social or economic conditions. The geographical events, need for a shelter and security concerns might also trigger people`s willingness to

move. In the early centuries, it was generally the result of people`s need for food, settlement and security which forced them to move from one region to another. Towards the beginning of and during the twentieth century the world witnessed huge migration waves where hundreds of thousands of people moved and immigrated into new regions due to great wars, annexations, political disturbances and search for a better life. This trend accelerated with the establishment of nation states. Consequently, this led to acceleration of the legal establishment and institutionalization of border and passport controls.

Western social scientists came up with some explanations for this trend and specified push and pull factors of migration, based on their observation and research in their local communities and historical experience. In this sense there is a common consensus that people`s economic, social, political issues and inability to meet their primary needs within their geographical area, and the absence of optimism to overcome these issues in the near future can be considered as a push factor. On the other hand, when existing problems make their life uncomfortable, these factors drag people away from their place of residence to a new region where they find a hope for living in freedom and better conditions. These positive features are known as pull factors of migration (Kushner & K. Knox, 2001, p. 1).

The immigrants who leave their countries with the fear that they might be the victims of cruelty often are put in the same category with the people who immigrate to find a new job, or to

get a proper education or to gather with their families. Although they had been practiced for centuries, the terms asylum seeker and refugee gained an institutional framework only in 1919 with the establishment of League of Nations. According to *Dünya Mültecilerinin Durumu* (2001) by 20th century there were around 150 million immigrants who went from their home states for other countries. This number was equivalent to 2.5 percent of world population by then. And around 10 percent of this 150 million people were refugees.

United Nations defines refugee as someone who has well-founded fear of torture and/or persecution in his state due to civil conflict or armed rivalry, hence with a legitimate fear of danger he asks for refuge from another state (BMMYK, 1997). The term `asylum seeker` is used in English to define the status of one who seeks for refuge. Person is considered to be an asylum seeker if he or she faces a threat or violation of his/her rights in his/her basic living conditions and from an official authority or state institution, and if he/she is left without the protection of his/her state and seeks to be settled up in another country.

In general, asylum seekers might face some difficulties until the process is over. Especially when the process of granting full refugee status becomes too long the situation gets too deterrent. Under state law, rights of asylum seekers are much limited compared to refugees. In some cases, there is overlapping of domestic and international law on refugees, and this leads to misunderstanding and misinterpretation regarding the rights of

asylum seekers. Because under this category, there are wide range of people whose application for refugee status is about to be completed, those whose application will be rejected, and those who will not be granted a refugee status but can still reside in the host country for a limited time. To overcome this complex situation UNHCR receives applications and until given a final verdict all asylum seekers are identified as `presumptive refugees`. Under the protection of these statues, people exercise the right of nonrefoulment which forbids states from returning asylum seekers to the regions where they will be subjected to persecution and torture again. Asylum seekers live under this protection until they receive a final decision. (Hein, 1993, pp. 43-44).

The term refugee is used for someone who applies for UNHCR to be granted official refuge, and whose application is considered by `Status Determination Unit` and approved after all the interviews and investigation. After the aproval of refugee`s application by UNHCR there is second round of interview for financial support. Unless the second interview ends with the conclusion that refugee is in financial need, certain amount of income is provided for her/him. Definitions we refer ti in this work have a clear legal framework for government authorities. However, for social scientist it is not possible to say how they came to a consesnus about the right definition of these words. Sociologist Hein, who is well known for his studies about

refugees, linked refugees to economic reasons and asylum seekers to political dimensions (Ibid.,).

Usually it is not easy to differentiate between asylum seekers and refugees on the bases of political and economic reasons. Similarly, it is not so easy to differentiate between immigrant, asylum seeker and refugee from one another with clear distinctions. Hence, these words and definitions are often used by social scientists interchangeably (Hacket, 1996, p. 9). Using immigrant, refugee and asylum seeker interchangeably and analyzing all three categories under the concept of refugee leads to this common conclusion: "Refugee is someone who was forced to leave his hometown and bear some threats in order to live in a safe region". Another definition stated that "Refugees are often considered as people who lost their home, family connections, friendships, social environments and financial assistances" (Williams, 1993, p. 135).

The economical and political reasons together with conditions of the 20th Century brought about new grievances for people to abandon their own countries. Under this circumstance the difference between economic immigrant and political refugee becomes more blurry. What makes this distinction even harder is the fact that all around the world political and economic conditions are interpenetrated and governments` perception of migration and refuge fully relies on political terms.

There are no concrete differences among the migrants, refugees and illegal migrants. A person can request the status of

asylum seeker due to outrage of his very primary rights and security concerns and meanwhile grant residency and work permit hence granting the status of a refugee. On the other hand an immigrant who settled in the country in a legal way might lose his rights due to breaking some rules or expiration of the time. This person can stay in the country by illegal means (Angenendt and Edward, 2002).

Illegal immigrants often arrive in the host country by migrant smuggling and human trafficking and pay huge amounts to people who organized the delivery. Throughout the journey they bear the risk of being deported, being a part of an international crime and being sent to the court. They cannot carry any official document for identification. They destroy all the identification documents in order not to be identified. The smugglers organize all the process and make sure it will go smoothly. Very often fake passports and visa are used; the journey may last months since they pass through several states. Due to the difficulties and possible problems that can be faced at the border passing's, the illegal human smuggling organizations also arrange the accommodation at the borders (Ibid, p. 11).

National and international migration laws determine the legal or illegal status of a migrant. For any given legislation the number of illegal migrants depends on the social-political and economic conditions of the sending countries and on the organizations which favor frontier transit, but also on push-pull forces in the host countries. This note elaborates on why

employers decide to use irregular workers – be they locals or foreign nationals; why workers decide to reside illegally in another country; why institutions enforce the law; and last but not least how society pushes institutional action or enforces legislation directly. Without social enforcement it is very costly to institutionally enforce a law which limits employment and income access to legal workers in societies where irregular employment is common practice (Venturini, 2009).

A second way of answering the question would be to focus on the sheer number of forced migrants in the world today, which has been estimated at between 100 and 200 million (Castles, 2003, p. 15). This phenomenon is a product of wider processes of social and economic change, processes that are normally referred to as 'globalisation' and which appear to be creating an ever increasing North-South divide in living standards, human security, and access to justice and human rights protection. It follows that forced migration, including the 'migration industry' of people trafficking and smuggling, can provide a kind of window on these processes, a way of examining and understanding them (Turton, 2003).

My main point in this section is that the distinctions we make within the wider category of forced migrants are an artifact of policy concerns rather than of empirical observation and scientific enquiry. It would be interesting to know exactly when the term forced migrant itself first entered into use in policy and academic circles, but this must have been fairly recently. For it

must have been a response to the narrowing down of the range of attribution of the term refugee to a legally defined category through the 1951 Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees and its 1967 Protocol. It then became necessary to treat the term 'refugee' which, in the language of everyday speech can mean anyone who has been forced to leave his or her home, as the name of a much narrower category of people, with special rights in international law and with a special call on the assistance of the international community. The term 'forced migrant' therefore came into existence as the name of the wider class, from which the legal category of 'refugee' had been 'extracted'.

When creating a legal category, of course, it is very important to be clear about its limits, about the membership criteria to be used. The refugee definition provided in the 1951 Convention relating to the Status of Refugees and its 1967 Protocol is, of course, the main standard of refugee status today. This definition provides two main criteria: persecution and 'alienage'. The refugee is a person who has crossed an international border because of a well-founded fear of being persecuted' in his or her state of origin (ibid.,).

Then you have the new category of 'asylum seekers', people who have made a claim for asylum but whose cases have not yet been determined. This category has emerged in response to the growing difficulty of making clear distinctions between people who are moving for political as opposed to economic reasons, since political upheavals go hand in hand with violent

conflict, economic distress and human rights abuses. Asylum seekers are, not surprisingly, found mainly in Northern countries, where they are assumed by governments and public alike to be economic migrants using the asylum procedure to circumvent immigration controls. When the number of asylum applications in W Europe began to rise in the early 1980s, partly no doubt because of the closing down of the migration channel, the immediate response of states was to introduce so-called 'restrictive asylum practices' - visa restrictions, carrier sanctions, safe third country and safe country of origin concepts, narrower interpretations of the 1951 Convention. These restrictions were successfully evaded by a large numbers of migrants using transnational social networks, new transport and communication technologies and people smugglers. It does not, of course, mean that asylum seekers are not 'genuine' just because they use migrant networks to make their way into Western Europe, nor because they make use of the services of people smugglers. What it does mean is that it has become increasingly difficult, in practice, to separate out refugees from economic migrants, and yet such a separation is seen by governments as an essential condition of an effective asylum and immigration policy. Nor is this just a European issue. The Afghan refugee crisis of the past twenty years, for example, has been superimposed on a history of seasonal economic migration, within the Central Asian region and beyond, going back hundreds of years (Ibid., pp. 52-53).

A Profile of Transit Migrants in TRNC

The issue of transit (illegal) migration is totally a new phenomenon for North Cyprus. For TRNC police record, transit migrants began to been seen since 2000. According to UNHCR Report by that time TRNC became one of the preferred routes for those, form Middle Eastern, African and Asian countries, who want to go to one of EU countries in an illegal way. Especially Syrian illegal migrants are using North Cyprus to pass to the RoC, due to geographical closeness. There is also some significant number of Iraqi and Palestinian transit migrants who might be considered as refugees.

For the TRNC Police Department (TRNC-PD), the total number of the migrants who have entered to TRNC in illegal ways and been arrested since 2000 is 1273. It is important to note here that there is a noteworthy increase in the number of detained illegal migrants by 2003. Since then 1107 transit (illegal) migrants have been detained; among them 99 migrants came in 2003; 163 in 2004; 111 in 2005; 289 in 2006; 362 in 2007; 83 in 2008. It is clear that there are two main reasons behind this increase. First, the TRNC authorities unexpectedly opened up the Green Line for border crossing in April 23, 2003, which has also an obvious impact on the Cyprus Question entering in a new unalterable process (Frantz, 2002). After lifting the ban on free-crossing a lot of Greek and Turkish Cypriots have crossed the line between the north and the south. Such free-crossing also makes human traffickers' job easy, starting to effectively use the gates to transfer illegal migrants. Second, the RoC became one of 25

members of the EU in May 2004. This makes the Green Line a *de facto* external border of the EU. As a result it became an attractive route for human traffickers to maintain illegal migration across the Green Line. In the increase of human trafficking across the Green Line, the attitudes of the RoC authorities have a greatest part. As reported in daily *Cyprus Mail*, "with the opening of the checkpoints in 2003, the government refused to establish anything that might resemble border posts, with scant controls on traffic at the checkpoints. Five years, on, officials remain housed in prefabs, and most of those crossing simply walk through unhindered, with no identity control whatsoever."

Syrian origin-illegal migrants constitute a large bulk of the transit migration in TRNC. The total number of Syrians been arrested since 2000 is 847, which drastically increased in recent years. Almost two-third of these transit migrants came in last two years and all of illegal migrants, 83, detained in 2008 have Syrian origin. We can easily call these Syrian migrants as labour migrants, due to the fact that the majority of these migrants have not applied for being considered as refugee and wanted to go back to their country. There are also some labour migrants from Iraq, Iran, Palestine and Georgia.

Iraqi transit migrants constitute the second largest group with detained 295 illegal migrants. When we look at their arrival time, three-fourth of them came in between 2000 and 2002. Here one can make a speculation that they escaped from Iraq which was under the threat of US invasion after September 11. Other

arrived in and detained by TRNC authorities in 2007. The significant majority of these migrants are asylum seekers or refugees. Together with them, Palestinian illegal migrants, whose number is 20, are also refugees. These Iraqi and Palestinian refugees usually start their journey from their country origin and come to North Cyprus *via* Syria and Turkey. And then they tried to cross to the south (www.unhcr.org.tr/MEP/FTP). Most of these refugees said that they escaped from civil skirmishes, widespread violence, war, and authoritarian rule and their life was under the threat (www.starkibris.net/index.asp).

Other nationals, comprising just 10 percentages of the total number of detained illegal migrants, include 44 Georgians, 17 Iranians, 15 Afghans, 10 Bangladeshis, 8 Lebanese, 7 Pakistanis, 4 Egyptians, 2 Jordanians, 2 Senegalese, 1 Mongolian and 1 Lithuanian. Almost all of these illegal migrants were arrested after 2003. Majority of them seem to fall into the category of labour migrants.

According to TRNC-PD's record and *Star Kıbrıs*, (2008), when one looks at the nature of transit migrants in terms of age, it is obvious that young people constitute majority. 52.2 percentages of 362 transit migrants detained in 2007 are ages between 21 and 30; 20.7 percentages of those are less than 21. Another major group is ages between 31 and 40, constituting 19.9 percentages; and just only almost 7 percentages are over 41. It is important to mention that more than one-fifth of transit migrants are less than 20 years

old. These figures show that there are many too young migrants; and also, it means that there are many children coming with their parents. But, when we consider the issue of gender, among detained illegal migrants, there are few women migrants who usually accompany their husbands.

When we analyze the news appearing in newspapers on the stories of illegal migrants, we discover the fact that the most favourite destination points are the member states of the EU. First they tried to go to South Cyprus and then the majority of them want to pass to one of other EU countries. Besides that, other major target countries for final destination are Australia, Canada and Scandinavian countries.

Besides these detained illegal migrants, it is also estimated that many illegal transit migrants crossed to the south in one way. Among them there are many transit migrants who enter to TRNC in a legal way as tourists and cross to South Cyprus in illegal ways. On this issue, Kıvanç Aktuğ, director of UNHCR's Human Relief Mission in the north, said that in 2006, 441 Syrians and 272 Iraqis came to North Cyprus and applied to the Mission for asylum; among them 17 Syrians and 13 Iraqis went back to their countries with their desire, but, after the Mission's rehabilitation of them, their majority crossed to the south with their efforts without informing them. Those 86 of Iraqis who were arrested while they were crossing over the Green Line were taken back from the Turkish Cypriot police and helped them, but later all of them crossed to the south again (*Star Kıbrıs*, 2008).

Routes of Transit Migrants and Particular Cases

There are four main routes human traffickers use in carrying illegal transit migrants. The first main route is from Turkey's southern provinces to North Cyprus. Here human traffickers use Turkey as a transit country to come North Cyprus and then cross over it to go to South Cyprus and then one of EU countries. In this route, Mersin, Adana ve Hatay are the favourite places to come to TRNC north-east coastline, especially Karpaz peninsula. Usually human traffickers use rented fishing boats to carry transit migrants to North Cyprus. Local collaborators take these migrants and travel throughout TRNC and help them crossing over the Green Line. The second main route is from Syria's Latakia to Famagusta coastline. In this route human traffickers use small boats or fishing boats to carry illegal migrants. Local collaborators take them who are landed by boats and then transfer them cross over North Cyprus. Third way is to carry illegal migrants in the trucks from Mersin and Taşucu ports to Girne and Gazimagusa ports. When we compare with other routes, this one is rarely utilized by human traffickers. The last one is that transit migrants use legal ways to enter the TRNC, usually as tourists. Usually they get lodged in one hotel and then enter to South Cyprus with the help of smugglers. In some cases they are taken from Ercan airport and directly transferred to cross over the Green Line.

In using the first two routes Karpaz peninsula came to the fore as a main geographical area where the most cases of detained illegal migrants happen. These migrants who tried to enter to TRNC have used sea routes and especially empty and long coastlines of Karpaz peninsula. These are not strictly controlled and so become the most suitable places for human smugglers and transit migrants.

Ferry Link between TRNC and Syria

Regarding the last route, the ferry link between North Cyprus and Syria achieved significance in recent times. In October 2007 Syria allowed a ferry link closed since the 1970s from Turkish Cypriot Gazimagusa to Latakia. It restarts twice weekly. As Gaziamgusa Port officials stated, "the ferry service was stopped during the winter time due to bad weather conditions, but it will be restarted when tourism season starts" (*Kıbrıs Gazetesi*, 2008). In the case of Syrians who came to TRNC *via* ferry in a legal way it is not easy to separate travellers from migrants. Some of them did not return in a time envisioned as a visa period. And those are estimated to pass to the south. Here, numbers of entries vs. exits help us to estimate transit migration. By early March 2008, 809 Syrians entered to TRNC in a legal way by 14 ferry services, but just only 200 of them went back to Syria (Ibid.,). It is estimated that majority of those legal entries went to the south in illegal ways, and some preferred to stay in the north and became part of illegal work force. According to Kivanc Aktuğ, director of UNHCR's

Human Relief Mission in the north, number of asylum seekers who applied to the Mission was 200 in 2006, but then in 2007 the number of asylum seekers increased to 731 since Gazimagusa-Latakia ferry link started. He said that those who came with ferry services paid 1600 US Dollars for five nights stay. They stayed at hotel for one or two nights and then, leaving their passport and belongings at hotel, they crossed to the south, but they do not have any idea about which ways they are using in crossing to the south (*Sözcü*, 2008.). The Greek Cypriot authorities accused the Turkish Cypriot administration and Syria on the ferry services as a responsible for increasing smuggling of illegal immigrants into the north.

Human Smugglers

According to *Crisis Group Europe Report* (2008) in smuggling of migrants, in the case of North Cyprus, it seems clear that there are various mafia-type structures which look like very organized in Turkey, Syria, the TRNC and the RoC. In these mafia-type organizations which are doing human trafficking, drugs and prostitution at the same time, human smugglers are made up of Turkish, Syrian, TRNC and RoC nationals. These human smugglers usually first procure the illegal entry of migrants into the TRNC from Turkey or Syria and then, with the help of their local collaborators, transport and transfer them throughout the TRNC and then assist them on the Green Line passing. Total money charged from each smuggled migrant as the

prices of smuggling and the usuries of travel costs, ranges from 1.500$ to 5.000$.

Case: Fake Passports

At the same time according to the police station; some refugees tried to enter to the TRNC with false stamp of their passports. 6 Georgian nationals were arrested with the false stamped passports, while entering to TRNC from Girne Port. These passports were prepared in Alanya, Antalya. These illegal migrants were sentenced for three days (Star Kıbrıs, 2007).

Case I: A Group of Syrian Migrants

17 Syrian illegal migrants were arrested by British bases police and Greek Cypriot police in March 26, 2008. They told that, as a group of 40 (illegal) migrants, they started their "journey to hope" from Latakia, Syria, in March 23 with a fishing boat. Later they were transferred to another boat. They landed on a sandy beach in Gazimagusa. They had to walk in the sea around 20 meters. Three men picked them up by a truck when they arrived in the north and took them to Duzce/Achna village where one of the men stayed to help them across. While crossing to the south, they were stopped and fired shots by Turkish border guards. Most of them entered the British bases, some the Greek government-controlled areas. There is no any information on other 23 migrants. Each Syrian migrant paid $2,600 to human traffickers (*Yenidüzen Gazetesi,* 2008 and *Cyprus Mail,* 2008).

Case II: Story of Osama Taha Hashim and his family

According to Bacheli (2008) Osama Taha Hashim and his family story start on September 27, 2007 in Istanbul airport with 7 family members including his wife, children, his dead brother's wife and her son. The plane was headed for Ercan airport in T.R.N.C. Earlier, Osama and his family had travelled from Iraq to Turkey using Iraqi travel documents. At this stage, according to the laws of Turkey and Iraq neither Osama nor his family, had done anything illegal but once on the plane, the family were in the hands of human traffickers, who for a fee supplied them with forged Turkish travel documents that would, if all went according to plan, enable them to enter northern Cyprus with a three-month holiday visa. Under instructions from the trafficker escorting them, Osama and his family were led through Turkish Cypriot immigration checks, where their documents were stamped by an allegedly "insider" immigration police official. Once in north Cyprus, the plan was for them to be smuggled to the south of the island, where they would be able to apply for political asylum – an application that would almost certainly have been granted. But things started to go wrong when the Turkish Cypriot authorities caught wind of the human trafficking ring that had helped smuggle them. In a matter of days, Osama and his seven family members, two suspected Turkish traffickers, a Turkish Cypriot go-between, and a Turkish Cypriot immigration policeman were all in custody. The children were placed in an orphanage in north

Nicosia, while Osama and his wife and sister-in-law were jailed, pending a trial for illegal entry into the north. The Turks and Turkish Cypriots were also jailed, pending their trial for membership of a human smuggling ring. Facing legal proceedings against themselves, Osama and his family had become key witnesses in a high-profile trial against the human traffickers.

Osama's lawyer Yusuf Tekinay, working with the UNHCR representative in north Cyprus Kivanc Aktug, recently managed, under condition of bail, to secure the release of Osama's wife and sister-in-law so that they can look after the children. However, under Turkish Cypriot law, they and Osama could face up to ten years in jail for entering the island with forged documents. Aktug says, "This is an exceptional case because Osama is the number one witness in the case, and the authorities are afraid he will go to the south if he is released." Aktug is confident, however, that once the case is concluded the judge will not hand down a custodial sentence, and that the UNHCR will eventually grant the family political asylum, either in the EU, the US or Canada. In fact, Aktug says that even though laws on illegal entry and forged documents are strict in the north, the authorities are usually lenient towards those whom the UNHCR say are genuine asylum seekers.

Osama and his family will also be helped by the fact that his case has triggered a report written by young Human Rights lawyer Öncel Polili on behalf of the Turkish Cypriot Human Rights Foundation (KTIHV) aimed at applying further pressure on

the Turkish Cypriot authorities. It also hopes to lead to an updating of the law that will end all imprisonment for asylum seeker captured in the north. The family's lawyer Yusuf Tekinay said that he had received reassurances from the judge presiding over the case that Osama's wife and sister-in-law's cases would not be taken to the high court. "This means that they are unlikely to spend more time in jail," Tekinay said. Osama, on the other hand, remains in jail with no such reassurances, a virtual hostage to the authorities and their ongoing but sometimes erratic mission to smash the smuggling rings.

A Case: Coming from Syria: Economic reason

In September 2007, 47 illegal migrants who were in a 11.5 meters fishing boat were arrested by TRNC coast guards in near to İskele, Karpaz. Together with them, the captain of the boat, Aftimous Dib (65), was arrasted too. The boat was coming from Latakia Harbour. Gazimagusa District Court sentenced the captain for 15 days of priosonment and 47 migrants just only for 2 days. The captain expressed that he agreed with Syranian national man and received 400 US dollars from each migrants to bring them to North Cyprus. Migrants said that they gave 2000 US dollars for per person t go to the RoC. They also expressed that the main reason pushing them coming to Cyprus illegally was economic; they are poor people and migrating with the hopes of finding better jobs and better life conditions (*Star Kıbrıs*,1997).

Case: Crossing to the UK Base

In 2001 and 2003 some migrants entered to North Cyprus with illegal ways and later they passed to the UK Base where they applied for asylum with a goal to go to England. They made several attempts to have English pasport, but they were refused in every time and they continued to be kept in the Base. (www.pratikhaber.com/new/haberdetay.asp).

Case: Wushu - Teak Wondo Team

Iraqi Marti Alarts Wushu team, including 15 people, came to North Cyprus as the guest of TRNC national team on 9 January, 2008. They remained in the Kaşkar Court Hotel, and in the following day, after the launch, they never came back to the hotel again. As reported by South Cyprus daily Filelefteros, Greek Cypriot police captured 7 man, 4 women and 4 children. And then they applied for asylum. These illegal migrants started their journey from Northern Iraq and then they came to Damascus with overland journey and from there they went to Mersin. They then entered to TRNC from Girne by a regular maritime line from Mersin. The TRNC Taekwondo Wushu chairman Mustafa Aktuğ said that these people engaging in sport previously joined to the international competition TRNC federation organized on October 2007, but later they applied again to come to TRNC and they paid their   expenses (www.urlax.net/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id= 79090&Itemid_100)

Case: In the truck carried by the ship

A group of Syrian illegal migrants are captured in the foreign ship, called Nancy, in Gazimagusa. It brought cigarettes to North Cyprus. And later it left from Gazimagusa Port and sailed around North Cyprus water. After that it again entered to the Port. Upon that, TRNC coast guards suspected from it and searched in this ship. They found 14 illegal migrants whose ages were between 20 and 52. The captain of the ship, having both Syrian and TRNC nationalities, was arrested (www.medyatext.com/print/ID/56350).

The Role of TRNC Government and NGOs

TRNC immigration policy is only about labour migrants according to which any company may bring and sign contract with foreign nationals as guest workers. The number of legally resident foreign nationals is around 30,000. The significant majority is of the Turks from Turkey as "quest workers". There are also some illegal workers from Turkey and other countries, especially African countries. In the TRNC there is no any special domestic legislation on transit migrants and refugees or efficient protection of asylum seekers or refugees. Although the 1951 Geneva Contract was accepted by the RoC in 1961, it can not be implemented in the north, first and foremost because of the international unrecognized, isolated position of the TRNC. At that point, the reasons highlighted by TRNC officials are that the

TRNC government can not establish any direct international relations with other countries and not have enough financial sources to feed and provide accommodation for refugees (*Star Kıbrıs,* 2008). Thus, it is obvious that these make TRNC more fragile in the flows of (irregular) transit migration.

The procedure about transit migrants the TRNC government mainly has followed is that, after transit migrants are arrested while entering or leaving the country in illegal ways, they are brought to the court and detained usually for three days and in some rare occasion for one to three months. If there are Iraqis and Palestinians among them or those who want to apply for asylum, the TRNC police inform UNHCR office about them. Usually after three days they are deported and sent to their original country *via* Turkey. The TRNC police usually take illegal migrants to Mersin Port or Adana International Airport and deliver them to the Turkish police. They also pay all their expenditures in this process. In most cases this is done without considering their request for asylum.

Thus, detained illegal migrants can not apply for asylum officially in TRNC. But, with the efforts of UNHCR's office called Human Relief Mission in TRNC, Iraqi and Palestinian transit migrants began to be considered as having a refugee position. It is because that, in accordance with the principle of *non-refoulement*, those Iraqi and Palestinian seeking asylum should not be forcibly returned to their countries where they risked serious human rights abuses. The Mission provides

accommodation and financial support to those asylum seekers / transit migrants who are accepted as refugee in North Cyprus. And also it tries to find a suitable country, usually Australia and New Zealand, to send them. Kıvanç Aktuğ, the Mission's director, explained how it works in a following way: "Those migrants, before coming, do not have any idea about the UNHCR office in the north. We are informed by TRNC-PD or TRNC Migration Office about illegal migrants. And then we get involved. We help to those who want to apply for asylum, especially Iraqis and Palestinians. Unfortunately, later, most of them cross to the Greek side" (*Sözcü*, 2008). By February 2008, he said, the Mission was taking care of 16 refugees.

Beside the Mission, other non-governmental organization which is active in the matters of refugee is the Turkish Cypriot Human Rights Foundation (*Kıbrıs Türk İnsan Hakları Vakfı*, KTHIV). KTHIV helps and mediates between those having a refugee position and the UNHCR located in the buffer zone. It puts a strong emphasis on the rights of refugees and highlights the obstacles they face to in TRNC such as they are immediately deported without any investigation. In this regard, its officials argue that TRNC laws must be redesigned to get in harmony with EU laws (www.kthiv.org).

Transit migrants use TRNC as a kind of a buffer zone to enter the EU. To stop the flow, the TRNC government has tightened border

control, but failed to control 180-km buffer zone and 300-km coastline. Regarding to the Green Line, the buffer zone, this is mainly because that the RoC government does not willing to make any co-operation with TRNC government to take measures against illegal transit migrants. Several times, Turkish Cypriot authorities offered co-operation with the Greek Cypriots on illegal crossing of the buffer zone; these have not found any echo from the South. The last call for co-operation from the north came in January 2008. Hasan Ercakica, the spokesman for Turkish Cypriot leader Mehmet Ali Talat, said that "this is a problem threatening both the north and the south of the island… The Greek Cypriot side has to understand that they can not free themselves of the responsibility by refraining from adopting effective measures along the Green Line and refusing to co-operate with the Turkish Cypriot authorities or by putting the blame of their negligence over the issue of human trafficking on the shoulders of others and making use of it as a means of political exploitation… The Turkish Cypriot side is ready to co-operate with the Greek Cypriot authorities (for the prevention of illegal immigration) and demands the assistance of the UNFICYP on the issue" (Christou, 2008). It is clearly mentioned in the recent Crisis Group Europe Report that:

> "(D)iplomats believe the Talat government is sincerely trying to combat illegal immigration, but due to recognition sensitivities, Greek and Turkish Cypriot police do not cooperate… The former Turkish Cypriot negotiator, Raşit Pertev, said, 'the Greek Cypriots won't cooperate …especially not with the Turkish Cypriot police. But bi-communal mafias are much organised, doing human

trafficking, drugs and prostitution'" (*Crisis Group Europe Report, 2008*, p. 16).

The Crisis Group Report condemns the Greek Cypriot government not wishing to establish "a hard frontier on the Green Line, which it believes would be contrary to its goal of full reunification, but it detained 5,191 illegal immigrants in 2005 and 3,796 in 2006, most from Turkey" (Ibid., p. 20). But, the EU Commission Report (2007) finds it "worryingly high numbers of illegal immigrants" and recommends that "the authorities of the Republic of Cyprus take concrete steps without delay in order to comply with their obligation under the Green Line Regulation… While the Green Line does not constitute an external border, the surveillance obligations of the Republic of Cyprus on the government-controlled side of the Green Line should be met effectively." For the Greek Cypriot authorities, in 2007 the government received 6790 application by asylum seekers who come across North Cyprus (Christou, 2008). In this increase, Sofokleus, minister of RoC's Justice and Public Order, blamed on the north authorities as willingly allowing these illegal migrants to cross over the Green Line; they use the coastline, ports and airports of Turkey and the North to enter to the South. To prevent such flow, he said, the Greek Cypriot government started to take important measures for controlling of the Green Line crossings (*Kıbrısılı Gazetesi*, 2007).

Conclusion

This is clearly observed in the context of Cyprus Question that transit migration being itself at the centre of political debates gains outmost significance. Both sides blame each other not reinforcing enough border control. No further progress has been reported in bringing the two sides together on the issues of illegal immigration, human trafficking, refugees or asylum seekers and also on the security aspects of migration control (borders, asylum, expulsion of illegal migrants). Just only the Turkish Cypriot government, Ozan said, is cooperating with the British bases on these illegal crossing. Also it improved security at the crossing point at Pergamos where a lot of illegal crossing happened. It is obvious that both sides have weak migration control in different vein. TRNC immigration policy seems to fail regarding immigration control on illegal migration and political asylum or refugees (Givens and Luedtke, 2005, p. 3).

References

Angenendt S. and Edward O. H.. 2002. *Asian Migration to Europe and European Migration&Refugee Policies*, German Council on Foreign Relations.

Baldwin-Edwards Martin. 2005. "Migration into Southern Europe: Non-Legality and Labour Markets in the Region." *MMO Working Paper.* No. 6.

Bahceli,S. 2008. Behind the scenes of human trafficking.

www.pratikhaber.com/new/haberdetay.asp.

BMMYK. 2001. *Dünya Mültecilerinin Durumu, İnsani Yardımın Elli Yılı,* Ankara.

BMMYK. 1997. *Dünya Mültecilerinin Durumu, Bir İnsanlık Sorunu,* Ankara.

Castles Stephen. 2003. "Towards a Sociology of Forced Migration and Social Transformation", *Sociology, A Journal of the British Sociological Association*, Vol. 37, No:1.

"Catch-22 on immigration." *Cyprus Mail*, 15 March 2008.

Christou Jean. 2008. "North authorities offer co-operation on illegal crossings." *Cyprus Mail*.

Christou Jean. 2008. "France says Cyprus needs EU help on immigration." *Cyprus Mail*.

"Communication from the Commission: Annual Report on the implementation of Council Regulation (EC) 866/2004", Brussels, 20 September 2007.

"Cyprus: Reversing the Drift to Partition", *Crisis Group Europe Report N°190, 10 January 2008*, p. 16.

Cyprus Mail 27 March 2008.

Frantz, D. 2002. "Cyprus: No Man's Land Cuts a Long, Sad Scar." *NYT on the web*.

Givens Terri and Luedtke Adam. 2005. "European Immigration Policies in Comparative Perspective: Issue Salience, Partisanship and Immigrant Rights." *Comparative European Politics*, 3.

Hacket Nied Beatrice. 1996. *Pray God And Keep Walking Storıes of Women Refgees,* McFarland & Company, Inc.,Publishers, North Carolina.

Hein Jeremy. 1993. "Refugees, Immigrants, And The State", *Annual Review Sociology*.

İçduygu, Ahmet. 2005. "Transit Migration in Turkey: Trends, Patterns, and Issues." CARIM-RR.

Kıbrısılı Gazetesi, 15 October 2007.

Kushner Tony & Knox K. 2001. *Refugees in an Age of Genocide Global, National and Local Perspective During the Twentieth Century.* Frank Cass, London, Portland.

Star Kıbrıs, 29 February 2008.

Sözcü, 29 February 2008.

Turton David. 2003. *Conceptualizing Forced Migration*. A lecture given at the Oxford RSC's International Summer School in Forced Migration.

Tumarabalar.com/araba/son-dakika-haberleri/92942-kibritsa-mülteci   sorunu-buyuyorhaberi.

Venturini Alessandra. 2009. *Irregular Migration: Incentives and Institutional and Social Enforcement*, CARIM Analytic and Synthetic Notes, No.3 Irregular Migration Series Background paper.

Williams Holy Ann. 1993. "Self-Settled Refugees in North-Western Zambia: Shifting Norms of Social Networks", *Selected Papers on Refugee Issues: II*, M. C. Hopkin & N. D.Donnel (eds.), American Anthropological Association.

www.unhcr.org.tr/MEP/FTPROOT/Dosyalar/Turkiyedebmmyk/ProtectionNGOs.

www.starkibris.net/index.asp. Interview with the chief of TRNC Police Department in March 2008.

Yenidüzen Gazetesi 27 March 2008.

The Changing Soaps and Telenovela Genre: Turkish Series Impact

Lejla Panjeta⁎

Abstract

The focus of this work is to establish the inherent features of the genre of series and discuss their importance and impact on society, politics and everyday life. We usually tend to address everything related to TV and sequel featured as series and soaps. This common presumption is wrong on so many levels, because the genre of sequels has many subgenres and mixed genres and they are constantly changing in the light of the new technologies of filmmaking, TV broadcast and demands of the market. The societies in transition are subjected to various media contents among which the greatest popularity is bestowed to the melodramatic narrative of telenovelas. The promotion of cultures and deconstruction of cultural stereotypes inherent to the mass audience is one of the values of this media content. How much does the genre of telenovelas differ in the context of cultural nuances and what is the genesis of the human urgency in retelling the melodramatic and tragic narratives? Is this genre based on Turkish production now trespassing into the territory of ancient tragedy, thus returning to the roots of all the fiction? Is so, why is that happening to this genre? Enormous popularity deriving from these stories is reflected in the prime time broadcasting by Croatians, Serbian and Bosnian TV stations since 2010. The paper will explain the ontogenesis of the popularity, reflections and influences on societies and cultures, and features of this hybrid and changing genre of telenovelas produced in Turkey.

Keywords: Serials; Telenovelas; Genre; Propaganda.

⁎ Lejla Panjeta, Associate Professor, Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences, International University of Sarajevo; e-mail: lpanjeta@ius.edu.ba

Introduction

There is a common joke in Bosnia nowadays, made under the impression of the impact that Turkish series made in the last couple of years: it is said that when the ottomans retreated in 19 century from Bosnia, they claimed: "We'll come back. In the series!" Enormous popularity of these series can be witnessed if nothing else, just by looking at the TV program. There isn't one public, state or private TV in Bosnia-Herzegovina, Croatia, and Serbia that has not at least one Turkish series in the daily schedule. The importance of debating this phenomenon rises from these facts.

Even in the prehistory of feature movies as artistic expression, but also as an entertainment industry, the extraordinary impact that film has on its users was registered. At the same time the effects that film makes, through its immanent persuasive characteristics and identification of audience with film reality, on the opinions, emotions attitudes and behavior of viewers were evident. Becoming aware that there is a possibility to manipulate with these effects the censorship boards that control the content shown in the film are created even at the very early stage of film development. Even in 1917, the Government of the United States has formed the Creel Committee, the authority that was entrusted to make the influence upon the public opinion on the American engagement in the First World War. One of the important media, through which the Government infiltrated its messages, was feature movies. The first showing of the first

feature movie in the history confirms that the film propaganda and, in general, the impact of film contents on the audience, are of big importance. With the approaching train and in close up to a static camera in the Lumiere brothers' film *L'arrivée d'un train en gare de La Ciotat* (1895), the viewers screamed and jumped out of the seats. Truthfulness and verisimilitude are the immanent features of narrative in film language. Often the film is now used for propaganda purposes. With the advent of television soap operas that combines cinematic narration and literal rules of dramatic tensions to what the media industry for mass audience serves has greater impact to the society and the individuals. Relaying on this powerful influence and manipulation related film feature, the narrative structure of TV series can be a useful tool for social, cultural and political impacts.

Profitable Industry and Global Popularity

The popularity of sequels and *logies* (duology, trilogy, quadrilogy… overwhelming us from bookshops, tobacco shops, and commercials) today is at its peak not only in cinema and TV, but in literature as well. The very first sequels can be found in the ancient storytelling. One of the first stories told in the serial manner is in *One thousand and one nights* or Arabian nights in which Scheherazade tells a story open ending it each night so she might live another day for her captor needs to hear how it's to be continued. Many classic authors such as Dostojevski, Tolstoy, or Flaubert published installments of their works in the journals such

as Ruski Vesnik or Pickwick Club. The first known e-book has emerged from the experiment with the new technologies in an epistolary form of a novel. It was created by Stephen King. Nowadays bestsellers varying from supernatural, to children's books, even pornographic (labeled as erotic) is done at least in three sequels. Recycling ideas and the profit making are the major incentives for authors and publishers or production companies to continue working on the same stuff and make a sequel out of the perfectly normal compact composition. Anticipated sequels end up the storytelling before drama epiphany is reached and right on the edge of climax and/or falling action. That is way the resolution of the plot is to be anticipated. This technique in modern storytelling was invented in 19th century. Apart from creating the first the paperback Charles Dickens was the first author who made a serial when he deliberately left the character hanging from the cliff in the third chapter of 1860 novel *Great Expectations*. This novel was printed in sequels in a magazine "All the Year Round." The dramaturgy device called cliffhanger is named after this invention.

One of the first cinema sequels is created by Friz Lang within the German expressionist period. Dr. Mabuze is psychological-gothical horror like drama. Similar to this, character sequels are popular in literature. Poirot, Marple, Sherlock Holmes, Robert Langdon and Harry Potter are characters that have many followers, and these days the supporters form a small internet based armies of fans. In TV, the series are often

made preempting the rights on the lead actors. They become the superstars whose character lives are usually followed with same ardor as their private lives.

Television series have developed into a profitable industry based on the postulates of film and drama arts but, first of all, on the economic requests and sale that rule in the entertainment industry. As nowadays we have significant improvement in HD film industry, today the television series are more like films and not only regarding the quality of the film narrative but also the manner of directing and film photography. As there is a possibility to work with the equipment which is now chipper and more portable, television series are made with more speed, on many different locations, including the action scenes, with many on locations. All these elements enable almost a film quality of an authors work. An example for this is a brilliant Hilal Saral's directing in the *Fatmagül'ün suçu ne?* series. "Several years back, 'I bought a one-hour (one hour of copyright) Turkish drama for $600 or $700. Today, there are parties who are willing to pay $40,000 for one-hour,' said Adeeb Khair, general manager and owner of Sama Art Productions, a Syrian TV production company which dubs Turkish dramas into colloquial Syrian Arabic. (Al Tamimi, 2012)

The enormous profits of the series witness their popularity or the rating in Turkey as well as in the countries where this cultural product is launched. But as in any other profit industry, it is necessary to have a top-quality product for export. For example

> The soap opera about Suleiman is the most expensive television program in Turkish history. Roughly $500,000 is spent per episode, twice the amount of other serials. The show's launch party was held in Cannes, France. Its elaborate, 15-room re-creation of Istanbul's Topkapi Palace has real marble floors, handcrafted woodwork and a mock European throne room. Actors wear exquisite silk and velvet gowns crafted by a leading Turkish costume designer. And the series is directed by Durul and Yağmur Taylan, two siblings known as the Coen Brothers of Turkey (Rohde, 2012).

According to data on one of the *Forum.hr* dedicated to the Turkish series in the Balkans, in 2011 and 2012 the total financial transactions for 39 Turkish series was 655 million TL (279,5 million Euros). Four of them were produced by Kerem Çatay from Ay Yapim production company Jasmina, 2012). In the countries of the former Yugoslavia (Bosnia-Herzegovina, Croatia, Serbia), which for the cultural and language similarities have an unique cable TV media, the fight for the prime time airing of Turkish series lasts already a year now. In Croatia, the Turkish series

> have over flown … the channels of the two private TV stations with national concessions. In its program from 7 to 15 hours, which ranges 15 hours, Nova TV airs or re-airs six hours of Turkish soap operas: four hours of *Fatmagül'ün suçu ne?* and two hours of *Hanımın Çiftliği*. At that same time period the RTL airs or re-airs seven hours of Turkish soap operas: four hours of *Muhteşem Yüzyil,* two hours of *Ezel* and one hour of *Dudaktan Kalbe* (Kasapović, 2012).

In Bosnia-Herzegovina the leading private TV station, OBN, airs in prime time *Muhteşem Yüzyil,* the series with the highest rating in 2012 and 2013. Public and state TV stations have also at least one hour of Turkish series at different hours during work days. There is also an unprecedented interest for the Turkish series with

highest rating of all times, *Kurtlar Vadisi*. The argument for this claim is not only the official rating report, but also the public opinion with regards to the series expressed in local media through various surveys, internet forums and public TV discussions. Here are some examples. Before the airing hours for the mentioned series were publicly announced at Hayat TV station a huge number of viewers called, sent messages or through public nets asked questions when the first episode of the series would be aired. Public competition for a look-alike for the Sultan Suleiman and Sultana Hurem, who won the trip to Istanbul, brought about an enormous interest and that was also a big promotion for the new season of the series. At the address of the OBN TV station about 300 registrations arrived and the social networks were actively incorporated into the process of decision making which Bosnians were the most a look-alike Turkish originals (Clipping). All of this media revolution begins with the broadcast of *Binbir Gece* (*One Thousand and One Nights*) at Croatian TV Nova in 2010.

Again there is the same situation of empty streets, low number of phone calls during the airing of the series and opening of language courses, which was registered in 1997 with the appearance of Latino-American telenovelas and with unprecedented ratings in the region. The influence of Latino-American telenovelas in the region of the former Yugoslavia resembled a mass hysteria. Viewers from Serbia sent official letters to the production team of the *Marisol* series requesting the

justice to be served for the main character of the series while the Orthodox Church received many donations for the healing of the leading heroine. In Goražde a local production made an amateur telenovela based on true events that happened in that small town. This resulted in many quarrels and legal suits. The ratings for *Muñeca Brava* telenovela were even higher than those for Dnevnik (The News) with up to that time the highest ratings in the history of RTVSA and RTVBiH programs. The TV station in Priština which aired *O Clone* series received the bomb attack threats if they continue to air that series, which according to the allegations of terrorists undermines the foundations of Islam. In Sarajevo the visit of the main actress in *Esmeralda* series was followed by euphoria in the main streets of this city like it was during former Tito visits to the towns in ex-Yugoslavia (Panjeta, et al, 2005).

Only two years after the end of the war in the region TV stations started to broadcast telenovelas in Spanish. Not being used to Spanish language and love plots with characters from middle and low classes the viewers at the beginning were distrustful as they were already used to sweetie rich class plots in American soap operas or American way of life living in sitcoms. This quite new form of plot finds its faithful fans and junkies waiting for many episodes with intriguing 40 minutes daily events somewhere in Latin America. Bosnian citizens with various religious and national convictions who just went out from the war sit together and watch telenovelas. Broadcasting time of these

telenovelas is the time of collective sedative for these people, the time reserved for trying to forget the horrors of war that they suffered. Repression, control of mind and universalizing of free time are the basic argument in many critics of the soap operas, which act as a global sedative during the time period of great recessions and socio-political crisis. On the other hand, popularity is piece of evidence for the quality of mass-products that are designed for mass public. Along with everyday airing intended to attract viewers, the basic technical element of directing used in telenovelas are the ending of an episode when action culminates (the so-called "cliffhanger drama technique"), and almost documentary manner for showing real life and love problems of an ordinary person, which by using a close ups as a mean of identification diminishes limits between film fiction and reality.

In the 1990-s the Mexican telenovelas ruled in the Arab world. But in 2008, MBC started to broadcast dubbed Turkish series. According to Al Tamimi (2012)

> the last two episodes of *Gümüş*, shown on August 30, 2008, attracted 85 million viewers in the Middle East and North Africa region, out of which 50 million were females… On a daily basis, the series has been watched by nearly 30 million viewers, he said… Turkish newspaper Hurriyet Daily News was quoted as saying that the soap operas have increased the country's influence abroad, especially in the Balkans and the Middle East, furthering the so-called soft power of Turkish diplomacy. According to Hurriyet, more than 100 Turkish television series have been watched in more than 20 countries this year, earning more than $60 million.

Globalization and regionalization have found their mutual language through the mass profitable industry of TV series. While

one stream tries to unify and universalize, the other one uses the oldest manner and through narrative techniques presents the uniqueness of human fate in given circumstances found in special social systems. Showing in a different manner one culture, about which the other one has earlier developed stereotypic connotations, and breaking so stereotypes, telenovelas and series can be a form of fight against cultural stereotypes control. Therefore, spreading the understanding between cultures, television series and their social networks, through interactions on forums and blog pages become a culture for itself. „The term cult TV would seem to refer to the method of watching and reacting to certain shows rather than referring to the shows themselves" (Fiddy, 2010, p. 230). This series cult is not reserved only for the fans and promotion campaigns of television advertisement agencies. The influence of fiction on reality has spread so much that the series become a subject of parliaments discussions or they cause open conflicts, while in real life the narrative series models are copied so that an individual or a group identify themselves with the fictional characters.

> Soap operas are wildly popular in Turkey and are among the country's most vital exports, both in terms of profit and public relations. Before the Mavi Marmara tried to deliver aid to Gaza in May 2010, Turkish soap operas had been illustrating the country's solidarity with Palestinians, often by maligning Israelis. *Gümüş*, which aired on Kanal D, became a popular soap in the Arab world, and flaunted Turkey's idealized self-image as a nation balancing its Islamic identity with Western behavior like drinking wine and kissing. Soaps have addressed serious issues—the lives of political prisoners, the decline of rural life, the role of women—with typical innuendo and melodrama (Krajeski, 2012).

Political and Social Impact of the Turkish Serials

Having in mind a specific feature of television verisimilitude and huge number of recipients, in some social circles there is a certain concern over historic, cultural or political inadequacy or incorrectness with regards to events or characters shown in TV series. The very fact that a certain concern exists is the argument proving that television series are a serious social issue and not only a creative narrative or entertainment product. The alcohol use by fictional characters in the series became an issue that waved the cleric circles because in the Islamic world the religious ban on use of alcohol is important. On the other hand, European viewers are shocked with the fact that there are alcohol beverages in Turkey and even more by the manner in which they are consumed, which is identical with the European one. Therefore

> people raised many questions why in that television series the Islamic culture is not presented more intensively. Really, a drama about attitude of a person who lives an honest and moral life, who preys God five times a day, fasts give *sadaka* and *zekiat,* goes to pilgrimage to Mecca would be a very boring one as there are no intrigues, cheating or gambling. In so sober and highly raised consciousness condition a person cannot make any big problem. That would be completely uninteresting', adds as a joke Ms. Šiljak-Jesenković… 'When the Ottomans withdrawn from the Balkans they said: We'll be back in TV series' (Dervišević, 2012).

In this interesting comment, interwoven with specific Balkan humor, it is true that there is no drama if there is no conflict, or if there are no tensions caused by strives of characters. It is true that no one wants to see happy and normal persons in the series, films

or literature. This is the law of dramaturgy and the series are based on this. However, it is not true that alcohol is the main incentive of a conflict. Comparing Turkish and Latino-American series, where due to character of Christian culture alcohol is not forbidden or comparing series with classic literature pieces we find that the fact of consuming alcohol is not the starting force that provoke tragic fate of characters. We do not see alcohol as the drama plot accelerator or motivator in Shakespeare, Dostoevsky, Tolstoy, or Greek tragedies. This tells us that people are the same everywhere and their problems that can inspire the drama for an interesting piece of fiction are deriving from people. This is just the point where the global successfulness of Turkish series lies because only cultural set design backdrop is different from the one to which Europe and the Balkans are used to. However, in Islamic and Arab world there are many complaints regarding the manner in which Islamic culture is portrayed.

After the 2011 premiere of *Muhteşem Yüzyil* on Turkish TV "critics hurled eggs at billboards advertising the program, protested outside the production company's office and filed more than 70,000 complaints with the Turkish government television agency. The show's producers shortened kissing scenes and toned down certain elements" (Rhode, 2012). Just like *Muhteşem Yüzyili*, *Gümüş,* translated as *Noor* in Arabic, one of the first widely popular series in the Middle East, also deals with some predicaments that are not always in accordance with the Islamic culture and religion.

> Some Muslim characters drank wine with dinner and engaged in premarital sex. In one case, a character had an abortion. The lead male character, Muhannad, was the show's handsome hero. A loving, attentive and loyal husband, he supported his wife's career as a fashion designer and treated her as an equal. Their successful marriage -- which combined traditional loyalty and modern independence -- was both popular among women and groundbreaking. Some Arabic-language newspapers reported that arguments and even divorces occurred in several countries as a result… Dubbed into colloquial Arabic, censored of its raciest scenes and renamed *Noor*, the series was a phenomenal hit. Unlike Western soap operas, it focused on an extended family, a strong tradition in Turkey and the region. In 2008, the show's final episode drew an estimated 85 million viewers over the age of 15, according to MBC, including 50 million women, a figure that represents more than half the adult women in the Arab world (ibid).

Fatwa was issued in Saudi Arabia forbidding *Gümüş* and the series was labeled as a secular Turkish assault on Saudi society. According the above mentioned Reuters article, leader of a Saudi religious council said the owner of MBC should be tried and potentially executed for airing broadcasting this series. Nevertheless, the article concludes that

> beyond breaking cultural taboos, the shows display something else: Turkey's rapid economic growth… In its soap operas, Turkey is modern, Muslim and prosperous at the same time. Intentionally or not, though, the makers of Turkey's soap operas are creating new roles, new heroes and new cultural norms in a rapidly changing region (ibid.).

According the writings of *Emirates.new.com*, divorce rates in UAE is increased in percentage of family disputes, for which some experts blame addiction to television programs. In

accordance with the number of complaints, it is clear that most women who watched these serials neglected their families.

The greater impact of the Turkish series with tragic consequences, then the mentioned cultural and religious disputes, is evident in the killings of five people in Yemen, inspired by the Turkish series *Kurtlar Vadisi*. Yemeni man has been executed after murdering four men and a woman in an effort to imitate a Turkish soap opera. According to Israel national news

> Mohamed al-Ali al-Azab, 31, confessed to his crime prior to his execution, saying he was inspired by the popular Turkish television series *Kurtlar Vadisi*...The incident began with a dispute between al-Azab and an unidentified man in Yemen's Dawran and resulted in the killing of five people, including the unidentified man's mother (Hirshfeld, 2012).

The political issues and political background of the cultural influences are not immune to the effects of Turkish series. The leader of Greece's far-right Golden Dawn party openly invites citizens to boycott Turkish series. "Michaloliakos said it was a shame that Turkish shows were being aired in Greece, which had a unique cultural heritage and said friendly relations between Turks and Greeks was against the well-being of Greece and its citizens" (Kirbak, 2012). *Kurtlar Vadisi* caused one more political dispute between Israel and Turkey. The series depicts Mossad agents in a negative context. Escalation of the diplomatic crisis between Jerusalem and Ankara was evident after the broadcasting of the scene in which Palestinian women were being raped in Israeli prisons. Apart from the complaints from the

prisoners, "the Foreign Ministry summoned the Turkish ambassador to Israel for a reprimand in which he was publicly humiliated by being seated at a lower chair than Deputy Minister Daniel Ayalon" (Nahmias, 2012).

In Serbia at the end of March 2012, members of the ultra right campaign *Naši* (*Ours*) put up posters all over Belgrade protesting against broadcasting of *Muhteşem Yüzyil* series, that stated

> The Serb history is dramatically falsified. Belgrade did not spread its arms waiting the Sultan to come. On the contrary, all 900 defenders were killed while defending it, and he was not a romantic knight but a brutal conquer… For example, 60 'unbelievers' impaled heads were waiting for him in front of Šabac fortress! (Ilić, 2012).

The Serb historians assert in public media that the history is forged. There is a similar situation in talk shows and media discussions in Bosnia and Herzegovina where the scholars and historians are gathered to discuss incorrectness presented about the life in harem and at the Ottoman palace where they defend the historic figure of this series character. "Master of arts in history and expert collaborator at the History Institute in Sarajevo … stated that 'the series gives a distorted picture of events'" (Dežulović, 2012, p. 11) and he also said that the top politicians in Turkey were not calm about the series fiction (ibid.). Turkish Prime Minister, Erdogan, condemned publically the production team of *Muhteşem Yüzyil* show. According the *Todayszaman.com* Turkish Prime minister emphasized „his government issued

warnings to the series and he hopes that the judicial mechanism will rule appropriately regarding the series. He said there must be a response within the law to those who mock the values of the people" (Anonymous, 2012, November 25).

There are many more examples where fiction contents are interpolated into the everyday lives of people and they are with political and sociological consequences. However, the majority negates the influences that series produce. Describing the plans for developing a TV entertainment network the Hamas leader's teenage son arrived, "complaining about Western music and his sister's taste for the Turkish soap operas. Then the son's cell phone rang. The ring tone was the theme song from *Noor*" (Kimmelan, 2010).

Under no circumstances the propaganda influences that series produce should not be neglected. However, the above mentioned discussions and opinions seem rather funny, because the polemicists prove a historic correctness making references to an entertaining and artistic creation. However, it is possible that the power the series do have, which is known from the very beginning of the film history, has been transferred from the hands that control political power to the hands that control economy, meaning the hands of those who control profit and budget of productions. Narrative feature of series and the realism in picturing the life itself, make Turkish series a suitable media for discussions about truthfulness in showing. However, "narration

promises a form of understanding which is not absolute or relative but is somewhere in between" (Kearney, 2009, p. 149). Confusion and conflict that series provoke with regard to historic trutfulness or untrutfulness is not founded. Here we have a fictitious creation which according to an author's vision represents its own narrative (phantasmagoric) world. This is best explained in the statement of the actor who portrays Sultan Suleiman the Magnificent, Halit Ergenç: "There is no political message or any other cultural message…This is a TV series. It is a soap opera" (Rohde, 2012).

Besides already mentioned effects that the fiction of series brings in real life, we cannot neglect many positive effects that television series made. Along with the growth of tourism, a high interest for Turkish language studying (Dervišević, 2012) and the expansion of Turkish economy and its political influence in the Middle East (Rohde, 2012, & Kimmelman, 2010), the mentioned series broadcasted in Bosnia, Serbia and Croatia are winners of Antalya Television Awards, which is an equivalent to American Emmy, and Turkish actors get the awards for their work even in Vatican, like Murat Yildirim who won a Giusepe Sciacca award. *Fatmagül'ün suçu ne?* series is used for therapeutic purposes in American clinic for sexually abused women (Canikligil, 2012). According to a post at Hurriyet news portal

> Turkish TV series are set to participate in a new campaign from the Urban Planning Ministry to raise earthquake awareness by including scenes that illustrate the dangers of temblors in the country… As part of the campaign, *Muhteşem Yüzyıl*, which follows the intrigues of the harem during the

reign of Süleyman the Magnificent, will reportedly be asked to include a dramatization of the 1509 earthquake in Istanbul that killed 13,000 people (Anonymous, 2012, July 16).

Popular and profitable television series are a good platform where ideas of public interest can be advertised or social issues raised. Therefore, many campaigns for bringing awareness of different illnesses of a person or society, like stereotypes and prejudice, may appear in television series. As modern narrations follow everyday life of characters, television series are a perfect place where a certain cultural context can be popularized. Namely, there is no a scientific work or a historical fact that can show a certain living cultural and anthropological feature more faithfully than today's television series can. The viewers from a different culture will learn through them, along with a language, much about gastronomy and cultural norms that exist during social gathering like weddings, baby deliveries, deaths and everyday communication and how love and hatred can be expressed in a socially acceptable manner. In countries where the foreign programs are subtitled (Bosnia, Croatia and Serbia are among them) Turkish television series help a lot in the process of language learning and they also offer possibility to notice cultural linguistic differences. For example, the manner in which two persons greet themselves with a form of "good day" in South-Slav languages and culture is rather poor if compared with the one in Turkey. In Turkish culture this kind of greeting can be expressed in many forms as the language is poetic and kindness culturally immanent compared with the South-Slav concreteness and

directness. Tense episodes about everyday dramas of Turkish characters make a contribution for better understanding of cultures and people individually and they also break stereotypes in a subtle and positive manner.

> What really hooks viewers are the rollicking storylines. The secret of a good soap is that all human joys and troubles are there, usually larger than life. *The Grapevine Mansion (Asmalı Konak),* the first great Turkish soap, debuted back in 2002. It was the tale of an urban sophisticate who marries into a small-town family living in an old mansion. There, she comes face to face with the old Turkey that most viewers left behind just a generation ago: blood feuds, illegitimate children, the bitter rivalries of the women of the house. *Noor,* turning the same theme on its head, is a Cinderella tale of a village girl who marries a rich Istanbul hunk, overcomes the envy of his evil mother and sister, and (spoiler alert) eventually saves the family textile business. Last year's crop of Turkish soaps were edgier: *1001 Nights* (*Binbir Gece)* follows a widow forced to sleep with her boss to get medicine for her son's leukemia; *Forbidden Love* (*Aşk-ı Memnu*) (is a roller coaster of suicide, betrayal, and adultery featuring an immoral mother and a vengeance-driven daughter (Matthews, 2012).

Postmodern Genre Transgression

Series which follow the genre of melodrama, and base their story on conflicts and intrigue plots, got a popular name Soap opera as the first commercials for the cleaning products were advertized during the series. These series were firstly created for radio programs in the 1930s of the last century and the culmination was seen on television in the form of American series. Their expansion started in the 1940s. Commercials for cleaners were firstly interpolated in the series because they were originally designed for housewives. Derogatory connotations of the term are

determined by the irony of the word opera, because in these series everyday life is raised to the level of tragedy and pathos of opera. Talking about television genres, there is a clear difference between drama (drama series) and soap opera. This latter one is a product of a happy marriage between the commercial features of media industry and dramatic narration in series. A new episode is possible thanks to an open end which attracts the viewers to watch the next episode. Originally oriented to internal family dramas of rich people in 1960s, through the series *Days of Our Lives*, the plots with a doctor as the main character were introduced. This innovation will have its genealogy in today series that deal exclusively with medical environments. However, the soap opera will wait for another twenty years to get its hybrid genre. This happens when the vast interior space with the houses of rich people, as a connotation of power, are replaced with smaller interiors (and with them come the characters from the middle class) in which the plot other than that of family one is built outside of the home that is in the workplace.

Bestselling author and a student of medicine, Michael Crichton, in 1974 gives the idea for a soap that takes place in a hospital. Steven Spielberg's involvement in the development of the show resulted latter in the worldwide popular series: ER. In the 1990s the series are more technologically and visually advanced and more drama and comedy oriented. The new sitcom genre emerges, as well as detective story based serials. Nevertheless, the soap opera is primary based on human interrelations and intrigues.

However, it is important to emphasize that although the soap opera can have supernatural elements, like the gothic soap opera *Dark Shadow* from 1960s, where the main character is a vampire, an essential defference between the series such as *True Blood* of today and the former soap operas exist not only in regard to the technological quality of production (soap opera characteristics: three point lighting, scenes ending with dramatical pause and close-ups, interior grandure, lower visual quality then that of the feature movies and TV mini series), but also in the narrative structure. For example, a diference between soap opera and telenovela is in the structure of the narration, but also in the features of TV industry. Both have developed as melodramatic stories, from the very begining of radio broadcasting, with an aim to unite cultural space and integrate Latin continent and create national hegemony, but only in 1980-ies the Latino-American telenovelas has become known all over the world. Essential genre characteristics between telenovelas and soap operas are as folows:

- telenovela has a limited duration (usually it is 7 months) while the soap opera is with no limits with regard to duration;
- telenovela is a product developed for the prime-time and the soap opera is not necessarily a prime-time product;
- the basic plot of telenovela show is love;
- telenovela clings firmly to the structure of melodrama with a hapy ending;
- evil, obstacles, intrigue, deceit, infidelity are the obstacles that will ultimately guarantee success for the telenovela protagonists (there is a very strong religious and cultural imperative – Way of the Cross),

while in the soap opera these drama tools are invented for entertainment;

- telenovela main characters belong to middle class, nationalism is propagated as well as the differences between the classes where the rich are to be blamed for, but in the soap operas the main issue is an intrigue between the rich;
- telenovela outlines differences and promotes teamwork, while the soap opera tends unification and globalization, through individualism.

Therefore, „soap operas are of two basic narrative types: 'open' soap operas, in which there is no end point toward which the action of the narrative moves; and 'closed' soap operas, in which, no matter how attenuated the process, the narrative eventually close" (Allen, unknown). In classification of genres that derived from soap operas it would be more accurate to name the letter one as telenovelas. However, only this differentiation is not sufficient for the classification within this television genre. Today, even those serials with five or more seasons, which might correspond to a soap-opera melodramatic narrative structure, are not named „derogatory" but are labeled with thematic feature and given the hybrid genre label: teen drama, vampire series, historical drama, action series, police series, detective, forensic, etc... Soap opera been a boast for generating a number of mixed genres that appear after the exhaustion of certain themes in classical genres. The genre here is not determined only by the self-defining elements of the narrative, but with the regulations of television distributions and broadcasting contracts with productions and advertizing agencies. It is essential not to

overlook the narrative components of Turkish series. Are they really fitting into a soap opera narrative models?

Turkish series in Bosnia and Herzegovina are broadcast every day in different parts of a day, and they usually cover prime-time. But in Turkey the same series are broadcast differently: once in a week where an episode lasts at least 90 minutes and it resembles dramaturgically and with the form of directing to a feature film. Therefore, along with the already mentioned genre characteristics, it is necessary to analyze the structure of the plot and development of characters in order to determine genre classification.

The main characteristics of telenovela are as follows: the basic plot and conflict is love; the action has a melodramatic discourse; Hero, Villain and Heroine dramaturgy; a happy ending – wedding (Panjeta, et. al, 2005, & Mazziotti, 1996). Characters' development and plots in telenovelas are comparative to the biblical allegories of the Cross Way, Passion of the Christ, and the Heavenly Kingdom. The reward in Heaven awaits those who suffer in this life. Such religious dualistic concept of justice and life suffering is not inherent in the Islamic world. However, this Christian philosophy is the main narrative discourse for the melodrama and telenovela.

Genre characteristics of Turkish series do not require necessarily a happy ending. Sometimes it is completely contrary to this. Series end tragically, although the melodramatic narrative structure suggested happy ending. The best indicator for this claim is the tragic end of the leading male character Halil, who is killed by his

opponent at the very end of the love plot based series *Menekşe ile Halil.* Along with the fact that the characters and plots overcome the usual clichés there are also many variations regarding the aforementioned characteristics of soap operas and telenovelas. Therefore, Turkish series cannot be considered telenovelas because here the very genre goes through the modeling process and some of the main rules of telenovela genre are broken.

Altman designates the "genre as process" (54-42) and explains that mixed features of classical genres come from rebellion against Classicism that was the characteristic of Romanticism as a movement and literature genre. "What we perceive as a mixture of pre-existing genres is often nothing less than the liquid lava of new genre still in the creation process" (Altman, 1999, p. 143). Mixed genre is also a consequence of the postmodern thought. It might be true to call the postmodern transgression of the soap opera genre to new mixed genres of drama serials, for which a good example is the Turkish serials. Although, we haven't gotten a new genre here, but the hybrid genre which mixes the TV series narrative structure and TV broadcasting rules with that of the classical narratives.

Some of the Turkish series are based on the classical works of literature or critically acclaimed novels. The examples of these adaptations are as follows:

- Yaprak Dökümü is besed on the novel by Reşat Nuri Güntekin written in 1939;
- *Fatmagül'ün suçu ne?* is an adaptation of the Vedat Turkali novel and the film with the same title made in 1986;
- *Kesanli Ali Destani* is filmed version of the most famous Turkish musicle with the same name from 1964;

- The scenario for the *Hanımın Çiftliği* is based on the novel *Hanımın Çiftliği* written by Orhana Kemal (Mehmet Raşit Öğütçü);
- *Dudaktan Kable* is an adaptation of the famos novel written by Reşat Nuri Güntekin with the same title published in 1923;
- *Ezel* is inspired by the popular novel *Grof Monte Cristo* written by the French writter Alexandre Dumas;
- *Leyla ile Mecnun* is an adaptation of a famos Arab love story;
- *Şubat* is based on the classical fairy-tale *The Beauty and the Beast*.

Given that the genre elements, which determine the categorization of soap operas and telenovelas, are narrative and industry related differentiating ones, in case of Turkish series it is necessary to make an insight not only into the narration, which uses classic patterns for screenplays, but also in directing and development of characters. The use of film language is different in the Turkish series than in telenovelas:

- moving camera, often dolly and tracking shots
- blocking the dialogs in non stationary and non conservative screen direction
- close-ups are in the function of the action, and not the tension elevating tool
- slow motion, overlapping and other editing filmmaking techinques are following the basic storyline by building the suspense and surpise, they are completly justified
- soundtrack following the action in a movie like manner
- *deus ex machina* dramaturgy solutions and evil characters *per se* are not so common
- script development of the character and acting is more sofisticated
- stories are life based, and dramatic creative solutions real, becouse the characters are not dualisticly antagonized betweed good and evil, but rather consequences of the character's decisions are the spin wheel for the plot.

Determining factor that separates the Turkish series out of telenovelas is the vitality of their stories and the manner of technical realization. Characters are not set or preset, but evolving, just as in the works of classical literature. Almost

Tolstoy characters and Shakespeare plotlines are placed into the context of everyday life, but not in an artificial manner of dues *ex machina* plots. Specifically, in the Turkish series, compared to soap operas or telenovelas, there is an organic compound of everyday life and tragedy elements. In the series *Fatmagül'ün suçu ne?*, there is a statement that Fatmagül (a raped girl) has a strong heart to which she answers: „I must have it to survive“. Here the moving force is not an already given character, but she is the character who transforms from gentle girl into a strong woman, but not because it is necessary for the story to develop from it, but because it has to be so in order to continue with life from which the narrative here happens. There is no room for pathos for its own sake, but the action is moved by the rigors of survival. „There is nothing with which stories are intimately concerned, then the conflict between 'dark' and 'light'“ (Booker, 2004, p. 700). Negative characters in the Turkish series are not entirely negative in themselves. They are more like the ancient heroes who, for reasons of pride or arrogance (hybris) are caught in the web of their own actions that end tragically. A good example is the replica of a villain from the aforementioned series, Reşat Yaşaran: „We live and experience everything. If your child commits a crime, would you let him to the fate to decide. I cannot.“ Within the basic clichés of good and evil narrative, the Turkish series offer us the new-old patterns of classic dramaturgy.

Concluding Remarks

According to Lešić (2005) "human's confrontation with circumstances that are not controlled by his/her own will but by God's will, or the very Fate (in Greek *Moira*) as the force even stronger than the one of Gods, which is why any disobedience of a human, his/her violation of given human limits or arrogance, his/her *hybris*, becomes a 'tragic guilt' of his/hers, and he/she becomes victim sentenced to suffering and anguish" (p. 487). This is how the understanding of the Heroes Flaw in Greek tragedies is described. In Turkish series we do not expect the wedding of the main character or unmasking of the villains as we would in telenovelas melodramatic stories. Not looking forward to see demise of the characters, just as the protagonists (the so-called positive figures) do, but as in a classical tragedy, in the process of catharsis, we are feel pity for the complete situation in which not willingly, but as a result of certain own decisions and fate's (*hybris* and Moira) the characters found themselves.

Defining the hero in tragedies, Aristotle (2002, p. 77) described him as the one „who is not eminently good and just, yet whose misfortune is brought about not by vice or depravity, but by some error or frailty." The development of the character in Turkish series is made according to this definition. However, these are not ancient Greek heroes, but everyday life people are forced to walk the path of the hero in order to survive in the world that is almost mythically cruel. The narrative taken as *mythos* (a story deriving from a meaning for a particular culture), and the

development of the character taken as everyday life hero, are the differentiating elements of this genre, which cannot be called telenovelas. "Myths are stories that people have recounted to explain themselves to themselves and to the others. But Aristotle developed this insight in philosophical outlook when … argued that the art of storytelling is the one … we owe the experience to share this world with others" (Kearney, 2009, p. 13). It is through the Turkish drama series, where reality, character evolve, and livingness are inherent as well as the sharing of intimate experience of the world with others, that this global voyeuristic demand for narratives found its embodiment.

The tragic concept in contemporary drama was already finished with Hegel's consideration of individuality, which is therefore not a mirror of the higher fatal forces, but a particular case. Universality of our pastime today is not comparable with the mythic universality, but the elements of the tragic vision of the world in the highly profitable and popular products, which the Turkish series surely are, actually do exist. Globalization, social impact and cult that the popularity of series carries with them, and the narrative models found in Turkish series raises them to a new higher level, which differs from the genre within which they originally were created. From probably the first serial storytelling, like for example Schereherazade's stories in a classic work *One thousand and One Nights*, a visualization techniques, as the cinematic storytelling, have evolved. The genres developed, characters are individualized, cultures damasked and stereotypes

smashed, identification of audience and development of virtual cults was intensified, and via Turkish series the classic narrative forms found their fans among the mass audience.

Index of TV Series and Films

Aksan, B. (Writer) & Ünlü, O. & Boz, E. (Directors). (2011-2013). In O. Ünlü & F. Alp (Producers) *Leyla ile Mecnun*. EFLATUN FILM.

Alp, F. & Ünlü, O. (Writers) & Kocatürk, V. (Director). (2012-2013). In F. Alp & O. Ünlü (Producers) *Şabat*. EFLATUN FILM.

Ball, A. & Harris, C. et al. (Writers) & Lehman, M. Winant, S. et al. (Directors). (2008-2013). In A. Ball (Executive Producer), *True Blood.* HBO

Canpolat, E. & Ergenekon, S. (Writers) & Alpagut, T. & Uzun, K. (Directors). (2005-2007). In I. Şahin (Producer), *Gümüş*. ANS PRODUCTIONS.

Curtis, D. Wallace, A. Russell, G. Hall, S. et al. (Writers) & Swift, L. Kaplan, H. Sedwick, J. Sullivan S.D. et al. (Directors) (1966-1971). In D. Curtis & R. Costello (Producers), *Dark Shadows*. DAN CURTIS PRODUCTIONS.

Deren, K. & Bulut, P. (Writers) & Bayraktar, U. (Director). (2009-2011). In K.Çatay (Producer), *Ezel*. AY YAPIM.

Ergun, M. (Writer) & Irmak, Ç. (Director). (2002-2004). In A. Oguz (Producer), *Asmalı Konak*. ANS PRODUCTIONS.

Lumiere, A. & L. (Directors). (1895). In Lumiere, A. & L. (Producers) *L'arrivée d'un train en gare de La Ciotat*.

Okay, M. & Şahin, Y. (Writers), & Taylan, Y. & Taylan, D. (Directors). (2011-2013). In T. Savci (Producer), *Muhteşem Yüzyil*. TIMS Productions.

Tunç, Y. & Dede, M.B. & Lüftü, M. and Yekta, E. (Writers) & Sabanci, K. (Director). (2006-2009). In E. Avci (Producer), *Binbir Gece.*TMC.

Yörenç, E. & Gençoğlu, M. (Writers) & Bayraktar, U. (Director). (2007-2008). In K. Çatay (Producer), *Menekşe ile Halil*. AY YAPIM.

Yörenç, E. & Gençoğlu, M. (Writers) & Erarslan, M (Director). (2005-2010). In K.Çatay (Producer), *Yaprak Dökümü.* AY YAPIM.

Yörenç, E. & Gençoğlu, M. (Writers) & Haznedaroğlu, A. (Director). (2007-2009). In K.Çatay (Producer), *Dudaktan Kalbe*. AY YAPIM.

Yörenç, E. & Gençoğlu, M. (Writers) & Saral, H. &Yöş. B. (Directors). (2008-2010). In K.Çatay (Producer), *Aşk-ı Memnu*. AY YAPIM.

Yörenç, E. & Gençoğlu, M. (Writers), & Saral, H. (Director). (2010-2012). In K.Çatay (Producer), *Fatmagül'ün suçu ne?*. AY YAPIM.

Yücel, Z. (Writer), & Teber, F. (Director). (2009-2011). In F. Turgut (Producer), *Hanımın Çiftliği*. GOLD FILM.

Yula, Ö. (Writer) & Irmak, Ç. (Director). (2011-2012). In E. Sakarya (Producer) *Kaşanli Ali Destani*. D Construction.

Yurdakul, A. & Şaşmaz, R. & Özderen, B. (Writers) & Sinav, O. (Director). (2003-2005). In R. Şaşmaz (Producer), *Kurtlar Vadisi*. PANA FİLM.

References

Allen, R. (unknown) Soap Opera. *MBC The Museum of Broadcast Communication.* Retrieved from

http://www.museum.tv/eotvsection.php?entrycode=soapopera

Al Tamimi, J. (2012, April 2). Challenge of the Turkish Soap Operas. *Gulf News.* Retrieved from

http://gulfnews.com/business/features/challenge-of-the-turkish-soap-operas-1.1002249

Altman, R. (1999). *Film/Genre* London: British Film Institute, Palgrave Macmillan.

Anonymous (2012, July 16). Famous TV series to air earthquake scenes to raise awareness. *Hurriyet Daily News.* Retrieved from http://www.hurriyetdailynews.com/TurkRadio.aspx?pageID=238&nID=25594

Anonymous, (2012, November 25). Turkey's PM Erdoğan slams TV series about Ottoman sultan. *Todayszaman.com.* Retrieved from http://www.todayszaman.com/news-299316-turkeys-pm-erdogan-slams-tv-series-about-ottoman-sultan.html

Aristotel. (2002). *Poetika : O pjesničkoj umjetnosti.* Beograd: Dereta. Transl. Đurić, N. (Original work approximately 350 BC)

Booker, C. (2004). *The Seven Basic Plots : Why We Tell Stories*. London, New York: Continuum.

Canikligil, R. (2012, March 7). Mary'ye 'Kerim' terapisi. *Hurriyet.* Retrieved form

http://www.hurriyet.com.tr/planet/20070921.asp

Dervišević, F. (2012, Septembar 7). Turska TV industrija - turske serije. Retrieved from http://tvnovele.motion-forum.net/t11589-turska-tv-industrija-turske-serije

Dežulović, B. (2012, August 30). Suljo Veličanstveni. *Oslobodjenje,* p. 11

Fiddy, D. *The Cult of Cult TV?.* in Abbott, S. (Ed.). (2010). *The Cult TV Book*. London, New York: I.B. Tauris & Co Ltd.

Hirshfeld, R. (2012, December 7). Turkish Soap Opera Inspires Murder, Clerics Blame 'West'. *Israelnationalnews.* Retrieved from http://www.israelnationalnews.com/News/News.aspx/157781#.UTPCr6I3uSo

Ilić, N. (2012, March 7). Istorijski falsifikat: "Romantični Sulejman nabijao srpske glave na kočeve!. *Telegraf.* Retrieved from http://www.telegraf.rs/vesti/104524-istorijski-falsifikat-romanticni-sulejman-nabijao-srpske-glave-na-koceve

Jasmina, M. (2012, August 30). Turska TV industrija - turske serije. Retrieved from

http://www.forum.hr/showthread.php?t=738745

Kasapović, M. (2012, September 8) Sulejman Veličanstveni ponovno pokorio Balkan. *Večernji list.* Retrieved from http://www.vecernji.hr/vijesti/sulejman-velicanstveni-ponovno-pokorio-balkan-clanak-450882

Kearney, R. (2009). *O Pričama*. Zagreb: Naklada Jesenski i Turk.

Kimmelman, M (2010, June 17). Turks Put Twist in Racy Soaps. NYTimes. Retrieved from

http://www.nytimes.com/2010/06/18/arts/18abroad.html?_r=0

Kırbak, Y. (2012, August 5). Greek neo-Nazi party calls for boycott to Turkish soap operas. *iHurriyet.com.tr.* Retrieved from http://www.hurriyetdailynews.com/greek-neo-nazi-party-calls-for-boycott-to-turkish-soap-operas-.aspx?pageID=238&nid=27098

Krajeski, J. (2012, March, 30). Turkey: Days of Their Lives. *Pulitzercenter.* Retrieved from

  http://pulitzercenter.org/reporting/turkey-diyarbakir-kurdish-roles-soap-opera-politics-ayrilik-olmasaydi

Lešić, Z. (2005). *Teorija književnosti*. Sarajevo: Sarajevo Publishing.

Matthewes, O. (2011, September 5). The Arab World's 'Dallas'. In Newsweek Magazine. Retrieved from

  http://www.thedailybeast.com/newsweek/2011/09/04/turkish-soap-operas-are-sweeping-the-middle-east.html

Mazziotti, N. (1996). *La industria de la telenovela*. Buenos Aires: Editorial Paidos.

Nahmias, R. (2012, June 4). Palestinian women outraged over Turkish TV series. *Israel News.* Retrieved from http://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-3872384,00.html

Panjeta, L., Mazziotti, N., Spahić, B., & Sanchez, L. (2005). *Telenovela - fabrika ljubavi, Uvod u produkciju i žanr (Telenovela - La fabrica del amor, Introduccion al genero y a la produccion)*. Sarajevo Naklada Zoro & HEFT.

Rohde, D. (2012, March 9). The Islamic World's Culture War, Played Out on TV Soap Operas. *Reuters. The Atlantic.* Retrieved from http://www.theatlantic.com/international/archive/2012/03/the-islamic-worlds-culture-war-played-out-on-tv-soap-operas/254247/

Staff. (2012, April 4). Tukish soap opera blamed for UAE divorces. *Emirates.news.* Retrived from

  http://www.emirates247.com/news/emirates/turkish-soap-opera-blamed-for-uae-divorces-2012-04-04-1.452235

Ethics and Dualism in Contemporary Psychology: From Avicenna and Descartes to Neuroscience

Alma Jeftić[*]

Abstract

From Avicenna and Descartes a long debate on the role of mind-body dilemma has left a huge impact on ethics of psychological research. That is especially applicable on researches that include both human and non-human participants, as well as their limitations and constraints that are connected to ethical principles. However, these principles are closely related to the interpretation of mind-body dilemma, which depends on different understandings of connection between soul and senses. The purpose of this paper is to examine the major impact of well-known "mind-body" dualism on ethics in psychological researches, with special emphasis on neuropsychology and neuroscience in general, as well as major constraints related to that dillema. The thought experiment has been recognized as a precursor to Rene Descartes' famous 'Cogito ergo sum', as well as his body-mind dilemma. However, Avicenna's argument is more intended to demonstrate conceptually that Aristotle's empirical axiom "*there is nothing in the mind which was not first in the senses*" is mistaken, since there is at least one thing in the mind which is not contingent upon experience, and that is self-awareness. The major contribution of this paper is the inclusion of two philosophical debates on mind-body dilemma while considering ethical approaches to neuropsychological research on both human and non-human participants.

Keywords: Ethics; Neuroscience; Dualism; Mind-body Dillema; Human and Non-human Participants

---

[*] Corresponding Author: Alma Jeftić, PhD Candidate, University of Belgrade; e-mail: ajeftic@ius.edu.ba

Introduction

According to Avicenna theoretical psychology lies outside the province of the physician *qua* physician. In his experiment which he called the "flying man" or the 'floating' man, found at the beginning of his *Fi'-Nafs/De Anima* (Treatise on the Soul), he asks us to imagine a human being with absolutely no sensory experience. According to Avicenna's opinion, the only thing this person with no experiences would know is that she/he himself exists. Therefore, person would be aware of herself/himself (self-aware) quite apart from experiences of other things which stand in some relation to her/him.

The thought experiment has been recognized as a precursor to Rene Descartes' famous 'Cogito ergo sum', as well as his body-mind dilemma. However, Avicenna's argument is more intended to demonstrate conceptually that Aristotle's empirical axiom "*there is nothing in the mind which was not first in the senses*" is mistaken, since there is at least one thing in the mind which is not contingent upon experience, and that is self-awareness.

Suspended in such a state, person is not able to affirm the existence of her/his body because she/he is not empirically aware of it, thus the argument may be seen as affirming the independence of the soul from the body, a form of dualism. However, there is a subject that is thinking, so she/he cannot doubt that self exists therefore the argument can be seen as an

affirmation of the self-awareness of the soul and its substantiality. This argument does raise an objection, which may be applicable to different understandings of ethics in neuroscientific research: how do we know that the knowing subject is the self and what the major differences and ethical constraints between human and non-human participants are.

Avicenna's Psychology and Descartes' Dualism

Avicenna's interest in classical psychology is primarily embodied in the *Kitab al-nafs* parts of his *Kitab al-shifa'* (*The Book of Healing*) and *Kitab al-najat* (*The Book of Deliverance*), which were known in Latin under the title *De Anima*. The main thesis of these tracts is represented in his "thought experiment", also known as "flying man" argument, which resonates with what was centuries later entailed by Descartes's *cogito* argument (Nader El-Bizri, 2003).

Avicenna's psychology requires that connection between the body and soul should be strong enough to ensure the soul's individuation, but weak enough to allow for its immortality (Rahman, 1981, 40). His psychology is based on physiology, which reveals that his understanding of the soul is one that deals almost entirely with the natural science of the body and its abilities of perception. Therefore, the major connection between the soul and body is explained by his understanding of perception,

where bodily perception interrelates with the immaterial human intellect (Rahman, 1981, 40).

The perceiver senses the form of the object first by perceiving features of the object by our external senses, but sensory information is supplied to the internal senses, which merge all the pieces into a whole, unified conscious experience. This process of perception and abstraction is the nexus of the soul and body, for the material body may only perceive material objects, while the immaterial soul may only receive the immaterial, universal forms, therefore the soul and body interact in the final abstraction of the universal (Rahman, 1981, 41).

The soul completes the action of intellection by accepting forms that have been abstracted from matter, which means that a concrete particular (material) must be abstracted into the universal intelligible (immaterial) (Rahman, 1981, 68-69). Both of them continue interaction through the Active Intellect, which is a "divine light" containing the intelligible forms (Rahman, 1981, 68-69). Reason is designed material (or hylic), possible or habitual, and it may be called "material" either in the pure sense, by analogy with the pure matter, which in itself is entirely formless but is the substratum of all possible forms (Fakhry, 2004, 145).

The most lasting legacies of Descartes' philosophy are his thesis that mind and body are really distinct entities. That thesis is

now called "mind-body dualism". He argues that the nature of the mind is completely different from that of the body, and therefore it is possible for one to exist without the other. This argument gives rise to some of the intriguing questions, such as: how can the mind cause some of our bodily limbs to move, and how can the body's sense organs cause sensations in the mind.

In the *Second Meditation*, Descartes argues that he is "thing that doubts, understands, affirms, denies, is willing, is unwilling, and also imagines and has sensory perceptions" (Descartes, 1985, 19). Neither a mind can be understood to be shaped or in motion, nor can a body understand or sense anything. However, human beings are combinations of mind and body such that the mind's choices can cause modes of motion in the body, and motions in certain bodily organs.

According to Descartes, a clear and distinct understanding of the mind without the body exists. Since the mind must have a surface and a capacity for motion, the mind must also be extended and, therefore, mind and body are not completely different. Even though he never described this problem clearly, Descartes himself never took this issue very seriously:

> "These questions presuppose amongst other things an explanation of the union between the soul and the body, which I have not yet dealt with at all. But I will say, for your benefit at least, that the whole problem contained in such questions arises simply from a supposition that is false and cannot in any way be proved, namely that, if the soul and the body are two substances whose nature is different, this

prevents them from being able to act on each other." (Descartes 1985, 275).

It is evident that his response to mind-body problem presupposes an explanation of the union between these two entities, as well as the false presupposition that two substances with completely different natures cannot act on each other.

„Flying Man" vs „Cogito"

One cannot fail to note the striking similarities between the flying man and Rene Descartes' cogito six centuries later (Kaukua, 2007, 14). Avicenna's most general definition of the soul conceives it as a perfection of a living body, but it is important to allow differences between the souls of animals and plants on the one hand, and the souls of human beings and the celestian spheres on the other hand (Kaukua, 2007, 24).

Avicenna's epistemology is based on a theory of soul that is independent of the body and capable of abstraction. This proof for the self in many ways prefigures by 600 years the Cartesian *cogito* and the modern philosophical notion of the self (Black, 2008, 65). It somehow demonstrates the Aristotelian base and Neoplatonic structure of his psychology. The so-called 'flying man' argument or thought experiment found at the beginning of his *Fi'-Nafs/De Anima* (Treatise on the Soul) can serve as one of the examples:

> "We say: one of us must imagine himself as creates all at once an perfect but with his sight veiled from observing

external things, and as created floating in the air or the void so that he would not encounter air resistance which he would have to sense, and with his limbs separate from each other in such a way that they neither meet nor touch each other. He must then reflect upon (the question) whether he would affirm the existence of his essence…" (Rahman 1959, 36)

The main question is: If a person were created in a perfect state, but blind and suspended in the air but unable to perceive anything through his senses, would he be able to affirm the existence of his self? Suspended in such a state, he cannot affirm the existence of his body because he is not empirically aware of it, thus the argument may be seen as affirming the independence of the soul from the body, which represents a form of dualism. But in that state he cannot doubt that his self exists because there is a subject that is thinking, thus the argument can be seen as an affirmation of the self-awareness of the soul and its substantiality (Black, 2008, 66). The same objection may also be posed at Descartes: *how do we know that the knowing subject is the self*?

This rational self possesses faculties or senses in a theory that begins with Aristotle and develops through Neoplatonism. According to Avicenna, the first sense is common sense, the second sense is imagination, the third sense is the imaginative faculty, the fourth sense is estimation, and the final sense is where the ideas produced are stored and analyzed and ascribed meanings based upon the production of the imaginative faculty and estimation (Fakhry, 2004).

The last move in Avicenna's "Thought experiment" is slightly problematic, since it seems to contain the obviously fallacious inference pattern, *"If I know x but I do not know y, then x cannot be the same as y"* (Black, 2008, 11). The question of whether Avicenna explicitly or implicitly commits this fallacy, (which is often laid against the Cartesian *cogito* as well), has been much discussed. However, while the Flying Man argument focuses primarily on the impossibility that self-awareness is a mode of sense perception, the primitive character of the experience exemplified in the Flying Man poses parallel and equal difficulties for the claim that it could be a mode of intellectual understanding as well (Black 2008, 12).

Ethics of Human Soul

Avicenna's particular interest was in the persistence of the Soul's consciousness of itself and its identity throughout the changing cycle of psychic conditions and states, from dreaming to intoxication to sleep (Fakhry, 2004, 164). According to him, even if the Soul is supposed to have been suspended in the air, and without any contact with the body or the external world, it would still be fully unconscious of anything but the fact of its existence. By this fact, existence and identity are achieved at once.

The Soul itself is the basis, of the entire motive, cognitive or the vital functions we associate with it, and as such is logically prior to all these functions (Fakhry, 2004, 164). This concept is

pretty similar to Descartes' cogito, and the similarity has been noted by many scholars. Also, both Aristotle and Plotinus had insisted on the unity or identity of the Soul and the fact that, in its inner and outer functions, motive and cognitive, it is diversified purely accidentally (Fakhry, 2004, 164).

Avicenna claims that human souls are subsistent entities in their own right, and yet, since there are multiple individuals in the species "human", those individuals can only been distinguished from one another by the diversity of their matter (Black, 2008, 77). But in that situation, what is happening to the souls of both human and non-human participants in neuropsychological researches? Is there possibility for researcher to distinguish causes and effects, or, to be sure that the knowing subject is aware? Are there difference between human and animal self-awareness, and, in the same line, differences in ethical principles that should be applied before conducting neuropsychological research on human and/or non-human participants?

According to the Ethical Principles of Psychologists and Code of Conduct (2010), "psychologist conducting intervention research involving the use of experimental treatments clarify to participants at the outset of the research (1) the experimental nature of the treatment; (2) the services that will or will not be available to the control group(s) if appropriate; (3) the means by which assignment to treatment and control groups will be made; (4) available treatment alternatives if an individual does not whish

to participate in the research or wishes to withdraw once a study has begun; and (5) compensation for or monetary costs of participating including, if appropriate, whether reimbursement from the participant or a third –party payor will be sought" (Standards 8.02b, Research and Publication, Informed Consent to Research).

However, there is no informed consent when it comes to the non-human participants, but the Ethical Principles of Psychologists and Code of Conduct (2010) contains parts describing "Human Care and Use of Animals in Research", as follows:

(a) Psychologists acquire, care for, use, and dispose of animals in compliance with current federal, state and local laws and regulations, and with professional standards.

(b) Psychologists trained in research methods and experienced in the care of laboratory animals supervise all procedures involving animals and are responsible for ensuring appropriate consideration of their comfort, health and humane treatment.

(c) Psychologists ensure that all individuals under their supervision who are using animals have received instruction in research methods and in the care, maintenance and handling of the species being used, to the extent appropriate to their role.

(d) Psychologists make reasonable efforts to minimize the discomfort, infection, illness and pain of animal subjects.

(e) Psychologists use a procedure subjecting animals to pain, stress or privation only when an alternative procedure is unavailable and the goal is justified by its prospective scientific, educational or applied value.

(f) Psychologists perform surgical procedures under appropriate anesthesia and follow techniques to avoid infection and minimize pain during and after surgery.

(g) When it is appropriate that an animal's life be terminated, psychologists proceed rapidly, with an effort to minimize pain and in accordance with accepted procedures.

However, it is evident that research ethics of non-human participants relies upon discomfort, illness, harms, while research ethics of human participants includes informed consent and basic information on research provided by researcher. Ethical standards do not include data on human and non-human souls, "knowing subject" and its ability to inform researcher of his/her/its states of awareness, as well as ethical considerations of interpretations of research results. It is a commonplace in the history of philosophy that issues surrounding self-awareness, consciousness, and self-knowledge do not become prominent until the early modern period, since for medieval philosophers, particularly those in the Aristotelian tradition, the nature of self-knowledge plays only an

ancillary role in psychology and epistemology (Black, 2008, 63). This is a natural consequence of Aristotle's characterization of the intellect as a pure capacity that has no nature of its own, therefore self-knowledge for Aristotle is derivative upon knowledge of other things, and thought is itself thinkable in exactly the same way as its objects are (Black 2008, 64).

States of Awareness: How Do We Know that the Knowing Subject Is the Self?

Avicenna recognizes two distinct levels of self-knowledge, the most basic of which is exemplified in the experience of the Flying Man, which Deborah Black labeled "primitive self-awareness" (Black, 2008, 69). Primitive self-awareness violates many of the structures placed on self-knowledge by the Aristotelian principles, and Avicenna differentiates it from the reflexive awareness of oneself via one's awareness of an object that is characteristic of Aristotelianism (Black, 2008, 69). He also distinguishes primitive self-awareness from our knowledge of our bodies and psychological faculties and from our scientific understanding of our essential natures as humans; and he explicitly recognizes the capacity for "knowing that we know" as a distinctive form of self-knowledge (Black, 2008, 70).

It remains unclear whether Avicenna is able to provide a coherent account of the relations among primitive self-awareness and the other varieties of self-knowledge that he inherits from the

Aristotelian tradition, but the broad contours of the Flying Man are generally well-known. Through that experiment, Avicenna identifies two fundamental sources of sense knowledge: everything previously acquired from experience, that is, all knowledge anchored in memory and imagination, and any ocurrent sensations (Black, 2008, 70).

Avicenna beliefs that no one would deny that his/her awareness of himself/herself would remain stable even in these conditions, therefore the subject would continue to affirm the existence of his self. Despite the fact that all sense perception is cut off, person is aware of his/her existence, and affirmation of our existence cannot be dependent upon the experience of having a body. Avicenna thus concludes that since "it is not possible for the thing of which one is aware and not aware to be one in any respect," it follows that the self cannot be either the whole body nor any one of its parts (Black, 2008, 74).

Insofar as the growth of the human body involves development of its faculties, and insofar as consequent changes in self-world relations are brought about through learning based on both exteroception and proprioception, these changes concern the corresponding dispositions in the intellect (Kaukua, 2007, 143). Corporeal awareness relies on perceptual functions (e.g., tactile, proprioceptive, gravitational, visual) and motor programs for bodily actions (Knoblich et al., 2006, 171). Also, picture of other people's bodies give rise to physical and emphatic responses in a

way that no text can produce (Knoblich et al., 2006, 136). Experimental paradigms have proves useful in elucidating the neuropsychological mechanisms underlying phantom-limb experiences, especially for the hemiphantom or phantom half-body (the experience of a defferented/deefferente half of one's body as an entity living a life on its own, and autoscopic phenomena in which one's entire body is experienced as a phantom (Knoblich et al., 2006, 172).

According to Avicenna, there are four basic requirements related to the concept of self-awareness: radical temporal continuity of self-awareness, non-reflectivity of self-awareness, immediacy of self-awareness, and lack of inherent objective content of self-awareness (Kaukua 2007, 102). However, Avicennian animals are capable of intentional apprehension of perceptible objects, therefore one can assume he is not denying the primitive type of self-awareness in animals (Kaukua, 2007, 112). If phenomenality is taken as a mental feature. then Descartes would have to deny any kind of awareness from animals and argues that animals can feel but that there is no sense of what it is like in this animal capacity of feeling (Morris 2000). However, difference between Avicenna and Descartes is quite obvious, and Avicennian animals are more "Aristotelian" animate beings.

If animals are primitively self-aware in much the same sense as humans, than it seems they should both adhere to the same ethical standards and guidelines prior to neuropsychological

research. Since animals cannot provide informed consent, experiments should be organized in a way to include zero harm. However, interpretation of results and conclusions should be analyzed seriously, since one cannot be sure if the knowing subject(s) is(are) the Self. Whereas in humans the account of primitive self-awareness was most intimately connected to the individuated existence of the incorporeal human soul, this cannot be true of animals whose souls are material souls (Kaukua 2007, 114). However, there is no essential difference between animal and human self-awareness. The only difference that should be taken into account is that human self-awareness possesses capacity of taking itself as object of consideration (Kaukua 2007, 117).

Conclusion

The main purpose of this essay was to examine different approaches to human soul and self-awareness provided by Avicenna and Descartes in order to examine its influence on ethics of neuropsychological researches conducted on both human and non-human participants.

According to the ethical standards informed consent is necessary for human participants, while researches conducted on non-human participants should exclude harm and life-threatening situations (same is for human participants as well). However, differences between human and animal soul according to Avicennian psychology do not imply huge differences when it comes to ethical standards and guidelines for human and non-

human participants. Since awareness is in its essence innate, knowing subject should be considered as a soul that is aware if its action in governing the body of both humans and non-humans. Therefore, the interpretation of neuropsychological experiments as well as results should be analyzed through the constraints of researcher to understand the dualism of mind and body united in self-awareness of knowing subject.

References

Black, Deborah. "Avicenna on Self-Awareness and Knowing that One Knows". *The Unity of Science in Arabic Tradition. Logic, Epistemology, and the Unity of Science, Vol 11.* Ed. Rahman, Shahid, Street, Tony, and Tahiri, Hassan. Kluwer Academic Publishers, 2008, 63-67.

Descartes, Rene. *The Philosophical Writings of Descartes*, 3 vols., (trans. John Cottingham, Robert Stoothoff, Dugald Murdoch and Anthony Kenny). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984-1991.

El-Bizri, Nader. "Avicenna's De Anima between Aristotle and Husserl". *The Passions of the Soul in the Metamorphosis of Becoming*. Ed. Anna-Teresa Tymieniecka. Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 2003, 67-89.

Ethical Principles of Psychologists and Code of Conduct. Adopted August 21, 2002; Effective June 1, 2003. With the 2010 Amendments. American Psychological Association.

Fakhry, Majid. *A History of Islamic Philosophy.* New York: Columbia University Press, 2004.

Kaukua, Jari. *Avicenna on Subjectivity. A Philosophical Study.* Yivaskyla: University of Yivaskyla, 2007.

Knoblich, Gunther, Thornton, Ian M., Grosjean, Marc, and Shiffrar, Maggie. *Human Body Perception from Inside Out.* London: Oxford University Press, 2006.

Morris, Katherine. "Bethes machines". *Descartes Natural Philosophy.* Ed. Gaukroger, Stephen et al. London: Routledge, 2000, 401-419.

Rahman, F. *Avicenna's Psychology. An English translation of Kitāb al-Najāt, Book II, Chapter VI, with Historico-Philosophical Notes and Textual Improvements on the Cairo edition*. London: Oxford University Press, 1981.

Psycho-Social Conception of National Identity and Collective Self-Esteem

Bisera Mavrić[*]

Abstract

This paper deals with the phenomenon of national identity as well as with its connection to personal and collective self-esteem. National identity and associated phenomena have so far mainly been investigated as part of sociology, anthropology and political science, since psychology was less engaged in the issue. The national identity out of all kinds of social identity had the greatest influence on historical events. The consequences for the human race, through history, have been both positive and negative. Understanding the importance of this phenomenon has not only theoretical but also practical value for encouraging international tolerance. In recent years, national identity is a topic of interest for many researchers, mainly because of political events and frequent conflicts that are associated with ethnicity. This concept is especially important for Bosnian citizens who are still struggling with consequences from the recent conflicts in this multiethnic country. Most previous scientific papers explain their results within one of three theoretical frameworks: the social identity theory, theories of acculturation and cultural conflict, and the development of the theory of identity formation. Due to geopolitical changes in Europe, the growing interest of psychology to national identity is present, and thus the number of diverse research in this area. In many of them, there is a question about whether reinforces strong identification with the national group as a positive self-image and self-esteem contributes to it.

Key words: Psycho-Social, National Identity, Ethnicity, Collective Self-Esteem

---

[*] Corresponding author: Bisera Mavrić, Assistant Professor; Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences, International Univeristy of Sarajevo, e-mail: bmavric@ius.edu.ba

Introduction

National identity colors numerous aspects of everyday life. Awareness of being a member of certain social category and emotional importance of this association builds the social identity. The process of social identification associated with group behavior involve: ethnocentrism, distinguishing into groups, conformity to group norms, appeal of own group and perception of another who is different. Social identification leads to these effects as well as to prejudice and stereotypes because it is connected with the social categorization (Francesco et al., 2002). Through the process of social categorization of people, things and phenomena in environment are placed in a certain categories based on their common heavy features. Often the information that people receive from the environment make it easier for human's knowledge of the world simplified. Categorization emphasizes similarities of people within the same category, their different diversity of members of other categories. The process of social categorization leads to the formation of stereotypes and prejudices, attitudes towards members of other categories or groups (Francesco et al., 2003). The fact that people identify with their social groups has become almost crucial to the explanation

of different intra and intergroup phenomena such as conflicts among different nations (Hui, 2004). The human need for self expression, the need for at least a certain aspect of self to be seen as constituted by a sense of collectivity and shared identity and not simply autonomous make it impossible to deny the reality of psycho-social conception of both national identity and collective self-esteem.

National identity

Groups with which people identify among the variety of them are certainly nations. Social identity stemmed from the feeling of belonging and identification with particular nation is called the national identity. National identity for an individual has the cognitive, emotional and motivational means of which it makes the subject interests of psychological research (Siber, 1998). The theory of social identity made by authors Tajfel and Turner (1986) is the first theory that fully engulfed the concept of social identity. This study explores its default settings, with the special focus on national identity as a kind of social identity. Within the theory I will explain the concepts of personal and collective self-esteem and observe their relationship with national

identity. Hopefully provided explanations should enlightened the complexity of Bosnian national identity as well. The people of Bosnia must understand their own position in order to behave and live in accordance with that position.

Theories

Social identity theory emerged in the mid-70s of the twentieth century and was made by authors Tajfel and Turner (1986). It is the first theory that systematically affected the concept of social identity and put it in the focus of social psychology. The theory deals with membership in the group, group processes and intergroup group relations (Tajfel and Turner 1989). Its basic premise is that the most only membership in a group is sufficient for providing the individual development of the feeling of belonging. According to Tajfel and Turner social identity is defined as the part of individuals sense of self that comes from the awareness that he is a member determined specific group (or groups), but also forms the emotional importance to him as affiliation (Tajfel, 1981, p. 255).

Social identity theory states that individual social identity is based on affiliation to specific groups that his social identity consists of aspects of their self-image which results from

those groups which human belongs to. Certain social categories within the group are excited about social identity (Francesco et al., 2003). Different authors will agree that the social identity of an individual depends on two processes: recognizing their similarities with members of their group and perceptions of different diversity in compared to members of other groups (Brewer, 1993, Calhoun 1994, Francesco et al., 2002). It is important to emphasize that an individual can have as many social identities as a group with which to identify. They vary in their importance that is salient for self-image depending on the situation in which the individual is located.

According to the theory of identity salience Stryker et al. (1994), an individual is more likely to identify with those groups that are prominent in their everyday life. In some social situation more pronounced will be the identity that involves relationships with several close people. Social identity theory emphasizes the differences between the personal and social identity. Personal identity is based on the idea of the uniqueness of each individual and its different diversity from all other people. It stems from the characteristics of the capabilities of the individual and his

relationships with other people. Personal identity is based on the individual values, ideas, emotions, goals, and self perception. Social identity, as it is mentioned earlier, refers to the individual self perception as the member of group to which it belongs. However, belonging to a group and social identification are possible only when compared with groups that do not belong to. Social identity refers to the distinction from other groups. Social identity can be seen as a contradiction as well because it is difficult to understand how an individual can simultaneously feel different from each other but still similar to them. However, researches on real social groups have shown that personal and social identities are associated (S. Worchel et al., 1998). According to Tajfel and Turner (1986) social identity can be positive or negative depending on how the individual assesses their own social group, regardless of personal characteristics or achievements within the group. Social identity of an individual depends on his own evaluation of the groups and the perception of how others evaluate the group (S. Worchel et al., 1998). In case your own group is estimated as positive compared with other groups, social identity is positive (Mummendey, 1985, according

to Francesco et al., 2003). The fundamental assumption of the theory of social identity is that membership in the group and feelings of belonging are contributing to the positive image of each individual.

Positive and negative social identity

Positive social identity provides a person the feeling of security, self-esteem, self-worth and affiliation. Future individual self-image will be based on own characteristics and the characteristics of the group to which they belong, so individual seeks group which is evaluated positively. It primarily makes the process of social comparison of own groups with other groups. The negative social identity refers to situation where individual's own group is estimated as negative compared with the comparative groups. It often happens that members of minority groups, in contact with a bigger majority group, develop low self-esteem, because they are perceived as belonging to an inferior group. Tajfel and Turner (1986) list some of ways in which the inferior group faces negative social identity. These are: social competence / members of a group trying to impartial way increase in the group and in the society. For example, members of ethnic

minorities established political parties in order to participate in local government. Organizing different cultural happenings and events to the public present their cultural and ordinary drives. Individual mobility - people with negative social identity may discard and replace certain group as a group that poses better basis for the development of a positive social identity. Moreover, it is not possible with category boundaries involved, such as race or gender. Different strategy of social creativity: a) comparative neglect of the dimension in which the comparison unfavorable for inferior group and search for new dimension on which will be more favorable comparisons, b) the choice of less threatening will out group comparison. Inferior group does not slow with the dominant group than the minorities in a way when the outcome is advantageous. The consequence is the development of pride in the group. Discrimination and vilification of other groups to own a group of experienced as superior and better. Tajfel and Turner states that people, in order to achieve a positive social identity, perceived their own group, not only as positive, but as better than other groups. National identity from all kinds of social identity had the greatest impact and the historical events devices. The

consequences for humanity, throughout history, have been both positive and negative. Understanding the importance of this phenomenon has not only theoretical but also practical value necessary to encourage international tolerance. In recent years, national identity is the subject of interest of many researchers primarily because of political developments and frequent conflicts that are associated with a national belongingness (Siber, 1998).

Psychological aspect of a nation

Psychological aspect of a nation is defined as a feeling of belonging, community, and as a system of attitudes towards their own ethnic group. National feeling is a feeling of belonging that is formed within a certain social group. However, besides the national feeling of subjective categories it largely depends on the behavior of others towards us and on their evaluation of our national identification. National identity and associated phenomena have so far mainly been investigated as part of sociology, anthropology and political science, and psychology to a lesser degree. In recent years, due to geopolitical changes in Europe, growing interest in psychology to national identity has been present. Most previous works

explaining their results within one of three theoretical frameworks: the theory of social identity theory of acculturation and cultural conflict, and developmental theories of identity formation (Phinney, 1990). According to social identity theory membership in the group in the individual arises the feeling of belonging and built the positive social identity. An individual with their national groups share common beliefs, attitudes, values, ordinary drivers, language and religion.

If we take as an example the fusion of religious and ethnic national identity in Bosnia and Herzegovina the distinction between "us" from "them" leads to understanding of national identity, which is constantly changing and is created through interaction and retreat borders to other groups. Different religious groups do not accept the same national identity. Subjective identification of the individual with the group is essential for national identity but also the recognition concerned group of by external members (Hui, 2004). Many studies raised the question if the strong identification with a national group contributes towards a positive image of yourself and higher self-esteem. When the dominant group in society underestimates or demeans a minority

group member of minority groups can develop negative social identity (Phinney, 1990). Contact with bigger majority group of members and minority groups can get to the development of low self-esteem because they are perceived as members of inferior groups. There are several different ways to "defense" the inferior group. Tajfel and Turner (1986) say that the identification with their own group is mostly pronounced when the boundaries between into tight groups, status refers unstable and when differences are perceived as illegitimate (Ellemers et al 1988). According to Phinney (1990), the identification of the two different groups can occur in people under the influence of two or more cultures. It may adversely affect the development of the national identity of members of minority groups due to a conflict of values, attitudes and norms behavior between them and most majority groups. Impact of two cultures or more cultures in some situations can have positive effects on the cultural identity of the individual. It is the most common to happen when cultures are compatible, similar in terms of norms, values and attitudes. Acculturation model emphasizes that the national identity can speak just in case when there is prolonged contact between the

two or more ethnical group, which then let a broader analysis of the changes in cultural attitudes, values and behavior which is the case in our country.

Developmental theories

Developmental theories are the third in the group of theories of national identity. According to them national identity is considered to be dynamic and changing anyone in time and context. Based on the theory of development of Erikson ego-identity of individual assumes a long process of research and experimentation (Fulgosi, 1983). Development of national identity is seen as a process where an individual examination of the role of national identity in their lives. The process consists of three phases. The first phase is diffused, unexplored national identity. According to the model, at this stage there are adolescents and those adults who have not been exposed review their own national identity. As quoted in Phinney (1990) key term period for the formation of national identity is considered the transition from primary to secondary school. Some authors believe that at this stage of minorities occurs preferences the dominant culture. However, it is not necessarily so because it is possible that young people were not interested in national issues

and not thinking about them. It is also possible that parents take positive national attitudes and therefore do not show a preference to the biggest group. Research of own national identity is the result of experience that has generated awareness of the individual of belonging to a certain group. This process involves various activities such as reading about ethnicity, participation in cultural events etc. For minorities this process can include both acceptance and rejection of the dominant culture. According to the process model, the development of national identity results in a better understanding of their nationality in the internalization of national identity. Because of different personal and historical experiences internalized national identity has different apparent means of the different individuals and groups.

Internalized national identity

Internalized national identity does not necessarily imply a high degree of ethnicity but includes exposure of an individual who may be aware of their national affiliation. Phinney (1990) states that minority at this stage faces supporting with two fundamental problems: a) cultural difference between their own and the dominant group and b) lower to their own group society.

According to the model Phinney, the adoption of national identity does not necessarily end of the process of its development. The model emphasizes the dynamic aspect of adoption of national identity. Phinney (1990) says that, when it comes to the dominant group, phase changes slower than at minority groups, because there is a longer stay at the stage of the diffusion of national identity. Members of the dominant group simply take the value of their groups and have less need for research of their own national identity as resulting in little change of phase of national identity. Deaux (1996) states that positive attitudes are the most commonly expressed and explored through positive affective reactions as pride and satisfaction and acceptance in regard of strengthening of their own group. The lack of positive attitudes and/or express negative attitudes towards their own national group can be seen as a denial of its own national identity. Negative attitudes can manifest itself as a desire for it to be become member of another ethnic group (Phinney, 1990). According to *the International Social Survey Programme* (ISSP) 22 European countries showed interesting results. A higher level of national pride show that participants have a strong feeling of national belonging that is

feeling the case "Close" to his country. Older and less educated participants show bigger national pride, while the difference based on gender was not determined (Orcs and Kamen, 1998). It also included exposure to the work and life of their own ethnic group and referred to how individuals involved in maintaining the tradition and culture. The research used the most common indicators included exposure to: the use of national language, the way of friendships and intimate relationships, i.e., whether it is for them belonging to the same ethnic important, how is group affiliation determined, particular religion and its practice, participation in activities and the formation of social and national institutions (homeland, clubs, societies), it also included exposure to political activities for the betterment of their own national group, the selection of housing with respect to the national affiliation, the fostering of national values, interest in the country of origin, and knowledge of national history and culture (Phinney, 1990). Rot and Havelka (by Siber, 1998) assume that there are five types of national attachment: First is the national attachment, characterized by a distinct awareness of belonging to their own nation, the only score that affiliation is important and means

significant, and contempt of other nations. The authors believe that this form of national attachment corresponding terms in the literature signifies concepts as ethnocentrism, nationalism or national chauvinism. Furthermore, they are talking about prominent national attachment that involves patriotism and a certain national level of acceptance and strengthening of the existence of other national affiliation.

Conclusion

Multiple national attachments are a form of internationalism that is characterized by feelings such as loyalty to their own nation, but also the desire for international cooperation and understanding. Loyalty is primarily reflected by mankind, according to what is judged human, valuable and advanced for all nations and peoples. Prominent international ties are characterized by attachment to the human community and strive to overcome narrow national interests. This would be the identifying sign of cosmopolitanism. The absence of national attachment or individualism or lack of attachment to any nation or the national feeling is considered unnecessary and harmful. A series of studies

were conducted in order to verify this theoretical model. In this scope, if Bosnia is a name for any kind of identity, its content is not the mathematical sum of nations or national cultures. Its content lies in permanent cultural interaction. The name Bosnian is not a term for a national order, or only a regional or territorial one. It is a name for the process of civilization that lasts for a millennium, through historical changes and political adversities practiced with vitality by all. In this ongoing process of interaction special identities retained exposing themselves to the continuous culture change.

References

Bray, B. M. (2001). *The influence of academic achievement on a college student's self-esteem.*

http://clearinghouse.mwsc.edu/manuscripts/225.asp.

Brewer, M. B. (1993). Social Identity, distinctiveness, and in-group homogeneity. *Social Cognition*, Vol. 11, No. 1, pp. 150-164.

Calhoun, C. (1994). Social Theory and the politics of identity, in Calhoun, C. (ed.) *Social Theory and the Politics of Identity*. Cambridge Mass: Blackwell Publishers.

Cinnirella, M. (1997). Towards a European identity, Interactions between the national and European social identities manifested by university students in Britain and Italy. *British Journal of Social Psychology*, 36,1, 19-31.

Corkalo, D. i Kamenov, Ž. (1998) *Nacionalni identitet i medjunacionalna tolerancija*, Izvještaj s VIII. Ljetne psihologijske škole, Odsjek za psihologiju Filozofskog fakulteta u Zagrebu.

Deaux, K. (1996). Social Identitety in: Social Psychology Handbook of Basic Principles, Higgins, E. T. & Kruglanski, A. W. (Eds.), Guilford Press.

Ellemers, N., Van Knippenberg, A., de Vries, N. & Wilke, H. (1988). Social identification and permeability of group boundaries. *European Journal of Social Psychology,* No. 18, pp. 497-513.

Franceško, M., Kodžopeljic, J., Majstorovic, N. i Mihic, V. (2002). Aspekti Evropskog identiteta operacionalizovani skalom EUROID2002, Licnost u višekulturnom društvu, Vol. 4, str. 105-114.

Forum Bosnae Journal, *Reconstruction and Deconstruction*, IFB , 2007.

Fulgosi, A. (1983). *Psihologija licnosti: teorije i istraživanja*, Školska knjiga, Zagreb.

Jelic, M. (2003). Provjera postavki teorije socijalnog identiteta na etnickim grupama, *Magistarski rad*, Filozofski fakultet u Zagrebu.

International Forum Bosnia, www. mfb.ba.

Lackovic- Grgin K. (1994) *Samopoimanje mladih*, Naklada Slap, Jastrebarsko.

Luhtanen, R. i Crocker, J. (1992). A Collective Self-Esteem Scale: Self-Evaluation of One`s Social Identity. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin*, Vol. 18, No.3, 302-318.

Miloševic. J. (2003). Jedan pokušaj klasifikacije teorijskih razmatranja nacionalnog identiteta, *Psihologija*, Vol. 36 (2).

Phinney, J. S. (1990). Ethnic identity in adolescents and adults: review of research. *Psychological Bulletin*, No. 108, pp. 499-514.

Rosenberg, M. (1965). *Society and Adolescent Self-Image*, Princeton, New Yersey, Princeton University Press.

Šiber, I. (1988). *Psihologijski aspekti medjunacionalnih odnosa*. Zagreb: Kulturno prosvjetni Sabor Hrvatske.

Šiber, I. (1998). *Osnove politicke psihologije*, Politika kultura, Zagreb.

Tajfel, H. (1981). *Human groups and social categories: Studies in Social Psychology*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press

Tajfel, H. i Turner, J. C. (1986). *The Social Identity Theory of Intergroup Conflict. The Social Psychology of Intergroup Relations*. (pp. 33-47). Monterey, CA: Brooks/Cole.

Weissbrod, L. (1983). Religion as national identity in secular society, *Review of Religious Research*, Vol. 24, No. 3, pp. 188 – 205.

Epiphany
Journal of transdisciplinary studies

REACHING OUT: SOCIAL SUPPORT AND MENTAL HEALTH PROBLEMS OF BOSNIAN IMMIGRANTS IN SWITZERLAND

Selvira Draganović[∗]

Abstract

A state of well being in which one realizes own potentials, can cope with every day stressors, can work productively and is able to constructively contribute to community is called mental health. Many stressful and negative events can interfere with these abilities and thus endanger someone's mental health. Migration is one of them. With its' pre and post phases/stages, migration represents great sources of stress and stressors. Immigrants need good personal and social resource in order to lessen down negative effects of migration on their mental health. The aim of this study is to explore presence of mental health problems in non clinical population of Bosnian immigrants (N=101, F=48, M=53) in Switzerland. It was assumed that migration stress acts negatively on immigrant's mental health. General health questionnaire was used to test this hypothesis. Participants mean score results on total GHQ28 questionnaire were M=51.06, S.D. =14.30, its subscales on depression M=10.12 S.D.=3.75, somatic complaints M=13.04 S.D.=4.5, anxiety/insomnia M=13.34 S.D. 4.8, and social dysfunction M=14.37 S.D.=3.5. This indicates presence of mental health problems among Bosnian immigrants. At the same time, the study shows presence of social support seeking (N=83 subjects listed family and friends) as primary coping strategy used by Bosnian immigrants while dealing with difficulties and problems rather than seeking professional help (N=3 subjects listed professional help seeking). Thus, social support seeking acts positively on mental health of Bosnian immigrants.

Keywords: Mental Health; Immigrants; Bosnian Immigrants; Social Support

---

[∗] Corresponding author: Selvira Draganović, PhD Candidate, Faculty of Philosophy, University of Sarajevo; e-mail: selvirad@hotmail.com

Background to the study

According to Kakar (Fernando, 2001) concept of mental health is a term which covers different aspects and concerns such as: absence of disabling symptoms, integration of psychological functioning, successful leading of personal and social life, and feeling of ethical and spiritual wellbeing. However, for our purpose, mental health defined as the ability to think logically and rationally, to adjust to transitions, stress, trauma and losses which happen to everyone, in a way which allows emotional stability and growth, suites better (Hales and Hales, 1995).

Immigrants belong to a risk group for mental health disorders due to many pre emigrational, emigrational as well as post emigrational factors and phases that they go through. Acculturation phases, adjustment, immigrants' age as well as effects of factors such as small income, immigrants' status, low access to psychiatric treatment etc, are in close relation to the emergence of mental health problems like depression, anxiety, suicide, alcohol and drug use by immigrants. Immigrants are at risk for mental health problems due to much pre-migration, migration as well post migration factors and phases which

immigrants experience. Acculturation phase, adjustment, immigrants' age, interrelated factors such as low income, immigrants' status, low access to psychiatric care etc. are related to appearance of mental health problems such as depression, anxiety, suicide, and alcohol and drug abuse in immigrants' population. Immigrants are risk population especially when they migrate with low or no prior knowledge about country they migrate to. Their coping strategies are not always efficient and acceptable. Coping strategies represent immigrant's efforts, mainly psychological and behavioural, which immigrants use, tolerate, decrease or minimize stressful events. Lazarus and Folkman (Horwitz and Scheid, 2006) coping strategies define as cognitive or behavioural attempts to cope with situational demands that someone perceives demanding or those that overcome someone's ability to cope. In other words, coping is actually a process by which people try to cope with perceived difference between demands and own resources which they assess in a given situation. People cope with certain problems by making certain efforts in order to adjust to a problem or change their perception about it. As such, these efforts could be effective

(seeking social support for example) or ineffective (avoiding problems) leading to problems solving or the opposite.

Effective coping strategies in a form of social support can decrease effects of permanent stressors and act positively on immigrants' mental health. On contrary, ineffective coping strategies which could appear in a form of avoidance or retreat when different stressors appear, contribute to emergence of mental health problems (Busse and O'Mahoney, 2000). Coping strategies are usually divided into primary and secondary coping strategies and problem focused and emotion focused coping strategies. Primary coping strategies are direct measures or, overt, problem focused behaviour directed to change of disturbing events in stressful environment (looking for social support). Unlike primary, secondary coping strategies are more cognitive than behavioural and they are most often related to changing perception and assessment of stressful situations and events. In another words, primary coping strategies mean changing environment so it will suite "me" and secondary, changing "me" so I will suit the environment.

Looking for social support contributes to adjustment and helps individuals to easily cope with problems because persons with social support are emotionally more stable and cope with different environmental demands as well as with mental health problems more easily (Horwitz and Scheid, 2006).

Social support is related to someone's social contacts and relations, social integration and relation inside primary group. Social support and relations (resources) and relations with others from where support emerges are not only basis for mental health but also can serve as protective factors from negative effects of different stressors. Resources or sources of coping (social support, strong felling of control etc.) and coping strategies reduce or diminish negative psychological effects of stress and stressors (Horwitz and Scheid, 2006).

Horwitz and Sheid (2006) cite many studies which researched significance of relation between mental health and social support (Cohen and Willis, 1985; Cohen and Syme, 1985; Dean and Lin 1977; Gottlieb, 1981; Kessler et all 1985; Sarason and Sarason, 1985; Sarason, Sarason and Pierce, 1990; Turner 1983; Vaux 1988; Veil and Bauman, 1992) and great majority of these studies

shows great correlation with little or no support and ill mental health in general, especially with frequent depression. Cassel and Cobb with their research have set preliminary foundation for hypothesis which dominates inside these researches: "social support is important moderator in effects of life stressors on mental health" and as such it represents significant protective factor (Horwitz and Scheid, 2006). Ward states that social support is related to improvement of psychological wellbeing (greater social support, better psychological wellbeing and vice versa) (Ward, Bochner and Furnham, 2003). Besides, sociological studies in domain of social support suggest abating effect of psychological problems when there is strong or just present social support regardless if it comes from ethnic community or local citizens (Khuo and Tsai, 1986).

Aim of this study is to explore presence and role of social support in mental health problems in non clinical population of Bosnian immigrants in Switzerland. It was assumed that social support has a role in mental health of Bosnian immigrants in Switzerland.

Participants and methods

Participants

Participants (N=200) were 48 female and 53 male, ages between 18 and 60, Bosnian immigrants currently residing in Switzerland. Mean age for the total sample was 32.9±, mainly married, who migrated to Switzerland in three periods, before the war (1992-1995), during the war, after the war. Out of total number 129 surveys were completed and delivered to researcher. 28 of them could be only partially used due to incomplete data (demographics or unanswered questions. Participants were generally healthy and were not cognitively or perceptually impaired. They were recruited from a large Bosnian community in Switzerland.

Procedure

Participation in the study was voluntary and no compensation was given. The survey, entitled "Mental Health," consisted of socio-demographic questionnaire and general health questionnaire GHQ 28.

Questionnaires

Demographic questionnaire, and participants demographics: A few independent variables stated as important predictors which act positively on mental health of immigrants, as proved by former

studies and report, were also included in our study: gender, marital status, age, year of migration, immigrants status – visa type (B visa – resident and work permit for a year –can be prolonged, or C visa – permanent work and resident permit or CH visa – Swiss citizenship, employment before migration, current employment, length of residency in Switzerland.

General health questionnaire 28 (GHQ 28) (widely used for similar purposes by, Jancz, 2000, for example).

General health questionnaire 28 (GHQ 28): For the purpose of this research we used general health questionnaire with 28 items, shortened version of GHQ with 60 items. General health questionnaire 28 (GHQ 28) is a multiple choice paper pen questionnaire. It is designed to detect current non psychotic psychiatric disorders in general population. Questionnaire has four subscales: Somatic complaints, anxiety and insomnia, social dysfunction, major depression.

General health questionnaire can be administered to adolescents or adults of any age. It is diagnostic but it can be used to detect acute conditions (Goldberg and Hillier, 1979). Since 1972 when Goldberg first created its' first version with 140 items, general

health questionnaire was translated to 38 world languages (Croatian is one of them, which we used) it has been validated in more than 50 studies. There are four versions of it at the moment (with 60, 30, 28 and 12 items) available to psychiatrists, qualified doctors, clinical psychologists and experienced counsellors (Jancz, 2000). Cronbach's (1951) alpha coefficient for internal validity for GHQ 28 version ranges from .84 to .93 in different studies. Goldberg and Hillier (1979) cite that test – retest probability coefficient on 87 psychiatric cases with six months follow up was .90 and it appears as reliable and valid assessment technique for psychological or mental health (Jancz, 2000). Results for general health questionnaire (GHQ 28) are gained by adding responses on all items and summing them up. Higher score implies more mental health problems in form of depression, anxiety, somatic complaints or social dysfunction.

These two parts were completed with **two open ended questions**: 1. Who do you talk to about your problems/difficulties, 2. Who do you seek to share or talk to when you face any kind of problems/difficulties.

Analysis and categorisation of respondents' answers to the two, above cited open ended questions, indicate four following categories: family and friends, professionals, myself and no one.

Results

We used General Health Questionnaire 28 in order to test presence of mental health problems among Bosnian immigrants in Switzerland. Results of means and standard deviations are listed in table below.

General health questionnaire GHQ 28	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
Results on somatic complaints subscale	98	7,00	24,00	13,0408	4,51097
Results on anxiety insomnia subscale	100	7,00	28,00	13,3400	4,88911
Results on social dysfunction subscale	96	7,00	25,00	14,3854	3,59933
Results on depression subscale	93	7,00	24,00	10,1290	3,75391
GHQ total results	87	28,00	91,00	51,0690	14,30547
Valid N (listwise)	78				

Table 1. Mean results on GHQ and its subscales

Table 2 two shows most frequently cited answers to question "Who do talk to - share your problems with?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Family and friends	83	82,2	84,7	84,7
	professionals	3	3,0	3,1	87,8
	No one	11	10,9	11,2	99,0
	myself	1	1,0	1,0	100,0
	Total	98	97,0	100,0	
Missing	System	3	3,0		
Total		101	100,0		

Table 3 shows most frequently cited answers to question "Who do you turn to/ask/ for advice and help when faced with difficulties and problems?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Family and friends	79	78,2	81,4	81,4
	Professionals	7	6,9	7,2	88,7
	No one	11	10,9	11,3	100,0
	Total	97	96,0	100,0	
Missing	System	4	4,0		
Total		101	100,0		

To test the the difference for variable: *talking with family and freinds*, and GHQ 28 and its subscales ANOVA test of variance. Results are presented in table below.

Variable: who do you talk with about your problems/difficulties? Participants-answered **Family and friends**	Variability source	Sum squares	df	Variance	F ratio	Sig.
General health questionnaire (GHQ 28)	Between groups	3625,568	3	1208,523	**7,150**	**,000**
	Within groups	13691,208	81	169,027		
	Total variability	17316,776	84			
GHQ-subscale somatic complaints	Between groups	122,829	3	40,943	2,069	,110
	Within groups	1820,911	92	19,793		
	Total variability	1943,740	95			
GHQ-subscale social dysfunction	Between groups	307,292	3	102,431	**10,086**	**,000**
	Within groups	903,826	89	10,155		
	Total variability	1211,118	92			
GHQ-subscale anxiety and insomnia	Between groups	181,622	3	60,541	2,657	,053
	Within groups	2141,644	94	22,783		
	Total variability	2323,265	97			
GHQ- Subscale depression	Between groups	1432,382	2	716,191	**8,326**	**,000**
	Within groups	7483,573	87	86,018		
	Total variability	8915,956	89			

Significance p < 0.05

Table 4. ANOVA variance test results for variable talking with family and friends and GHQ, and its subscales: somatic complaints and social disfunction. Note: Significant results are emboldened.

Discussion

As presented in tables above, mean scores results on GHQ 28 and it's subscales, indicate mild presence of mental health problems (Mean scores=51.07, s.d. 14.31). Social dysfunction scale points to the highest mean scores results, Mean=14.3854, s.d. 3.593). ANOVA results point significant difference on variable talking with family and friends and general health questionnaire GHQ 28, its' social dysfunction and depression subscales. F-ratio is, 7.15 (with p= .000), 10.09 (p= .000), and 8.33 (p= .000) respectively. Considering stressful effects of migration and adjustment processes this results are not surprising. However, in answer to the open ended questions "who do you talk to/who do you seek to talk with when faced with problems", most frequently cited response was "family and friends (before professionals). This response indicates strong presence of social support, good social

networking, and reaching out as coping strategy which Bosnian immigrants use. Reaching out and seeking social support and networking, which appears in a form of the need for instant/immediate talk with family/friends during and after problems (and personal distress) incessant phenomena within Bosnian community. Stressful and problematic situations have to be shared and discussed right away (Bosnian call this "a cup of talk", a talk while drinking coffee or some other drink). Such encounters have many positive outcomes. Firstly, utmost important for immigrant's mental health is a strong sense of emotional relief which follows this "cup of talk" or layman's therapeutic sessions (immediate sharing/discussion of problems). Secondly, reaching out and social support seeking results in diminishing of short and long term stressful issues and problems. Still, sharing problems with others results in short stress relief.

Operational definition of migration in our paper is based on the fact that migration is closely related with psycho social process of loss and change as well as adjusting to a number of stressors. In psychiatric terminology loss is linked to the grieving process (Carta, Bernal, Hardoy, Haro-Abad, 2005.) Grieving is reaction to

a specific psychosocial stressor (a loss of a loved one for example) but it is not considered as psychological disorder. However, if grieving is severe or prolonged more than it should be, then it belongs to the category of major depressive disorder or adjustment disorder (First, Frances and Pincus, 1997).

This grieving process during migration is explained through seven stages which cause anxiety and distress in immigrants: family, friends, language, culture, homeland, loss of status, loss of contact with ethnic group and exposure to the physical risks (Carta, Bernal, Hardoy and Haro-Abad, 2005). Above this, researchers consider that this emigrational grieving is interrupted/discontinuous because sources of grieving disappear during the contact with homeland and appear again after the return. This is not the case with grieving for the loss of the loved one which is continuous process (contact with a person completely ceased due the death). Thus, host country acceptance is of crucial importance in this case because difficulties in showing the grief might cause many psychological problems.

The loss of contact with family and friends, loss of status, adapting to the new language, culture, environment and all the

other inevitable changes in a process of immigration could be huge sources of anxiety, distress and stress thus endangering immigrant's mental health. At the same time, regardless of the country's politics, citizens in some countries fiercely react to foreigners and as a result discrimination, xenophobia, racism, and different stereotypes appear. Problems which arise as a result of such reactions make immigrant's adjustment difficult and may cause adjustment disorders.

Conclusion

Even though social support is one of the coping strategies most often used by Bosnian immigrants in Switzerland, which according to many studies, proves to serve as mediator in manifestation and occurrence of mental health problems, it seems that solely it does not serve the purpose. Our results, in line with other studies, indicate that migration stress acts negatively on mental health of immigrants. Mean scores on GHQ 28 show that Bosnian immigrants suffer from mild stress, depression, anxiety, somatic complaints, insomnia and social dysfunction. ANOVA t-test for variance also shows significant results for variable "talking with family and friends "and General health

questionnaire GHQ 28 and its social dysfunction and depression subscales.

Family and friends are most frequently sought source of support among Bosnian immigrants. This speaks of immigrants' two very important coping factors: integration and assimilation. Integration means shaping up own identity by nurturing own traditional values (ethnic country) and adopting cultural traditions of host country. Assimilation is a process which contains three basic elements: learning and adopting new reactions to the host society, irretrievable changes related to adoption and acceptance of cultural, historic and intellectual forms of new, host society and finally, transformation into a full social member of a given new society. Strong social support from family and friends of Bosnian immigrants in Switzerland could mean strong social networking made of members of own ethnicity what indicates confinement inside own ethno group and weak or no integration and assimilation.

Weak or no integration and assimilation, on the other side, means weak acceptance by host society and adjustment to it, what in turn can result in psychological maladjustment, feeling of being

discriminated, feeling of being a citizen of second order, feeling of not belonging there, feeling rejected and unwanted. Perceived discrimination is related to increased psychological distress and pain (Furnham and Shiek, 1993, Ying, 1996). Such feelings form solid basis for immigrants' even greater wish to close up and remain within own ethno-group. Members of their own ethno-group understand one another and have the same or similar problems. This leads to immigrants need to meet and associate even more often and discuss their problems. In the end, although they talk about their problems and social support as coping strategy is strongly present, strong feelings of not belonging, discrimination and rejection might still cause distress. Thus, mental health problems might appear showing that immigrants are vulnerable and at risk to develop mental health problems.

Finally, this study indicates that Bosnian immigrants turn to mental health professional little or not at all when they face problems or difficulties (only 10 % or participants stated that they turn to mental health professionals when they face problems and difficulties). This data also indicates different beliefs about mental health and illness as well as treatment of mental disorders which

is typical for Bosnian citizens who turn to mental health professional only as a last resort, when they exhaust all other ways and means. Stigma (mental health issues are still related to "being crazy/mad") related to mental disorders is still present among Bosnians, even when they live in society with different orientation towards mental health/disorders.

References

Beck A. T., Steer R. A., Garbin M. G. 1988. "Psychometric properties of BDI: twenty-five years of evaluation." *Clinical Psychology Review*.

Busse D., O'Mahoney G.P. 2000. *Migration Issues in Mental Health: A Review*; 1-er Congreso Virtuale Psiquiatria, February – Mart, inter Salud net.

Carta, M. G., Bernal, M., Hardoy, C. M. 2005. "Migration and mental health in Europe (the state of mental health in Europe working group)." *Clin Pract Epidemiol Ment Health*. 2005; 1: 13.

Cohen, Kamarck and Mermelstein. 1983. "A global measure of perceived stress*." Journal of Health and social behavior*; 24/4; 385 –396.

Fernando S. 1995. *Mental Health in a Multi Ethnic Society: a Multi-disciplinary Handbook.* Routledge, UK.

Furnham, A., Sheikh, S. 1993. "Gender, generational and social support correlates of mental health in Asian immigrants." *International Journal of Social Psychiatry* 39:22-33

Goldberg, D. P., and Hillier, V. F. 1979. "A scaled version of the General Health Questionnaire." *Psychological Medicine*, 9, 139-145.

Hales, D., and Hales, R. E. 1995. *Caring for the Mind: The Comprehensive Guide to Mental Health.* Bantam Books, New York

Horwitz A. V., Scheid T. L. 1999. *A Handbook for the study of Mental Health: Social Context, theories and systems.* Cambridge University press, UK.

Jancz M. 2000. *Social and psychological adjustment of first generation Polish Immigrants to Australia*. University of Sidney. Sidney.

Kuo W. H.; Tsai Y. M. 1986. "Social networking, hardiness and Immigrant's Mental health." *Journal of health and social behaviour*. vol. 27; 2, 133-149.

Lazarus R., Folkman S. 1984. *Stress, appraisal and coping.* Springer Publishing Company, New York.

Ward C., Bachner S., Furuhan A. 2001. *The psychology of culture shock.* Routledge, United Kingdom.

Epiphany

Journal of transdisciplinary studies

Psychological Aspects of Elopement: A Case in Bosnia-Herzegovina

Đenita Tuce[*]

Abstract

Despite the fact that an elopement becomes declining marriage practice in Bosnia, there are still a significant number of women who marry this way and who are able to share their knowledge on this cultural heritage. It is not call into question that elopement has a great sociological significance for young women. After elopement the marriage gains an achieved status and the girl gets stable position in the society as married women. However, the question posed in this paper is what does elopement imply from psychological point of view? Could it be considered as a sign of integrated ego-identity or does it just reflect youthful defiance and spirit of exploration. In addressing these questions, we relied on Erikson's work as a theoretical framework and discussed the relation of elopement and ego-identity within his psychosocial theory of development.

Keywords: Elopement; Ego-identity; Erikson's Psycho-social Theory of Development

---

[*] Corresponding author: Đenita Tuce, Senior Assistant;Faculty of Phylosophy, University of Sarajevo; e-mail: djenita.tuce@gmail.com

Introduction

In general, the term *elopement* is used to refer to a marriage conducted in sudden and secretive manner, usually involving hurried flight away from one's home together with one's beloved with the intention of getting married. A Bosnian phrase for elopement is *ukrala se*. It is a long-standing practice in Bosnian culture, when a woman leaves her home without her parents' knowledge to live a life with her future husband. Elopement often occurs as a result of an impending pre-arranged marriage or in defiance to parents' disapproval of a girl's choice and decision to marry.

It is worth to notice that elopement is different from *bride abduction,* although studies often discuss these two phenomena together (Kudat 1974; after Doubt, 2012). Although, elopement occurs without knowledge or permission of girl's parents, it involves the consent of a young girl. Bride abduction, on the other hand, occurs when a girl unwillingly is kidnapped into marriage (Doubt, 2012). Elopement is also different from *traditional wedding ceremony*, which usually follows after a public period of engagement and after the parents' permission is received.

Although this custom is changing in Bosnia and is not as common as it was sixty years ago, there are still a significant number of young women who get married in such a way (Doubt, 2014). In the research conducted in 2013 by Mareco Index Bosnia, a survey research group in Sarajevo, the result showed 20.5% of 1.875 subjects reported marrying by elopement. Of the respondents, 6.8% married, between the ages of eighteen and twenty-seven, reported to have eloped to marry (Doubt, 2014). As it was pointed out by Doubt (2014), despite the fact that elopement is becoming declining marriage practice in Bosnia, there are still a significant number of women who are able to share their knowledge on this cultural heritage. It is a reason why it is important to study this custom today.

In the following lines, there is one story about elopement which happened in 2006. It is a story of the young woman's participation in a close friend's elopement.

The elopement story

The elopement happened in a town of middle Bosnia. Her girlfriend decided to elope and get married to a guy whom she was dating for four years and was already engaged to. Decision

for such sudden marriage occurred due to unplanned pregnancy, and the couple decided to do it secretly, because they were afraid of girl parents' reaction. His parents, on the other hand, were acquainted of the plan and he had their support to take the girl to live with them. At that time, the girl was 22 years old college student.

They arranged elopement in 15 days. Meanwhile, the girl lived with her parents. She attended college, hid the pregnancy and acted like it was all the usual. Her parents didn't suspect anything and had no idea what was about to happen. Several of her best friends, including our storyteller, knew about the plan. Although, she kept her girlfriend's secret and tried to be supportive during this "preparation period", she was also trying to convince her that it was not a way to get married and to encourage her to talk to her parents and tell them the truth. Her girlfriend was aware that her parents will be hurt, but still persisted in her decision to elope. She said that, despite the circumstances, she loved her boyfriend and really wanted to get married with him, but she just couldn't stand their disappointment and reaction, because they would think that this came too early.

Few days before the elopement, her girlfriend told her that there would be a modest wedding party in her future husband's house, just with a few relatives and the closest friends, and she asked her and other girlfriends to come. All of them accepted invitation, except her. She felt it would be wrong to celebrate this act in the groom's house, knowing that bride's parents were in the agony at the same time. "I wouldn't be able to look her parents in the eyes after that", she said. So, she didn't go, but she visited her girlfriend in her house just before she planned to go "on regular date" (as her parents thought). She gave her a hug and wished her all best in the future life.

Next day, she found out that there was a great party in the groom's house. There were musicians and nice food, and everybody had good time. Few hours after bride's arrival to the groom's house, they called her parents and told them that she had eloped. Just as it was expected, her parents were shocked. Her father was so angry and her mother was out of herself. She got so sick, so they had to give her a glass of water and a pill to calm down.

Two days after, all brides' girlfriends, including our storyteller, went to visit her mother, to see how she was doing and to comfort her. They were being prepared to everything – to anger, to disappointment, to rejection. They knew that they were some kind of accomplices in that act. But, when they arrived, her mother welcomed them and was so happy that they came to visit her. Although, she was still sad because of everything, she thanked to those who have gone with her daughter to the groom's house. "I am so happy that she wasn't alone and that there was someone from her side of wedding guests", she said. Our storyteller remembered how frustrated she was by that statement, because, she was the only one who didn't go there and obviously the worst one in the eyes of her girlfriend's mother. The irony was that she decided not to go, precisely because of them and their sadness. But she didn't say anything. She just accepted that she was "the black sheep" in the group.

Today, her girlfriend lives in a happy marriage and has two beautiful sons. Her parents forgave her all very soon after everything happened. They have good relationship and visit each

other often. Her parents enjoy the company of their grandsons and the elopement has been re-told as the anecdote of their life.

This story is in line with many other elopement stories (for more examples see Doubt, 2012). There are a few main concepts, which are common to the most of them: *secrecy*, *shock and disappointment* of the girl's parents and their *acceptance* in the end. Also, what is obvious in most of such stories is that elopement results in a change of a girl's social position and has great sociological significance for young girl. As it was pointed out by Doubt (2012), in a short period after elopement, marriage gains achieved status and the girl gets a stable position in the society as married women.

Our question in this paper, however, is what psychological implications of elopement are? Is it just a behavior governed by external circumstances and social conditions or is it more than that? What does this act actually come to signify when it comes to personal characteristics of the women who marry this way? Could it be considered as a sign of formed ego-identity which is characterized by clear vision of one's own future, or it just reflects youthful defiance and spirit of exploration?

In attempt to address these questions, we are going to rely on Erikson's work as a theoretical framework and discuss the relation of elopement and ego-identity within his psychosocial theory of development. In the following lines, there is a brief overview of Erikson's work as an introduction to discussion of these relations.

Psychological aspects of elopement

Erikson's work, which was greatly influenced by Freud, is consistent with Freud's ideas about the structure and topography of personality (Hall, Lindsey & Campbell, 1997). Similarly to Freud, Erikson emphasized that personality develops in a predetermined order, and build upon each previous stage. However, while Freud was an id psychologist, Erikson was an ego psychologist and his main concern was development of the person within a social context (Leman, Bremner, Parke & Gauvain, 2012). According to Erikson (1980), the environment in which a child lives is crucial to providing growth, adjustment, self-awareness and identity.

Erikson (1968; after Leman et al., 2012) described development that occurs in eight stages throughout the lifespan. Each stage is

associated with a specific developmental task, from which than follows a developmental crisis (Leman et al., 2012). For Erikson (1980) these crises are psychosocial in nature because they involve psychological needs of the individual conflicting with the requirements of society. According to Erikson (1980) a crisis is crucial period of increased vulnerability and heightened potential and can be resolved positively or negatively. In other words, each stage involves opportunities for positive ego development as well as deficits in one's character.

These stages represent a sequence of ego growth, occurring as the individual meets the challenges of different periods of life and resolves the conflicts that are dominant in those periods (Marcia, 1994). According to the theory, successful overcoming of each stage results in a healthy personality and achieving of personality strengths, which the ego can use to resolve current crises (Erikson, 1980). Failure to successfully overcome a stage, on the other hand, can result in a reduced ability to complete further stages and therefore a more unhealthy personality and sense of self (Erikson, 1980). These stages, however, can be resolved successfully at a later time (Berk, 2006).

Among all stages, Erikson put the greatest deal of emphasis on the adolescent period, stressing it is a crucial stage for developing a person's identity (Berk, 2006). During adolescence, the most important developmental task is transition from childhood to adulthood. Children are becoming more independent, and begin to look at the future in terms of career, relationships, families, etc. At the same time, they want to belong to a society and fit in (Erikson, 1980).

This is a major stage in development where the adolescent, in order to integrate resolutions from all previous stages, will re-examine his identity and try to find out who exactly he or she is. During this period, adolescents explore possibilities and begin to form their own identity based upon the outcome of their explorations. According to Erikson (1980), what should happen at the end of this stage is a re-integrated sense of self, of what one wants to do or be. Failure to establish a sense of identity within society can lead to role confusion, involving the individuals not being sure about themselves or their place in society (Erikson, 1980).

Up to this stage development mostly depends upon how we resolve the crisis in previous stages. Speaking in terms of Erikson (1980), the preconditions of integrated sense of self and personal identity are positive resolutions of the previous crisis. These involve establishing *a sense of trust in others* in the first stage, *a sense of autonomy* in the second stage, *a sense of purpose and initiative* in the third stage and *a sense of competence* in the fourth stage (Erikson, 1980).

The next stage of psychosocial development, Erikson (1980) characterized as the initial stage of being an adult and called it *intimacy vs. isolation*, according to main developmental task which is related to forming intimate, loving relationships with other people. Successfully resolution of this crisis leads to strong relationships, while failure results in loneliness and isolation. But, as in all previous stages, the positive resolution of this crisis has developmental forerunner at the previous one. It means, that precondition of being able to accomplish intimacy with others is integrated sense of self and personal identity (Erikson, 1980).

While elopements of Bosnian women occur within traditional, patriarchic social structures, they defy parental

authority over a young person's decision to marriage (Doubt, 2012). In that sense, although these women seem sensitive to external circumstances and social conditions, they have made their own decision based upon internalized, self-constructed values. Taking that into account, it seems justified to assume that there is a positive relation between elopement and ego-identity.

There are few reasons for such assumptions. First, decision to elope indicates that unmarried girl, in her attempt to successful transition to adulthood, re-examines her identity and tries to adopt new role as an adult woman, so she could fit in the society. By undergoing elopement, she demonstrates a clear vision into her own future and enough courage to bring it into action. Both of that indicate the integrated sense of personal identity. On the other hand, the elopement by itself shows that girl is willing to form intimate, loving relationship with her future husband, which also, according to Erikson (1980), wouldn't be possible without stable and integrated ego-identity. As it was pointed out by Erikson (1980), without stable identity, it is difficult to achieve intimacy with other person. It requires that person in a certain way

renounces oneself. So, in order "not to lose oneself", the person must have a deep inner security and be able to return to oneself after having been close with other person (Erikson, 1980). In this regard, genuine and stable binding with others might be considered as a result of verification of strong self-determination and integrated identity.

Individuals, who don't have a strong identity, are afraid of intimacy, of losing their autonomy and of drowning their own self into others. Faced with these fears, they can either isolate themselves of others or look for the intimacy through repetition of trials and errors (Erikson, 1980). In these circumstances, many of them enter into marriage, hoping that, by finding each other, they will find themselves. Unfortunately, common outcome for the couples who married while still quite young and immature is divorce (Leman et al., 2012).

In that sense, it is reasonable to take into consideration the maturity of Bosnian women who eloped, since the most of them were quite young when they got into marriage (see Doubt, 2012). Since the adolescence is a period of exploration of different possibilities, it can be argued whether this decision was a

reflection of maturity and clear vision of the future, or it just reflected youthful rebellion and spirit of exploration. In other words, it may be call into question whether elopement really implies strong ego-identity or, on the contrary, only one of the attempts of forming one, or what Marcia (1994) called *identity moratorium.* In this respect, it is important to emphasize that Erikson (1980) considered that achieved identity of an individual, does not remain his permanent achievement and that process of identity formation continues through the person's life. As he pointed out, identity can be in some later stages, weakened or strengthened, as well as changed (Erikson, 1980). In that sense, the possibility that elopement gave the young women an achieved ego-identity is not questionable. As it was pointed out by Doubt (2014), most of these women reported that they felt stronger and more self-confident, after this act. But, what makes elopement more than just a phase of exploration in order to form ego-identity is *commitment*, which is clearly highlighted in the narratives of elopements by Bosnian women (see Doubt, 2012). This virtue is, according to Erikson (1980), the main achievement in this stage of development and the most important sign of formed identity.

When there is a lack of commitment, as Erikson (1980) pointed out, the young person, although sexually mature, cannot become neither spouse, nor parent. This is in line with Marcia's (1994) definition of final identity status, which he called *identity achievement*. This identity status represents both a high degree of exploration and a high degree of commitment. According to Marcia (1994), at this identity status adolescents will experiment with many different beliefs and values, and analyze their pathway in life, but they will be able to prioritize what is important to them and will sort through many possibilities of who they want to be. Marcia (1994) also pointed out that in order to fully achieve this type of identity, the young person must feel positive and confident about his/her decisions and values. *Identity moratorium*, on the other hand, refers to the identity status which represents high degree of exploration but a low degree of commitment. At this status, adolescents are in the midst of an identity crisis which has required them to explore and experiment with different values, beliefs and goals. However, they have not made any final decisions about which beliefs and values are most important to them, and which principles should guide their lives. In other

words, they have not been committed to a particular identity yet (Marcia, 1994).

Conclusion

A crucial feature of elopement is that the young woman autonomously chooses to elope and form loving, intimate relationship with her future husband. The old values and ascribed roles are seriously examined and new alternatives are explored. The young woman chooses the future and makes a commitment, even as she is determined by social condition and her past. Taking into account all of these, as well as the analysis based on Erikson's theory, it seems justified to advocate the assumption that decision to elope implies more than just a reflection of youthful rebellion and spirit of exploration and could be considered as a sign of formed ego identity. Of course, these assumptions would be worth verifying through empirical research at some point in the future.

References

Berk, L. 2006. *Development through the Lifespan* (4nd Ed.). Boston, MA: Allyn & Bacon, Inc.

Doubt, K. 2012. "Elopements of Bosnian Women." *Anthropology of East Europe Review,* 30(2): 91-101

Doubt, K. 2014. "Elopement and Ego-Identity in the Narratives of Bosnian Women." In M. Adamović, B. Galić, A. Gvozdanović, A. Maskalan, D. Potočnik, L. Somun Krupalija (Eds.). *Young Women in Post-Yugoslav Societies: Research, Practice and Policy* (pp. 287-304). Zagreb and Sarajevo: Institute for Social Research in Zagreb, Human Rights Centre, University of Sarajevo

Erikson, E.H. 1980. *Identiy and the Life Cycle*. New York: W.W. Norton & Company, Inc.

Hall, C. S., Lindzey, G., & Campbell, J. B. 1997. *Theories of personality* (4th Ed.). New York: John Wiley & Sons

Leman, P., Bremner, A.J., Parke, R.D, & Gauvain, M. 2012. *Developmental Psychology*. London: McGraw-Hill

Marcia, J.E. 1994. "The Empirical Study of Ego Identity." In H.A., Bosma, T.L.G., Graafsma, H.D. Grotevant & D.J. de Levita (Eds.). *Identity and Development: An Interdisciplinary Approach* (pp. 67-80). London: Sage Publications, Inc.

Theory, Literature, and Dialogue: Bakhtinian Consciousness in New Indian Literature

Bhumika Sharma[∗]

Abstract

Emerging new literature has facilitated a dialogue among the alternative aesthetics created by new literature with an interpolation of central theoretical discourses. It opens an avenue for theories travelling across cultures to decipher intricacies involved into contemporary world. Today we live with a global consciousness that illustrates the formulation of a new postcolonial-postmodernist 'I'. Bakhtin's concepts of dialogic consciousness, the unfinalizable self and the idea of the relationship between the 'self' and 'others' lead us to understand this postcolonial-postmodernist framework as reflected in many Indian literary and cultural discourses. It throws light on how we perceive an individual entity in relation to the specific socio-cultural code which inhere multiple intercessions. Present article attempts to discover the fundamentals of the 'postcolonial-postmodernist liberation' through the case study of two selected Indian literary texts by Arvind Adiga and Amitav Ghosh. Both the texts explain the psychology behind the working of dialogic consciousness and the intercession involved in the formulation of postcolonial-postmodernist subject. It may be elucidated through the understanding of mechanism that always strives to attain a point of equilibrium. Representing the postcolonial-postmodernist psychology which questions various cultural norms, it initiates a dialogue between freedom and restrictions, individual and social, and real versus virtual. It turns out an everlasting quest for refined version of the metamorphic 'self' shaped by the dialogic consciousness of the postcolonial and postmodernist world.

Keywords: Dialogic Consciousness; Unfinalizable 'self'; New Literature; Theoretical Intercession; Postcolonial-postmodernist Psychology

---

∗ Corresponding author: Bhumika Sharma, Assistant Professor, Central University of Rajasthan, Bandar Sindri, Ajmer Rajasthan, India; e-mail: sharmabhumika@curaj.ac.in

The vast realm of emerging new literature opens an avenue for theories travelling across cultures to decipher intricacies involved into contemporary world. Today we live with a global consciousness that shape our psychology. Theorists have given us many analytical tools to understand the differences and diversities of the 21st century postmodernist and postcolonial world. It has facilitated a new dialogue among the alternative aesthetics created by new literature with an interpolation of central theoretical discourses. Does it illustrate a new postcolonial-postmodernist flux that indicates a complex dialogic embrace between theory and literature? How does such interlacing comprehend subtle implications of cultural crisscross? In fact, it designates a new psychological paradigm which elucidates various postcolonial and postmodernist developments.

Defining Contemporariness

In a glimpse, our contemporariness appears a curious combination of east and west, real and virtual, and a process of redefining 'centres' in relation to the 'margins'. Being a part of the hi-tech multicultural global world, we experience these juxtapositions at every moment. The world seems to be constituted of images drawn from different sources. Holding so many differences together a postcolonial-postmodernist understanding strives to negotiate multiple 'others' with reference to one's defined spatial-temporal positioning. It is the key term 'difference' that underlies every 'post' theory mosaic. All postmodernist compositions whether at physical or at metaphysical level, are acknowledged as

well as absorbed with a typical psychological bend to the underlying idea of 'difference' that resists the process of homogenisation at the same time facilitating a reasonable covert acceptance of it. Each response to the prevailing multiplicities of postmodernist time is regulated by the interactive action taking place in the negotiating zone. In fact, it is the irresistible negotiation among various differences that constitutes the key element of postmodernist psychology. It works both at individual and collective level especially when an entity undergoes the process of identity formulation.

A Dialogic Zone: Bakhtin's Theoretical Explanation of Negotiating Differences

Bakhtin's concepts like carnival, heteroglossia, and polyphony help to explain the nature of contemporary culture where one may find oneself engaged in an everlasting dialogue within and without. Perhaps, it is the compulsive human instinct of negotiating differences that generates a dialogic consciousness. Every individual, being a unit, constitutes merely a part of the whole. Yet, on the other hand, existing as an independent entity one also strives to attain completeness in oneself. In this process of *self attainment* the dialogic consciousness assumes central role, formulating a typical tendency of talking to 'self' with regard to the fragmented 'others' around.

Negotiating differences is a very important term when we open an explorative chapter on postcolonial and postmodernist psychology. Since living in today's era means living with

differences and dissensions, the validity of any kind of uniform coding appears susceptible. With the postmodernist mode of thinking the idea of 'absolute' crumbles. Monologue gives way to dialogue and we acknowledge the dialogic consciousness as an inherent feature of human sensibility. The historical consciousness which underlies the vast literary and cultural discourses of human civilisation reinterprets the strategic relationship between the differentiating 'twos' of binary opposition. With the increasing dialogue 'twos' break down into 'many' debilitating all the boundaries that create them. It questions the foundational principles of various categorisations that define our contemporariness.

Intercessional Working of Postcolonial-postmodernist Psychology

How do we perceive the conception of identity especially with regard to today's postcolonial and postmodernist position? Do we all collectively inhabit the world as an assortment of individuals living in continuous flux? Since the idea of any stable identity founded on original purity does not hold true in the world of multiple centres engaged in continuous dialogue, the process of identity formulation becomes more complex. Identifying oneself with such state of incomplete 'self' endorses Bakhtin's conception of unfinalizable 'self'. It substantiates the strong imminence of negotiation, here predominantly with respect to the scattered 'others' the 'self' chooses to interact with in the postmodernist world of 'differences'. It calls for an intercessional mode of

working in human psyche. What is important to understand the constitution of postmodernist psychology is to identify this intercessional form, i. e., the nature of bargain and the level of intensity at which socio-political or cultural negotiations are worked out at different levels of human sensibility.

While investigating the issue harbouring on Bakhtin's idea of dialogic consciousness, one can easily recognise the multiplicity of perspective and voices and the possibility of their cohabitation at borderline. But there exist two levels of dialogic consciousness where negotiations are enacted in the process of identity formation especially in relation to the postmodernist condition of multiple 'others.' How it is worked out anticipates a layered exposition of the consciousness. In view of the complexities involved in a two tier visualisation of human consciousness, one's enquiry of intercessional working need to be conducted separately, in a phased manner. Since it is the two dimensional expansion of the 'self' which brings out the attributive difference between the individual and collective consciousness and its characterisation of intercessional working of the postcolonial-postmodernist psychology.

At the level of individual consciousness it is the dialogic 'self' that undergoes the process of identity formulation making itself responsible for the negotiation. Being the double edged postcolonial-postmodernist 'self' it, a priori, acknowledges the presence of 'others' for address and engagement. Its dialogue with multiple others necessarily anticipates closure, notwithstanding

how short lived and unfinalizable, but a closures that anticipates the next level of closure making it an ongoing process.

On the other hand, the postmodernist collective consciousness, while engineered with the post-national outlook of postcolonial framework, appears more inclined to erase the borderlines. It passes by the first stage celebration of postcolonial national identity paving the way to global consciousness through a network of statements and responses. In its incomplete and unfinalizable expression it continuously rejects the authoritative discourses to respect the existing world in its autonomy generating a dialogue in which all socio-cultural components are forced to participate for more truthful version of postcolonial-postmodernist reality.

Who Am I? The Postcolonial-postmodernist 'Self' in Dialogue

Human psyche conceives the 'differences' with ambivalence. The 'difference' creates the idea of 'other' and the 'other' is always seen an object of embrace as well as resistance. Present postcolonial and postmodernist phase definitely blurs, if not erases completely, the boundaries existing between the categorised constructions of different nature. These realities manage to coexist on account of peculiar psychology of embracing the 'Others' while relieving the apprehensions of losing 'Self' through dialogic consciousness. Since it is a vital question that how far one allows the 'other' to be accommodated as a part of the 'self' while negotiating differences, one needs to understand the nature of such barter at every level of consciousness. Perhaps, there is a dicey borderline drawn by each

one of us in the process of resolving inner and outer contradictions.

> I am conscious of myself and become myself only while revealing myself for another, through another, and with the help of another. The most important acts constituting self-consciousness are determined by a relationship toward another consciousness (toward a thou) … The very being of man (both external and internal) is the deepest communion. To be means to communicate … To be means to be for another, and through the other for oneself. A person has no internal sovereign territory, he is wholly and always on the boundary: looking inside himself, he looks into the eyes of another or with the eyes of another … I cannot manage without another, I cannot become myself without another. (287)

The above quoted expression of 'the self' reveals the importance of 'other' in the formation of one's identity. Whatever 'I' expresses is always out of its dialogue with 'other' as well as its response to the 'other'. As pointed out by Martin Irvin, in Bakhtin's view,

> an *expression* in a living context of exchange--termed a "word" or "utterance"--is the main unit of meaning. It is formed through a speaker's relation to Otherness, that is to say, other people, others' words and expressions, and the lived cultural world in time and place.

The postcolonial-postmodernist dialogue of the 'self' consists of many such expressions. It occurs both at inner and outer stratum since the postmodernist psychology inheres the internalisation of 'other' in the 'self' as an ongoing process of identity formulation. Situated at the hinge, the conversation may take place within the 'self'. One is the speaker as well as the listener. Who speaks here on behalf of the 'self' as the postcolonial-postmodernist condition does not leave any place for

original purity? Is it the 'Other Voice' experienced within the 'self'? Does it represent those 'others' picked up by the 'I' from the outside world. Perhaps, it is the same 'other' existing in the world without, but knowingly or unknowingly, internalised as a part of the 'self'. It may be denominated variedly, call it the voice of conscience, or internalised stereotypes, absorbed ideologies or to be more scientific, the domain of human psyche termed 'superego' by Freud in his theory of psychoanalysis. In simpler terms it is the inner resistance or the acquiescence that rein the flight of the 'self' giving it desired direction in response to the question "Who am I?" The answer to this question can never be monologic. It is always an outcome of inner dialogic consciousness that confers upon the 'singularity' to each individual through a distinct identity to the 'self' despite sharing numerous common features with others.

Illustrating the Composition of Rare 'I' in Adiga's *The White Tiger*

Let's probe into the formation of a combinative 'rarity' that marks the duality of postcolonial-postmodernist consciousness. It consists in choosing the assumptions that suits to the desired liberation of the 'Self'. The postcolonial-postmodernist 'Self' appears a proportionate composition of various selections of what one would like to be. Textual analysis of Adiga's celebrated work *The White* Tiger demonstrates how it is worked out through a dialogic consciousness. According to Bakhtin, the 'I' cannot maintain neutrality toward moral and ethical demands which manifest themselves as one's voice of consciousness. Freud'

classification of Id, Ego and Superego also refers to the same while explaining the structure of psychological sections that rift apart the 'self' exhibiting a clash between natural drives and social obligations. Yet, it is an accepted dictum that one owes to his own feelings and sentiments. An individual is always committed to the liberation of its 'self'. While confronting any 'Other' that liberates the 'Self' from the pressure of such demands, the 'self' moves out from already defined territory. It is drawn to embrace the 'Other' that attracts it for being unconventional, or unfamiliar, or the 'different'. It seems alluring on account of its liberalising impact. But such lead is always full of apprehension of dismembering the 'self' or robbing of its unity. Post modernist psychology frees the 'self' from such apprehensions facilitating a free dialogue. Since the postmodernist world of mosaic multiplicities offers one immense possibilities to drift from the accustomed 'self' through a dialogic process, the intercessions become less restrictive and more open, as well as intense and regular both at internal and outer levels. The 'self' is free to negotiate with multiple 'others' in its constant reification. It facilitates one's liberation revising the points of equilibrium attained through dialogic consciousness that constantly shapes the transformed 'I'. Being charged with a fascination to attain completeness, the 'self' always remains dialogic. Bakhtin's concepts of the unfinalizable self and the idea of the relationship between the self and others help us to understand this postcolonial-postmodernist psychology. It's reflection in Adiga's *The White Tiger* becomes apparent when the reader discovers its

protagonist engaged in a continuous dialogue which subscribes to the formulation of his identity. Whether addressed to the Chinese premier or enacted in his own mind, the protagonist of the novel exposes a dialogue at work, working out the new 'Self' of its protagonist Balram. Balram is the emergence of new 'I' as a postmodernist individual, at the same time, facilitating the Indo-Chinese dialogue of collaborative Asian understanding against colonial west. What Balram attains at postmodernist level reinforces the postcolonial resistance and denial to neocolonialism.

Adiga christians Balram the white tiger for being rare. What makes him 'rare'? Doesn't the narrative evince that it is Balram himself who bequeaths rarity to his 'self'. He rejects all the prior definitions imposed upon him by various class and caste meta-narratives. Same holds true for new third world power like India and China. He represents the true postmodernist construction where meta-narratives crumple down giving way to a significant micro narrative generated out of his dialogue with the organic world around him. It is the dialogue between these two that makes him rare since Balram's uninhibited dialogic consciousness endorses the postcolonial-postmodernist psychology of disbelief in fixed definitions.

Adiga's white tiger may be treated as an interesting case study of postcolonial-postmodernist psychology of intercession. The rarity of Balram exhibits how we can perceive each individual in relation to the specific socio-cultural code. Each 'self' in postmodernist condition is rare on account of its

combinative quality. It reiterates postcolonial rhetoric of a new negotiated multicultural identity founded on global consciousness. Postcoloniality is an ever evolving dialogue with the west. As the dialogue never closes permanently, multi-layered intercessions reify the self, keeping it always in flux and for that matter, anticipating further and, in fact, continuous transformation. As a postcolonial-postmodernist construction Balram epitomises affirmation and negation of dialogic consciousness executed by the 'self' as it suits to it in its response to other. It is executed at the level of both person and nation in today's postcolonial-postmodernist world. Since the postmodernist displacement of meta- narratives with multiple micro narratives evinces loosening of the conceptions like ethics, morality and many such impositions, postcolonial designates the liberated nationalist assumption within reconstructed global liberation. As a sign of it, one can easily experience how to let the other permeate into or release it from one's 'self' when engaged in dialogue.

It, in a way, explains the psychology behind the working of dialogic consciousness. Comprehended through the mechanism that always strives to attain a point of equilibrium, postcolonial-postmodernist psychology demonstrates an intersection between yeas and nays. What determines the identity of the 'self' in question is the attainment of that point, how so ever momentary. Let's see how it works in the case of Balram who reveals his dialogic consciousness in the following expression:

> One day at a traffic signal, the driver of the car next me lowered the window and spat out: he had been chewing *paan*, and a vivid red puddle of expectorate splashed on the hot midday road and festered there like a living thing, spreading

and sizzling. A second later, he spat again-and now there was a second puddle on the road. I stared at the two puddles of red, spreading spit- and then:

The left-hand puddle of spit seemed to say:
Your father wanted you to be an honest man.
Mr. Ashok does not hit you or spit on you, like people did to your father.
Mr. Ashok pays you well, 4,000 rupees a month. He has been raising your salary without your even asking.
Remember what the buffalo did to his servant's family. Mr. Ashok will ask his father to do the same to your family once you run away.

But the right-hand puddle of spit seemed to say:
Your father wanted you to be a man.
Mr. Ashok made you take the blame when his wife killed that child on the road.
This is a pittance. You live in a city. What do you save? Nothing.
The very fact that Mr. Ashok threatens your family makes your blood boil.
I turned my face away from, the red puddles. I looked at the red bag sitting in the centre of my rearview mirror, like the exposed heart of the Honda City. (Adiga, Pg. 245-46)

It is the cleft in the 'self'. It is the part of the 'self' trying to shed the ideological burdens of ethics and morality imposed upon it by socio-political norms. These norms anticipate each to follow the rules laid down for classified group or social stratum that structure the system. Certain well defined behaviour pattern is expected from each one to make the system work. 'Self' is pressurised to follow the normative lines that identifies one's 'self' with a particular class or categorisation. Only that makes one fit in the system. Balram was planning to murder his master for no apparent personal consciously done mistake by him. Now what matters most is to understand how far his innocent master resembles the innocent neo-colonial hegemony. This pretended

innocence is to be exterminated for the realisation of a truly liberated 'Self'. So, it was his psychological need to justify his intended act otherwise how will he define his 'self' in the light of his acts. It reminds well known African American artist Richard Wright's seminal work *Native Son* the protagonist of which also undergoes the same dialogic process in defining himself in the context of outside world. Such dialogue consists of what he thinks of himself in response to what others think of him. He also undertakes the liberation of 'self' which inheres a dialogic nature talking to itself and finding who's, why's and how's of the happenings. How can he justify his present action with special reference to the injustices done to his 'self' in the past? The internal quietening extends to the world without, turning into a passionately heated dialogue with the society. The author himself appears intensely engaged in the dialogue raising the question if it is possible to find out an ideological solution of racial debate prevalent in America.

 Adiga's white tiger Balram resembles Wrtight's native son Bigger since both exemplifies the dialogic consciousness of the 'self' that defines it. Their dialogue within the 'self' represents a well composed heteroglot. Whether it is 20th century American Bigger or 21st century Indian Balram, their 'self' consists of various voices from different sources, be it social, political, economic, religious, moral or ethical institution of the society. The difference simply lies in the focus and intentionality of the dialogue that dramatises its fictional representation in the text. In Wright's case it is racial oppression whereas Adiga picks up the

class conflict underlying the contemporary capitalistic democracy of a developing third world. Both of them bring out the psychological underpinnings that shape the behaviour pattern of human character.

Bakhtin's concept of dialogic imagination helps to explain the postcolonial-postmodernist psychology of conflicting ideas that simultaneously dwell in consciousness driving the individual 'self' into different directions. Since the postcolonial-postmodernist world is seen as a fragmented whole, an individual mind turns into a fragmentary composition of ideas. There is neither certainty nor finality. Values change with the time; meaning alters with the place; and the text varies with the context since there is no meta-narrative to supply the defined norms. It is the epoch of multiple micro narratives involved in a never ending dialogue. The postcolonial-postmodernist 'self' absorbs this dialogue placing itself in relation to the multiple 'others' that shape today's multicultural, multi-linguistic, multi- religious, and multi-ethical society.

> And finally, at any given moment, languages of various epochs and periods of socio-ideological life cohabit with one another... Thus at any given moment of its historical existence, language is heteroglot from top to bottom: it represents the co-existence of socio-ideological contradictions between the present and the past, between differing epochs of the past, between different socio-ideological groups in the present, between tendencies, schools, circles and so forth, all given a bodily form... Therefore languages do not exclude each other, but rather intersect with each other in many different ways. (*Dialogic Imagination*, Pg. 291)

In the context of *The White Tiger* Adiga's protagonist finds it difficult to obliterate the voice of past existing in his

consciousness in the form of his father's image and words spoken by him. But he has to resolve the debate to ensure a concrete action. Decision is to be taken in either/or and it is important since it is closely associated with the question of the liberation of the 'self' from multiple others imposed upon the consciousness of Balram. In the words of Bakhtin, "The word lives, as it were, on the boundary between its own context and another, alien, context." (*Dialogic Imagination*, Pg. 284).

Balram's dialogic imagination differentiates between 'honest man' and 'man' in a subtle manner. In the perception of his 'self' an honest man can never become a man given the relative position of his 'self' to the 'others'. He makes the language of his 'self' an instrument to express his dissension with his defined status and role. It is very much required for its liberation. He constructs a different and contextualised meaning in his expression to himself since the 'addressivity' and 'answerability' both lie in one's own perception. It is his own self that engages in the conversation with itself, hence the meaning is to be constructed as well as understood from two different stands.

> Neutral dictionary meanings of the words of a language ensure their common features and guarantee that all speakers of a given language will understand one another, but the use of words in live speech communication is always individual and contextual in nature. (Speech Genres and Other Late Essays p.88)

An author uses various narrative techniques to bring in the dialogic consciousness of the 'self'. Sometimes it takes the form of interior monologue and at other times it simply flows along the stream of consciousness embroiled in the inner thoughts and

opinions of the person in question. Whatever the case, it ultimately exhibits the acceptance and rejection of the 'other' by the 'self'.

> There is adequate complexity in postmodern fiction of the 1980s and 1990s to trace those internal dialectics of complicity and immanent critique without anticipating some 'unimaginable new mode of representation' which will somehow make it all easier for us. (*The Fiction of Postmodernity*, p. 56)

Perhaps, it illustrates the complexity of the postcolonial-postmodernist 'self' reflected in the fictional works of post 1950s Indian literary tradition.

Postcolonial-postmodernist Deconstruction: Towards a Borderless World

Besides the negotiations of macro and micro narratives enacted in the multilayered consciousness of the postcolonial-postmodernist self, the intercessional psychology is to be understood at the level of collective consciousness too. Since it is the shared sensibilities that give birth to typical inclinations and collective responses, one is required to decipher the formation of group identity. How are the group identities formed? Are these fully proportional to the erection or corrosion of various socio-political constructs? Caused by the emergence of new sensibilities, and performed at community level, indeed these are always subject to altercation. The changed perception of the postcolonial-postmodernist world serves as a demonstration of its deconstructive nature which makes it conducive to the notion of ever changing space-time continuum.

To test the validity of the argument let's take up a case study of the novel *The Shadow Lines* (1988) penned down by the Indian-Bengali writer Amitav Ghosh. The novel brings out the intricacies of the deconstructive psychology that shapes the virtual reality of the contemporary world. In this world one finds it hard to demarcate the 'real' and 'virtual'. Founded on the conception, the novel exquisitely illustrates Bakhtin's questioning of the significance or non-significance of borderlines. Demarcation always anticipates division, and division leads to dialogue. Does the dialogue generated out of civilizational coding and categorised divisions manifest the working of postmodernist collective consciousness? Since the dialogue anticipates a connection, its possibility right away ruptures the idea of segmentation implied in all kind of divisions. Constant blurring of the boundaries through such dialogic consciousness explicates the postcolonial-postmodernist move from local to global. The image of the global citizen represents an all inclusive collective identity. It reflects the cumulative projection of a fractured identity caught in the precariousness of negotiating zone.

Ghosh's novel *The Shadow Lines* interlaces the life of a young boy growing up in Calcutta and later on in Delhi and London. The narrator adores Tridib because of his tremendous knowledge and his perspective of the incidents and places. He loves listening to Tridib because Tridib's lore is very different from the collection of facts and figures. Narrator's grandmother called Tha'mma has a dreadful past and wants to reunite her

family and goes to Dhaka to bring back her uncle. Later Tridbib gets killed by frenzied mob in the communal riots of 1963-64 in Dhaka in his attempt to rescue her love May.

The novel aptly epitomises the cleft experienced in the new global world emerging out of postcolonial-postmodernist sensibility. Those who live that experience pass through a dilemma of being placed between local and global. The postcolonial-postmodernist reality of the world marked with an implicated diasporic consciousness shatters the unity of nationalist identity codified in the 'self' in terms of political geography. It is the part of the consciousness that identifies the elements of national as well as cultural 'otherness'. How does the postcolonial-postmodernist self react to it? What experience does it undergo? It is interestingly captured in the broodings of the narrator of *The Shadow Lines*, whose narration captures the dialogic consciousness. The novel evinces the disjointed perspective of time and events, of lines that bring people together and hold them apart, lines that are clearly visible from one perspective and nonexistent from another, Lines that exist in the memory of one, and therefore in another's imagination and so on. The author seems to believe that these are the lines that fragment the unified 'self' of an individual. The postcolonial-postmodernist psychology lies in questioning all those non-existent lines which are made to appear real, so compelling as well as appalling. It is a postcolonial-postmodernist dialogue between the 'real' and the 'virtual' as in postmodernist discourse, or 'real' and the

'imaginary' in terms of postcolonial diaspora. How much can one believe in these nonexistent lines that demarcate the regions called 'mine' and 'others'. Perceived from the global perspective, the dialogue immediately deconstructs all the meta-narratives pertaining to the nationalist constructions of the world. As exhibited in the following passage:

> The narrator's grandmother in *The Shadow Lines* exemplifies nationalist attitudes towards time and space. She passionately values the idea of a national tradition ... Linked to this history teacher's idealization of tradition is her naive faith in national borders. Not realising that borders in maps are conventional constructions, she wonders when she flies back to her home in East Pakistan like "the long black line with green on one side and scarlet on the other... in a school atlas." ("The Contradictory Sexual Politics of *The Shadow Lines*", pp. 117-18)

Can one trust the demarcations made out of defined territories? In the later stage of postcolonial-postmodernist world where the boundaries of the nations appear shattering down, one is robbed of one's beliefs in one's nationalist culture. The whole experience seems disarming and weakening in which a major part of one's 'self' formulated by immediate cultural forces appear cracking down. The text of the novel reconstructs the shadow lines drawn on the map calling into question the very veracity of those defined lines. It throws back to the defined domains of human psyche. Evoking a corollary, it draws the segmented psychological realms of human mind. But, how far even these cerebral lines are to be trusted? Don't these also reproduce the feigned image of shadow lines in one's 'self'? Being constituted of the multiple impressions of 'otherness' which assimilate in the formulation of the 'self, how can one rely only on one's own

history or celebrated nationalist culture of first phase of postcolonial for define one's 'self'? Tidib's model symbolises this distrust:

> If in a Cartesian epistemological model, the observing subject disinterestedly observes the object, and if in one version of nationalist epistemology, historical knowledge is material that is appropriated for the national good, in Tridib's model, the observing subject is unmanned   by his desire for the otherness of knowledge. ("The Contradictory Sexual Politics of *The Shadow Lines*" p. 123)

 The narrative of the novel is built out of an intricate, constantly crisscrossing web of memories of many people. It invites the reader to invent an embedded spokespersonship, drawing out of the memories of those involved. Presenting a dialogue among the memories that hold mirrors of differing shades to the same experience, it reflects how the dialogic 'self' expresses itself out of a precarious negotiation of 'real' and 'virtual' on the one hand and 'real' and 'imaginary' on the other. The dialogue lies in weaving the discourse making use of the impressions accumulated and assorted at the level of collective consciousness.

Conclusion

In fact, living in today's era means living with differences and dissensions, which doubt the very foundation of the existence of these differences. Postcolonial-postmodernist literary discourses bring out the characters which represent this tendency of subversion. They appear grappling with the inner dissensions especially when found themselves standing in negotiated zones. It is the dialogic zone constituted of either the multiple viewpoints

of the 'self' or the contradictory traits of multiple cultural constructions. As a 21st century world citizen, one may feel the affinity with the characters like Balram, Tridib or the middle class growing boy narrator of Ghosh's *The Shadow Lines*, who defy the stability of monologue. At the same time formulating and resisting their own parameters, they rebel against any kind of 'fixity'. It subverts the very idea of the 'definite'. Their emotional and ideological dilemma represent the postcolonial-postmodernist psychology which questions various social and cultural norms evoking a dialogue between freedom and restrictions, ethical and unethical, individual and social, and real and 'virtual' versus real and 'imaginary'. It is an everlasting quest for refined version of human civilisation that can reflect the true spirit of the postcolonial-postmodernist world. As reflected in the post 1950s Indian fiction, it always evokes a dialogue posing some very essential questions regarding the contemporary reality:

> It (postmodernist fiction) foregrounds and thus contests the conventionality and unacknowledged ideology of the assumption of seamlessness and asks its readers to question the process by which we represent ourselves and our world to ourselves and to become aware of the means by which we *make* sense of and *construct* order out of experience in our particular culture. (*The Politics of Postmodernism*, pp. 53-54)

Indeed, as above quoted words reveal, it is simply the short term representations that assume any sense or order realised by one at individual or collective level. In today's world of negotiating differences, it always remains impossible to reach to the final resolution that can assert of monologic unity. Bakhtin's disclaiming of the possibility of finalisation enunciates the open

ended nature of the dialogue. It may disappoint one but an assumption of paving way to a unified systematically structured realisation of complete 'self' is merely a deception. Hence the postcolonial-postmodernist 'self' is bound to remain floated. Affirming finality through accepting the possibility of unity being materialised through transcending differences somewhere will betray the true psychological underpinnings of new world.

References

Adiga, Arvind. *The White Tiger*. New Delhi: Harper Collins, 2008. Print.

Baker, Stephen. *The Fiction of Postmodernity*. Ediburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2000. Print.

Bakhtin, Mikhail. *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1992. Print.

___ The Dialogical Imagination. ed. and trans. C. Emerson and M. Holquist. Austin: University of Texas P, 1981

___ *Speech Genres and Other Late Essays*. Trans. Vern W. McGee. Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 1986. Print.

___Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics. trans. C. Emerson. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press,1984.

Da Silva, Stephen. "'Tridib's Gastric': The Contradictory Sexual Politics of *The Shadow Lines*". *Postcolonial Indian Fiction in English and Masulanity*. Ed. Rajeshwar Mittapalli and Letizia Alterno. New Delhi: Atlantic Publishers, 2009. Print.

Ghosh, Amitav. *The Shadow Lines*. New Delhi: Penguin Books, 1988. Print.

Hutcheon, Linda. *The Politics of Postmodernism*. London: Routledge, 1989. Print.

Wright, Richard. *Native Son*. New York: Perennial, 2003. Print.

On The Postmodernist Elements in Shakespeare's *The Tempest*

Dr. Payam Abbasi∗
Ali Saeedi

Abstract

Having been discussed for more than four centuries, Shakespeare (1564-1616), believed by many critics to be the most important English dramatist, is still inexhaustible. Through these years and especially in the twentieth century, many different approaches have been applied to his plays. This study is an attempt to have a postmodernist reading of *The Tempest* (1610). Based on the definition and characterization of postmodernism by Ihab Hassan and Brian McHale, and through a careful language analysis, the postmodernist elements in the speeches of characters are detected and discussed. By using postmodernist elements and techniques such as puns, wordplays, paradoxes, and versal prose, the language becomes anarchic, playful, disperse, polymorphous and indeterminate. By finding and analyzing these features in the language of the play it becomes arguable that The Tempest is a postmodern comedy.

Keywords: Shakespeare; *The Tempest*; Language; Postmodern; Wordplay.

∗ Corresponding author: **Payam Abbasi**; Assistant Professor and **Ali Saeedi** M.A Student; Department of English Literature, Faculty of Foreign Languages, University of Isfahan, Isfahan, Iran; e-mail: a.saeedi1367@gmail.com

Introduction

Up to the recent times, it had been a long-held idea that *The Tempest* is Shakespeare's last play. Being so, Shakespeare put all his knowledge, experience, and talent into it, making it one of his richest plays. *The Tempest* is of such significance that it is included in many Shakespeare collections and many anthologies of English and even Western literature.

In *The Development of Shakespeare's Imagery* (1951) a chapter is devoted to *The Tempest*. In this chapter W. H. Clemens (1951) discusses the different types of imagery in *The Tempest* and the influence upon the reader's view of the play. He believes the imagery in *The Tempest* serves more than just creating an atmosphere or background or intensifying the theme of the play (Clemens 1951, p. 182). Clemens believes that since *The Tempest* is among the plays where the supernatural has a significant role, therefore the skillful use of imagery here serves as a mediator of these supernatural elements. In this regard he categorizes the three major groups of imagery as the sea imagery, the animal and vegetation imagery, and finally the olfactory imagery. By carefully examining these groups he concludes that they have a huge role in creating the strange vision of the "nature world", making a counterpart to the world of the supernatural in the play (Clemens 1951, p. 194).

In *The Masterpieces of Western Literature* (1966), a chapter is also allocated to *The Tempest*. In this chapter David R. Clark (1966) analyses the significance of Prospero and his

different roles in the play. By recognizing "personal discipline" and "social responsibility" as the conditions of freedom, he studies Prospero's role in obtaining such a freedom for himself as well as other characters (Clark 1966, p. 1).

Interesting studies have been done in recent decades regarding contemporary and postmodern readings of Shakespeare. The originally Polish Jan Kott (1967) in his *Shakespeare Our Contemporary* (1967) tries to trace modern and postmodern elements in Shakespeare. For example, he deconstructs the long-lasting belief of regarding *The Tempest* as a play of "forgiveness and reconciliation" (p. 238). He also rejects the popular autobiographical reading of the play (p. 240). His book was so influential that some years later a book named *Is Shakespeare Still Our Contemporary?* (1989) was published on his view points. The book is in fact a collection of meetings held by scholars on Kott's theories. His ideas received a wide range of responses from the well-known Shakespeare scholar Helen Gardener who called them "outrageous arrogances" to Bertolt Brecht who insisted that Shakespeare should always be regarded a man of his time (Elson 1989, p. 4).

The aim of this article is to have a postmodern reading of *The Tempest*. In other words, this study is going to analyze the play in terms of language techniques and to show that based on these techniques the play can be regarded as a postmodern comedy. The famous critic and writer Ihab Hassan (1982) has defined postmodernism as "a new aesthetic formation" (ctd. in

Malpas 2005, p. 6). In his momentous book *The Dismemberment of Orpheus: Toward a Postmodern Literature* (1982), Hassan has made a table of comparison between modernism and postmodernism. In contrast to modernist features he attributes the following elements to postmodernism: "antiform, play, chance, anarchy, participation, dispersal, text / intertext, misreading, mutant, polymorphous, rhetoric, schizophrenia, the Holy Ghost, and indeterminacy" (Hassan 1982, pp. 267-268). All these features are at the service of decentering the language and making it polysemous. By tracing and analyzing these elements in the language of *The Tempest*, it becomes debatable that it has a playful, decentered, and polysemous diction and therefore can be regarded as a postmodern play.

With a focus on postmodern elements mentioned by Hassan (1982), this study is an attempt to show and analyze these features in *The Tempest*, which results in manifesting that *The Tempest* is a postmodern play. The article is divided into five main sections. The first section deals with the names of characters. In this part a thorough analysis of the names of some of the characters is given. It is shown that through the use of allusive, playful, and polysemous names, Shakespeare has enriched the play with a postmodern language, besides making it intertextual which again is itself a postmodern feature. The second part is allocated to versal prose. Aristotle believed that in a play, high characters must speak high, refined and elevated language, while the low characters should have a low and base diction (Warrington 1963, pp. 12&26). Breaking this rule results in

violating the hierarchy of the play, and thus, making the language anarchic. In this part, examples of versal prose are discussed and their role in making *The Tempest* a postmodern play is displayed. The third part is devoted to puns and wordplays. In this part, by a close reading of the play, significant examples of puns, word plays, and paradoxes are detected and analyzed; the play is indeed rich in terms of this technique. By making the diction of the play chancy, playful, anarchic, mutant, polymorphous and indeterminate, this technique is at the service of decentering the language, and therefore contributes a lot in creating a postmodern atmosphere. The fourth part talks about ontological interferences. Brian McHale (1987) argues that postmodernism is distinguished by a shift from modernism (McHale 1987, p. 10). That is a change in the point of concentration from epistemology in modernism to ontology in postmodernism. In other words in modernism, there is a focus on the matters regarding knowledge, and how it is acquired, while in postmodernism the focus is on questions and issues regarding the very nature of existence. Based on this definition, in this section of the article those parts of the play are analyzed which are important regarding ontological interferences. The fifth and final section deals with another postmodern feature; Hassan (1982) attributes "the holy ghost" to postmodernism in contrast to "god the father" which is a modernist feature (p. 268). Here, with concentration on the epilogue of the play the manifestation of this postmodern element is shown. This section concludes this study on postmodernist elements in *The Tempest*

believed to be a postmodern play, since it contains many of the postmodernist elements mentioned by major literary theorists.

Names of Characters

As mentioned earlier, "play, anarchy, dispersal, and intertextuality" are among the features of a postmodern piece of literary writing. Here in this section the names of some characters, are in line with these features, are analyzed. Some names are playful: having their roots in Greek and Latin, their meanings are associated with characters' occupation, speeches, actions, and mentality. Some are allusive. By referring to historical, geographical, mythological and religious figures, events and places, the names make the passage intertextual. Finally, some names possess all the above elements. All these features are at the service of decentering the language and making different layers of meaning which is a pivotal postmodern concept.

Caliban

Caliban is one of the most interesting and controversial characters of Shakespeare. The significance has caused Shakespeare critics and scholars to write a numerous number of articles on Caliban, scrutinizing the different parts of this Shakespearean character. One of them is "Caliban's Mask" (2003), by Kevin Pask. Here, he tries to have an analysis of the different responses on *The Tempest* from its own time up to the Restoration Period with a special focus on the character of Caliban. For instance, the two contrary viewpoints of Addison and Jonson are

mentioned, where Addison regards the creation of Caliban as "artistic creation" and "imaginative control" but, the latter regards it as a large "artistic weakness" (Pask 2003, p. 740). Another study is "The Backward Voice of Coriol–anus" (2004). Here, Maurice Hunt (2004) discusses the idea of purgation in the speeches of Shakespeare characters. In one part of the article he talks about this issue in the language of Caliban and other characters in *The Tempest*. For example, he believes this purgation is manifest in the conversations of Trinculo and Stephano. Caliban's curses also function as "symbolic purgation" and "gradual reclamation" of this character (Hunt, 2004, p. 225).

As manifested in this chapter, and later in other sections of the article, Caliban's name as well as his presence, shape, diction, and personality contribute largely to the richness of the play. An important feature of Shakespeare's time was the sea voyages, which resulted in, first, the discovery and exploration of the new islands and continents and, then, the act of colonizing them. Many travel writings were produced during that time explaining the adventures of the mariners and voyagers at sea and in the "new world." Shakespeare was certainly familiar with them, as he uses the material in *The Tempest* and many of his other plays. Among these accounts, two are of utmost importance: the first one is Montaigne's essay "Of Cannibals" (1580) which is believed to be the only undisputed source of *The Tempest* (Kermode, 1954, p. xxxiv). Montaigne (1533-1592) traveled to Brazil in 1557 and wrote his memories of the travel in *Essays* (1580), one of which is "Of Cannibals." He describes the

supposed practice of cannibalism among the natives with a positive, naturalistic attitude towards them. He is very critical of European culture and believes that

> They are even savage, as we call those fruits wilde, which nature of her selfe … hath produced: where as indeed those which our selves have altered by our artifice all devices, and diverted from their common order, we should rather term savage. (ctd. in Kermode 1954, p. xxxv)

The second source is *Bermuda Pamphlets* (1610). In May 1609 some ships left England for the Virginia colony. One of these ships was lost because of the storm and was driven near the coast of Bermudas while the other ships reached the main destination. After sometime in May 1610 the lost ship also managed to reach the main land of America. Many narratives of this adventure, regarding the voyagers' confrontation with the nature and inhabitants of those islands were written and published in England. By using the names such as "Caliban", "Setebos" (Kermode 1954, I.ii.375), and "still vexed Bermoothes" (I.ii.229) in *The Tempest*, there leaves almost no doubt that Shakespeare was familiar with these accounts.

Based on the information about the sources of *The Tempest,* it is generally accepted that Caliban's name is an anagram of the word "cannibal" (Skura 1989, p.51). Being a distortion of the word "carib," which later became "cannib" and "cannibal," both words refer to the native Caribbean and their practice of cannibalism. Although some other critics such as Chambers have proposed another meaning: it is also believed that the name is derived from the gypsy word "cauliban" meaning

"blackness" (Kermode 1954, p. xxxviii). Caliban's representation in the play, through the eyes of other characters as well as through his own acts and speeches, resembles both meanings properly. First of all, Caliban is described as a "salvage and deformed slave" in Dramatis Personae, preparing the reader to confront an animalistic, evil creature. The reader confronts Caliban, first, in act I, scene ii, where he expresses his wish to rape Miranda (I.ii.351-352). Later he plots to murder Prospero by encouraging Stephano to kill him, seize Miranda as his wife and become the king of the isle (III.ii.85-100). Caliban is continually referred to as: "slave, villain, earth, tortoise, poisonous, abhorred, capable of all ill, savage, vile race, hag seed, and devil" (I.ii.315-372). Just in one scene (II, ii) he is nineteen times referred to as "monster" and "moon calf" by Trinculo and Stephano. In all these instances, Caliban is associated with being terrestrial, earthly, evil, black, and lowly. Caliban was taught language by Prospero and Miranda, but he even uses this virtue as an opportunity to constantly curse others (II.ii.1-13)—even Caliban himself acknowledges his talent in cursing (I.ii.323-326). Finally at the end of the play, Prospero, when forgiving his enemies declares Caliban as a "thing of darkness" which belongs to him. Thus, as the above evidences clarify, Caliban's name is in compete accordance with his shape, actions, language and personality. Moreover, by being associated with different sources of *The Tempest*, the name adds to the multiple layers of allusiveness and intertextuality of the play. By being meaningful, and related to Caliban's character, his name further makes the language of *The Tempest* playful, and

indeterminate. Therefore, Caliban's name has a huge role in making the language of the play postmodern.

Sycorax

Sycorax is also one of the interesting minor characters of Shakespeare. Though an absent character, she has a great impact on creating a postmodern atmosphere in the play. Shakespeare critics are conscious of the importance of absent characters in his works. One study analyzing the absent figures in *The Tempest* is done by Sarah Annes Brown (2008). In "The Return of Prospero's Wife: Mother Figures in *The Tempest*" (2008), Brown states that *The Tempest* is among the plays that receives a wide range of responses both in older time and modern era. Her focus is on the absent characters of the play, particularly the absent mother figures (p. 146). The article studies the importance of Sycorax and Prospero's wife in *The Tempest*.

Sycorax's name is of Latin root, and a combination of two words: "sys" meaning "sow" and "korax" meaning "raven," the animals that are associated with lust, darkness, and evil omen. Her name is also in full correspondence with her past and her action. First of all, she was a witch practicing black magic (I.ii.258). In the Renaissance time witches were considered evil and unlucky, and the practice of witchcraft was regarded as sinful. Many witches were burnt alive or left to drown in the Thames in that time because of these reasons. Furthermore, Sycorax had committed a crime, whose normal punishment was execution, but, because of being pregnant she had been exiled—instead of being

executed (I.ii.261-267). She had continued her practice of necromancy in her exile in the island by confining Ariel into a tree (I.ii.285&293). Caliban also refers to her black magic as well as her name: Cal: "As wicked dew as ever my mother brush'd, / With raven's feather from unwholesome fen, / Drop on you both! / A south – west blow on ye, And blister yon all o'er!" (I.ii.323-325).

At a deeper layer of intertextuality, she was also a worshipper of Setebos (I.ii.374-376) who was a god of Patagonians. It is very likely that Shakespeare might have come across the word in Robert Eden's *History of Travaile* (1577) where narrating Magellan's voyages, the writer refers to Patagonians and their method of worshipping their god, Setebos (Kermode 1954, p. xxxii). Further, at another level of allusiveness, Sycorax has features in common with the ancient mythological witches, particularly Circe a Greek mythological figure, had been exiled to the solitary island of Aeaea because of committing murder. According to Homer, she invited Odysseus's men to a feast and changed them into swine.

So as manifested above, by using different layers of allusions, as well as playing on the word in just a single name of an absent character, Shakespeare displays his mastery in the language as well as adding to its richness and multiplicity of meaning.

Versal Prose

In his *Poetics* (335 B. C.), in "Definition of Tragedy," Aristotle (384-322 B. C.) argues that in a play "in some portions verse only is employed, and in others song" (Warrington 1963, p. 12). What Aristotle means is that verse and prose shall not mix with each other in the language of the play. In "Delineation of Characters," he further clarifies that "all the characters should remain consistent throughout the play" (Ibid. p. 26). In *The Tempest*, Shakespeare, particularly, tries to be loyal to Aristotle by observing the three unities of time, place, and action. However, deviations are not difficult to be observed. High characters lower their language by cursing and using inappropriate words and phrases, and base characters use highly rhymed verses and/or very courtly and refined diction which is a postmodern feature. By disturbing the hierarchy of language as well as making it mutant and idiolect, the diction of the play becomes chaotic and polymorphous. Besides, this technique, by opposing the characters' language to their social status disrupts the consistency of the characters. In the following part instances of versal prose in the play are detected and analyzed.

Caliban is an important character regarding the use of versal prose. Caliban defined as a "savage and deformed slave" in the List of Characters, indeed, satisfies the definition by constant cursing during the course of the play. But, there are some occasions in which his language becomes dignified, elevated, and highly rhymed, showing his ability and skill in using language.

One example is act II, scene ii where Trinculo and Stephano find Caliban. Assuming the king and all his men drowned, they choose Stephano to be the king of the island. Caliban is also happy of getting rid of his cruel master, Prospero, and decides to worship Stephano as a god. He promises Stephano to show him the wonders and natural sources of food and drink in the isle. Happily he celebrates his freedom with the following song:

Cal: *No more dams i'll make for fish;*
   Nor fetch in firing
   At requiring;
   Nor scrape trenching, nor wash dish:
   'Ban, 'Ban, Ca Caliban
   Has a new master: get a new man.

<div align="right">

Freedom, high–day! high day, freedom! freedom, high–day, freedom! (II.ii.180-187)

</div>

Though simple and childish, this piece of song shows Caliban's ability in using language in other ways than cursing. It also exhibits another dimension of Caliban's mentality and personality: the reader is confronted with a Caliban who can sing and compose rhymed verses. This side, which is shadowed by his dominant negative personality throughout the play, is very different from the all-time cursing and nagging deformed slave. Another example of Caliban's elegant and refined diction is in act III, scene ii where Caliban tells his story to Stephano and Trinculo and encourages Stephano to kill Prospero and become the king of the isle. After plotting to do so, Trinculo and Stephano start to sing merrily. But, Caliban reminds them that they are not singing "in tune" (III.ii.122). Ariel, invisible, comes and plays the music, and the other two are frightened by the unknown source of the sound. But, Caliban is not in horror and comforts them instead:

Cal: Be not afeard; the isle is full of
noises,
    Sounds and sweet airs, that give
delight, and
    hurt not.
    Sometimes a thousand twangeling
instruments
    Will hum about my ear; and
sometimes voices,
    That, if I then had wak'd after long
sleep,
    Will making me sleep again: and
then, in dreaming,
    The clouds me thought would
open, and show
    riches.
    Ready to drop upon me; that when
I wak'd,
    I cried to dream again. (III.ii.133-
141)

Caliban's referring to words and entities such as "airs,
music, delight, and dream, " with his love and enjoyment of them,
is in sharp contrast with his dominant language and personality
throughout the play. As mentioned earlier, Caliban also warns the
other two that they are not singing "in tune." That an uncivilized
and abominable slave is aware of musical tunes and sensitive to
deviations from that is of utmost amazement. Caliban's diction,
in several occasions, diverges from his social status and dominant
language and characteristic in the play. This results in creating an
anarchic atmosphere in the diction of *The Tempest*, as well as
inconsistency of the characters. These features contribute a lot in
facilitating a postmodern reading of the play.

Puns/Wordlays

One of the weightiest elements that make a postmodern reading of *The Tempest* possible is the extensive use of puns and wordplays. By playing on different meanings of a single word, Shakespeare intensifies the "chancy", "anarchic", and "indeterminate" tone of the play and "disperses" the language from its center. He further provides an opportunity to have different interpretations and "misreadings" of the play. Moreover, puns and wordplays are associated, mostly, with the "rhetoric" aspect of the language which concerns the mastery and talent in representing speech and diction, rather than the "semantic" aspect, concerned mostly with delivering the meaning of the text. This technique also helps to create "signifiers" which lead to multiple "signifieds" at a time. Finally, it enriches the "intertexuality" and "allusiveness" of the play in many occasions, as it paves the way for associations between the play and other literary, religious, geographical, and historical texts. All the above mentioned features contribute to the decentering of the language and therefore creation of a postmodern play.

Act II, scene i, is so full of puns and language plays that the whole scene may be considered a huge wordplay. Here, king and his attendants are searching the isle to find Ferdinand. The scene begins with Gonzalo,"an honest old councellor," hoping their search to be fruitful. Alonso, who is not so much optimistic, asks him to be quite and leave him in "peace" (II.i.9). Sebastian, cynical and sarcastic throughout the scene, puns on Alonso's

"peace" by saying that: "He receives comfort like cold porridge" (II.i.10), with a wordplay on Alonso's "peace" and "pease porridge." Antonio continues the wordplay by an allusion to the "visitor" or the church official who comforts the ill (II.i.11) by which he means that Gonzalo is like a priest who is vainly trying to console Alonso. The language play further continues by Sebastian comparing Gonzalo to a clock which is striking at every hour and cannot remain quiet (II.i.13). The scene continues as the following:

> Gon: Sir,
> Seb: [Aside to Antonio] One: tell.
> > Gon: When every grief is entertain'd
> >   that's offer'd,
> >   Comes   to   the   entertainer
> >   ……………..
> > Seb: A dollar
> > Gon: Dolour comes to him, indeed: you
> >   have spoken
> >   truer than you purpo'sd. (II.i.14-20)

Here in another attempt, Gonzalo tries to cheer up Alonso. He states that an entertainer makes his audience happy and what comes to him is, as Sebastian interrupts him, a "dollor." Gonzalo puns on the word and uses "dolour," meaning "grief". Sebastian intends to say that the entertainer gains money as his reward but, Gonzalo means that he takes the grief away from the audience. After some chat, Adrian, one of the courtiers, comments on the island that: "Though this island seems to be deserted […] uninhabitable and almost inaccessible […] It must needs be of subtle, tender, delicate, temperance" (II.i.34&37&41-42). Antonio plays on the word "temperance" saying that "Temperance was a

delicate wench" (II.i.44). By "temperance," Adrian means the climate of the island, while Antonio means the proper name of a prostitute. In line with his bleak view, and continuing the conversation on the weather of the isle, Antonio states that it is "perfumed by a fen" (II.i.47) producing a huge paradox, by referring to Adrian's optimistic view on the "sweet breathe of air" (II.i.45). Paradoxes, that will be further analyzed, later in the scene, contribute a lot to the playfulness of the language. Gonzalo, cheerful and optimistic as usual, states that their garments are as fresh as when they left the wedding ceremony (II.i.59-62). Antonio answers that if but one of his pockets could speak, it would reveal his lies (II.i.63-64). Sebastian continuing the mimicry, puns on the word "pocket" and says that it can "pocket up" Gonzalo's reports (II.i.65), meaning that the pockets, which are unlike the outer garments dirty and muddy and also invisible to the viewer, can conceal Gonzalo's lies about the freshness of the clothes. The conversation continues as the following:

> Gon: Methinks our garments are now as fresh as when
>   we put them on first in Afric, at the marriage of the
>   King's fair daughter Claribel to the king of Tunis.
> Seb: 'T was a sweet marriage, and we prosper well in our
>   return.
> Adr: Tunis was never grac'd before with such a paragon
>   to their queen.
> Gon: Not since widow Dido's time.
> Ant: Widow! a pox o'that! How came that widow in?
>   widow Dido!

> Seb: What if he had said "widower
>   Aeneas" too? Good
>   Lord, how you take it!
> Adr: "Widow Dido" said you? You
>   make me study of
>   that: she was of Carthage, not of
>   Tunis.
> Gon: This Tunis sir, was Carthage.
> Adr: Carthage?
> Gon: I assure you, Carthage.
> Ant: His word is more than the
>   miraculous harp.
> Seb: he hath rais'd the wall, and houses
>   too.
> Ant: What impossible matter will he
>   make easy next?
> Seb: I think he will carry this island
>   home in his pocket,
>   and give it his son for an apple.
> Ant: And, sowing the kernels of it in the
>   sea, bring forth
>   more islands.
> Gon: Ay (II.i.66-90).

Here, Adrian comments that such a grace has never been fallen on Tunis. Gonzalo Continues: "not since widow Dido's time." This short sentence becomes the source for a chain of word plays, puns, paradoxes, and allusions. Dido was the mythological queen of Carthage whom Elizabethans associated, mostly, as a lover of Aeneas, not as the widow of Sychaeus who was originally her husband. The mistake paves the way for the two jokers to mock Gonzalo. What makes it even worse is Adrian's comment. Puzzled by the phrase "widow Dido," he expresses that: "she was of Carthage, not of Tunis." In another paradoxical mistake Gonzalo assumes Carthage and Tunis to be the same. Antonio and Sebastian, seize the opportunity by referring to Amphion's harp, which raised the walls of Thebes, and continue to make sneering comments on Gonzalo. While the group continues the search,

Sebastian mercilessly tries to put the blame of Ferdinand's loss on Alonso. Gonzalo warns the harshness of his language because "when he should bring plaster be rubs the sore" (II.i.134-135). Antonio plays on the simple sentence by comparing Gonzalo to a surgeon. Then, Gonzalo contemplates the possibility of colonizing the island: ["had I a plantation of this isle my lord-----------", (II.i.139)]. Again, Antonio and Sebastian choose to understand him as they like and interpret the word literary, meaning "farming and agriculture" (II.i.139-140). Gonzalo decides to elaborate on the features of his commonwealth:

> Gon: I' th' commonwealth I would by contraries.
>   Execute all things; for no kind of traffic
>   Would I admit; no name of magistrate;
>   Letters should not be known; riches, poverty,
>   And use of service, none; contract, succession,
>   Bourn, bound of land, filth, vineyard, none;
>   No use of metal, corn, or wine, or oil;
>   No occupation; all men idle, all;
>   And women too, but innocent and pure:
>   No sovereignty;_____ (II.i.143-152)

In this passage, Gonzalo, in numerating the elements of his colony, deprives it of all its necessary features and finishes his speech by the paradoxical statement that in his commonwealth there will be "no sovereignty."

After a while by the magical music of Ariel, the group falls into sleep except Antonio and Sebastian. From now on to the end of the scene when courtiers are awakened the reader finds significant examples of wordplays and paradoxes. Antonio tries to seduce Sebastian that supposing Ferdinand to be drowned he is the second line to the throne, and it is a great opportunity for him to get rid of Alonso, and become king. Sebastian showing his doubtfulness states that he is "standing water" (II.i.216), not to know whether to ebb or flow. Antonio using the same analogy says that he will teach him "how to flow" (II.i.217). Answering him with the same wordplay Sebastian says "to ebb hereditary sloth instructs me" (II.i.217-218). Besides continuing the sea imagery, Sebastian here puns on the phrase, meaning that because of his natural laziness and being a younger brother it is not appropriate for him to be ambitious. Antonio goes on:

> Ant: O,
>   If you but knew how you the purpose cherish
>   While thus you mock it! How, in stripping it,
>   You more invest it! Ebbing men, indeed,
>   Most often do so near the bottom run
>   By their own fear of sloth. (II.i.218-223)

Here, Antonio intensifying his seductions suggests that Sebastian is in fact willing to become king. Since "ebbing men," or men who hesitate and move backwards will get "near the bottom," and will never reach their goal. Apart from his intelligent use of paradox (how, in stripping it, you more invest it!), Antonio

apparently uses the same sea imagery and word play which lingers in their conversation, in order to persuade Sebastian to do his intended evil act. Further in the scene, recognizing that Sebastian has not yet completely believed that Ferdinand is drowned, Antonio states:

> Ant: O, out of that "no hope"
>   What great hope have you! no hope
> that way is
>   Another way so high a hope, that
> even
>   Ambition cannot pierce a wink
> beyond,
>   But doubt discovery there. Will
> you grant with me
>   That   Ferdinand   is   drown'd?
> (II.i.234-239)

Here, like the previously-quoted passage, Antonio with the skillful use of paradox, plays on Sebastian's sense of doubtfulness, that "out of no hope," what "high a hope" emerges. He means that by murdering Alonso, Sebastian can easily reach his goal to be the king.

To conclude this part, it is essential to mention that the vast and extensive use of puns, wordplays, and paradoxes gives the language of *The Tempest* a highly postmodern air, for these techniques cause the diction to become considerably playful, anarchic, uncertain, and indeterminate; all postmodern features.

Ontological Interferences

Brian McHale in his *Postmodernist Fiction* (1987) discusses that the difference between modernism and

postmodernism may be understood based on their focal point. He believes that in modernist fiction there is a focus on epistemological matters, while in postmodernism the focus has been shifted to ontological issues (1987, p.10). In other words, in modernism the concentration is on questions and matters related to knowledge and how they are gained, while in postmodernism the questions are related to the notion of "being" and "existence," such as "what is a world, what kinds of worlds are there, how are they constituted, and how do they differ? What happens when different kinds of worlds are placed in confrontation, or when boundaries between worlds are violated?" (Ibid., p.10). As evident in the above questions, in postmodernism, the focus is on the very concept of "reality," "being," "different worlds," "their boundaries," and "the intermingling of these worlds." In this section, based on McHale's definition and characterization of postmodernism, the study focuses on ontological interferences in *The Tempest*. The first part of this section is devoted to detecting this feature in the setting of the play, and the second part to the two worlds of dream and reality, their boundaries and their amalgamation in the play.

The setting of the play

While keeping the characters real and tangible, Shakespeare makes the atmosphere of his plays as imaginary and dreamy as possible. In this section the setting of the play as one aspect of the imaginary quality of *The Tempest* is analyzed. As mentioned earlier, Shakespeare is loyal to Aristotle by observing

the unities of time, place, and action. *The Tempest* happens in one island and the setting does not change throughout the play. But, the location of that very island is itself ambiguous. There are two sets of information, each supporting a separate island as the setting of the play. Based on Dramatis Personae as well as the evidences in the text, one supportable location for the play is an island in the Mediterranean Sea. The main characters of the play, Prospero, Miranda, Alonso and his attendants are all of Milan or Naples and are on their way back from Claribel's wedding in Tunis to their homeland Italy (II.i.66-68), when they are caught by a tempest and driven to an island. Another group of evidences supports a place near Americas as the setting. First of all, Ariel in reporting to Prospero about his mission of drowning the ship, clearly states that he had saved the people on board, and the ship is safe "in the deep nook where once thou cal'dst me upon at midnight to fetch dew form the still-vexed Bermoothes" (I.ii.226-230). Talking about the rest of the crew, who are moving back to Naples supposing the king and his attendants all drowned, Ariel, very interestingly, in the same passage refers to "Mediterranean flot" (I.ii.234), thousands of miles away of Bermoothes. Another evidence is the reference to Setebos—a god of the Patagonians. Caliban explicitly mentions that his mother was a worshipper of Setebos (I.ii.373-376). Moreover, Caliban himself at the end of the play invokes to Setebos to avoid Prospero's punishment (V.i.261-263), showing that he also worships the same god. On the other hand, Sycorax, Caliban's mother, is said to be an Algerian who had been banished in an island, presumably in the

Mediterranean, where she gives birth to Caliban (I. ii.261&267-282). It is very curious that an Algerian who lives in a Mediterranean island is a worshipper of a god of native Americans. The third and the last evidence is the presence of Caliban himself as an islander. In the Renaissance time, Europeans associated mostly the "new world" with novelty, secrecy, and exoticism. Since Ptolemy's *Geography* written in the 2nd century A. D. in Alexandria, Europeans had been familiar with the Mediterranean, Africa, and Asia (Brotton 2005, pp. 79-81), at least 1200 years before Renaissance. They associated darkness, mystery, and weirdness mostly with their newly discovered lands and their people; Americas and Australia are noteworthy. All of these features are present in Caliban whose presence in the play, his name, his shape and color, his deformity, his language, and actions have a close resemblance to that of the inhabitants of the "new world."

Thus, as argued in this section, the two sets of information in the play each have enough weight to support a separate place as the setting, and finally they leave it equivocal as to where the real island that *The Tempest* takes place is. This absorbing instance of the violation of boundaries between possible existing worlds paves the way for the reader to think of ontological interferences when one is reminded of the fact that this imaginary setting is a construct of Shakespeare's world of the imagination.

Dream vs. Reality

Another important case of ontological interference is the existence and intermingling of the two realms of dream and reality. At the end of act II, scene i, the courtiers are overwhelmed by a magical sleep, put to them by Ariel's music. The reader here begins to confront the two domains of dream and reality. When Alonso and his party fall asleep, the limit between the two worlds of sleep and reality starts to blur. This confusion is intensified by the conversation between Sebastian and Antonio whose language is full of sleepy, dreamy, and hallucinatory implications. After all fall asleep, Sebastian wonders the strange "drowsiness" which has possessed them (II.i.194), and does not cause his "eyelids to sink," and make him "sleep;" nor does Antonio feel sleepy. His spirits are "nimble" and he fantasizes a crown falling on Sebastian's head. Sebastian wonders if Antonio is "awake," since he speaks "sleepy language" (II.i.206). He believes Antonio's speeches to be strange and fanciful because "this is a strange repose to be asleep with eyes wide open, standing, speaking, moving and yet so fast asleep" (II.i.208-210). Antonio, on the other hand believes that it is Sebastian who lets his fortune "sleep" or rather die, and keeps his eyes shut, while he is awake. Shocked by Antonio's speeches and believing him not to be awake, Sebastian compares what Antonio says to "the snores of a sleeping person" saying that "there is meaning in" his "snores" (II.i.212-213). Antonio's temptations continue till he says what he means in plain words using the same sleep and dream imagery. Addressing Alonso's daughter, Claribel, Antonio asks her to remain in Tunis and "let Sebastian wake" (II.i.263). Then he asks Sebastian to suppose as

if "this were death that now that seiz'd them [The courtiers]" (II.i.255-256), since even the dead can rule as properly as these men. This "sleep," he believes, is indeed an opportunity for Sebastian's "advancement" (II.i.263). The intermingling of the two worlds of dream and reality reaches its peak at the end of the scene, when Ariel sings in Gonzalo's ear to wake because while he "snoring lies, open–eyed conspiracy" is taking place. Hearing this, Gonzalo wakes, and other courtiers rise by his cry, and the plot ends unsuccessfully. Shakespeare has stuffed this short passage with as much references to sleep, dream, and imagination as possible, removing the borders of imagination and reality.

Another significant example of this mixture occurs in act IV, scene i. Almost finished with his plan, and granted Ferdinand with the marriage to Miranda, Prospero then summons the goddesses (Iris, Juno, and Ceres), nymphs and reapers, in order to celebrate the happy marriage with their song and music. After they finish, Prospero continues:

> Pros: You do look my son, in a mov'd sort,
> As if you were dismay'd: be cheerful, sir.
> Our revels now are ended, These our actors,
> As I foretold you, were all spirits, and
> Are melted into air, into thin air:
> And like the baseless fabric of this vision,
> The cloud-capp'd towers, the gorgeous palaces,
> The solemn temples, the great globe itself
> Yea, all which it inherits, shall dissolve,

> And, like this insubstantial pageant faded,
> Leave not a rack behind. We are such stuff
> As dreams are made on: And our little life
> Is rounded with a sleep. (IV.i.146-158)

Here is an amazing instance of ontological confusion. First of all, Prospero confesses that all which has happened has been a pure fantasy; it was a play with "imaginary" players, that are going to melt into "thin air" when the play ends. Further, he also states that all the locations of the play, such as palaces, temples, and even the globe itself are going to be "dissolved." Astonishingly, by blurring the borders of dream and reality, Prospero declares that human beings themselves are "such stuff as dreams are made on," and their life is concluded by a "sleep." Questioning the very nature of "being," Prospero in his last statement clearly mentions that human life is nothing but a fantasy.

In this part in the light of Brian McHale's characterization of postmodernism, an analysis of the language with regard to ontological confusions in *The Tempest* was given. What follows is a focus on "the holy ghost" which is, believed by Ihab Hassan, another postmodernist feature.

God the Father vs. The Holy Ghost

In his famous table, Hassan (1982) attributes two interesting features to modernism and postmodernism. He assigns

"god the father" to modernism, in contrast to "the holy ghost" which is a postmodern element (Hassan 1982, p. 268). Here, with a focus on the epilogue of *The Tempest* it is argued that at the end of the play, Prospero as "god the father" is weakened, and Ariel as "the holy ghost" is powered up and finally freed. Thus, by the decline of "god the father," and giving power to "the holy ghost" another postmodern element is intensified. Ariel functions as an archangel to Prospero, who appears as God in the island. Right from the beginning of the play, Prospero promises Ariel to set him free (I.ii.242-250). He repeats his vow several times during the play (I.ii.423-424&444-445&IV.i.35&264-266&V.i.87&95). He had promised Ariel that after a full year of service he would be liberated. First of all, it is interesting that Prospero's power, all throughout the play, seems to be attached to Ariel. Prospero never performs magic himself. He orders Ariel and it is Ariel who does the job. In other words, Prospero's power is put into action through Ariel. All the magical events of the play such as drowning the ship, scattering the people on board in different parts of the island, the magical sleep of the courtiers and their awakening, appearing and disappearing of the banquet, and the summon of goddesses, spirits and reapers, are done either by Ariel or spirits under his command. So, Ariel is the main tool for Prospero to actualize his plans. In fact, Prospero is powerless without Ariel. Interestingly, Prospero acknowledges his weakness without Ariel when he says that he shall miss Ariel when he is liberated (V.i.95). At the end of the play, Prospero produces the following epilogue:

Now my charms are all o'erthrown,
And what strength I have's mine own,
Which is most faint: now, 'tis true,
I must be here confin'd by you,
Or sent to Naples. Let me not,
Since I have my dukedom got,
And pardon'd the deceiver, dwell,
In this bare island by your spell;
But release me from my bands,
With the help of your good hands:
Gentle breath of yours my sails
Must fill, or else my project fails,
Which was to please. Now I want
Spirits to enforce, Art to enchant:
And my ending is despair,
Which pierces so, that it assaults
Mercy itself, and frees all faults.
    As you from crimes would pardon'd
    be,
    Let your indulgence set me free.
    Exit.

Prospero's language is full of the implications of 'weakness, bondage, and sadness.' He must be "confined" in the deserted isle for ever or be sent to Naples. But, he is "demanding" to be "released" from his "bonds." In order to avoid his project to "fail" and his ending in "despair," he is asking to be "relieved" and "set free." In sharp contrast to Prospero's gloomy and helpless language, there exists Ariel's happy and lively diction in his joyful song, when informed that he is soon going to be liberated. He merrily celebrates the occasion by declaring that from now on "Merrily, merrily, shall I live now, under the blossoms that hang on the bough" (V.i.93-94). The ongoing tension between Prospero as the magician and commander vs. Ariel as the agent reaches to the peak in the epilogue. Ariel has been released long before the

play ends, but Prospero, on the other hand, has been "bounded" and is asking to "be set free." Actually, Ariel or "the holy ghost" now completely dominates and overpowers Prospero or "god the father." Ariel has gained his liberty, while Prospero in contrast, has been confined, and is asking for his freedom. In fact, the phrase "setting free" makes a pun here. Using it for Ariel, it indicates freedom, joy, power, and happiness, while on the other hand for Prospero, it is a demand for becoming liberated, which adds to the indeterminate quality of the play.

Conclusion

This study was an attempt to show that *The Tempest* is a postmodern play. Based on Hassan's (1982) table of comparison between modernism and postmodernism (pp. 267-268), and to a lesser extent McHale's (1987) definition and classification of postmodernism (p.10) it was argued that the language of *The Tempest* is full of postmodern elements. Divided in five parts the article analyzed the five main techniques which make *The Tempest* open to a postmodernist approach. The method practiced here can be applied to Shakespeare's other plays as well. For instance, among the comedies *Twelfth Night* (1601) is very rewarding in this regard, since it possesses important postmodern features such as wordplays, versal prose, and disguise. Among the tragedies *Macbeth* (1606) is of great significance in terms of ontological confusions, and intermingling of the worlds of magic, dream, hallucination, and reality, all throughout the play. Because of being rich in language techniques and the indeterminacy of

language, these plays are apt to be analyzed with postmodernist approaches.

References

Brotton, Jerry. *The Renaissance, A Very Short Introduction.* Oxford: Oxford UP. 2005.

Brown, Sarah Annes. "The Return of Prospero's Wife: Mother Figures in *The Tempest*'s After Life". *Shakespeare Survey.* Ed. Peter Holland. Vol. 56. No. 12. 2008. 146-160.

Clarck, David R. "The Tempest". In A. Page & L. Brown (Eds.). *Masterpieces of Western Literature.* (1-19) Iowa: W.M.C. Brown Books Company. 1966.

Clemens, W. H. *The Development of Shakespeare's Imagery.* New York: A Drama Book. 1951.

Elson, John. *Is Shakespeare Still Our Contemporary?* London: Routledge. 1989.

Hassan, Ihab. *The Dismemberment of Orpheus: Toward a Postmodern Literature.* New York: Oxford UP. 1982.

Hunt, Maurice. "The Backward Voice of Coriol–anus". *Shakespeare Studies*. Vol. 32. 2004. 220-239.

Kermode, Frank. *The Tempest*. London: Methuen and Co LTD. 1954.

Kott, Jan. *Shakespeare Our Contemporary*. London: Methuen and Co LTD. 1967.

Malpas, Simon. *The Postmodern*. Oxen: Routledge. 2005.

McHale, Brian. *Postmodernist Fiction*. London: Methuen. 1987.

Pask, Kevin. "Caliban's Mask". *ELH*. Vol. 70. No. 3. (Fall. 2003): 27 Dec 2011 <http://www.jstore.org/stable/30029897>.

Skura, Meredith Anne. "Discourse, and the Individual: The Case of Colonialism in *The Tempest*". *Shakespeare Quarterly* Vol. 40. No. 1. (Spring. 1989): 27 Dec 2011 <http://www.jstore.org/stable/2870753>.

Warrington, John. *Aristotle's Poetics*. London: Everyman's Library. 1963.