

P-ISSN 2303-6850

E-ISSN: 1840-3719

Volume 7

Numer 2

2014

Epiphany

Journal of Transdisciplinary Studies

Journal of the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences
International University of Sarajevo

Epiphany - Journal of Transdisciplinary Studies

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Muhidin Mulalić

MANAGING EDITOR

Mr. Ahmed Kulanić

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Lejla Panjeta

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Senija Tahirović

Assist. Prof. Dr. Tuba Boz

Assist. Prof. Dr. Julie Bates

Assist. Prof. Dr. Joseph Jon Kaminski

EDITORIAL BOARD

Prof. Dr. Yucel Ogurlu, (Turkey)

Prof. Dr. Keith Doubt, (USA)

Prof. Dr. Ali Gunes, (Turkey)

Prof. Dr. Ljuebe Trpeski, (Macedonia)

Prof. Dr. Rafik Beekun, (USA)

Prof. Dr. Mesut Idriz, (Macedonia)

Prof. Dr. Robert Oprisko (USA)

Prof. Dr. Anas Al-Shaikh Ali, (USA)

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Metin Bosnak, (Turkey)

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Abdulserdar Ozturk, (Turkey)

Assist. Prof. Dr. Mustafa Bal, (Turkey)

Assist. Prof. Dr. Aliye F. Mataraci (Turkey)

Assist. Prof. Dr. Marco Maroni (Italy)

Assist. Prof. Dr. Lynn Marie Tesser, (USA)

Assist. Prof. Dr. Esref Kenan Rasidagic, (BiH)

Assist. Prof. Dr. Hasan Korkut, (Turkey)

Assist. Prof. Kenan Zekic, (BiH)

Assist. Prof. Dr. Muhamed Ali, (Macedonia)

Assist. Prof. Dr. Esi Marius Costel, (Romania)

Assist. Prof. Dr. Mirsad Karić, (BiH)

GRAPHIC DESIGNER

Ms. Maja Zećo

PUBLISHER

International University of Sarajevo

PRESS RUN

200 copies

EDITORIAL CORRESPONDENCE

Journal correspondence and submission of articles should be addressed to: Editor-in-Chief, Epiphany, Journal of Transdisciplinary Studies, International University of Sarajevo (IUS), Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences (FASS), Hrasnička cesta 15, 71210 Ilidža-Sarajevo, Bosnia and Herzegovina Tel: (387) 33 957 310; Fax: (387) 33 957 105 Email: epiphany@ius.edu.ba

ABOUT JOURNAL

Epiphany (p-ISSN 2303-6850, e-ISSN 1840-3719), Journal of Transdisciplinary Studies is double-blind peer-reviewed journal dedicated to the promotion of scholarly publication in humanities and social sciences. Epiphany is a semi-annual publication affiliated to Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences, at the International University of Sarajevo in Bosnia-Herzegovina. The journal aims to promote transdisciplinary studies that cross many disciplinary boundaries to create a holistic approach. It refers to concepts or field research methods originally developed in one discipline, but now widely used by other disciplines in the area of humanities and social sciences including anthropology, philosophy, economics, media studies, history, psychology, sociology, visual and performing arts, literature, technology and cultural studies. We invite scholars interested in transcending classical scholarship to submit their manuscripts to Epiphany.

The journal is currently indexed in DOAJ, EBSCO, CEEOL, CITEFACTOR, Academic Journal Database, BASE and J-GATE.

PRINTING HOUSE

“Štamparija Petica” d.o.o. Zenica

OFFICER IN CHARGE

Zikret Valentić

Table of Contents

Emir Hadzikadunić

Understanding Iranian Foreign Policy - The Case of Iranian Nuclear Program4

Yücel Oğurlu

“E-government Portal” and E-Services in Turkey.....17

Dželal Ibraković, Haris Hojkurić

The Forging of National States on the Anvil of War.....27

Robert Lee Oprisko, Josh Caplan

Beyond the Cake Model.....35

Indira Hasanović

Gender Equality & Work: Are we there yet?55

Joseph Jon Kaminski

World War I and Propaganda Poster Art: Comparing the US and German Cases.....64

Jahja Muhasilović

Image of the Ottomans in Bosnian Textbooks Published After 2007.....81

Golbarg Khorsand

Paths to Paralysis: Symbolism and Narratology in James Joyce’s “Araby” and “Eveline”... 92

Alice Manuela Martins Guimaraes

Light ! Camera! Education: The Use of Cinema to Enhance Education and Learning.....105

Lejla Panjeta

The Good, the Bad, and the Ugly in Bosnian Cinema.....113

Selvira Draganović and Anela Hasanagić

Exploring the difference between Turkish and Bosnian students in Triangular Love scale..128

UNDERSTANDING IRANIAN FOREIGN POLICY - THE CASE OF IRANIAN NUCLEAR PROGRAM

Emir Hadžikadunić*

Abstract

This paper examines the complexity of the Iranian foreign policy through the case of Iranian nuclear program and analyzes foreign policy orientations of the last three Iranian presidents, Mohammad Khatami, Mahmoud Ahmadinejad and Hassan Rouhani in dealing with the international community in pursuing its nuclear program. This assessment would not be complete without reference to the Iranian supreme leader Ali Khamenei who is the most powerful political authority. This paper also examines Iranian foreign policy expectations with various theories of international relations as to identify the most dominant or the most consistent policy orientation. Its aim is also to strengthen realist and power-based explanations that have dominated the discourse on the Middle Eastern in general and Iranian foreign policy in particular. In this context, a number of questions will be addressed here. To what extend was Iranian negotiation with the international community over its nuclear program consistent throughout these three presidencies? What has changed, if anything, from Iranian foreign policy perspective and why? Can Iranian foreign policy behavior on this specific topic and in this specific time be explained through any international relations theory? The methods employed in answering these questions are largely structured around ethnographic research methodology and my personal diplomatic experience. In addition, a chronological account and comparative approaches will be used to analyze foreign policy discourse and the assessment of key decision makers.

Keywords: Iranian Foreign Policy; Nuclear Program; Realism; Power and Middle East.

Introduction

The Iranian foreign policy could be analyzed through different perspectives and case studies. In fact, many academic attempts have been made to refer the Iranian foreign policy to existing international relation theories. Iranian nuclear program is one of those cases that could draw additional light into the complexity of Iranian foreign policy behavior and there are several reasons for this assessment. First of all, it has remained as an important diplomatic topic on the international agenda that lasted since the Islamic Revolution of 1979. Second, it particularly exposed Iranian foreign policy decision-makers to their western counterparts in the last decade. Third, like no other topic, it draws a light into different, some have stated, conflicting foreign policy perceptions of existing Iranian establishment. Three last Iranian presidents have been involved in this case in different political and regional circumstances and different negotiating frameworks with the international community. These circumstances and their opposing views and actions have also provided

*Corresponding author: Emir Hadžikadunić, PhD Candidate, International University of Sarajevo, Bosnia and Herzegovina; e-mail: ehadzikadunic@ius.edu.ba

an important analytical ground to reveal tendencies in Iranian diplomacy. Mohammad Khatami is regarded as the Iran's first reformist president who based his diplomatic efforts on dialogue with the international community. His cabinet has attempted to find a compromising solution with the troika of the European Union at the time of Iraqi crisis with an aim to build confidence with the West and to promote Iranian openness. Additional goal was to prevent bringing Iran's nuclear case to the UN Security Council while strong US military presence was increasing in the neighborhood. While dialogue, compromise and confidence building reflected new foreign policy style, the latter goal reflected rather true national interest of his country. To add some complexity, his policies of openness led to repeated clashes with the conservative Islamists from the Iranian establishment. This may have reflected double track approach of the latter.

At the beginning of his first presidential term Mahmoud Ahmadinejad changed immediately this reformist course and made it sound more populist and nationalistic. In the meantime, political and security considerations in the region have changed to favor Iranian position. As evidence suggested, official Tehran had other national interests to pursue. In a speech to students in Mashhad, Ahmedinejad was quoted as saying that Iran's conditions had changed completely as it had become a nuclear state and could talk to other states from that stand. In the meantime, new multilateral negotiating framework has been designed as the US government decided to step in.

Circumstances and expectations have changed once again at the end of his presidency. The evidence has suggested that economic sanctions were becoming unbearable and political isolation was increasing in Iran in 2011-2013. This might have caused yet another shift in Iranian foreign policy approach. New Iranian president, a relative moderate cleric, has been the Secretary of the Supreme National Security Council (SNSC) for 16 years. Hasan Rouhani has been involved as close associate of the supreme leader Khomeini and key nuclear negotiator of his reformist predecessor. In this regard, he looked like trustworthy option for change. Rouhani also promised to promote greater openness of the Islamic Republic. He went as far as talking to president Obama directly over the phone, the diplomatic move that was unbelievable in the past. As time has repeated itself, Rouhani has also run into fierce resistance from hard-liners who were opposing his pragmatic ideas.

It is important to note that the office of the president is not directly responsible for the nuclear negotiation. It is instead set by the Supreme National Security Council (SNSC). SNSC includes two representatives appointed by the Iranian supreme leader Ali Khamenei, military officials, and other executive, judicial, and legislative representatives. In this regard, Ali Khamenei has been playing a critical role in direction of the Islamic Republic of Iran.

Several examples of his political moves were very illustrative. Khamenei broke all illusion of the West by stating that Iran is not Soviet Union and that Khatami is not Gorbacov (Hefner, 2005). This has also been evident during the tumultuous 2009 presidential elections, the outcome of which was determined by Khamenei's decisive support of President Mahmoud Ahmadinejad. The third striking example is when Khamenei endorsed Rouhani and allowed his administration to have direct contacts with American administration on the very top.

A Survey of Iranian Nuclear Issue

It has been the Iranian monarch Reza Shah Pahlavi who initiated the national nuclear program in 1960s. Evidence has suggested that governments of the United States supported Iranian nuclear program from the very beginning and Israel from 1977. The Tehran Nuclear Research Center, supplied by the United States, opened in 1967. It was equipped with 5-megawatt nuclear research reactor called the Tehran Research Reactor (TRR), fueled by highly enriched uranium. Iran signed the Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty (NPT) in 1968 and the Parliament ratified it in February 1970. The process of Uranium enrichment was allowed under this treaty. Few years later, the president Ford was quoted as expressing his support in principle for the shah's plan to develop a full-fledged nuclear power program to diversify Iran's energy sources.

The Iranian involvement in the nuclear program did not bring any special diplomatic or security consideration in 1960s or 1970s, neither by the United States nor by Israel. The Iranian revolution, however, brought different perceptions of the Program in 1979. Due to the regime change, nuclear dossier of Iran has also changed and became important security issue. Golamreza Jusefi, former Iranian ambassador to Bosnia and Herzegovina, has talked about American shift from fully fledged support to isolation of his country in an interview for the local Bosnian press in February 12, 2012. Germany has also withdrawn from building six nuclear reactors, two of them in Busher in 1979. It signed this agreement with Iranian authorities in 1976.

Imam Khomeini wrote that Iranians must stand on their own feet after war with Iraq (Baquer, 2009.) Iran was particularly vulnerable to chemical weapons used by Iraqi forces. Some foreign dignitaries understood Khomeini's statement as a call to develop non-conventional weapons. Opponents of this argument are often quoting Khomeini's fatwa by which he disapproved building nuclear weapons in his country. Since February 2003, Iran's program for constructing the complete cycle for producing enriched Uranium has been the subject of intense international debates. Authorities from Tehran strongly advocated that it was their international right to pursue civil nuclear energy, not for any kind of the military purposes. The last three Iranian presidents have been involved in this issue during tense negotiation with the international community, particularly the European Union and the US government.

The United States suspected that Iran might divert from civil to military component and produce nuclear weapons. European governments were concerned that Iran's nuclear program could set off a spiral of nuclear proliferation in the Middle East and finally kill off the Non-Proliferation Treaty (Leonard, 2005). Israel in particular and other regional countries in general feared that Iranian nuclear case will change existing balance of power in Iranian favor and bring about new nuclear proliferation. In fact, Iran and Western countries have made various diplomatic up-s and down-s over possible deal, from easing the tension and reaching the point of compromise from one side to international isolation, sanction and war games to the other, never crossing the red line on either side. At the latest stage of the negotiations Iran held its first bilateral talks in decades with the United States in a major step towards concluding a comprehensive nuclear deal with the West. Several discussion rounds at the level of foreign ministers took place in Geneva and Wien in 2014, the latest in November this year.

Phase of Iranian Foreign Policy

As reflected through Iranian nuclear dossier in the last 11 years, three different phases could be distinguished in Iranian foreign policy behavior. The first phase was linked with the second mandate of Khatami presidency with particular attention to the period of 2003 - 2005. At that specific time, we have witnessed serious and open dialogue and near compromise with EU troika on the diplomatic surface. The second phase was the period of nuclear populism and nationalism of Ahmedinejad in both of his presidential mandates (2005-2009 and 2009-2013). This also included unsuccessful negotiations with the Security Council (plus Germany) that ended with fourth round of international sanctions and toughest isolation of the Islamic Republic of Iran ever. Finally, the third phase came with the election of reformist president Rouhani in 2013. This phase reset Iranian foreign policy and increased hope in diplomatic solution.

Towards Dialogue and Double Track Approach

Iranian authorities and the European Union Troika have intensively tried to find common ground over Iranian nuclear program from 2003 – 2005 with each side pursuing its own foreign policy agenda. Former Iranian president Khatami advanced the policy of dialogue and mutual agreement with the international community. According to Thaler, Nader and Chubin (2010) his reformist camp believed that stabilization policy of decreased confrontation would secure achievements of Islamic revolution. Iran is a signer of the Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty, which president Khatami said ensures that member nations have the right to develop peaceful nuclear technology. His administration managed to skillfully handle the nuclear dossier by negotiating compromise with European powers.

Under Khatami's presidency, Iran signed the Sa'd Abaad agreement with the European troika in 2003. According to this agreement, "the Iranian authorities reaffirmed that nuclear weapons have no place in Iran's defense doctrine and that its nuclear program

and activities have been exclusively in the peaceful domain.” The Iranian Government has also decided “to engage in full co-operation with the IAEA to address and resolve through full transparency all requirements and outstanding issues.” Following this path, Iran suspended its Uranium enrichment program under the new agreement with the EU troika in November 2004. Negotiating team of president Khatami also agreed to sign the Additional Protocol of the Non-Proliferation Treaty and its safeguards agreement with the International Atomic Energy Agency. The Additional Protocol granted IAEA inspectors greater authority in their nuclear verification programs.

All these agreements and unilateral acts reflected reformist approach in the Iranian foreign policy. Their main elements included opening and integration of Iran in the international community. Other foreign policy objectives may be more pragmatic from the security point. Local sources have suggested that Iranian establishment did not want to bring nuclear case at the UN Security Council while US troops were stationed in Iraq. Former spokesperson of Iran’s nuclear negotiation team (2003-2005), Seyed Hossein Mousavian argued that this was the major success and skillful diplomatic maneuver missed by Khatami successor. “While Mohammad Khatami was president, Mousavian notes, Iran was not referred to the UN Security Council and did not face the array of draconian sanctions that are dragging down its economy today.”

Khatami phase also reflected double track approach of Iranian foreign policy. While temporary suspension of Uranium enrichment as a confidence-building gesture was formally accepted and practically applied from the end of 2004 through 2005, the Iranian Parliament never ratified the Additional Protocol. President Khatami has indicated in his communication with the EU that Iranian authorities will preserve the enrichment freeze. Similar and reconciliatory diplomatic messages have been stated by his key nuclear negotiator and future president Hassan Rouhani. However, as reported by local media in Tehran, other authorities were sending mixed signals in the election years of 2004 (parliamentary) and 2005 (presidential). This could only be understood as building up an alternative road.

The Iranian supreme leader Ali Khamenei did not object that president Khatami has open dialogue with the EU troika. He neither stopped him from offering gestures of good will. However, he did not restrain from public criticism of Khatami throughout his mandate and endorsed opposition groups to be more critical of his moderate foreign policy. As Khatami mandate was approaching to an end, this role has been more evident and politically transparent. The Guardian Council disqualified 3533 moderate candidates out of 8145, among whom 80 were existing moderate MP-s, for parliamentary election in 2004. Ali Khamenei who controlled the Guardian Council may have already decided to bring new leadership and produce policy change. Independent scholar Farideh Farhi also examined Iran’s nuclear policy and argued that the foundations for a nationalist nuclear

discourse were carefully laid out during the presidency of reformist Khatami.

It is understood that Iranian establishment and true decision makers calculated that it was not necessary to continue this path of compromise and opening as from 2005. Thus, the policy of dialogue has ended with the end of Khatami presidency. Hassan Rouhani also resigned as key nuclear negotiator. Time was ready for different foreign policy rhetoric. It seems that Ahmedinejad was perfect choice.

Towards Diplomatic Tension

The victory of Mahmoud Ahmadinejad brought new political elite in the Iranian government. It also brought new political discourse and new diplomatic agenda of confidence breaking. New president inaugurated nationalistic and populist rhetoric from the very beginning of his mandate. Ehteshami and Zweiri (2007) from the Institute of Middle East and Islamic Studies made detailed analysis of this political transformation by marking Ahmedinejad and his political cycle as neoconservative, principal, ideologically Islamic, revolution in character and non clerical.

Even though Ahmadinejad reaffirmed his intention to put forward new proposals during his speech at the UN General Assembly in 2005, he recommended restarting Uranium enrichment process at home. Actually, his first major policy was to reject the EU's offer from 2005. Ahmedinejad also sacked 40 Iranian diplomats in a massive cleaning of the reformist oriented Foreign Service including those involved in the country's nuclear negotiations with the European troika. Hassan Rouhani, the pragmatic chief negotiator, was replaced with Ali Larijani, who said that exchanging Iran's nuclear program for trade concessions would be like trading "a pearl for a candy." Leonard (2005) has marked new president's initial phase as aggressive and toxic. Ahmedinejad's diplomatic approach has been followed by specific action plan at home. Officials from Tehran broke open internationally monitored seals on the Natanz enrichment facility in the central Iran and at two related storage and testing locations. These activities cleared the way for Iranians to resume Uranium enrichment and nuclear fuel research what the US and EU countries objected and feared the most.

There were several possible reasons why this foreign policy change happened. It has been argued that the EU troika reacted slow and late to Khatami's unilateral favor. They agreed to deliver a set of political, economic and nuclear offers only after presidential elections in 2005. It also remains a question how much Iranian leadership was willing to make a deal with the EU without the United States. Seyed Hossein Mousavian argued that the supreme leader had lost confidence in the ability of the Europeans to deliver on their promises by early 2005. Farideh Farhi argued that the failure of negotiations between the reformist government and European representatives and subsequent increased pressure on Ahmadinejad government contributed to the increasingly loud tone Iranian

negotiators took after 2006.

Iran felt more secured after constitutional changes and elections in Iraq favored their pro Iranian constituency. Peter Galbraith shared these views in his book from the same year "Iraq: Bush Islamic Republic." To support this argument further, I will also quote Iranian ambassador to Bagdad as saying that it was big day for them as elected Iraqi people were our people that we supported. American casualties have been on increase at that time. Woodward (2008) suggested that Iran gave his contribution to this. By publishing National Intelligence Estimate in 2007, the US administration gave up the military solution against Iran completely. Ahmedinejad celebrated this news by proclaiming the largest Iranian victory in last 100 years (David E. Thaler, Alireza Nader, Shahram Chubin, Jarrold D. Greem, Charlotte Lynch, F. Wehrey, 2010).

In the meantime, the US government got involved in this case along China and Russia. Iranian nuclear dossier has been moved into the new multilateral negotiating framework of five plus one (5 members of UN Security Council plus Germany). Throughout Ahmedinedjad mandate, Iran and Western countries, however, remained far apart in these negotiations. As they continued without any compromise at reach, Bush administration lobbied for three rounds of sanctions by UNSC. President Obama offered dialogue but soon realized that diplomatic breakthrough with Ahmedinejad was not possible. He also lobbied for the UN Security Council Resolution 1929 imposing fourth round of multilateral sanctions in 2011. On every move in this regard, Ahmedinejad radicalized his rhetoric and announced further unilateral moves. He called these resolutions a piece of torn paper. Challenging expected fourth round of UN sanctions, he announced that Iran would increase Uranium enrichment process from 3% to 20% level for the first time. This move marked a major increase in Iranian nuclear capabilities in 2010 narrowing the space between civil and military level.

There was one important observation during this phase. According to IAEA report from August, 2012, Iran enriched 6876 kg of Uranium up to level of 3 % and 189 kg up to level of 20%. As noticed from all other IAEA reports, enriched uranium of 20% never crossed 200 kg. As soon as Iranian authorities would reach close to 200 kg, they would convert it into nonreturnable fuel recycle for civil purpose. This represented small but important sign of Iranian rationality not to provoke international intervention. The problem would have appeared if 20% enriched Uranium had piled up more than 200kg and eventually enriched to 90%. The latter enrichment level is considered by experts as the military level sufficient for one nuclear bomb. It seems that 200 kg was self-declared Iranian red line. It was also publicly declared red line by Israeli Prime Minister Netanyahu who stated this at different multilateral forums.

At the peak of this diplomatic crisis, the US and EU member states imposed multi-

lateral and bilateral sanctions preventing Iran from trading its oil to the EU in 2012. President Ahmadinejad said the sanctions were a “used hand tissue that should be thrown in the dustbin,” and that they were “not capable of harming Iranians.” Iran threatened to close Hormuz passage and entered war games with US war ships. Both sides were approaching the point of entering the real conflict. As evidence suggested in the past, as soon as Iran was close to crossing this red line it diverted toward reconciliation. Economic authorities from Tehran also admitted that international sanctions were bringing serious economic consequences. Iranian oil sale has fallen from almost 4 million to less than 2 million barrels a day.

During his presidential mandates, Ahmedinejad tried to play visible diplomatic role by attending every annual session of the UN General Assembly and addressing different multilateral forums with tough messages. His team negotiated within framework of 5+1 without closing increasing gap between Iran and the international community. In the course of his second presidential mandate, he tried to reach some diplomatic breakthrough bypassing negotiating framework of 5+1 by using bilateral or trilateral links with Japan, Turkey or Brazil. Ahmedinejad signed Teheran declaration with Brazilian President Luiz Inacio Lula and Turkish Prime Minister Recep Tayyip Erdogan in 2010 as a compromise offer that was not acceptable to the US.

At the end of his mission, Ahmedinejad was increasingly marginalized by the supreme leader Ali Khamenei. In his double road approach, Khamenei slowly opened an opportunity for yet another foreign policy shift. Ahmedinejad was left alone and he slightly changed his rhetoric and offered reconciliatory messages. In his speech at the Summit of the Nonaligned Movement in Tehran in 2012, he sounded more like a pacifist than a conservative politician. Iranian more aggressive foreign policy actually ended before he completed his second term.

Towards Dialogue II

President Hassan Rouhani's new cabinet brought back some reformist faces from the Khatami administrations from 1997 to 2005. The new foreign minister, Mohammad Javad Zarif, was Iran's UN ambassador in the later years of Khatami's presidency. Massoumeh Ebtekar, one of Khatami's vice presidents and the first woman to hold such office in Iran, returns as vice president responsible for the environment. With new faces, Rouhani brought back the old reformist foreign policy. As stated, Rouhani wanted to promote Iranian openness, build new confidence and decrease sanctions. Actually, he wanted quick diplomatic results. In this regard, he went much further or he was allowed to go further than ex reformist president Khatami by having direct phone discussion with president Obama, the first such dialogue after Islamic revolution. His foreign minister Zarifi has been in regular bilateral meetings with the US State Secretary Kerry in a very relaxed diplomatic atmosphere.

These diplomatic moves were not allowed to Khatami's cabinet members, at least not that fast or that often. Rouhani was politically appropriate, trustworthy and most knowledgeable presidential candidate from within Khamenei circles (Ex SNSC Secretary). There are arguments that seeds for new moderate presidency in 2013 were also planted during Khatami presidency. Rouhani's reconciliatory messages as nuclear negotiator from 2003-2005 were not forgotten by the international community and key negotiating countries. This presidency to come was additionally cultivated during intellectual and surprisingly open debate for Iranian standards on the character of Iranian foreign policy in 2006 and 2008. In his article in *Iranian Foreign Policy Journal*, Rouhani asked either we wanted Iran to scare the region and the world or we need to build friendly relations. He concluded that between Islamic Republic and Islamic Revolution he chose Islamic Republic (Rouhani, 2006 and 2008).

It is not by surprise that on the opposite line was the Iranian president Ahmedinejad himself. The latter argued that reformists were traitors. As reported by Hemayat web site on March 10, 2008, Ahmedinejad was quoted as saying that those people were asking the approval from the US government for Iranian progress. All foreign embassies and observers noted strong rhetoric difference in the Iranian political culture and foreign policy discourse.

American policy and advisors were also sending positive signals in this regard. If he wants any progress in the Middle East, president Obama needs to open dialogue with Iran, suggested Gary Sick, prominent university professor and adviser of three US presidents, Ford, Carter and Regan on CNN on November 16, 2012. Best seller author Stephen Kinzer (2010) argued in his book *Reset* that America had interest to open dialog with Iran prior to this negotiation round. Iran that does not feel any threat may reach compromise on its nuclear program, open up energy market to US companies, stabilize Iraq and Afghanistan, and improve fight against terrorism, particularly Al-Qaida. Then, Limbert (2008) gave 15 recommendations to Obama administration to succeed in dialogue with Iran. His conclusion was that negotiation between two sides, no matter how hard and difficult, was probably better than continues violent relations.

In his first press conference as president in August 2013, Rouhani stated: "we seek a win-win game and this is possible... We are prepared to enter serious and meaningful negotiations with determination and without wasting time, and if our opposing party is equally ready, I am confident that the concerns of both sides will be allayed through dialogue." This rhetoric has been followed by fresh round of multilateral negotiations within the group of P 5+1. In November 2013, two sides already signed Technical agreement and agreed to continue negotiation to reach comprehensive deal in 2014. Under this Technical agreement, Iranian side agreed to stop 20% enrichment of Uranium started by Ahmedinejad in 2010 and close its Plutonium facility in Arak. From the other side, 5

billion of frozen Iranian financial recourses have been released and other minor sanctions were removed. In the meantime, several new rounds of talks have been held in Vienna, including bilateral talks between Iranian Foreign Minister Zarifi and US Secretary Kerry. Negotiators aimed to find an exceedingly complex and lasting deal limiting Iran's atomic activities in exchange for a lifting of sanctions.

The latest foreign policy shift might help the supreme leader Khamenei to improve his standing with increasing and disappointed Iranian population that belongs to reformist or pragmatic constituency by bringing Reformist back on the main course after political turmoil in 2009. However, some recent events indicated that Khamenei's support may be waning as reflected through increased criticism from the right wing individuals. Iranian Parliament also rejected Rouhani's nominations for vacant ministry positions on several occasion. These controlled attacks against Rouhani may be explained by several reasons. As suggested by analysts, Ali Khamenei will not appear to betray his base of support from Iranian Revolutionary Guard Corps (IRGC). Then, he may attempt to increase bargaining power of Rouhani abroad by criticizing him at home. Third, most probable and most consistent, Khamenei may be building an alternative foreign policy option as he did on two other occasions with Khatami and Ahmedinejad already.

According to the latest negotiation round between Iranian and 5+1 delegations on November 22-24, 2014, new deadline has been extended to March 1, 2015 for new technical agreement and July 1, 2015 for final agreement. Iran's supreme leader gave his indirect approval for a continuation of talks over its disputed nuclear program on November 25, 2014. He has been quoted as saying: "on the nuclear issue, the United States and European colonialist countries gathered and applied their entire efforts to bring the Islamic Republic to its knees but they could not and they will not." Vice chairman of parliament, Mohammad Hassan Aboutorabifard, said the U.S. is not trustworthy since Washington "sacrifices" its national interests for Israel, but he still voiced support for further nuclear talks. In an address to the nation, the President Rouhani said that the extension was a victory, adding negotiations will lead to a deal, "sooner or later." In this regard, we have yet to see what final approach would be taken by Ali Khamenei. Will this latest diplomatic breakthrough of partial nuclear compromise from November 2013 go all the way forward? As always, Iranian supreme leader has kept all options available by taking into consideration Iranian national interest. Political experience and evidence from the past also suggested that as soon as Iran arrives close to any big deal, cordial relations or opening of the country, it will divert in the opposite direction.

Conclusion

It is evident that Iran is preoccupied with its security and continuation of their state's leadership existence. In order to ensure its survival, it will seek to maximize its negotiation power relative to others. As evidence suggested, international law and international

institutions did not constrain or influence Iranian behavior to the extent that they blindly follow. In this regard, there is no difference with the Iranian foreign policy which is extension of its internal policy.

Iran has been using its energy wealth and leverage to strengthen his regional influence with more vulnerable neighbors. It has also used the stature to complicate U.S. interests (Carlos Pascual and Evie Zambetakís, 2010). In this regard, it clearly reflects the realist point of view. However, Iranian decision makers seem to be pragmatic as well in terms of not crossing self declared red lines. As presented in the paper, they never decided to accumulate enriched Uranium of 20% to 200kg, thus avoiding breaking the trust completely or giving strong evidence of nuclear military program.

This historical attitude of last 11 years has been fluid between two red lines reflecting Iranian double track approach. As presented in the paper, Iranian establishment moved between two opposing lines all the time. As soon as Iran reached one (dialogue, compromise, cordial relations with the West), it diverted towards animosity and instability almost as a rule.

This has been the transitional phase from Khatami to Ahmedinejad presidency. On the other side, as soon as it reached the other red line (instability, isolation and possible war with the United States), it diverted again, this time towards dialogue, compromise or cordial relations. This has been the transitional phase from Ahmedinejad to Rouhani presidency. As Iran followed its national interest at the time, it also reflected the realist point rather than any other understanding of international relations behavior. Thus, Donette (2010) spoke about generational struggle in her book *US Foreign Policy and Iran*.

It has been evident that all negotiating positions and all shifts in Iranian foreign relations have been supervised by the supreme leader. And this has been consistent policy throughout three phases that have been examined. Although the decision to end the suspension of Uranium enrichment in 2005 was probably taken before Ahmadinejad, Ayatollah Ali Khamenei made clear before the election that the nuclear issue was a national, not a presidential matter (Leonard, 2005). After the latest negotiating round in November this year, the New York Times reported that Iranian current foreign minister “often warned that the final decision would be in the hands of the supreme leader, Ayatollah Ali Khamenei.”

Is comprehensive nuclear deal between Iran and the West possible? The supreme leader was initially restraining public criticism of Rouhani through his public support for the nuclear negotiations at the end of 2013 and beginning of 2014. Khamenei gave him a chance, tested his loyalty and checked US / EU approach and readiness for compromise. To some extent, he is still checking deal options as negotiating deadline has been extended

to mid of 2015. Other options have been kept alive as controlled attacks from the conservative cycles continued. American analysts believe that any serious attempt to renew Iranian American relations would be political earthquake in Iran, would create political fractions of losers and winners where losers would refuse to accept change of existing status quo (David E. Thaler, Alireza Nader, Shahram Chubin, Jarrold D. Greem, Charlotte Lynch, F. Wehrey, 2010).

Therefore, for any nuclear deal to be agreed on Iranian side, it is not sufficient that the negotiating delegation only consent. More importantly, it is conservative cycles in general and supreme leader in particular that has the final say. Rouhani has complex position in this regard. He has to reach as better deal as possible. At the same time, he is supposed to convince extreme circles, including supreme leader, that there is no alternative to Iranian course of opening. Failure to deal with the international community is failure to his reformist policy. Similar stand could be expected from the US side. As reported by US media, "Kerry's position was complicated by the Republican midterm election victory and the fear of feeding the narrative that Mr. Obama was a weakened president." This brings us to the final conclusion that reaching final deal between Iran and the West next year depends on so many centers of power and so many opposing views.

Success in ongoing negotiations could resolve one of the most intractable geopolitical problems in the region. From the other side, the failure could divert Iran from dialog to tension yet again. If there is no deal between Iran and the international community next year, the United States will face a clear choice. On one side, US will be in position of tolerating the Iranian nuclear ambition. On the other, it may reapply continued diplomatic and economic pressure. On the extreme side, as suggested by US authorities, military means have not been excluded.

References

- Baqer, Moin. 2009. *Khomeini, Life of the Ayatollah*, I.B. Tauris.
- David E. Thaler, Alireza Nader, Shahram Chubin, Jarrold D. Greem, Charlotte Lynch, F. Wehrey. 2010. *Mullas, Guards and Bonyads, An Explorationm of Iranian Leadership Dynamics*, RAND Corporation.
- Ehteshami and Zweiri. 2007. *Iran and the Rise of its Neoconservatives*, I.B. Tauris.
- Hadzikadunic, Emir. 2013. *Zasto Iran*, Centar za napredne studije i Dobra knjiga, Sarajevo.
- Hefner, Robert. 2005. *Remaking Muslim Politics: Pluralism, Democratization, Contestation*, Princeton University Press.
- International Atomic Energy Agency. 2012. IAEA Report on Iran.
- Kinzer, Stephen. 2010. *Iran, Turkey and America's Future*, Times Books, New York.
- Leonard, Mark. 2005. *Can EU diplomacy stop Iran's nuclear program?*, Centre for European Forum.
- Limbert, W. John. 2008. *Negotiating with the Islamic Republic of Iran: Raising Chances for Success*,

- Fifteen Points to Remember*, US Institute for Peace, Special Report 199.
- Middle East Monitor*, Vol 22, Issue 1, January 2012.
- Murrey, Donette. 2010. *US Foreign Policy and Iran, American Iranian relations since the Islamic revolution*, Routledge.
- Noar, Atye. 1993. *Begin in Power: A Personal Testimony*.
- Pascual, Carlos and Zambetakis, Evie. 2010. *The Geopolitics of Energy*. Brookings Institution Press.
- Peter W. Galbraith. 2005. "Iraq: Bush Islamic Republic," *New York Review of Books*.
- Rowhani, Hasan. 2008. *20 Years Perspective and Progressive Foreign Policy*, Persian Journal, February 28.
- See also "Iran Press: Ex Nuclear Chief Criticizes Ideological Impact on Foreign Policy", Baztab News Information Center web site quoted on E'temad-e Melli Tehran.
- Woodward, Bob. 2008. *The War Within: A Secret White House History 2006-2008*, Simon and Schuster.

“E-GOVERNMENT PORTAL” AND E-SERVICES IN TURKEY

Yucel Ogurlu*

Abstract

Likewise in other developed countries, E-government in public administration in Turkey has been introduced with an aim to improve state's administrative efficiency and competency. These modern administrative approaches and opportunities from technological innovation will inevitably provide high quality services and participation at all levels of the public administration. For this purpose, Turkey established e-Government portal, (e-Devlet Kapısı) a virtual structure which enables access to digital public services. The aim of the e-Government portal is to provide its users service through only one website and safe digital media. Since accessing the services through only one website makes access easier, high speed and system security are required too. The security system requires identity verification, password and e-Signature. Turkey has successfully implemented the e-government project and with sub-projects such as the National Judiciary Information System Turkey received many international awards. Other than public services similar to e-hospital, e-municipality and e-tender, other social service institutions can also use same administrative approach as to make their service available. Therefore, this paper shortly analyzes technical and legal challenges and technical, administrative and legal solutions of the e-Government portal.

Keywords: E-Government; E-signature; E-Service; Digital Public Service and Electronic Service.

Introduction

Technological developments on the eve of the twentieth century reshaped almost every aspect of human life and significantly influenced almost every academic discipline. Information and communication technologies restructured not only the way we understand the concept of government in classical terms, but also it changed the way governments and public administrations operated and functioned. Internet, perceived as one of the major achievements of the information revolution, singled out itself as the most important tool for restructuring the public administration due its high potential in optimization, efficiency, productivity, accountability and transparency.

Public administration changes fostered by the information and communication revolution led to the transformation into new forms of government usually referred as e-government, electronic or digital government. The concept of e-government could be seen as ambiguous; however generally it is defined as the use of technology as a tool to deliver government services to its customers which can be citizens, businesses, other

*Corresponding author: Yucel Ogurlu, Full Professor, International University of Sarajevo, Bosnia and Herzegovina; e-mail: yogurlu@ius.edu.ba

governments, NGOs, etc. (Means and Schneider in Yildiz, 2002 pp. 41-57). Today, e-government encompasses a wide range of meanings from policies related to the development of information structures to the measures for the improvement of the public administration's functions (Linz, 1996).

One of the major aspects of e-government is how to bring customers (citizens, business, other governments and NGOs) closer to their governments aiming at simplifying procedures but keeping the privacy and security of its clients. Therefore, there are four main, very broad, categories or models which e-government encompass that represent the scope of e-government: Government-to-Citizens (G2C), Government-to-Business (G2B), Government-to-Government (G2G) and Government-to-NGO (G2N).

E-government, contrary to tradition governments, aims at reducing and minimizing the bureaucracy in order to ensure that governments functions more accurately, efficiently and transparently. In the e-government system there is no mediator between citizens/business and information, that enables quick flow of information, reduced workflow and reduces the error rates (Stamoulis, 2001). One of the major provisions of e-government is e-services which represent its ultimate goal, but not aiming to replace the traditional services. Rather, they are perceived as complementary aiming at reducing the lines and providing the services 24 hours per day, seven days in a week.

According to the United Nations e-Government Survey 2012 five world leading countries in implementation of e-government initiatives are Republic of Korea, the Netherlands, United Kingdom, Denmark and United States, with the e-government development index higher than 0.85.

Table 1.1. World e-government leaders (Very High EGDl) in 2014

Country	Region	2014 EGDI	2014 Rank	2012 Rank	Change (2012)
Republic of Korea	Asia	0.9462	1	1	
Australia	Oceania	0.9103	2	12	↑
Singapore	Asia	0.9076	3	10	↑
France	Europe	0.8938	4	6	↑
Netherlands	Europe	0.8897	5	2	↓
Japan	Asia	0.8874	6	18	↑
United States of America	Americas	0.8748	7	5	↓
United Kingdom	Europe	0.8695	8	3	↓
New Zealand	Oceania	0.8644	9	13	↑
Finland	Europe	0.8449	10	9	↓
Canada	Americas	0.8418	11	11	
Spain	Europe	0.8410	12	23	↑
Norway	Europe	0.8357	13	8	↓
Sweden	Europe	0.8225	14	7	↓
Estonia	Europe	0.8180	15	20	↑
Denmark	Europe	0.8162	16	4	↓
Israel	Asia	0.8162	17	16	↓
Bahrain	Asia	0.8089	18	36	↑
Iceland	Europe	0.7970	19	22	↑
Austria	Europe	0.7912	20	21	↑
Germany	Europe	0.7864	21	17	↓

Source: UN e-Government Survey 2014.

E-government in Turkey

Development of e-Government in Turkey started in early 1990s with the establishment of Information Society and knowledge-based economy (Sayan, et al. 2004). The purpose of Information Society was to increase Turkey's competitiveness focusing on innovation, science and technology and strengthening ICT capacities and capabilities in Turkey (OECD, 2007).

The first phase was characterized with simple application of ICT technologies usually providing basic information to citizens via official websites that could be considered only as electronic user manuals of institution that continued to provide services in traditional manner. Late 1990s and by the beginning of 2000s mainly were characterized by the initiatives and developmental plans for implementation of e-government services which led to broad discussion of government, academic, NGO, business and public sector.

In the past several years' Turkish officials argued that it is necessary to develop so-called *Prime Ministry Management Information Center* in order to provide services and information through only one website on the model of USA *Firstgov Portal* (Fletcher Patricia and Torok, 2003, pp. 268-281). Those pioneers of e-Administration in Turkey were arguing that without such an integrated service stipulation, e-Administration would appear as isolated from each other, independent and scattered. Therefore, because of the complexity of this structure, public service users refrained from using e-Administration services and relied more on classical procedures. In this regard, there was always a need for integrating portal throughout the country.

The Prime Ministry Directorate General for Personnel and Policies initiated the establishment of the *Board of Technical Public Network* formed (Genelge, 1998). In 2002, the *Board of Technical Public Network*, within the framework of e-Europe and e-Turkey, managed to transform traditional system of government to e-Government. New e-Government model aimed to provide "*efficient, transparent, fast and continuous*" services by using information and communication technology. Then, in order to comply with the needs of information society, e-Government also aimed to incorporate state-citizen relationships into digital media by establishing e-Institutions and "Government e-Portal" (State Planning Organization, 2002, p. 1).

There are many works on the implementation of e-Government (Ogurlu, 2010); however for the sake of a brief illustration the "Ninth Development Plan" (2007-2013) summarized e-Government implementation as follows:

MERNIS project is information system which keeps citizen identity information based on single number and these information are shared with other public institutions. Tax and customs transactions procedures

are significantly introduced in electronic environment and its usage is continuously expanding. National Jurisdiction Network Project and e-declaration that include social security proceedings have been implemented. Budget Management Information System that is supporting budget preparation and operations is being efficiently implemented by public administrations. All legal and administrative infrastructures for e-Signature have been created and it is already in public use. E-Government portal that was introduced in 2005 continues its efforts towards integrating the service delivery to citizen from single point (pp. 51-52).

In the aforementioned *Development Plan*, e-Government basic infrastructure was envisioned. Actually, there are views that since 2005 initial steps towards e-Government portal and further gradual developments provided “integrated service delivery” from one internet point. In this regard, according to MERNIS Project,

a single number, based on citizens’ identity information and information held information system created to be shared with other public institutions started. A tax and customs operation with a large extent is presented and the use of electronic media has become widespread. e-Declaration applications including The National Judiciary Network Project and the social insurance transactions, have been carried out. The Budget Management Information System that supports process of budget preparation and operational support, has been using by public administrations effectively. For the use of e-signature in the public sector, legal and administrative substructure were created and the application was begun (Ninth Development Plan (2007-2013), 2006, p. 52).

According to the survey result, www.turkiye.gov.tr was adopted as yet another name for the portal that will be created.

E-Government Digital Public Service Opportunities

Users of digital public services should possess “password, electronic signature and mobile electronic signature,” as to verify their identity. Since this information is accessible only to people who can provide identity verification, they are completely safe. Then, other most important advantages of e-Government and *digital public services* are user-friendly applications and confidentiality. In this regard, for the identification of a particular user a variety of means could be used from credit cards to password, e-signature and m-signature (mobile signature) (Ninth Development Plan (2007-2013), 2006, p. 52). It is worth mentioning that this model, that provides services and infrastructure through e-Government, is familiar to the users of other countries, especially neighboring countries (Devletin Kısayolu-turkiye.gov.tr).

At this moment, *e-Government home portal (e-Government portal)* is a system which gives access to digital public services through a single web site. E-Government portal aims to provide the services to the public through a single address and in a safe digital environment. In order to approach other services, single identification confirmation is enough. In the Article 2, paragraph (i) of the “Draft of the Law on e-Government and Information Society” prepared by the Prime Minister, “e-Government portal” is defined as follows: “The e-Government portal: information system provides users a single access point to services of e-government public institutions and organizations” (Devletin Kısayolu-turkiye.gov.tr).

In the twenty-first article of the Draft titled e-Government Portal, it is planned to give a more superior regulation:

- (1) E-Government portal, as common e-government service, is regulated within the guidance and supervision of the Agency. The mission, authority and responsibilities of manager of *e-Government portal* are determinate by regulations prepared by Agency.
- (2) Services of e-Government portal are offered in the way that users can easily benefit from it; it is simple and functional.
- (3) Agency gives priority to public institutions and organizations that take place in e-Government Commitment Service and it sets services through e-Government portal. The services will be integrated into *e-government portal* and indicated separately in *e-government* service commitment of related institution. The integration of established services to *e-government portal* is provided by manager of *e-government portal* and institutions providing the related service.
- (4) While providing supplement to projects, the Agency takes into consideration studies of integration to *e-government portal*. Agency has the authority to take the necessary measures in order to complete all activities regarding the integration of public services into e-Government without the delay.
- (5) The content presented through e-Government Portal and service-related changes are at the same time forwarded to the operator of e-Government Portal to be published by the institution responsible for the content. The institution providing given content and *e-government portal* manager are both responsible for up-dating the information.
- (6) In *e-government portal* identity verification is done at various levels. For which services and at what level identity verification will be made is determined by responsible institution according to principles and procedures published by the Agency.

According to the Community Information Strategy (2006) it is determined that change in ‘citizen oriented’ public services will be redesigned and during implementation of this strategy, as the main principle, public service and “user satisfaction” with work

processes will be considered. Here, it will be useful as well, to set a goal defined by strategy:

“The primary aim of the service in conversion is not to move data to electronic location without the improvement of current work processes, but redesigning it by combining and simplifying it according to users’ needs and in the way that is efficient, fast, continuous, transparent, safe and integrated. In order to simplify access of the citizens and businesses to electronic public services, access to these services from single point and different platforms will be secured (Bilgi Toplumu Stratejisi Belgesi (2006-2010)).

E-government Portal and Digital Public Services

E-government portal gives opportunity to public institutions to share information and documents with each other. Public institutions and public services of the organizations and all those associated with these services are opened to share “correct and update information” (“Devletin Kısayolu-turkiye.gov.tr”). It is easy to make payment transaction for digital public services (tax, fees, etc.) through “payment unit service” of “e-government portal” (e-government home portal). This step meets an important precondition in running the e-government and it is a basic step for carrying out the financial work. On this site, with cooperation of totally 17 institutions, 122 services and facilities have been offered.

The services provided through e-government portal can be grouped according to their type in following six titles: information services, digital public services, payment systems, shortest way to access institutions and organizations, up-dated information and notices and messages from institutions to the public (Information Society Strategy Document (2006-2010), p. 29).

There are different information and articles on services that are given by e-government portal and home portal links in Turkey.

1. Individuals and society: Access to information on topics such are homeless children, social assistance and solidarity, female gender issues, housing and gambling games.
2. Legal procedures, rights and defense: law measures, voter procedures, protection of the consumers, system of address registration, access to public notaries, application and required information.
3. Birth: Information and services such as birth registration, prenatal and post natal permits, maternal and infant health.
4. Military service and mobilization: Such procedures are military operation, officer ranks and reserve military, abroad or payment in foreign currency for military service.
5. Education: Kindergarten, primary and secondary schools, distance learning

- education, higher education and services provided by Student Selection and Placement Center.
6. Traffic: Traffic safety, motor vehicle operations, driving license procedures, highway control.
 7. Health: Family health, public health, oral and dental health, nutrition information and scheduling appointments at hospital.
 8. Citizens with disabilities: Health, education, employment, social rights and services, home-care services.
 9. Turkish citizens living abroad: Information and services such as *e*-Consulate, population registrations, diploma equivalency, military service and marriage.
 10. Art, culture and sport: Information and services such as cultural heritage, cultural activities, theaters, festivals, sport activities, fairs and local activities.
 11. Job and career: Social Security Institution services for employees.
 12. Family: Information and application forms for marriage, family health, population registration, children and teenagers and children rights.
 13. Travel and tourism: General information about Turkey, types of tourism in Turkey, service for Turkish citizens living abroad, information about railway and highway transportation.

E-Government Portal Institutional Usage

Besides providing informative services such as weather forecast Turkish State Meteorological Service also interactively downloads forms, keeps tracks of documents and follows their online phases or makes payments by filling out the declaration statements. It is a remarkable fact that, just like UYAP Portal (National Judiciary Information System), Ministry of Justice also supports a trial service that uses the public services. Similar forms of *e-Government portal* services are provided by the Ministry of labor and social security, Turkish National Police, Revenue administration department - *e*-Tax Registration Certificate Inquiry, Turkish Employment Agency (İŞ-KUR), General Directorate of Coastal Safety, The Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Defense, General Directorate of Civil Registration and Nationality, Post Office, The Ministry of Health, The Ministry of Industry and Commerce, General Directorate of Civil Aviation, General Directorate of Land Registry and Cadastre, Turkish State Railways and Ministry of Transportation.

When designing E-government portal, people with disabilities were not forgotten and system was made easy for them to use. Recommended by European Union and accepted in all European countries, easier access for disabled people to public digital services was taken into consideration while designing the portal. It should be noted that it is not possible to make successful parallel infrastructure expansion and advertisement on this matter. Being able to apprehend reasonable and realizable goals is also important for later goals and plans.

One of the goals for the year of 2010, as it is presented in the Information Community Strategy Document (2006-2010), is ‘people oriented service transformation’ that uses information and communication technology to present public services in digital media in effective way. While doing this, we need to have in mind those who benefit from such preferences and requirements, since the goal is to make easier approach to digital services, increasing its usage rate and increasing the satisfaction of those using the services. In the strategy report planned till the year of 2010, it has been emphasized that these basic goals should be achieved:

- Increasing the number of public services offered in digital media and raising their level of development.
- Increasing the use of public services presented in digital media,
- Increasing the level of satisfaction of those benefiting from the use of public services offered in digital media services (Bilgi Toplumu Stratejisi Belgesi (2006-2010)).

In the above mentioned document, among the other goals that will be carefully considered by the year of 2010, there is realization of 70% of public services that were feasible to be offered digitally have been provided, improvement of presentations’ “level of development” and “Benefit-cost rates”. Priority will be given to “high income services” and resources that are intensively and efficiently used (Information Society Strategy Document (2006-2010) p. 30).

According to data gathered from Under-secretariat of State Planning Organization, in the annexed Action Plan and in Turkey’s Community Information Strategy that is planned to be completed by the year of 2010, at the beginning of 2009 only 4 out of 74 planned activities were used effectively, showing the necessitate to start with more pragmatic plans when it comes to their realization (Bilgi Toplumu Stratejisi Eylem Planı, 2006; “e-Devlet ve Bilgi Toplumu Kanun Tasarısı Taslağı”nın Genel Gerekçesi, 2009). In the year of 2010, it is expected that one out of three public service transactions made by citizens would be conducted through electronic ways, and in 2010 consumers’ satisfaction shall rise to 80% (Information Society Strategy Document (2006-2010), 2006, p. 30).

Conclusion

Digital public services and its preparatory digital facilities are related to its quality. It is necessary to consider digital public service as services that has benefited from classic public services and one that facilitates services. New possibilities and opportunities provided by information and communication technologies determinate natural border that will be provided through digital services environment. Certain public services are comprised of steps such as informing, downloading a form, filling and exercising a form. Since some actions require accurate and executive steps, it is not possible for these services to be provided by digital environment. Public services such as garbage collection,

physical intervention to provide public order, and medical examination are not possible to be transmitted through digital environment. Even in classical public services such as safety, health and education, information and communication technology possibilities and opportunities are considered an auxiliary element. Some public services can be completely provided through digital environment. It is impossible to imagine and predict in advance what kind of service models will appear in the future. Mobile phones and security cameras we watched in science fiction movies, which were made 20 years ago, became part of our lives today, so it is difficult to imagine new models we are to see in the future. Services such as radio and TV broadcasting, communication services, telephone and fax, education, jurisdiction and preventive medicine are most likely to be transmitted to digital environment in the near future. The classic education and court activities are gradually beginning to be transmitted to distance learning education and *e-courts*. It has also become a support element for the public services which are not suitable to provide MOBESE cameras in security, computer aided planner statistics program in collecting garbage, medical services, data collection, storage, monitoring, evaluating and keeping statistics, in digital environment. Besides this, looking from the administration law point of view, *e-Administration* eased the job of municipality services such as subscription, objection, filling out statements, paying taxes, applications for administration and application tracking.

Tens of countries started to use *e-administration* in period before Turkey but they are still looking for solutions related to *e-Administration* problems. Within the framework of this problem and solution efforts, digital public services should be integrated throughout the country; responsibilities about the establishment, operation and management of *e-Administration* should be undertaken; gained momentum should be maintained; focus of the program should not be diverted; the aim of drawn plan and strategy should be preserved; cooperation between public service users and administration comprising *e-Administration* parties should be established; continuous renewed technical components should be introduced to service users and public staff.

References

- Behire Esra Çayhan, 2008. "Implementing e-Government in Turkey: A Comparison of Online Public Service Delivery in Turkey and the European Union", *The Electronic Journal on Information Systems in Developing Countries*. 35, 8, 1-11.
- "Bilgi Toplumu Stratejisi Belgesi." (2006-2010) , RG.28.07.2006, S.: 26242, s.28.
- "Devletin Kısayolu-turkiye.gov.tr", (çevrimiçi); *Türkiye'de E-Devlet Çerçevesinde İdare Hukuku Anlayışında Değişim*
- "Devletin Kısayolu-turkiye.gov.tr"
- <https://www.turkiye.gov.tr/portal/dt?channel=bilgilendirme&bilgilendirme.bilgiTipi=sikcaSoru-lanlar>. ET.28.03.2009.
- Diamond Fletcher Patricia; Torok Andrew G., 2003. "Creating the front door to government: A case study

- of the Firstgov portal,” *Library Trends*, Vol. 52, No. 2, pp. 268-281.
- Genelge. 1998. *Republic of Turkey Prime Ministry Directorate General for Personel and Policies*, Number: B.02.0.PPG.0.12-320-04993.
- Ibrahim Akman, Ali Yazici, Alok Mishra, Ali Arifoglu. 2005. “E-Government: A global view and an empirical evaluation of some attributes of citizens”, *Government Information Quaterly*, 20.
- Information Society Strategy Document (2006-2010), RG.28.07.2006, Number: 26242.
- “Ninth Development Plan” (2007-2013), dated on 1 st July, 2006 Mükerrer Official Gazzette (Number.: 26215).
- OECD (2007), *OECD e-Government Studies: Turkey 2007*, OECD Publishing.
- Ogurlu, Yücel. 2010. “İdare Hukukunda “e-Devlet” Dönüşümü ve Dijitalleşen Kamu Hizmeti”, Oniki Levha Publications, Istanbul.
- State Planning Organization, “e-Devlet’e Geçiş Sürecinde KamuNet Çalışmaları,” KamuNet Technical Board Passingto Information Age State, State Planning Organization, Management Information Center Department (KamuNet Technical Board Chairmanship), November 2002.
- Türksel K. Bensghir and Mete Yildiz. 2001-2002. “Perceptions of E-government in Turkey”, *Turkish Public Administration Annual*, Vol. 27-28, p. 41-57.
- UN e-Government Survey. 2014 UN Publishing, Available at: http://unpan3.un.org/egovkb/Portals/egovkb/Documents/un/2014-Survey/E-Gov_Complete_Survey-2014.pdf
- D. Stamoulis, D. Gouscos, P. Georgiadis and D. Martakos, 2001 “Revisiting public information management for effective e-government services”, *Information Management and Computer Security*, Vol.9 No.4, MCB University Press, pp. 146-153.

THE FORGING OF NATIONAL STATES ON THE ANVIL OF WAR

Haris Hojkurić*
Dželal Ibraković*

Abstract

The progress of Western countries and the colonization of oil-rich Muslim countries clustered within the Ottoman Empire, which was located in the controlled agony of the new geo-strategic and technological processes, produced a turbulent beginning of the 20th century. The establishment of nation states has jeopardized the survival of monarchies such as Austro-Hungary, Russia, and others. The battle for the new, above all, European order signified the World War, in political science but also in historiography, and it established the principle that the term “world” war refers to the conflicts waged in Europe. The First World War was the site scene of the disappearance of the great empires and also the definite disappearance of the juncture of state and religion, as well as suppression of religion and other monarchist structures into new paradigms such as the nation-state, democracy and secularization. On the contrary, it opened the opportunity for the development of totalitarian regimes - socialism and Nazism - created precisely in Europe. Muslim-majority countries were colonized and brought to a vassal state, and their rich natural resources were enslaved. The principle of the nation state was imposed upon them by imperial methods and brutal clashes with opponents, aiming to eliminate in the long term any significant force since the overthrow of the Ottoman Empire and the attempts to destroy Turkey completely. Bosnia and Herzegovina and the Balkans emerge as a collateral damage that lasts even in the 21st century.

Keywords: The “World War” State and Nation; The Balkans; Territory and Conflict

Introduction:

The 20th century is one of the deadliest centuries in human history. Contemporaries often emphasize that the modern age has successfully brought violence under control although the Great War or the First World War paved the way for a drastic use of violence in this century. British sociologist and one of the most significant interpreters of the last century, Anthony Giddens, will come to conclusion that this century, as so called “the century of modern societies”, was, according to the number of its armed conflicts, extremely violent and terrifying. Maid Taherian asserts that

after 1900, there were approximately 250 international and civil wars and as a result 100 million soldiers and around 100 million civilians were killed. By counting only war victims, 18th century had a rate of 50 victims per million residents, in comparison to 60 victims in the 19th, and 460 in the 20th century. (By Hersak, 1999: 32-33)

*Corresponding authors: Haris Hojkurić, International University of Sarajevo; Dželal Ibraković, Faculty of Political Sciences, University of Sarajevo; Bosnia and Herzegovina, e-mail: hhojkuric@ius.edu.ba

A small country in Europe, Bosnia and Herzegovina, without any desire of its people, has marked this tendency by which the 20th century will be remembered in history. Events in and around this country marked the beginning and the end of this murderous century. The annexation of Bosnia and the assassination of the Austro-Hungarian Archduke Franz Ferdinand and his pregnant wife Sophia by Gavrilo Princip in Sarajevo in 1914 were the events that introduced and formally launched the First World War. On the other hand, the aggression on Bosnia (1992-1995) was treated as “ethnic conflict” or “civil war” in the Balkans. This country also suffered a tremendous desolation during the Second World War; in any of these cases its citizens, material goods and wealth were exposed to destruction, ruthless killings and plundering.

Scientists are faced with a multiple dilemmas that are not sufficiently clarified, and as a result there are many approaches to them even in the scientific circles. This is corroborated by the controversy concerning the celebration of the 100th anniversary of the assassination attempt in Sarajevo – an entire century from the beginning of the First World War. There is no dilemma, however, about the fact that the criteria for a “world” war only applies to armed conflicts that took place in the European countries. This shows a rule of Euro centrism in social relations in the world.

There are, certainly, other opinions which consider that during the modern age (ongoing) the great war was a constant of human development which only improves the possibilities of destruction, and its objectives as such are not just military any more, but through the forms of national, ideological, religious and individual terrorism it expands itself to a war of all against all. The aim of this work is not to analyze the layers and complexities of international relations and geopolitical games which are present and increasingly gaining certain forms of conspiracy theories, or overemphasized roles of ideology, rigid divisions of the world on East and West or on the “good” and the “bad” guys. Edward Said rightly stated that “every single empire, in its official discourse, has said that it is not like all the others, that its circumstances are special, that it has a mission to enlighten, civilize, bring order and democracy, and that it uses force only as a last resort.” Engdahl (1999) points to some of these motives which are not the subject of the adopted and ruling views on the world. In the struggle for the control of strategic resources (energy and oil), he sees the explanation for the events that occurred in the 20th century and also the real causes of major conflicts that happened then and continued in the 21st century.

The socio-historical concept of the 20th century is certainly important because this century brought unimagined achievements in the development of science, especially technology. The world system of capital relations was being established on the global level. The means of production which were mainly related to agriculture were conquering types of feudal empires, and they were never able to achieve any global significance.

Industrial revolution led to such social changes which, sooner or later, involved global character. The fight for supremacy and control over strategic resources is still directed by the form of nation states.

Nation and nation state is the main product of the new world view, which enables the development of capital relations and it strives to have a dominant influence. Its internal logic of existence is based on the profit and this goal is the guiding principle for the suppression of other forms and spheres of influence. This also applies to the suppression of the great feudal empires, of religion, and also other forms of social cohesion and solidarity. The demolition of values which were considered permanent, on which human society was based for the past several thousands of years, and the pace of the change that occurred intensively in the 20th century, represent the characteristic that led to the epochal changes, as well as the changes in power relations in the world.

Such changes were characterized by secularization, the availability of education and technology to all residents, the increase in the standard of living, faster physical and virtual communication, the flow of knowledge and capital, competition, globalization of the world, the spread of human right and freedom and many other achievements. They were all the potential for an unseen development. This potential reflected in all areas, and it would be unjust not to mention the great rise of the human race which resulted in the presence of man beyond the boundaries of Earth. Great inventions in all fields of life, including medicine, led to an increasing life expectancy and an increase in living standards led to a demographic “explosion” which became particularly expressed in the second half of the 20th century and it has multiplied the population of our planet. Such an intensive development obviously contributed to the environmental imbalance, where the ecological problems are being very much expressed and they are being on the “other side” with many other negative consequences that are often concealed and represent the price of irrational spending of limited resources. Climate change is only one part of the threats to the modern society.

Hostile Serbia as the Piedmont of the Balkans

The 20th century in the area of the Balkans, as an imaginary space which has a more symbolic than geographical significance, has left open questions about the formation of the nation state. The process of formation of nation states in Europe (France) begins after 1799. In this process, the formation of a nation was often treated as a formation of an “imagined community” (Anderson), but there is no doubt that the international order, based on the sovereignty of people (known as “the right to self-determination”) established a nation state which appears on the ruins of feudal empires (Katunovic, 2003, 96-98). Of course, the principle of “one (majority) nation- one country” has opened a Pandora’s Box where the territorial pretensions and the concept of “one nation” collide and leave room for interpretations which last up until today. Bosnia and Herzegovina is (once again) in the

spotlight. The inevitable departure of the Ottomans from the Balkans in the 19th century was accompanied by numerous remains of a century-long presence which left traces in all spheres of life and they are inevitably recognized even now. This “transition” occurred at a time when even within the Ottoman state the “national question” was questioned, and the ideas of the Young Turks were gaining strength and dominance.

Multi-ethnic empire had another form of internal solidarity (monarchist Sultan’s authority) which unified the Caliphate character in yet another community that has not been sufficiently explored, and whose scope is usually minimized by artificial means. That is the Muslim community, and it is consisted of followers of Islam. They represent a real force, but through colonial conquests, the concept of nation made these countries primarily nation states formed by colonial borders and only optionally a part of a Muslim community which has no significance in power relations of the world. On the contrary, since the occupation of Iraq and Palestine (made under the form of “liberation” by one of the major Entente powers- Great Britain) it has been shown that by breaking the solidarity of this kind of community, at the expense of formation of states such as Saudi Arabia, there is a possibility that the defense of some of the most important cultural foundations of the Islamic community would be lost. Defense of Gaza by the Ottoman army during the First World War was the last true defense of the indigenous inhabitants of Palestine. Unfortunately, the solidarity of other Islamic countries was completely left out. This is something that is repeated in the 21st century, which shows that this kind of community withdrew itself before the enchanting idea of “its own nation” and “its own country”. It is so far clear that the idea of a nation and “own country” has opened many possibilities for defining the “unification of one nation” but even more for the definition of the “nation state”. This happened before and after the First World War (More: Sokolovic, 2014).

During the formation of nation states in the late 19th century and in the process of liberation before and after the WWI, Bosnia had a great misfortune that its state uniqueness before the arrival of the Ottomans (medieval Bosnian state), which was also accepted by the Ottoman and Austro-Hungarian governments, failed to endure at this time. Namely we can agree with Milenko Markovic (2008) that there were continuing aspirations towards B&H, solely because its 2 main neighbors (Serbia and Croatia) did not fully profit in terms of definitely rounded national territory. In our opinion, the basic element of the disagreement between these two countries was not the “hatred” among Serbs and Croats but rather to whom should Bosnia belong to. Territorial aspirations of both sides could be observed in continuity. Milenko Markovic says: “these claims remained unrealized over the centuries, firstly because Bosnian state uniqueness and multi-ethnicity refused to accept them, and secondly because the external factor was opposed to them as well.”

Bosnia, however, gained its state uniqueness during the Middle Ages along with the existence of Serbian and Croatian states. During the Kotromanian dynasty, and even

more during the time of King Tvrtko, Bosnia was (in addition to Dusan's empire) the largest country in the Balkans and it remained independent for the longest period of time. The second thing that history verifies is the fact that Bosnia, with the exception of some of its smaller parts, has never been part of any Serbian nor Croatian state (except during the years of WWII when the Germans and Italians put B&H under the jurisdiction of Pavelić's Independent State of Croatia). Otherwise, Bosnian territorial and multi-ethnic distinctiveness was respected by both empires that ruled over it-Turkey and Austria-Hungary (Markovic, 2008).

The Serbian and Croatian Undefined Boundaries

In the situation of undefined territory, especially of the nation state of Serbia (which has lasted up to the modern era) there is a constant threat because of the tendency of encouraging "the Serbs across the river Drina" to revolt, to develop a specific patriotic feeling in which the "special Serbism" is highlighted and this crashes any patriotic attachments of the Orthodox population of B&H to the country where they were born and lived, as well as many of their ancestors. Such strategy, which is clearly supported by each government in Serbia, runs from the second half of the 19th century, the whole 20th and the beginning of the 21st century, and it reflects the ideas of Serbia as a nation state which should have maximum territory.

The concept of so-called "Great Serbia" is often perceived as as a national state of all Serbs. Besides the well known documents such as the famous "*Načertanija*" by Ilija Garasanin (1844), there are numerous moves that indicate the ambiguous idea of joining the territory of Bosnia and Herzegovina, Montenegro, Macedonia as well as parts of Croatia to this new state. Serbia's interest for liberation of other "South Slavic brothers" was in the function of that national goal mainly as a project for the expansion of Serbian state. Serbia always favored the idea of unitary concept and not any kind of federation or co-federalization. The most common argument was the accomplished advantage of the power of weapons and force of the population number rather than any achievements of democracy (Markovic, 2008). This approach, along with Croatian aspirations, is one of the main reasons for the failure of the first and second Yugoslavia. In 1899 a book by Miroslav Spalajkovic "*La Bosnie et l' Herzegovine*" was published in Paris, and it was a doctoral dissertation defended three years earlier. This book claimed that Bosnia and Herzegovina contains "the most valuable part of the Serbian race", and gaining Bosnia is an existential issue for Serbia (Sehic, 2014).

Throughout this period, which has reflected the idea of the nation-state as the European project, the characteristics of the great empires which had a lot of influence on the events in the Balkans were under attack. It is their multicultural character, multi-ethnic composition, which had survived and had become the main obstacle to the idea of a nation that was a substitute for repressed religion, and its flammable content had given strength

to various imposed movements.

In the very center of the empires, there was a victory of the national idea and thus the nation state itself, from the German, Hungarian to the Russian or Turkish national state. This kind of a new world image profiling in which the dominant nation state was able to mobilize millions of people who would go to war not for the idea of a community of nations, but for a union of states and above all in the name of their own nation. Although the worldwide organization (UN) has a name which resembles the “united nations”, it is in its essence, the unity of its state members-mostly national states. This applies to the European Union in its modern form, where the insistence on standards, legislation and unification even of the human rights by certain cultural rules, is a recognition of the very ideas that simply overwrite the boundaries of the former multi-ethnic empires. The First World War was used as an anvil on which the nation states were forged and developed; the remains of the monarchist government were more part of the folklore.

After the introduction of a compulsory military service, Bosnia and Herzegovina had a significant participation in Austro-Hungarian army. Before the end of the 1917 there were 298,773 soldiers in Bosnian troops. It is interesting that in all the records, the members of these troops were appointed as Bosnians, a mark for all religions and peoples of Bosnia and Herzegovina. Heroism that characterized these troops has led thousands of young men into death. In this war, Austria-Hungary mobilized 17.2% of the total male population in Bosnia between the age of 16 and 70. The multi-religious Bosnianhood, as a concept advocated by Austria-Hungary in an attempt to return this medieval concept into a collective memory, experienced a collapse with the growth of national movements and it was definitely abandoned with the disappearance of Austria-Hungary from the world scene.

Bosnia and Herzegovina brought its own uniqueness into the new state of Slovenes, Croats and Serbs, which was a community of Yugoslavian people (again multiethnic!), but this uniqueness was not appreciated by the new authorities. This agreement between Serbs, Croats, and Slovenes, at the time when nation-states were being determined all around Europe, the colonial Africa, but also around the world, has delayed the implementation of the concept of nation state in B&H. The tendencies of Bosnia's two neighboring countries were expressed through the “implication” of special connections between Bosnian Serbs and Croats, as well as the attempt to separate all the territory from Bosnia and Herzegovina and to merge it with Serbia (more open and evident effort) and Croatia. These aspirations were continuous and they were shaken by the affirmation of Bosnian statehood in the 1974 Constitution which resulted in an attempt to terminate it with aggression and genocide against B&H from 1992-1995.

Conclusion

The shots fired in Sarajevo, in 1914, symbolically marked the victory of the national state over the monarchist multiethnic empire. The historical paradox in this case is that this happened in the capital city of a country that will withstand great difficulty and destruction during the twentieth century, just to defend the idea of multi-ethnicity. Bosniaks, people who are gathered around this national name (still more names than national ideologies) at the end of the twentieth and the beginning of the twenty first century, are the majority population in Bosnia. They are mainly Muslims, one of the largest and most persistent (potentially) state-building groups in the “heart of Europe”. As such, and in addition being in a struggle for multi-ethnicity, they have been labeled as “others” in Europe which mainly consisted of one nation states. Different geostrategic policies of the most powerful economic, political, and military powers are intertwined in a historical continuity over the territory of Bosnia and Herzegovina and the Balkans, and an interesting fact is that no one is satisfied with anyone’s advantage. The qualification of the Balkans (Southeast Europe) as the “other” shows yet another constant that becomes evident when it comes to the concept of nation state and that is, that in its implementation both Orthodoxy (Orthodox Christianity) and Islam are beyond the standard form of the nation state constitution.

The Orthodox people have a predominant theory of the nation as a community of blood and soil and they try to define their countries as larger by placing “predestined” and “historical” rights over other territories, and this leads to a myth production that causes territorial ambiguity, e.g. Russia, Serbia, Ukraine, Romania, Bulgaria... In Muslim majority countries the idea of the nation state was imposed as a part of a standard and enforced colonial relationship in which the ruling concept is based on the nation state and it sets the affiliation to a much wider community of Muslims. All of this causes various problems and holds back the idea of a “new world order”, or the idea of liberal democracy and free market as the “end of history.” (Fukuyama).

Forced transitions and the imposition of various models are common, and it is evident that Bosniaks in Bosnia and Herzegovina became cross-eyed ever since the departure of the Ottomans, with one eye looking towards Istanbul and with the other towards the upcoming West, and out of the corners of their eyes trying to identify the threats from the neighborhood. We can agree with Abdulgafar Velic that in all these years, from the time of occupation, annexation, the First World War but also in the Kingdom of Yugoslavia, they built their identity on faith. As a result, the terms own country and nation, as represented in European culture, were set in the background (Velic, 2013:168). This prevented Bosnians to plan their conquests towards their neighbors, but also it developed a tolerance and acceptance of others who are different and this was a characteristic of Bosnia and Herzegovina. Bosnians were among the first in Europe who publically were opposed to Fascism (Bandzovic, 2010), and the fact that the elements of multi-ethnicity and multiculturalism held the pressure in the recent aggression (1992-1995) says

that although the concept of coexistence of difference in one area could be a potential alternative to the processes that produce conflicts, still these conflicts are becoming even more monstrous by the number of its victims and destruction. Dzermal Sokolovic (2014) has a point when he states that with the shots of Gavrilo Princip in Sarajevo, Europe shot itself, she entered the field of intolerance, bloody conflicts, totalitarian ideologies such as Fascism and Stalinism, holocaust and genocide, where victims are counted in hundreds of millions. Therefore, in our opinion, we should reroute this dilemma about the 100th anniversary of the First World War, and switch it to another domain: whether the assassins are terrorists or heroes?

They were the product and the weapon in the forging of new national boundaries, and without doubt, the shots in Sarajevo represent a real media bomb in those flammable times which were preceded by atrocities of the First and Second Balkan War. That was a preparation and introduction to the Great War which was vigorously knocking on the door as a solution to the “national question” of this, or that nation. It turned out that all of the ideas such as pan-Slavic, South Slavic, pan-Islamic, pan-Arab, have lost the battle with the nation state which still tries to line new boundaries, open new settlements in Gaza, rattle arms around Crimea, Donetsk, Kashmir, Chechnya, Syria, Iraq, imaginary Kurdistan and Nagorno Karabakh. It threatens with referendums for secession, introduces the nuclear weapons and gas restrictions, and it intimidates with the triggering of the world war which, according to many, has never ceased to exist from the moment the First World War began.

References

- Bandžović, Safet. 2010. *Bošnjaci i antifašizam*, Sarajevo.
- Engdahl, F.William. 1999. *The Century of War (translation)*, Sarajevo.
- Heršak Emil. 1999. *Etničnost i povijest*, Zagreb, Institute for Migration and Ethnic studies, Edition Jasenski and Turk, Croatian Sociological Association.
- Katunarić, Vjeran. 2003. *Sporna zajednica (novije terorije o naciji i nacionalizmu)*. Zagreb: Edition Jasenski and Turk and Croatian Sociological Association.
- Marković, Milenko. 2008. *Stvaranje i razaranje Jugoslavije*, Republika br. 438 – 439 <http://www.republika.co.rs/438-439/20.html> (visited 09.10.2008.)
- Schachinger, Werner. 1996. *Bošnjaci dolaze*, Sarajevo: Cambi.
- Sokolović, Džermal. 2014. „Sukob nacionalne i multietničke države,“ *E-novine*, feljton od 21.08. 2014. – 27.08.2014. <http://www.e-novine.com/feljton/> (posjeta 01.09.2014.)
- Šehić, Zijad. 2014. „Sarajevski atentant – varnica koja je zapalila svijet,“ *Gračanički glasnik*, god. XIX br. 37, pp. 27- 94
- Velić, Abdulgafar. 2013. *Bošnjaci i Evropa*, Sarajevo, Dobra knjiga.

BEYOND THE CAKE MODEL: CRITICAL INTERSECTIONALITY AND THE RELATIVE ADVANTAGE OF DISADVANTAGE

Robert Lee Oprisko*

Josh Caplan*

Abstract

Intersectionality came about as a critique of traditional, uniaxial studies of oppression. The initial wave argued that the intersection(s) of multiple axes of social construction create uniquely experienced forms of domination and oppression that can only be studied within the context of said intersections. Methodologically, intersectional research has been used primarily as a tool of studying dichotomous intersections of race, gender, and class. However, theoretically focused literature articulates the importance of operating in a more complex understanding of intersectional axes by adding both breadth and depth. Current intersectional studies, therefore, are locked intradeoff between precision and generalizability in any quantitative research and intersect thus far, the power of intersectionality remains unrealized. This paper argues for a large-scale expansion of the number of variables studied in order to gain the most precise understandings of social construction. This creates a tradeoff between precision and generalizability. The power of intersectionality however is not in its generalizability, but rather in its precision for the study of small-n groups. We suggest moving beyond the cake model and into acritical intersectionality model that embraces the agential realism of quantum politics.

Keywords: Intersectionality; Methodology; Quantum Politics; Social String Theory; Critical Theory and Human Dignity

Introduction

Contemporary intersectional research is imprecisely studying systems of oppression and domination, which contributes to the invisibility of unique groups who are even less likely to be studied in the literature and engaged within the policy process. These groups, the *least advantaged of the least advantaged*, are being *hyper-marginalized*; they were ignored in early writings but current discourse implies that they are being taken into account when they are still not being engaged adds a level of marginalization. The traits that marginalize these individuals are not inconsequential, but have meaningful implications for their experience in society.

This paper argues for intersectional research to further incorporate the advances within uniaxial studies into their analyses in order to gain a more precise understanding of the social and political experiences of uniquely marginalized groups. Each axis must

*Corresponding authors: Robert L. Oprisko, Research Fellow, Indiana University; USA, Josh Caplan, Independent Scholar, e-mail: roprisk@indiana.edu

be deconstructed as far as is of momentary critical importance in order to optimize the precision of the model(s). This form of intersectional inquiry is both critical and self-reflective, recognizing the power that external inscription of value plays in systems of structural domination and oppression. Therefore, we argue for researchers to defend the operationalization of their variables at a certain level of precision by engaging with the next most precise level. We assert that this increased precision will, in fact, contribute to greater empirical accuracy in intersectional research. Without adding a greater quantity and quality of axes into intersectionality studies, research projects that rely on intersectionality tend to focus solely on those who are the most advantaged within their sub-category within society while those who are least advantaged will continue to exist invisibly at the margins. This more rigorous form of analysis adds additional context and precision to the studies at the cost of generalizability of the knowledge gained. Intersectionality theory is premised on the idea that context is critical for social construction, and as such grand-scale generalizability is significantly at odds with intersectional analyses.

The first section of this paper will articulate this framework and differentiate itself from previous studies of intersectionality. Following that analysis, this paper will briefly illustrate deconstructed theories that have already been created by scholars that are rarely present in intersectionality literature. This latter section will emphasize that the current approaches select for those who are most advantaged and average out the experiences of both the most and least advantaged members of society. Finally, we present a new model for intersectional research that moves intersectionality into the cutting edge of mixed-methodological study.

Framework for Intersectionality

Intersectionality within this framework will be defined as the unique social experience that occurs when multiple socially constructed axes interact within an individual at a specific time and place. (Oprisko *Honor* 55-58) This operationalization emphasizes the context of an either explicitly or implicitly defined spatial and temporal context. It also removes the emphasis of *oppression* in intersectionality, which is present in numerous important works (Bilge; Davis; Nash; Strolovich “Do Interest Groups Represent the Disadvantaged? Advocacy at the Intersections of Race, Class, and Gender”; Syed; Weldon). Individuals exist simultaneously in positions of *oppressed* and *oppressor* depending on the issue and framing at hand; intersectionality equally allows for the study and understanding of social advantages just as well as it does with disadvantages. (Warner) An additional substantive concern with using the oppression rhetoric is that it reinforces the impression that one intersection is normal, or *good*, while an opposing intersection is deviant, or *problematic* (Foucault *Madness and Civilization: A History of Insanity and the Age of Reason*; Hegarty and Pratto; Schneider and Ingram; Warner). By separating the process of intersectionality from the rhetoric of oppression, the process becomes phenomenologically sound and lacks an arbitrary constraint.

The intersectionality literature has largely coalesced around an approach best defined by Weldon (2008) of *intersectionality-plus* where individuals are constructed by and experience both singular axial constructions as well as unique experiences that can only be accessed at their personal intersection. An individual is constructed along each axis as well as in conjunction with other axes, which create unique experiences; the identification of these unique experiences is what brings scholars into intersectionality. This paper engages in the highly cited and impactful methodology outlined by McCall (2005) called *intracategorical complexity*. The idea of categories are not rejected as is true for *anticategorical approaches*, rather they should be qualitatively deconstructed to their most precise forms for use in critical assessment in future research. Even though categories are wholly constructed, as will be shown, they still have the potential of being a critical tool in which to engage the internal organization of individuals. This approach allows for the researcher to study intersectional groups that are both important to the particular research study and *practically invisible*, heretofore unseen as a unique presentation of intersected identities with socio-political relevance, while not being constrained to a set number of arbitrarily delineated social structures that may or may not prove most relevant to the research.

All categorizations are, by their nature, socially constructed through the discursive creation of reality (Rawls; Sessions). The categorical identities that individuals both assume and with which they are inscribed are the collected norms and understandings of appropriateness that are internalized, and externally projected, by individuals and the groups with which they associate. Specifically, the ideas, images, and symbols that individuals associate with determined traits are simultaneously aggregates and interactions within a society of discursively agreed upon understandings of a given phenomenon along with normatively appropriate prescriptions (Foucault *Madness and Civilization: A History of Insanity and the Age of Reason*; Rabinow; Risse; Foucault *Discipline and Punish*).

Relying on deeply reductionist categories marginalize significant individuality and diversity within members of the category not as an externality, but as an intention. The rationale for using simplistic typologies is that the actual construction of an individual promises to be excessively complex, fluid, and ultimately unworkable; rather than directly engage such complexities, these typologies seek to gain knowledge through highly indirect proxies. Fortunately, scholars in their respected social fields have deconstructed the broad and highly marginalizing terms of *race*, (Williams; Lieberman and Reynolds; Manly; Abel) *gender*, (Knights; Deutscher; Sieber; Goldner) and *class*, (Fuchs; Goldthorpe; Pintelon et al.; Ashley and Empson; Anthias). along with other axes, into numerous concepts and proxies that are collectively more precise than these initial umbrella terms. The advocacy of this paper is to deconstruct the categories as far as is theoretically possible and use these diverse and more precise measures, in conjunction with other constructions, to

both recreate and discover the social and political experiences of individuals within the framework of intersectionality. This type of work has been done, (LaVaque-Manty) and should represent the standard to which future intersectional research should strive.

In several influential works on intersectionality, the question arises as to what axes are relevant and which ones are simply superfluous and risk throwing the research into an infinitely regressive system (Lewis; Weldon; Young). This paper will make two arguments on this front. First, the value of intersectionality is the deeply contextualized viewpoint that it creates; simply put, if the bottom of the rabbit hole is an incredibly small-*n* group, this allows for the researcher to gain incredible depth even if it is hardly generalizable. There is no reason to approach sociological or political studies with a preconceived quantitative unit threshold before a group gains relevant size; there is no *a priori* basis to reject the possibility of a group of one existing in a meaningful manner, rather it is the responsibility of the researcher to show that a group is or is not socially meaningful, politically salient, or unique oppressed (Wlezien; Duncan; Duncan and Stewart). With this noted, it is difficult to think of a significant number of social or political experiences that are salient to a group of one while either completely lacking salience or existing in a fundamentally different manner to other individuals.

Second, researchers should engage as many axes as possible in as many combinations as is allowable in order to determine the salience of the intersectional group(s) for the research being conducted. We concur with Analouise Keating that researchers are often “normalize[d] and naturalize[d]” in “the existing social system, values, and standards so entirely that they deny the possibility of change.” (Keating, 83) With *a priori* assumptions of salient identity groups as variables, scholars are not truly testing the key independent variable of intersectionality – identity. In many ways, it is an arbitrary limitation of intersectional models, similar to allowing only integers into one’s mathematical reality.

By accepting the social-construction of reality, each research agenda is focused on a critical moment in time and space, which presents a unique social hierarchy predicated on the valuation and evaluation of individuals and sub-groups within the group that represents the level of analysis (Oprisko *Honor* 29-39). Kornprobst (2011) argues that systems of hierarchical authority, which is both the foundation for intersectionality studies and the academic community, result from unequal levels of persuasiveness and receptivity. He shows that experts are able to present their own expertise as a successful defense for their arguments, rather than relying on the logic of argument itself (Kornprobst 74-76). While such success is possible, it does not provide the community with better research. A necessary part of any research project is an explanation for the inclusion of every given variable; researchers using intersectionality should be equally pressed in justifying why they do *not* include an axis of construction as they are for including one. The level of

deconstruction should show that further deconstruction does not offer greater or more meaningful insight in relation to the phenomenon at hand. Salience should be determined, not assumed. The premise behind intersectionality is that experiences are buried by a rush to study primary constructions without looking at the intersections between other axes; Purdie-Vaughns and Eibach (2008) refer to this phenomenon as *intersectional invisibility* where individuals who are outside of the predetermined norm are ignored or marginalized. It is nearly axiomatic that some intersections are more meaningful than others, (Yuval-Davis “Belonging and the Politics of Belonging”; Yuval-Davis “Intersectionality and Feminist Politics”) however this does not justify the automatic exclusion of studying other intersections within a research program. Continuing to focus on a small number of intersections diminishes the power and rigor of intersectionality as a method by structuring the literature to perceive only a small number of intersections as meaningful. Failing to sufficiently situate our research further entrenches the invisibility of individuals and groups that exist at more precise intersections.

The act of grouping potentially meaningful sub-categories into larger, more general categories marginalizes the critical differences that intersectionality is trying to ferret out. The act of using a category such as “African-American” as the most precise measure washes out the significant dynamics within that group. The marginalization of axes of oppression in a research program, the “etc.” of possible axes, has the direct effect of marginalizing those who are constrained within them. (Butler; Ludvig) While Butler’s (1990) argument of marginalization is widely cited and agreed upon, the actual operationalization of intersectionality works tend to still fall into this paradox of marginalizing individuals while trying to study invisible groups.

Strolovich (2006, 2007) argued that the value of intersectionality is that it allows for one to study the least advantaged within uniaxial approaches. Research and advocacy tends to focus on members of the group that are by their nature better advantaged than other members of the group; women’s groups tend to focus on issues that impact white women more than they impact black women. This project seeks to expand this rhetoric by focusing on the hierarchy within the “least advantaged”. The *most advantaged of the least advantaged* are defined as being individuals who are disadvantaged within highly imprecise measures, such as the studies of black women having a fundamentally different experience than the simply cumulative effect of both axes as already described, (Crenshaw) yet are more advantaged or have a fundamentally different experience than those who fall under the same measures, but are disadvantaged by more precise measures within the axes, such as the challenges that face black women with darker skin tone that black women with lighter skin tone do not face, (Hunter) as will be shown later. The darker skin toned individuals are, therefore, the relatively less advantaged of the least advantaged and face challenges that the relatively more advantaged of the least advantaged do not. Thus for a study that studies the impact of skin-tone on economic advantage of young, black women, the hypothesis would be that women with the darkest skin-tone would be the *least*

advantaged of the least advantaged.

The implication of extrapolating the Strolovich framework is that it shows how experiences, hierarchies, and complexities of social construction are marginalized when intersectionality is not rigorously employed as a research methodology. Rather than provide greater context for understanding the experiences of individuals, traditional intersectionality approaches can marginalize the experiences of both the advantaged and disadvantaged within the intersection; the most advantaged are perceived of as being worse off than is factual, while the least advantaged are perceived as being better off, and neither gain precise nor accurate measures of their experiences. Although there may always be a further possible delineation that could potentially produce a split between advantages and disadvantages within a sub group, it is critical that the deconstructions that have been discovered be incorporated. As previously noted, it is possible that the experiences are different without a clear advantage or disadvantage between the groups.

The importance of adding this rigor to intersectional studies has nothing to do with the denigration of past research and everything to do with maintaining the humanity and dignity of the individuals that form the groups being studied. (Oprisko “The Rebel as Sovereign”) Intersectionality is premised upon the need not to ignore the marginalized and is therefore self-immolating when it caters to the statistical norms while dismissing both extreme cases and the standard error. The marginal groups, the statistically insignificant are supposed to be the primary concern within intersectional studies, and providing dignity to these groups is the purpose and duty of the researcher.

Methodological Concerns

With the intersectionality approach previously articulated, there is the potential for criticism in regards to the logistics of the methodology. Intersectionality is a process or a framework through which individual situations are understood as being constitutively created and influenced by the context of their environment. It is not a mere methodological tool in the same way as logit regression or surveys are; rather it is a theoretical tool that aids and directs the researcher in methodically uncovering experiences or constructions that would otherwise be invisible (Davis; Purdie-Vaughns and Eibach; Syed; Warner; Weldon). This definition does not *prima facie* prescribe a methodological approach for studying complex, constitutively constructed individuals. However there are predispositions associated with both quantitative and qualitative methods, which give both options strengths and weaknesses. While quantitative studies are often credited with uncovering large scale trends within data, qualitative methods tend to allow for more comprehensive descriptions of a phenomenon and the uniqueness that causes it either to stand out or to be representative of a greater trend (King, Keohane and Verba; Van Evera). It is the descriptive comprehensiveness of the qualitative methods that have made them the predominant approach, but it is not necessarily the only approach that can be

used within intersectionality (Cole; Mahalingam; Shields; Yuval-Davis “Intersectionality and Feminist Politics”) McCall (2005) notes that the descriptive power of case studies allows for researchers to understand newly discovered groups before choosing additional appropriate methodologies.

The primary methodological concern with using a multitude of highly precise axes is that readily available data may not operationalize individuals with enough precision. This is especially a concern when using common data sets; the data may allow for studies of individuals based on sex, uni-axial race, or income bracket, but there are few if any data sets that engage other axes of oppression, such as sexuality, skin tone, or physical and emotional conditions. It is within these axes that the least advantaged may dwell. While employing statistical models with data can create interesting arguments that are potentially generalizable, (Darity Jr. and Mason; Dottolo and Stewart; Holmsten, Moser and Slosar) there is a clear tradeoff. As already shown, the push towards generalizability fundamentally contrasts with the purpose of intersectionality.

Hunter (2005) showed both the difficulty in creating a data set using intersectionality as well the benefits of having one created. In order to study the effect of skin tone on job and life prospects of African American and Mexican American women, Hunter used specific and probing interviews that asked in-depth questions, with necessary follow up, of a representative sampling of these groups about their experiences. What makes the Hunter approach stand out is the combination of resisting the urge to use easily accessible members of the community while ensuring that the subjects are analytically and theoretically accurate representatives of their respective constructions, and creating a data set that operationalized her subjects along a large number of axes (Hunter). Datasets like these that collect every identity of the individual have the advantage of being usable in non-intersectional studies while still retaining their higher precision that optimizes them for intersectionality (Yuval-Davis “Intersectionality and Feminist Politics”)

Gathering data on axes can also be difficult due to the potential differences between the internal and external associations. While an individual associates with one characterization, the norm of that category may believe, and act, in a manner that associates the individual with a mutually exclusive category. Intersectionality is predicated on the complexity of identity which embraces plural affiliation, (Sen) personal political salience, (Duncan and Stewart) the economy of esteem, (Brennan and Pettit) and dynamic tension between external inscription and the personal introjection of identity (Oprisko *Honor*). Scholars should not assume that multiple identifications cleanly complement each other (Yuval-Davis “Belonging and the Politics of Belonging”). In engaging these possibilities, the researcher must cross-reference the criterion for inclusion from the group with the criterion used by the individual in question; in instances where there is a difference in criteria, researchers should investigate the reasoning before proceeding with the labeling

of an individual as belonging to a certain category. Although intersectionality clearly focuses upon the structure of identification, it is important to use a complex engagement of identity in order to best delineate which group(s) is being oppressed by which other (probably overarching) group. This will determine the appropriate level of analysis.

The Deconstruction of Gender

Through the system that has been promoted by numerous intersectionality scholars in regards to the use of gender, one can only see an entrenchment of the archaic and obsolete notion that there can only be two sexes which neatly correspond to two complementing genders, which are exclusive, immutable, and static. The breadth of those that are marginalized within these projects is as unquestionably vast as it is unnecessary. A dichotomous understanding of gender has been rejected as not being meaningful (Ludvig). Despite using the moniker of *gender*, many intersectionality papers are in fact engaging *sex* through their focus on physical manifestation of the individual, which ignores issues of gender and sexuality, both of which focus on the sociological constructions of physical manifestation (Risman). In the interest of space, this paper will briefly focus on the implications of eschewing the deconstruction of sexuality and of the dichotomous operationalization of sex.

Sexuality

The *a priori* assumption in engaging the social construction of gender is that there is a male experience that is largely experienced by all males within the population and a female experience that is largely experienced by all females and that these two experiences may or may not be different. This corresponds to the propensity in American society of a heteronormative range in which an individual falls in relation to their degrees of masculinity/femininity and sexuality. Existing outside of this framework, the individual may experience hostility and oppression, or some form of unique interactions between those that propagate the heteronormativity and the individual. Heteronormativity describes the tendency for default assumptions of gender and sexuality to be heterosexual with women consisting overwhelmingly of feminine characteristics and men to be overwhelmingly masculine characteristics (Duerst-Lahti; Hegarty and Pratto; Hegarty, Pratto and Lemieux; Lippa; Nielson, Walden and Kunkel).

However when individuals who are homosexual or identifying with an opposing gender identity, i.e. a masculine female or a feminine male, they potentially clash with the heteronormative framework that is relevant to their specific time and place. These clashes have the potential of fundamentally altering their experiences and interactions with society (Lippa; Nielson, Walden and Kunkel). There are two primary constructions that are at the greatest risk of having their experiences impacted by clashes with heteronormative barriers. The first is homosexuality, which in American society leads to a fundamentally unique experience when compared to heterosexuality due to the implicit heteronormative

values and the explicit actions taken to maintain them (Hegarty, Pratto and Lemieux). Homosexuals are systemically approached as committing an act of sexual deviance of such odious proportions that one's enemies, or the *hated others*, are often attributed as having homosexual tendencies or characteristics (Puar). Such actions and individuals are framed as being dangerous to *society*, the *public*, and *morality*, and need to be hindered and denigrated at every opportunity; (Hegarty, Pratto and Lemieux) reference conflicts over openly serving in the military or marriage rights for explicit examples.

While theorists reference the value of an intersectionality approach for understanding the construction of homosexuality, (Warner; Weldon) and interesting and engaging work on it has been completed, (See Anderson and McCormack) the implications of sexuality cannot be accessed in a framework that engages gender solely through a dichotomous variable of sex. Hutchinson (1999) showed that within the framework of *least advantaged* that would later be described by Strolovich (2006) that lesbians are uniquely marginalized in discussions of advantages; groups that seek to merge sexual and racial advocacies at first tend to ignore the implications of homosexuality, but when they do engage it they do so through a masculine framework that disproportionately focuses on gay men rather than lesbian women. This degree of analysis is often hidden by heteronormativity within a male-female breakdown of sex.

The second construction that is hidden by the conflation of gender and sex are individuals who are transgender, or self-identify with a gender identity that does not correspond to the norms dictated by their biological sex. These individuals are often perceived of as being aberrations or caricatures of deviance within the national discourse (Cooper). As a result of conflicting with heteronormative presuppositions, highly stigmatized transgendered individuals, especially among the youth, have a dramatically higher rate of depression and suicide (Clements-Noelle, Marx and Katz). This is indicative of a social experience being significantly harsher and more negative than for those who are not transgender. Identifying these experiences, along with identifying the transgendered individuals themselves, is impossible without a more precise operationalization procedure.

Gender scholars have created a wide range of methods for studying a further deconstructed view of sex, and intersectionality scholars should use similar frameworks. Intersectionality works should engage issues of sexuality, measures of self-identified gender that are independent of sex, as well as attempt to identify heteronormative structures of social control within the time and space of the study (Speier). By engaging in this precision, a more complete understanding of the construction of both individuals and interactions can be performed.

The Deconstruction of Race

Throughout intersectional writings, there is a tendency to approach racial categorization as a dichotomous variable of "black or white" (Cole and Omari; Collins; Crenshaw; Goff,

Thomas and Jackson; Mansbridge). This observation should not be interpreted as universal, but as a trend (Hunter; Strolovich “Do Interest Groups Represent the Disadvantaged? Advocacy at the Intersections of Race, Class, and Gender”; Strolovich *Affirmative Advocacy: Race, Class, and Gender in Interest Group Politics*). The concern is that the social implications of race, which should not be confused with ethnicity, are highly nuanced, subtle, and significant in the individual’s construction and as such is best understood with as much attention and definitiveness as possible within the operationalization.

The question of belonging within a racial group is not a small matter. Due to the political and sociological significance of race in the U.S., combined with the ambiguity in defining racial categories, belonging has become a point of tension and conflict both within racial groups as individuals decide who belongs and who does not, and across racial groups as individuals struggle with the implications of categorization (Kennedy; Yuval-Davis “Belonging and the Politics of Belonging”). Operating on a dichotomous level is insufficient at best and meaningless at worst; more accurate and precise operationalization is needed to explain race as experienced.

We have become so accustomed to indentifying each other based upon skin color, physiological features, and other external markers that we assume racial categories are factually accurate, unchanging and homogeneous. Ironically, these assumptions – coupled with our daily unthinking references to “race” – create “race,” making it more permanent and inflexible (Keating 83).

This paper will explore the idea of multiracialism and colorism as examples of racial theories that emphasize the significant constraints of a dichotomous approach to race.

Multi-racialism

A dichotomous approach to racial identification marginalizes those that self-identify as multiracial. By engaging in a measurement that approaches individuals as belonging to one racial category *or* another, individuals who identify with multiple categories are either not taken into account within the research program, are forced to pick one internal identification over another, or are exist as marginal members, never integrated with either identity. Multiracial individuals may find themselves to be strangers in familiar territory, exiles at home, and existentially *other* in all groups with whom they may seek to identify (Camus).

Hunter (2005) observes that subjects who have one Caucasian parent and one African American parent may either feel alienated from both communities and seek to associate with similar biracial individuals, in effect creating their own racial category, find acceptance in one category but not another, or move seamlessly and comfortably between

both categorizations. Granting that there is highly significant middle ground between these scenarios, the Hunter analysis shows that dichotomous or even multi-categorical classifications of race have a disparate impact on multiracial individuals; rather than fitting in *either/or* categories, individuals can potentially, and in all likelihood, probably, exist in *both/neither* categorization. The implication of this is that individuals who exist in non-uniaxial constructions of race are being categorized in a manner that excludes them or marginalizes their experiences into that of an approximate racial category.

Skin tone and colorism

Even if one were to engage in a research program that assumed the validity of single-racial categories, there is a rich literature showing that there are significant differences in the experiences of individuals within one race based on their skin tone. Studies on skin tone, or racial stratification, show that there is an economic and social hierarchy, or propensity for class based distinctions, based on the darkness of one's skin within the racial group (Hunter). Some studies have shown that skin tone is a better predictor for economic success than the socioeconomic position into which an individual is born (Keith and Herring). Colorist biases occur both within and across racial categories (Maddox and Gray).

Research on skin tone has coalesced around social perceptions of beauty and intelligence as directly correlating with the degree of *whiteness* that an individual possesses. This is determined by the prominence of *white* features, such as straight hair, light colored eyes, and light skin tone. Individuals who are perceived as being *more white* within their racial category are more likely to be able to access higher paying and more stable careers with a greater likelihood of promotion than those who are *less white* (Hunter; Maddox and Gray).

The implications for incorporating this analysis into intersectionality are clear and significant; while colorism affects both genders, it impacts women far more than men (Thompson and Keith). Holding background variables constant, light skin African American and Mexican American women consistently have higher incomes, lengthier education histories, and more stable marriages due to resources being allocated disproportionately between light and dark skin women (Goldsmith, Hamilton and Darity Jr.; Hunter; Thompson and Keith). The role of colorism is not solely subconscious; women, across racial categories, have harmed or killed themselves using chemicals to bleach their skin or straighten their hair in order to be perceived as *whiter* and more marketable (Charles; Hall; Li et al.). Color bias is systemic. Medical professionals have been found to work harder, by performing statistically more tests and requiring longer hospital stays, for lighter-skinned individuals within a racial category (White-Means et al.).

All intersectionality research that operationalize using unnecessarily imprecise measures such as dichotomous-race or racial clumping, are marginalizing the racially least advantaged who, as a result of their placement within the skin stratification hierarchy, are at risk of unique challenges and experiences. Incorporating skin tone into surveys that require self-reporting may be questionably effective as respondents may not be precise in stating their skin tone based on a provided scale due to the potentially subjective nature of the measurement; (Keith and Herring) however, this may not substantially differ from self-reported responses to many other variables, such as income or sexuality (King, Keohane and Verba). Effective operationalization strategies rely on the interviewer deciding independently of the belief of the individual due to the interviewer being trained to identify tone in accordance with a standardized measure (Hunter; Keith and Herring; White-Means et al.).

Beyond the Cake Model

We argue for the adoption of a refined and more robust model for intersectionality. Intersectionality can and should be viewed as a theory/method that requires dialectic engagement between the researcher and the researched. The most imperative facet of intersectional studies is that they were developed in order to fight against the structural oppression of precise groups who are not recognized as unique by the social-structure, which leads to a loss of human and personal dignity (Oprisko “The Rebel as Sovereign”). As academics and researchers, we operate within a hierarchical structure where our judgments can either illuminate the unique plight of intersectional groups, or reinforce said plight through a lack of due diligence (Kornprobst; Keating). It is important to remember the human impact of research; the operationalization of variables represent the values that are inscribed onto the real persons who form the units of analysis and whom may become subjectified (Heller; Foucault “The Subject and Power”). Because intersectionality seeks to illuminate structural oppression, the most salient point of concern for intersectional studies is precisely where the introjected self-identification of a person does not dovetail with external inscriptions of value(s). Thus, we break with the Cartesian universal epistemology that focuses on a single positive truth in favor of Weinstein’s particularistic interdependence. The onto-epistemology moves toward Bohr as articulated by (Barad) and agential realism, which focuses on an agent-object model rather than a subject-object-observer model. Our move in this direction is premised on identity being an agential performance: identity is a product of action that form agential cuts – valuation and evaluation (Oprisko *Honor*). Furthermore, acts of identification always necessarily fail to define the object comprehensively, diminishing the totality of the object by the agent (Zizek 959-61). This epistemological shift benefits from a terminological shift from *levels of analysis* to *realms of action* and from *units of analysis* to *aspects and phases of action* (Weinstein “New Ways and Old to Talk Politics” 44-46). This change not only allows for locational and temporal shifts in the “structure and arrangement of empirical phenomena,” but also reinforces the agency of the act of identification: it is important to remember that

structural oppression is a result of those acts (Weinstein “New Ways and Old to Talk Politics” 46).

Brennan and Pettit view social-value through an economic/transactional lens and suggest that there are groups to which individuals actively seek inclusion and those to which individuals are placed regardless of their will (2005). Their focus is on elite individuals who act in ways that are mutually advantageous, thus defending the position and excellence of the *most advantaged of the most advantaged*. Oprisko argues that systems of hierarchical oppression are rooted in honor-systems (external value) which are contested by individuals (rebels) and groups (revolutionaries) who defend the dignity of being different (2012a). He elaborates with a *social string theory*, showing identitarian variables that are externally deemed to be significant are *thick*, or easily perceived whereas identitarian variables that are internally deemed to be significant are *dense*, or difficult to compromise (Oprisko *Honor* 154-55). However, he argues for researchers to do due diligence in asking the research subjects what aspects of their identity are most important to them within the moment of critical inquiry. The degree of internalization for an identity determines its density, or how meaningful it is to the individual. By engaging with how persons self-identify and are identified by others, it becomes possible to determine where there is not only structural oppression premised upon identitarian inequality, but also where the inscription of identity presents a source of conflict.

Our proposed *critical intersectionality* model suggests that the salience of any variable or intersection of variables is situated and positioned in time and space and are not transferable. Each moment of critical inquiry must include a rigorous methodological treatment to discover which intersectional and autonomous identitarian values are most salient without making assumptions from historical analogy that aren’t reverified. However, critical intersectionality invites meta-analyses of intersectional research to study systemic trends in oppression and to trace the effectiveness of programs to reduce sustained and continuous structural violence. However, such models will only work because researchers must determine, in dialogue with subject groups, which aspects of identity are relevant. When research shows that the intersectional variables that define the oppressed are disappearing, we know that progress is being made. If said variables are changing, researchers can track the effects of policy initiatives to determine if said policy is initiating a transfer in structural violence (a different intersectional variable-set is being negatively affected by said policy that helps the original intersectional variable-set) or that the policy is producing gradual positive results (the identitarian values in intersection must increase precision in order to remain significant).

Critical intersectionality moves beyond Weldon’s cake model and intersectionality-plus not by suggesting that she was incorrect in stating that the identitarian variables combine to form something altogether different, but in that the cake is static. People change

and societies change. As an individual gets older, they will remain themselves, but they will be different versions of themselves (Weinstein *Meaning and Appreciation: Time and Modern Political Life*). Similarly, external perception of acceptability will change; action is reality – the realization that the actual event fails to achieve the ideal (Oprisko “Failure as the Real”). An individual with an eighth-grade reading level is considered normal in the eighth-grade, but is considered advanced if in the second-grade, however pockets of adults who do not exceed an eighth-grade reading level are indicative of an education system that suggests structural oppression in a focused direction. Critical intersectionality will thus prove to be exceptionally effective in determining whether certain structures of oppression are limited in time and space or is indicative of a pervasive social problem.

We believe that a better representation for critical intersectionality lies in strings. If we accept that each person is a combination of multiple internal and external identities, those identities combine much like the tex and strands of a string twist around one another. Each strand represents a relational identity: mother, student, light-skinned, African-American, etc. External importance can be represented in terms of thickness, or visibility. Internal importance can be represented in terms of density. In terms of the cake model, we hold that each individual person is not only a unique combination of ingredients, but that the ratio of said combination is contingent upon the active engagement of the individual within a realm of action at a critical moment. In terms of our social string theory, certain identities may appear to be invisible, but that does not diminish the density felt by the individual; similarly, certain identities may appear to be dominant, but they may or may not impact a specific realm of action. As a person ages, their string grows longer and they, as a holistic and indivisible person weaves themselves throughout a network of equally complex individuals forming “the fabric of society and the tartans of civilization” (Oprisko *Honor* 154-55).

The salient identities in social engagement bind individuals to each other and to groups. Singular affiliation would resonate similarly to a pure note on a stringed-instrument; more complex relationships will resemble chords. Every relationship is different, unique, but can be generalized by note. This is the power of intersectionality – to determine the most powerful position in the trade-off between generalizability and specificity, enabling highly precise engagement at the salient realm of action.

Conclusion

This paper has shown that numerous works in intersectionality have focused on the most advantaged members of a given intersection by operating in archaic and highly imprecise dichotomous measures of social construction. Within all socially constructed axes, with this paper focusing on the most popular ones of gender and race, theorists have uncovered valuable deconstructions and nuances that better articulate the complexity and fluidity of individual construction. Intersectionality authors have largely bypassed these

deconstructions in favor of less rigorous but more easily obtained and employed measures, such as conflating gender and sex with measures of *male or female*. This paper does not argue that interesting and meaningful observations cannot be generated by this approach. We do, however, argue that such research runs contrary to the founding principles of intersectionality that focus on the critical importance of contextualization and precision in studying systems of oppression and domination.

This paper noted that differences between groups of individuals do not necessitate salience within those differences; the context in which they exist can provide, maximize, or minimize the salience of a given organization (Posner). This paper has argued that every possible axis must be investigated in order to determine if there is salience with it singularly or within the context of other axes. After investigating, it is necessary for the researcher to explain not only the rationale for the axes and levels of deconstruction that they chose, but also for those that they did not. We emphasize the importance of the dialectic model of *critical intersectionality* in order to minimize the structural oppression inherent within academic research. This model provides the best solution thus far between precision and generalizability in intersectionality studies. It allows for both external perception and internal introspection. It both requires research to focus on individual moments of critical inquiry and provides a logical argument for longitudinal analyses that can study the effects of policy on structural oppression. It allows for changes within individuals and within groups and accounts for the structural oppression inherent within intersectionality studies themselves.

The most significant axes to explore illuminate the most invisible groups of intersectionality. We find that it is the uniquely marginalized groups, the radically oppressed, who are arguably the most important subjects for examination with intersectionality as a theory/method. These statistically insignificant groups of individuals are the most socially significant because they reflect the society's depth of devotion to the ideals of human dignity.

References

- Abel, Elizabeth. "Black Writing, White Reading: Race and the Politics of Feminist Interpretation." *Critical Inquiry* 19.3 (1993): 470-98. Print.
- Anderson, E., and M. McCormack. "Intersectionality, Critical Race Theory, and American Sporting Oppression: Examining Black and Gay Male Athletes." *Journal of Homosexuality* 57.8 (2010): 949-67. Print.
- Anthias, Floya. "Hierarchies of Social Location, Class, and Intersectionality: Towards a Translocational Frame." *International Sociology* 28.1 (2013): 121-38. Print.
- Ashley, Louise, and Laura Empson. "Differentiation and Discrimination: Understanding Social Class and Social Exclusion in Leading Law Firms." *Human Relations* 66.2 (2013): 219-44. Print.
- Barad, Karen. *Meeting the Universe Halfway: Quantum Physics and the Entanglement of Matter and*

- Meaning. Kindle ed. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2007. Print.
- Bilge, Sirma. "Recent Feminist Outlooks on Intersectionality." *Diogenes* 57.1 (2010): 58-72. Print.
- Brennan, Geoffrey, and Philip Pettit. *The Economy of Esteem: An Essay on Civil and Political Society*. Kindle ed. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2005. Print.
- Butler, Judith. *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. New York, NY: Routledge, 1990. Print.
- Camus, Albert. "Exile and the Kingdom." Trans. O'Brien, Justin. *The Plague, the Fall, Exile and the Kingdom, and Selected Essays*. 1957. Everyman's Library ed. New York, NY: Alfred A. Knopf, 2004. 357-488. Print.
- Charles, Christopher. "Skin Bleaching, Self-Hate, and Black Identity in Jamaica." *Journal of Black Studies* 33.6 (2003): 711-28. Print.
- Clements-Noelle, K., R. Marx, and M. Katz. "Attempted Suicide among Transgendered Persons: The Influence of Gender-Based Discrimination and Victimization." *Journal of Homosexuality* 51.3 (2006): 53-69. Print.
- Cole, Elizabeth. "Intersectionality and Research in Psychology." *American Psychologist* 64.3 (2009): 170-80. Print.
- Cole, Elizabeth, and Safiya Omari. "Race, Class, and the Dilemmas of Upward Mobility for African Americans." *Journal of Social Issues* 59.4 (2003): 785-802. Print.
- Collins, Patricia. "It's All in the Family: Intersections of Gender, Race, and Nation." *Hypatia* 13.3 (1998): 62-82. Print.
- Cooper, Brenda. "Boys Don't Cry and Female Masculinity: Reclaiming a Life and Dismantling the Politics of Normative Heterosexuality." *Critical Studies in Media Communication* 19.1 (2002): 44-63. Print.
- Crenshaw, Kimberle. "Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity, Politics, and Violence against Women of Color." *Stanford Law Review* 43.6 (1991): 1241-99. Print.
- Darity Jr., William, and Patrick Mason. "Evidence on Discrimination in Employment: Codes of Color, Codes of Gender." *Journal of Economic Perspectives* 12.2 (1998): 63-90. Print.
- Davis, Kathy. "Intersectionality as a Buzzword: A Sociology of Science Perspective on What Makes a Feminist Theory Successful." *Feminist Theory* 9.1 (2008): 67-85. Print.
- Deutscher, Penelope. *Yielding Gender: Feminism, Deconstruction, and the History of Philosophy*. New York, NY: Routledge, 1997. Print.
- Dottolo, Andrea, and Abigail Stewart. "Don't Ever Forget, Now, You're a Black Man in America: Intersections of Race, Class, and Gender in Encounters with the Police." *Sex Roles* 59.2 (2008): 350-64. Print.
- Duerst-Lahti, Georgia. "Gender Ideology: Masculinism and Feminism." *Politics, Gender, and Concepts: Theory and Methodology*. Eds. Geertz, Gary and Amy G. Mazur. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2008. Print.
- Duncan, Lauren E. "Personal Political Salience as a Self-Schema: Consequences for Political Information Processing." *Political Psychology* 26.6 (2005): 965-76. Print.
- Duncan, Lauren E., and Abigail Stewart. "Personal Political Salience: The Role of Personality in Collective Action and Identity." *Political Psychology* 28.2 (2007): 143-64. Print.

- Foucault, Michel. *Discipline and Punish*. Trans. Sheridan, Alan. Vintage ed. New York, NY: Random House, 1995. Print.
- . *Madness and Civilization: A History of Insanity and the Age of Reason*. New York, NY: Random House, 1965. Print.
- . "The Subject and Power." *Critical Inquiry* 8.4 (1982): 777-95. Print.
- Fuchs, Christian. *Deconstructive Class Analysis: Theoretical Foundations and Empirical Examples for the Richness and the Class Analysis of the Media and the Culture of Industry*. Salzburg, Austria: ICT&S, 2008. Print.
- Goff, Phillip, Margaret Thomas, and Matthew Jackson. "Ain't I a Woman?: Towards an Intersectional Approach to Person Perception and Group-Based Harms." *Sex Roles* 59.2 (2008): 392-403. Print.
- Goldner, Virginia. "Ironic Gender/Authentic Sex." *Studies in Gender and Sexuality* 4.2 (2003): 113-39. Print.
- Goldsmith, Arthur, Darrick Hamilton, and William Darity Jr. "From Dark to Light: Skin Color and Wages among African-Americans." *The Journal of Human Resources* 42.4 (2007): 701-38. Print.
- Goldthorpe, John H. "The Promising Future of Class Analysis: A Response to Recent Critiques." *Sociology* 26.3 (1992): 381-400. Print.
- Hall, Ronald. "The Bleaching Syndrome: African American's Response to Cultural Domination Vis-a-Vis Skin Color." *Journal of Black Studies* 26.2 (1995): 172-84. Print.
- Hegarty, Peter, and Felicia Pratto. "The Differences That Norms Make: Empiricism, Social Constructionism, and the Interpretation of Group Differences." *Sex Roles* 50.7 (2004): 445-53. Print.
- Hegarty, Peter, Felicia Pratto, and Anthony F. Lemieux. "Heterosexist Ambivalence and Heterocentric Norms: Drinking in Intergroup Discomfort." *Group Processes and Intergroup Relations* 7.2 (2004): 119-30. Print.
- Heller, Kevin J. "Power, Subjectification, and Resistance in Foucault." *Substance* 25.1 (1996): 78-110. Print.
- Holmsten, Stephanie, Robert Moser, and Mary Slosar. "Do Ethnic Parties Exclude Women?" *Comparative Political Studies* 43.10 (2010): 1179-201. Print.
- Hunter, Margaret. *Race, Gender, and the Politics of Skin Tone*. New York, NY: Routledge, 2005. Print.
- Keating, Analouise. "From Intersections to Interconnections: Lessons for Transformation from 'This Bridge Called My Back: Radical Writings by Women of Color'." *The Intersectional Approach: Transforming the Academy through Race, Class, and Gender*. Eds. Berger, Michele Tracy and Kathleen Guidroz. Chapel Hill, NC: The University of North Carolina Press, 2009. 81-99. Print.
- Keith, Verna, and Cedric Herring. "Skin Tone and Stratification in the Black Community." *American Journal of Sociology* 97.3 (1991): 760-78. Print.
- Kennedy, Randall. *Sellout: The Politics of Racial Betrayal*. New York, NY: Random House, 2008. Print.
- King, Gary, Robert O. Keohane, and Sidney Verba. *Designing Social Inquiry: Scientific Inference in Qualitative Research*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1994. Print.
- Knights, David. "Organization Theory in the Age of Deconstruction: Dualism, Gender, and Postmodernism Revisited." *Organization Studies* 18.1 (1997): 1-19. Print.
- Kornprobst, Markus. "The Agent's Logic of Action: Defining and Mapping Political Judgement." *International Theory* 3.1 (2011): 70-104. Print.

- LaVaque-Manty, Mika. *The Playing Fields of Eton: Equality and Excellence in Modern Meritocracy*. Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 2009. Print.
- Lewis, Gail. "Celebrating Intersectionality? Debates on a Multi-Faceted Concept in Gender Studies: Themes from a Conference." *European Journal of Women's Studies* 16.3 (2009): 203-10. Print.
- Li, Eric, et al. "Skin Lightening and Beauty in Four Asian Cultures." *Advances in Consumer Research* 35 (2008): 444-49. Print.
- Lieberman, Leonard, and Larry T. Reynolds. "Race: The Deconstruction of a Scientific Concept." *Race and Other Misadventures: Essays in Honor of Ashley Montagu in His Ninetieth Year*. Eds. Reynolds, Larry T. and Leonard Lieberman. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 1996. Print.
- Lippa, Richard. "On Deconstructing and Reconstructing Masculinity-Femininity." *Journal of Research in Personality* 35.1 (2001): 168-207. Print.
- Ludvig, Alice. "Differences between Women? Intersecting Voices in a Female Narrative." *European Journal of Women's Studies* 13.3 (2006): 245-58. Print.
- Maddox, Keith B., and Stephanie Gray. "Cognitive Representations of Black Americans: Reexploring the Role of Skin Tone." *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin* 28.2 (2002): 250-59. Print.
- Mahalingam, Ramaswami. "Engendering Immigrant Psychology: An Intersectionality Perspective." *Sex Roles* 59.5 (2008): 326-36. Print.
- Manly, Jennifer J. "Deconstructing Race and Ethnicity: Implications for Measurement of Health Outcomes." *Medical Care* 44.11 (2006): S10-S16. Print.
- Mansbridge, Jane. "Should Blacks Represent Blacks and Women Represent Women? A Contingent Yes." *Journal of Politics* 61.3 (1999): 628-57. Print.
- Nash, Jennifer. "Review Essay: Undisciplining Intersectionality." *International Feminist Journal of Politics* 11.4 (2009): 587-93. Print.
- Nielson, Joyce, Glenda Walden, and Charlotte A. Kunkel. "Gendered Heteronormativity: Empirical Illustrations in Everyday Life." *The Sociological Quarterly* 41.2 (2000): 283-96. Print.
- Oprisko, Robert L. "Failure as the Real: A Review of Slavoj Zizek's *Less Than Nothing: Hegel and the Shadow of Dialectical Materialism*." *Theoria and Praxis* 1.2 (2014). Print.
- . *Honor: A Phenomenology*. Routledge Innovations in Political Theory. New York, NY: Routledge, 2012. Print.
- . "The Rebel as Sovereign: The Political Theology of Dignity." *Revista Pleyade* 9 (2012): 119-36. Print.
- Pintelon, Olivier, et al. "The Social Stratification of Social Risks: The Relevance of Class for Social Investment Strategies." *Journal of European Social Policy* 23.1 (2013): 52-67. Print.
- Posner, Daniel. "The Political Salience of Cultural Difference: Why Chewas and Tumbukas Are Allies in Zambia and Adversaries in Malawi." *American Political Science Review* 98.4 (2004): 529-45. Print.
- Puar, Jasbir. "Mapping Us Hmonormativities." *Gender, Place, and Culture* 13.1 (2006): 67-88. Print.
- Purdie-Vaughns, Valerie, and Richard Eibach. "Intersectional Invisibility: The Distinctive Advantages and Disadvantages of Multiple Subordinate-Group Identities." *Sex Roles* 59.1 (2008): 377-91. Print.
- Rabinow, Paul. "Introduction." *The Foucault Reader*. Ed. Rabinow, Paul. New York, NY: Random House, 1984. Print.
- Rawls, John. *A Theory of Justice*. Kindle ed. Cambridge, MA: Belknap, 1971. Print.

- Risman, Barbara. "Gender as Social Structure: Theory Wrestling with Activism." *Gender and Society* 18.4 (2004): 429-50. Print.
- Risse, Thomas. "Let's Argue!: Communicative Action in World Politics." *International Organization* 54.1 (2000): 1-39. Print.
- Schneider, Anne, and Helen Ingram. "Social Construction of Target Populations: Implications for Politics and Policy." *American Political Science Review* 87.2 (1993): 334-47. Print.
- Sen, Amartya. *Identity and Violence. Issues of Our Time*. Ed. Gates Jr., Henry Louis. New York, NY: W. W. Norton and Co., 2006. Print.
- Sessions, William Lad. *Honor for Us: A Philosophical Analysis, Interpretation and Defense*. New York, NY: Continuum, 2010. Print.
- Shields, Stephanie. "Gender: An Intersectionality Perspective." *Sex Roles* 59.5 (2008): 301-11. Print.
- Sieber, Sharon. "The Deconstruction of Gender as Archetype in Rosario Castellanos' *El Eterno Femenino*." *Letras Femeninas* 25.1 (1999): 39-48. Print.
- Speier, Hans. "Freedom and Social Planning." *The American Journal of Sociology* 42.4 (1937): 463-83. Print.
- Strolovich, Dara. *Affirmative Advocacy: Race, Class, and Gender in Interest Group Politics*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 2007. Print.
- . "Do Interest Groups Represent the Disadvantaged? Advocacy at the Intersections of Race, Class, and Gender." *Journal of Politics* 68.4 (2006): 894-910. Print.
- Syed, Moin. "Disciplinarity and Methodology in Intersectionality Theory and Research." *American Psychologist* 65.1 (2010): 61-62. Print.
- Thompson, Maxine S., and Verna M. Keith. "The Blacker the Berry: Gender, Skin Tone, Self-Esteem, and Self-Efficacy." *Gender and Society* 15.3 (2001): 336-57. Print.
- Van Evera, Stephen. *Guide to Methods for Students of Political Science*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1997. Print.
- Warner, Leah. "A Best Practices Guide to Intersectional Approaches in Psychological Research." *Sex Roles* 59.2 (2008): 454-63. Print.
- Weinstein, Michael A. *Meaning and Appreciation: Time and Modern Political Life*. Google E-book ed. West Lafayette, IN: Purdue University Press, 1978. Print.
- . "New Ways and Old to Talk Politics." *The Review of Politics* 35.1 (1973): 41-60. Print.
- Weldon, S. Laurel. "Intersectionality." *Politics, Gender, and Concepts: Theory and Methodology*. Eds. Goertz, Gary and Amy G. Mazur. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2008. 193-218. Print.
- White-Means, Shelley, et al. "Cultural Competency, Race, and Skin Tone Bias among Pharmacy, Nursing, and Medical Students: Implications for Addressing Health Disparities." *Medical Care Research and Review* 66.4 (2009): 436-55. Print.
- Williams, Rhonda M. "Race, Deconstruction, and the Emergent Agenda of Feminist Economic Theory." *Beyond Economic Man: Feminist Theory and Economics*. Eds. Ferber, Marianne A. and Julie A. Ielson. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 2009. Print.
- Wlezien, Christopher. "On the Salience of Political Issues: The Problem with 'Most Important Problem'." *Electoral Studies* 24.4 (1988): 555-79. Print.

- Young, Iris. "Gender as Seriality: Thinking About Women as a Social Collective." *Signs* 19.3 (1994): 713-38. Print.
- Yuval-Davis, Nira. "Belonging and the Politics of Belonging." *Patterns of Prejudice* 40.3 (2006): 198-214. Print.
- . "Intersectionality and Feminist Politics." *European Journal of Women's Studies* 13.3 (2006): 193-209. Print.
- Zizek, Slavoj. *Less Than Nothing: Hegel and the Shadow of Dialectical Materialism*. Brooklyn, NY: Verso, 2012. Print.

GENDER EQUALITY & WORK: ARE WE THERE YET?

Indira Hasanović*

Abstract

Gender is a social construct that outlines the roles, behaviors, activities and features that a particular society believes are appropriate for men and women. Gender equality is necessary in order to ensure a fair and productive labor market. Even though, Bosnia and Herzegovina has established legal framework including gender equality laws, women are still facing barriers to participation in the labor market. This research paper will indicate what are the main challenges behind the low participation of women in the labor market. It will provide information on gender differences; the main challenges, and also emphasize gender stereotypes which are contributing the gendered division in labor market.

Keywords: Gender; Inequality; Work; Bosnia and Herzegovina and Labor Market.

Introduction

Gender is a social construct that outlines the roles, behaviors, activities and features that a particular society believes are appropriate for men and women. According to Anker (1997) "it is the fact that gender is used as criteria of social classification. Thus, is mainly determined by natural instincts of people to classify everything, where a great attention is paid to categorization as to gender features" (p. 2). The main theoretical perspectives are focused on labor market segregation, wage differences and aspect of gender equality in the labor market. The labor market segmentation theoretical approach is related to the existing explanations of present labor market processes by defining the existing problems of gender equality. The feminist approach has anthropological character and it concerns notion of social process, norms and concepts of society in gender equality.

This topic has been most researched by economic scholars and their main focus was on economical causes of the gender inequality in labor market. From social point of view the unfavorable position of women in labor market is nothing more than reflection of their social position, role and expectation. The basic statement of gender theory reflects the disadvantageous position of women in patriarchal society. The same position has been created thanks to unequal and subordinated position of women in a family and in the society in general. The reality perceptions of what is practiced in real social construct appears misleading compared to what is theoretically framed. Therefore, the labor market is a location where gender inequalities can be visible and sustained.

*Corresponding author: Indira Hasanović, PhD Candidate, International University of Sarajevo, Bosnia and Herzegovina, e-mail: ihasanovic@indiana.edu

In shaping power and status for both women and men, work plays a significant component. This generates gender inequalities in the division of everyday jobs. In case of Bosnia and Herzegovina, current economical changes are perfect base for discrimination in sphere of work and employment. According to World Bank Group, the extent to which B&H has installed institutions and programs to enforce laws and policies that promote equal access for men and women on CPIA gender equality rating scale in period of 2010-2014 is 4.0 (from scale 1.0 low to 6.0 high). The question is does this reflexes reality? Generally speaking, no country do women enjoy the same opportunities as men, irrespective of a country's income level. Although over the years some aspects of women's situation have improved, their opportunities in economic and political areas are still clearly limited.

The Conception of Gender Equality and Work

Gender inequalities and the promotion of women's rights, interests and issues, are the common basis of the feminist studies. Butler (2010) claims that, "what is seen as general truth, as common knowledge, is instead naturalized through the workings of power." Butler's view of gender difference and importantly are not natural or authentic, but rather, "are constructs that are produced and maintained through the workings of power in societies." (p. 3). Then according to Begley (2000) "stereotypes present a trap into which many people can fall. Gender stereotypes are very influential; they affect conceptualizations of women and men and establish social categories for gender. These categories represent what people think, and even when beliefs vary from reality" (pp. 66-67). The beliefs can be very powerful forces in judgments of self and others.

Cross-cultural research on gender roles and gender stereotyping indicates that all cultures delegate different roles to men and women. Overall, there is no significant difference between the sexes when it comes to global unemployment rates but the female rate is consistently slightly higher than the male (Olgiati and Shapiro 2002, 6). When it comes to the transformation of men's and women's work roles it stands out among the many technological, economic, social and cultural changes. Despite this progress in the last half of the 20th century, inequality remains after all across the three main dimensions—work outside the home, the kinds of jobs men and women do, and the relative pay they receive. We can say that, labor force participation is often seen as the prime indicator of changes in women's status.

As far back as Fredrich Engels' or Charlotte Perkins Gilman's writings on the subject in the late 1800s, social scientists and other observers have identified employment outside the home as the starting point for understanding women's position in society. Social theory often focuses on women's employment because it determines their access to resources and their ability to make independent decisions (Cotter, Hermsen and Vanneman, 2004, 4). Even if there is improvement of gender scores in recent years, B&H is still far behind in terms of gender equality in labor market. Previously, few studies have

been conducted to explore different types of labor discrimination. According to the major findings of conducted studies, women continue to face many barriers on their way to the top that are unique to their gender. They are often under-represented in organizations, nearly in all categories of jobs in B&H (Somun-Krupalija, 2011, 21). Competence and accomplishment of women is widely acknowledged, but despite this woman in the B&H situation is often exposed to some form of gender discrimination.

The legal and policy framework, in Article II of Gender Equality Law B&H states that: "It prohibits discrimination on the grounds of sex and sexual orientation. It also promotes equal participation of women in areas where they are considered less advantaged than men, namely education, economics, social security, health, sport, culture, public life, media as well as labor and employment." (Article II, GEL, B&H, 2010) Women's representation in the public sphere in B&H still remains low. Also, women who experience discrimination is more likely to quit or change their jobs rather report the case to the responsible institution. Position of women in the labor market has weakened: the employment rate of women is lower than the employment rate of men, and the gender gap is present in all indicators that frame the labor market.

Demanded employment is often not only sex and gender specified, but also associated with physical looks, which in practice usually means discrimination. According to Agency for Statistics B&H for the year 2013, women possibilities to access to the labor market are still low. Based on report, women are still lagging behind significantly from men. In year 2013, unemployment rate for men is 26.5%, and women rate is 29 %.

Another impact on the employment rate of women is parenthood, which is considered as one of the main reason for the withdrawal of women from the labor market. According to research, women in their 1920s and 1930s are asked in interview whether they are married or plan to have children, so they can see if women can spend time outside of office and travel. The issues of women's exclusion must be considered against the backdrop of stereotypes concerning the roles of man and women. This division of roles and responsibilities are mirrored in workplace relations (Somun-Krupalija, 2011, 14). Girls and women in their reproductive age are undesirable labor force in B&H. A child born more often means losing the job. All of this has placed women in position of choosing between motherhood and carrier.

Differences of the dominating motivation among men and women influence the choice of profession and position and involvement in the labor market. The most important conditions for women are good wage and safe work environment. These conditions are social aspects and possibilities to coordinate job with free time and family life. Men often express a viewpoint that sometimes they are made to work more in order to earn more and realize his role of bread winner superior. Women in this respect more often perceive

work as a possibility to realize her personal, social and mental needs” (WDR, 2012, 198). *In Framed by Gender: How Gender Inequality Persist in the Modern World*, Ridgeway has given a true contribution to field of gender inequality. She provides a theoretical framework to explain gender inequality on the workplace. The central premises is that, most fundamental to her argument is recognition that because we are all social actors, we view ourselves and others through gender lens. It permeates and shapes all of our interactions.

According to research provided by International Labor Organization women are paid especially little in “women’s jobs” such as those in cleaning and child care (ILO, 2003, 6). A research provided in B&H examined the socio-cultural determinants of the low representation of women in top managerial positions in public sector of B&H. Findings revealed that both male and female respondents perceived that societal culture has an important bearing on both thought processes and nature. The study concluded that if effective work-life policies are adopted, which support dual-earner couples, employers would get benefits in turn (Brankovic, 2013).

In 2013, ministers of all nine ministries of Bosnia and Herzegovina were men. Chairman of the Council of Ministers is a man. Gender representation of deputy ministers is equal - five women and five men, which is more women than in the previous term, when there were only two women deputy ministers (Agency for Statistics, 2013, 45). Managers reported organizational culture to be favorable to men. Male respondents believed more in hierarchical relationships, which support the notion that Bosnian society is hierarchical in nature, and affects interpersonal relationships of people. In Bosnian society, men are perceived to be assertive and commanding, where as women are expected to comply, obey and be submissive and inactive.

Having said that, what seems to be emerging is a view that there is a correlation between a number of women at the top of an organization and better organizational performance generally. There is, however, contention as to why this might be so. There is an ongoing dialogue about women’s leadership and management style and how it might differ from that of men. While many comment actors support there being a difference, there is a different view that this constitutes gender stereotyping which lacks validity. The fact is that there is evidence of an association which is sufficient to support having an increased representation of women in leadership roles (Conway, 2012, 4).

Gender equality in employment today is not only a question of social justice, but it represents an economic necessity. In fact, there are strong economic reasons for the increased presence of women in the workforce, and its working age population aging. Due to an aging population, we will not be able to count on the young generation as before, the woman is expected active role at all levels and in all sectors of the labor market. Thus,

the need for more active policy that would allow more women to participate in the labor market. It will contribute to such a policy, which will go convened the family, i.e., which will help establish a balance between the worlds of work and family commitments, and allow an easier return to work after absence from the labor market. Due to demographic changes it will be necessary to think about higher economic activity of women (Kerovec, 2003, 275-279).

Survey of relevant data on status of gender equality in B&H

Particularly interesting is the analysis of the underlying gender stereotypes which shape the gendered division of employment in labor market. The subject of research is perception of gender equality in B&H based on categories of an unequal employment possibilities, unequal social status and unequal possibilities regarding working rights. All data collected for this research is secondary data. Data for this research is collected from World Bank data bases and Agency for Statistics of the Bosnia and Herzegovina. Time period of data analyzed is from referent period of 2007 - 2011 mainly collected from Labor Force Survey (LFS) from year 2009, 2012 by Agency for Statistics of Bosnia and Herzegovina. This date covered around 10,509 households and the age of people who were included in survey is 15 or more. All the data collected and analyzed is in accordance to European Statistics Office (EUROSTAT) standards.

Data used for this research is not normally distributed; therefore nonparametric tests will be used. These tests will be conducted in statistical software named Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS). Therefore, test that will be used is Wilcoxon Signed- ranks samples test or in SPSS test named Mann - Whitney for two independent variables. This research centers on the idea of judging the understanding reality of gender in the labor market. According to the literature, people's views of the gender issue are affected by different factors or situations. The preformed analysis examines whether the finding is relevant to the B&H, and if so, which are the factors that have major impact. It is easy to expect women to have less supportive approaches toward gender inequality than men. In this article, the Mann-Whitney test is conducted to see whether the result makes a difference in people's perceptions of gender equality. If it is significant, this means that these factors have a major impact either positive or negative on gender perception. Throughout the analysis we present only the p-value for the Mann-Whitney test.

Summary of the Results

In Table 1 it is measured principle population characteristics, possible inequality or equality of activity rate, employment rate and unemployment rate by gender criteria on the labor market.

Table 1. Principle population characteristics by activity and gender in B&H

Year		Activity rate	Employment rate	Unemployment rate
2007-2011	Male(AVG)	56.7	42.9	24.5
	Female(AVG)	32.1	22.7	29.0
	p-value	0.008	0.008	0.032

Source: Agency for Statistics of Bosnia and Herzegovina

From the results, we can conclude that, throughout all categories there is evident inequality of genders by activity rate, employment rate and unemployment rate. From this, a category of rate to which person belongs to, we can see that there are more males employed than females. In the Table 2 analysis is preformed on persons in employment by groups of sections of economic activities attained by gender. There are three groups of sections of economic activities of persons who are employed (Agricultural, Industry, Services). All of these groups are classified by gender.

Table 2. Persons in employment by groups of sections of economic activities and gender in B&H

Year		Agricultural	Industry	Services
2007-2011	Male(AVG)	18.7	39.3	41.9
	Female(AVG)	22.6	17.1	60.2
	p-value	0.008	0.008	0.008

Source: Agency for Statistics of Bosnia and Herzegovina

According to this analysis, there is gender inequality in all three groups. In terms of the overall labor market, industry and services are the main areas of employment. The service sector is still the leading sector of employment in the country. In the Table 3 analysis is preformed on persons in employment by highest level of education attained by gender. There are three groups in the classification of education level of persons who are employed (primary school, secondary school, higher (higher level of education covers college, university, master, doctoral degree)). All of these categories are classified by gender.

Table 3. Persons in employment by highest level of education attained by gender in B&H

Year		Primary	Secondary	Higher
2007-2011	Male(AVG)	21.9	62.9	15.0
	Female(AVG)	23.4	60.1	16.4
	p-value	0.548	0.222	0.690

Source: Agency for Statistics of Bosnia and Herzegovina

Throughout all groups there is evident equality of genders by employment related with level of education. From the category level of education to who person belongs to, there are more female employed than male in Primary and Higher level of education. Also, the largest proportion of working population in country has completed Secondary education. Since p value is more than 0.05 we can say that persons in employment by highest level of education attained by gender in B&H. In the Table 4 analysis is preformed on persons in unemployment by highest level of education attained by gender. There are three groups in the classification of education level of persons who are employed (primary school, secondary school, higher (higher level of education covers college, university, master, doctoral degree)). All of these categories are classified by gender.

Table 4. Unemployed persons by the highest level of education attained by gender in B&H

Year		Primary	Secondary	Higher
2007-2011	Male(AVG)	23.8	71.3	4.6
	Female(AVG)	23.4	68.6	7.9
	p-value	1.000	0.016	0.056

Source: Agency for Statistics of Bosnia and Herzegovina

In the group Primary and Higher level of education according to analysis preformed genders are equal by employment rate according to level of education. In the group Secondary, genders are not equal by employment rate according to level of education; more males are unemployed then females. The largest proportion of unemployed population in country is persons with Secondary education. Since p value is less than 0.05 we reject the H_0 hypothesis for Secondary level of education. Since p value is more than 0.05 we retain the H_0 hypothesis for Primary and Higher level of education.

Conclusion

In B&H employment trends shows that women have been and continue to be employed less than men. Some of the barriers that women face in terms of employment are related to the unequal distribution of labor in the family, a lack of appropriate enforcement of legal regulations and the impact of the traditional norms and values in society. Even though it is prohibited discrimination based on gender in all areas including employment procedures, the real problem is in the lack of implementation of the law. We should not forget to mention that society has different expectations for men and women in fulfilling their social roles. Deviation from these roles is not encouraged, and traditional norms and values are clearly proscribed. Because of this, there is inability of women to enter the labor market. Based on analysis that we preformed, gender inequality persists. The findings outlined above showed that women are still somewhat less likely than men to be active in the labor force.

The journey for gender equality in labor market in B&H is still long way to go. In shaping the 21st century, women and men should be equal partners. The results showed that the research confirmed our assumptions, particularly the general hypothesis of gender discrimination and treatment of women compared to men. Also, women in the labor market are discriminated because of their gender, not because of lack of skills or abilities to particular job. Gender inequality, marked imbalanced distribution of power, resources and privileges at the expense of women, present not only in the private sphere and family relationships, but also in the so-called public patriarchy.

Unequal social treatment of women and men in the labor market in B&H is partially conditioned by biological differences such as, women's pregnancy that may differently reflect the status of women in society in general. In the struggle of to keep their jobs, common opinion, again to the expenses of women, implies the acceptance of the present irresponsibility of the society/state in ensuring the occurrence of sex or gender based discrimination in all spheres of social life. The fact presented in this paper suggests that a socially determined issue does a better job than efficiency detriment ones in explaining many existing patterns. The question is will women because of the presence of discrimination be forced to return to their "origins" (role of mother who takes care of the children)? It is clear, the path to full gender equality is not easy; thus, the future of gender equality will depend significantly on how we use these facts to guide the choice we make as societies.

References

- Anker, Richard. 1997. "Theories of occupational segregation by sex: An overview," *International Labor Review*, 136(3).
- Branković, Azra. 2013. "Femininity Cultural Dimension in Bosnia and Herzegovina". *International Conference on education, culture and identity*. 6-8 July, 2013. International University of Sarajevo. Sarajevo.
- Begley, Sharon. 2000. *Newsweek*, Vol. 136 Issue 19.
- Berenson L. Mark., Levine M. David and Kathryn A. Szabat. 2010. "Basic Business Statistics. Concepts and Applications." *Pearson Education*.
- Boesten, Jelke. 2010. "Inequality, normative violence and livable life Judith Butler and Peruvian Reality", *POLIS Working Papers 2010 (1)*, University of Leeds, Web. <http://www.polis.leeds.ac.uk/assets/files/research/working-papers/working-paper-no1-2010.pdf>, 1.12.2014.
- Conway, Helen. 2012. "Gender in the Workplace- the Journey to Equality." *The 20th Annual Kingsley Laffer Memorial Lecture*. The University of Sydney.
- Cotter, David, Hermesen, M. Joan and Vanneman, Reeve. 2004. "Gender Inequality at Work." Web. http://www.vanneman.umd.edu/papers/cotter_etal.pdf. 10 Nov. 2013.
- Labour Market Studies. 2006. "Gender Equality Aspects in the Labor Market " *ESF*. Web. http://www.lm.gov.lv/upload/darba_tirgus/darba_tirgus/petijumi/10_pet_en.pdf. 20 Dec. 2013.

- International Labor Organization (ILO). 2003. "Time for equality at work." Geneva. International Labor Office. Web.http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/@dgreports/@dcomm/@publ/documents/publication/wcms_publ_9221128717_en.pdf 14 Nov. 2013.
- Kerovec, Nada. 2003. "(Ne)jednakost žena na tržištu rada." *Revija za socijalnu politiku*. No. 10.3 Zagreb. Web. <http://www.rsp.hr/ojs2/index.php/rsp/article/view/105/109> 10 Jan. 2014
- Labor Force Survey 2009. Agency for Statistics of the B&H. Sarajevo. 2010 Web. http://www.fzs.ba/Anketa/ars_2009bh.pdf 21 Jan.2013.
- Labor Force Survey 2012. Agency for Statistics of the B&H. Sarajevo. 2013 Web. http://www.bhas.ba/tematskibilteni/lfs_bh.pdf 21 Jan.2013.
- Labor Force Survey 2013. Agency for Statistics of the B&H. Sarajevo. 2014 Web. http://www.bhas.ba/tematskibilteni/BHAS_Ars_BH_press.pdf 26 Dec.2014.
- Olgiati, Etta and Shapiro, Gillian. 2002. "Promoting Gender Equality in the Workplace." Luxembourg: European Communities.
- Ridgeway, L. Cecilia. 2011. *Framed by Gender: How Gender Inequality Persists in the Modern World*. 1st ed. Oxford University Press.
- Somun-Krupajla, Lejla. 2011. "Gender and employment in the B&H- a Country Study." *International Labour Office*.
- United Nations Development Program. *Gender Inequality Index*. 2012. Web. <http://hdr.undp.org/en/statistics/gii> 26 Dec. 2013.
- Wolfe, A. Douglas., & Hollander, Myles. 1999. *Nonparametric statistical methods*. 2nd ed. Wiley-Interscience.
- World Bank, *CPIA Gender Equality Rating 2012 in B&H*. Web. <http://data.worldbank.org/country/bosnia-and-herzegovina> 26 Dec. 2013.
- World Development Report 2012. *Gender differences in employment and why they matter*. Web. <http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTWDR2012/Resources/7778105-1299699968583/7786210-1315936222006/chapter-5.pdf> 03 Jan. 2013

WORLD WAR I AND PROPAGANDA POSTER ART: COMPARING THE UNITED STATES AND GERMAN CASES

Joseph Joe Kaminski*

Abstract

This paper looks at some similarities and differences between propaganda art used by Germany and the United States during World War I. The first section briefly looks at aesthetic theory and addresses the philosophical question of whether war propaganda posters are, in fact, 'art' at all. Then images of various posters that were popular and widely published by both nations are shown and discussed. This paper concludes that while there are many thematic similarities between the posters used by both sides, there are also some important differences. The most obvious difference between the German and American propaganda art was in regard to the overall tone of the posters and the colors used in the presentation. The images used have been downloaded from a reputable website that depicts reproductions of the posters that were used during WWI. Understanding the nature of the propaganda used by each side can help shed light on the attitudes and sentiments towards the war held by political elites and citizens alike.

Keywords: Propaganda Art; Uncle Sam; Social Mobilization; World War I; Aesthetic Theory; Theodor Adorno and Immanuel Kant

Introduction

World War I saw a major shift in the way warfare was carried out at many different levels. Most notably, it ushered in a new form of mechanized form of warfare previously unknown in the world. While the war began with similar technology and military tactics as utilized in 19th century warfare, by the end of the war, telephones, wireless communications, armored tanks, and even airplanes would be utilized by all sides involved. (Hartcup, 1988) In regards to the harsh realities of the new mechanized warfare of World War I, Ernst Jünger's monumental literary effort, *Storm of Steel*, explains the confusion and fear of those troops in his battalion after their first time being attacked;

War had shown its claws, and stripped off its mask of cosiness [sic]. It was all so strange, so impersonal. We had barely begun to think about the enemy, that mysterious, treacherous being somewhere. This event, so far beyond anything we had experienced, made such a powerful impression on us that it was difficult to understand what had happened. It was like a ghostly manifestation in broad daylight. (Jünger, 2003: 7)

War was now total and entire nation states were involved. Along with the transformation of the way war was conducted on the ground, WWI was also represented

*Corresponding author: Joseph Joe Kaminski, Assist. Prof. Dr. at Social and Political Sciences, International University of Sarajevo, Bosnia and Herzegovina, e-mail: jkaminski@ius.edu.ba.

a shift in the way the ‘war for public support’ was fought. The use of propaganda art was essential in galvanizing opinions and reshaping ideas during WWI. (DeBauche, 1997; Latham, 2006, and Tunc, 2012) Both the Central Powers and Allied Powers used propaganda to encourage citizens to not only join the army, but to also engage in certain desirable social behaviors at home that to assist in the war effort such as purchasing war bonds and conserving food and other physical resources. In this paper I will compare and contrast the different styles seen in allied propaganda as opposed to German propaganda.

The Function of War Propaganda Art – Is it Really *Art* at All?

The essential thing to understand about war propaganda art is that it seeks to appeal to emotion over reason. In the case of World War I, it was meant to be approachable and understandable. According to Chambers,

The function of posters was to inform, instruct, or suggest new ways of looking at the war. Their central ideas had either to correspond to the mentality and ideas of the viewer, or had to manipulate his ideas in a positive or negative manner. The idea or message had to be easily comprehended by the target audience. Its appeal was more emotional than rational. (Chambers, 1984: 54)

Richard Chambers (1983) offers 3 main areas of content that are commonly utilized in war propaganda posters. Below is a chart outlining these 3 main areas;

Chambers 3 main areas of War Propaganda Art

1. Appeals to patriotism and valor in order to motivate an individual(s) to contribute to the war effort by joining the military.
2. Appeals to civilian-orientated activities, emphasizing the civilian/military inter relationship. This relationship includes the production of war materials, the incorporation of women into the work force, and/or campaigns to collect funds to finance the war.
3. Appeals to fear, specifically via the demonization of the enemy. These appeals often contain ‘horror and atrocity’ images in an effort to instill hate and fear for the enemy in the minds and hearts of citizens. (Chambers, 1983)

From a theoretical perspective on the function of art, Chambers explanation of what is essential in war propaganda art stands in opposition to the view articulated by the influential art and cultural critic, Theodor Adorno on the function and role of art.

Adorno was a part of a generation of Jewish intellectual émigrés who escaped Nazi Germany during WWII. Most of these critics steeped their critiques of the fine arts within a specific type of cultural Marxism. (Houston, 2012) This movement would later come to be known as *Western Marxism*, because it consciously divorced itself from the political and cultural orbit of the Soviet Union. According to Doug Kellner,

The term “Western Marxism” was first used by Soviet Communists to

disparage the turn to more Hegelian and critical forms of Marxism in Western Europe, but it was soon adopted by thinkers like [Georg] Lukács and [Karl] Korsch to describe a more independent and critical Marxism from the party and “scientific” Marxism of the Second and Third Internationals. (Kellner, 2005: 155)

At the core of the Western Marxist analysis of art was the recognition of the central role social and economic conditions play in the construction of any work of art. This is to suggest each work of art is unique in the sense that it could only be completed within the specific spatial-temporal location it was created in. For example, it would be impossible to assume Leonard Da Vinci’s, *Mona Lisa*, could have been created 300 years earlier or 300 years later than it was; its creation was a direct result of the social and economic conditions the artist himself was living in. The same can be said for other high works of art. Within this view, each work of art truly is a *unique* and *original* creation.

At the crux of Adorno’s argument was that authentic arts’ primary function was to raise critical/radical revolutionary consciousness amongst its viewers. This helps explain why many members of the Frankfurt School admired artists like Russian artist Wassily Kandinsky and atonal composers like Alban Berg and Arnold Schönberg. These artists all experimented with new artistic forms that were meant to be revolutionary in both form and content.

As mentioned previously, rather than war propaganda art appealing to an individual’s higher intellectual and emotional reflexive capacities, it instead was meant to appeal to the most base and easily accessible emotions. While at the most basic level, propaganda art is concerned with raising *some type of consciousness* (most certainly not revolutionary), its primary concern was with appeals to raw emotion rather than one’s rational reflexive capacities. Hence within war propaganda art there exist common leitmotifs in many WWI propaganda posters; these include patriotism and unquestioning loyalty to the regime. This will be further explored in the next couple sections of this paper.

Theodor Adorno wrote extensively on the function of art and music. Adorno’s view on art and music was similar to John Dewey, William James, and cultural Marxists like Walter Benjamin and Siegfried Kracauer, who saw both art and music as inextricably connected to its immediate culture context. (Kerr, 2012) Like the other Western Marxists, Adorno believed that a work of art’s meaning was not objectively universal like Kant did; rather meaning and value was contingent upon the historical circumstances surrounding a work of art and the subjective position of the viewer of the work itself. In Adorno’s words, “Since time immemorial, human reactions to artworks have been mediated to their utmost and do not refer immediately to the object; indeed they are now mediated by society as a whole (Adorno, 2004: 299).” Not only does the individual’s location in space and time

viewing the work of art influence a particular work of arts meaning, but the overall *pulse of society* does as well.

Adorno's approach to aesthetic theory differed from the earlier aesthetic theory offered by Kant which posited that within each work of art was a unique objective truth that existed independent of the viewer or interpreter of the work of art. According to Murray Skees,

The autonomy of art for Kant lies, then, in both the aesthetic judgment of the beautiful object and, in the case of art, the artist's creation of that work of art as well. In the first instance, the judgment is autonomous in that it does not presuppose or depend upon the object's utility or purpose, but in the pleasure of the contemplative attitude that we take towards the work of art. (Skees, 2011: 920)

Where war propaganda art most radically differs from traditional forms of art for the likes of Adorno is the function it plays in reaffirming the prevailing attitudes and values of the state. Rather than war propaganda art acting as a subjective critique of reified social structures and the apparatus of the repressive state itself, war propaganda art seeks to reinforce traditional orthodoxy within the state. In this regard, it is quite reasonable to assume within the framework of critical theorists like Adorno and Kracauer, propaganda 'art' is not actually 'art' at all since *true* art serves some type of liberating and revolutionary function; art is meant to challenge the state, not reaffirm its prevailing norms, values, and institutions.

Moving beyond the philosophical discussion on what constitutes *art*, the fact remains that World War I propaganda posters were a widespread historical phenomenon. They were viewed and interpreted by millions of people across the world. To deny their importance and role in the shaping of attitudes and values would be a serious mistake. Understanding the images and themes covered in WWI propaganda art can shed light on the attitudes of those living during this time period towards their own nation and the war in general.

The United States and World War I Propaganda Art

The United States sought to stay out of WWI as long as it could. However, the sinking of the Lusitania in 1915, in which 1,198 innocent passengers died, was really the very public incident necessary in the eyes of most historians that ultimately forced the Americans into war. (Jones, 2001) According to Howard Jones, the popular American publication, *The Nation*, stated, the sinking of the Lusitania was, "a deed for which a Hun would blush, a Turk be ashamed, and a Barbary pirate apologize (Jones, 2001: 73)." 128 of 139 American passengers died in the unprovoked attack.

Despite the fact the US did not formally enter the war until 1917, the Wilson administration began promoting the use of propaganda as early as 1914 when the war began. “Even though the United States had remained neutral until 1917, it had begun using the ‘power of suggestion’ through mass communication in 1914 with its negative portrayal of the ‘rape of Belgium’, and in 1915 with the yellow journalism associated with the *Lusitania* incident (Tunc, 2012: 195).” The Wilson administration went as far as creating a ‘Committee on Public Information,’ that not only strategically placed advertisements in newspapers and magazines, but went as far as encouraging US filmmakers to make movies demonizing the German state. (DeBauche, 1997, and Latham, 2006) Two such anti-German films that came out around the time of WWI were, *The Kaiser: The Beast of Berlin* (1918) and *The Prussian Cur* (1919).

As the US entered the war, along with building up the war effort in the sense of artillery and tanks, the US needed to desperately win support from the mass publics. Many American’s were initially opposed to getting involved in the war for numerous reasons. According to Jeanette Keith, sentiment for neutrality was strong among church leaders and certain immigrant communities in the United States, including Irish Americans, German Americans and Swedish Americans. (Keith, 2004) The propaganda apparatus needed to somehow address all the grievances against engaging in WWI while at the same time not making the situation sound so dire as to foster even more negative sentiment towards the war. Much of the propaganda artwork of WWI sought to highlight positive American themes. The imagery below demonstrates some of the major themes covered in WWI propaganda art.¹



Uncle Sam: I want YOU for the US Army portrays the classic image of Uncle Sam. In this image we see a tough looking-elderly, bearded white male, dressed patriotically, affirmatively pointing at the viewer. In this iconic image that to this day is revered in

¹All of the American WWI posters mentioned in this article can be found at <http://www.ww1propaganda.com/world-war-1-posters/american-ww1-propaganda-posters>. All German WWI posters mentioned in this article can be found at, <http://www.ww1propaganda.com/world-war-1-posters/german-ww1-propaganda-posters>

Americana, and American folklore, Uncle Sam is admonishing young men to join the U.S. army. ‘Uncle Sam’ is a character that often is used to personify the US Government. For example, a phrase commonly used in the United States is, ‘I owe money to Uncle Sam,’ which means one owes taxes to the United States Government. Uncle Sam is mentioned in the British folk song mocking the rag-tag US Revolutionary Army, ‘Yankee Doodle’ in 1775. (Lossing, 1850) However, reports of ‘Uncle Sam’ have dated back to the 1st half of the 18th century and the creation of the United States.

The creator of the iconic ‘Uncle Sam’ image is credited to the popular American political illustrator James Montgomery Flagg (1877-1960). Flagg’s portrayal of Uncle Sam was first published on the cover of the magazine *Leslie’s Weekly*, on July 6, 1916, with the caption, “What Are You Doing for Preparedness?” (Library of Congress Archives) The poster, *Boys and Girls! You can Help Uncle Sam win the War*, also contains a variation of Uncle Sam. This time he appears in a much friendlier and more approachable form; a young girl is sitting on his lap and a young boy is listening intently. This particular poster is an appeal for the youth to save their money and buy war savings stamps. The tone is hopeful; a personal appeal is made to the reader of this poster that they do not have to directly engage in overseas combat to help the US win the war; instead simply supporting the war effort financially can make a difference. This means that all American’s can get involved, not just those who are young, healthy, and male. One can be an 85 year old woman who is deaf and blind and still be a part of the victory. The theme of inclusivity can be noted in much of the US propaganda used throughout the war. The role of children in the US war effort will be further discussed in the next few pages.

The Woman’s Land Army of America poster emphasizes the role of women in the US war effort. One of the more common themes in American WWI posters is that of the role citizens who are not directly in combat can play in the war effort. Middle-class, progressive urban women were a major part of the mobilization effort.

With the assistance of mostly middle-class urban Progressive women, Hoover [in charge of the Land Army of America at the time] was able to recast rural values as a panacea to wartime problems by promoting war gardening, or victory gardens, as a means of involving civilians in the war effort and lessening the load on the US manufacturing system. (Tunc, 2012: 199)

Once again, one immediately notices bright colors used in this poster. Two women can be seen working together to haul a large wooden basket filled to the brim with freshly gathered fruits and vegetables. Behind the two women carrying the heavy load of produce, is a woman gallantly riding on a horse, holding a large American flag. The American flag is placed in the center of the poster, reminding the viewer of patriotic themes.

The heroic efforts of women during WWI showed the world that women had the ability to take on essential roles in public life. (Dumenil, 2002, and Adie, 2013) According to Dumenil, “For many women, the war effort offered opportunities for volunteer service to the nation that also provided the personal satisfaction of fulfilling, meaningful work, even though it was unpaid labor. For others, the war provided new, though often temporary, employment options (Dumenil, 2002: 36-37).” The women who volunteered for service learned many important trade skills such as carpentry, farming, and metal work.

Women were not allowed to fight in the US Military during WWI and most were expected to keep things functioning smoothly back at home. (Tunc, 2012) The US government invested in the creation of numerous different posters emphasizing the importance of land management and farming during WWI. Since many of the men who were farmers were off at war, the women left behind were needed to keep the farms running. Many women at the time did not have the same knowledge as their husbands of modern farming techniques. As a result, the US government offered courses to teach them the skills needed to keep food production high. *The Woman's Land Army of America* encourages women to take courses at the University of Virginia to learn modern farming techniques. One notices the tuition for the 2 week course was free and that board was only \$5 a week. The US needed constant food production in order to keep the soldiers properly fed and the economy at home strong.

Despite the efforts to include women in the war effort, the poster's themselves still reinforced gender stereotypes and did not accurately portray the demographic realities in the US at the time. “War posters were far from accurate in their depiction of American women. The images were white and the messages for the most part reinforced conventional gender stereotypes. The emphasis was on female service and self-sacrifice (Dumenil, 2002: 36-37).” Images of black, Asian, and Hispanic women are not seen in most US war posters. The emphasis on service and sacrifice also was applied to the case of children in US war posters.

Lest we perish Campaign for \$30,000,000; American Committee for Relief in the Near East; Armenia-Greece-Syria-Persia, is another example of a poster that utilizes the feminine form to convey its message. This particular poster is an appeal to Americans once again to reach deep into their pockets and give money towards US interests in the war effort. This particular poster is a call for, \$30,000,000, an enormous amount of money in the 1910's. A simple purchasing power calculator would calculate the relative value of \$30,000,000 around 1914 to \$721,000,000 today. This image does not actually spell out how the money is going to be used other than calling it relief in the near east. During WWI, Armenia, Greece, Syria, and Persia were seen as allies. The situation of these nations was dire. According to a congressional report in 1918, “The largest part of the funds contributed for relief goes to these orphanages. Letters are constantly being

received in order that the number of orphans be increased (Fowle, Gates, et. al, 1918: 10).”

The image shows a young, fair skinned woman, who clearly is of Mediterranean or Persian descent with her arms outstretched asking for help from the Americans. Non-sexually provocative images of regular housewives, Lady Columbia, and the Statue of Liberty were commonly used to promote food related programs, whereas more sexually provocative images of beautiful, youthful women were used to sell war bonds, raise cash directly, and encourage men to join the service in the United States. (Stanley, 1983, and Banta, 1987) If one looks closely, the woman is wearing some type of head covering. However, it is being worn in a way that would not be *too foreign* to the American public as to be alienating. The colors are simpler in this poster than in other ones, however one cannot help but be drawn to the red scarf in the picture as a focal point.

Helping Hoover in our U.S. School Garden is a poster that refers to a government program that was created with the passage of the 1914 Smith-Lever Act, also commonly referred to as the *Agricultural Extension Act*. The Smith-Lever Act established a system of cooperative extension services that were connected to the land-grant universities. The goal of the new system of cooperative extension services was to inform people about the most contemporary developments in agriculture, home economics, public policy/government, leadership, 4-H, economic development, and coastal issues.

The Smith-Lever Act also gave President Woodrow Wilson the authority to appoint future US president Herbert Hoover to a new government agency that sought to prevent food shortages and price inflation which could have threatened the entire war effort. Hoover and Wilson had to toe a fine line; while they needed to encourage rationing and frugality, they did not want to appear as ‘socialists’ by *forcing* American’s to ration. According to Tunc, based on these realities, “Hoover thus had to convince Americans to self-regulate their consumption of food voluntarily, and realized that playing on patriotic sentiments would be the easiest, and quickest, way to do so (Tunc, 2012: 197).” As a result of slick advertising and posters, Hoover’s program quickly gained popularity amongst Americans everywhere. Hoover made specific efforts to encourage women to participate in the food rationing program. (Gordon, 1999, and Kingsbury, 2008) This would explain the use of happy, wholesome, ‘All-American’ Caucasian children in food preservation posters and similar WWI advertising campaigns.

Despite most US posters being more upbeat in general, there were some exceptions. The final American example explored in this article is the ominous poster; *We’ve fought in the open bubonic plague, yellow fever, tuberculosis: Now venereal diseases*. This poster shows that sexually transmitted diseases (STD’s) had been a concern of various armies prior to WW1. During the mid 19th century, the British passed laws regulating prostitution that were ultimately unsuccessful. Despite laws being enacted in the mid 1860’s, by 1895,

STD's were at a peak amongst British military men. (Harrison, 1995) The United States had its own problems with venereal diseases during the Philippines-American War which lasted from 1899-1902, just prior to the outbreak of WWI.

The US Military and State Department set up commissions that sought to monitor and quarantine Filipino women who were thought to be infected with sexually transmitted diseases. Males who contracted STD's were looked at by the commanders in charge as morally flawed. "[...] they [the US military commanders] made the act of contraction a sort of bodily treason, a partial denial of one's physical constitution to the state (Kramer, 2011: 3)." During WWI sexually transmitted diseases were of particular danger to soldiers. Having an STD coupled with the filthy conditions of trench warfare could become deadly in a very short time after contracting the disease(s).

This poster also references previous ailments that most Americans would be familiar with that have caused mass deaths such as the bubonic plague, yellow fever, and tuberculosis. Each of these previous plagues is represented by one of the 3 skeletons standing behind the demon woman, who represents the new danger, venereal diseases. In the first decade of the 20th century, over 100,000 Americans died each year of the decade from tuberculosis, also known as 'consumption' and 'the White Plague' (Lochimescu and Tomford, 2014). The word 'tuberculosis' on the poster would most certainly raise immediate attention to the viewer living in the 1910's who very likely knew someone who died of this terrible disease. The mention of bubonic plague would also resonate with most Americans who were most certainly taught about how it killed approximately 1/3 of the European population in 1347AD in a world history class in grade school.

The colors in this poster are much darker. The image of skeletons and semi-naked demon women, representing lust and fornication, holding a chained eagle or vulture standing on a skull were meant to both shock and raise fear inside the viewer. While it appears that the bird used in this image is a vulture, upon first glance one could easily think it might be some type of eagle. This is important for historical and cultural reasons within the US.

The bald eagle has been the symbol of American 'democracy and freedom' almost since America's inception. The founding fathers of the US like to compare the new nation to the Roman Empire. The use of the Eagle was common in the Roman Empire, thus the founding fathers chose the Bald Eagle as the main symbol that appears on the Great Seal of the United States. (Lawrence, 1990) While at this point in history it may be impossible, it would be interesting to find out if the choice of the 'bald eagle-looking' bird being chained to the demon woman, standing on top of a skull was intentional. The poster is saying that lust and sexually transmitted diseases are enthralling Americans and the future of America in general.

Germany and World War I Propaganda Art

Following the assassination of Archduke Franz Ferdinand of the Austro-Hungarian Monarchy by a Serbian nationalist, the reeling Austro-Hungarian Empire declared war on Serbia. Following this declaration, a German response was imminent, especially considering the long historical ties between the two states directly linked to the powerful Habsburg Dynasty. For a long time, what was called, the ‘spirit of 1914’ hypothesis argued that German’s were almost unanimously excited about the prospect of war. This went largely unquestioned by academics for decades. This hypothesis was bolstered by the fact that every party in the Reichstag voted in favor of entering the war, even traditionally anti-war Socialists. However in the past 20-30 years new scholarship has emerged challenging that axiom.

In 2000, Jeffrey Verhey published, *The Spirit of 1914: Militarism, Myth, and Mobilization in Germany* (Cambridge, 2000), which argued that, similarly to their American counterparts, German’s held mixed feelings on whether to enter the war or not. On the ‘spirit of 1914’ hypothesis, Verhey states, “Indeed, given the myth-makers’ intentions, it is not surprising that their myth of the ‘spirit of 1914,’ an account of the history of German public opinion in July and August 1914, became increasingly more removed from its real history (Verhey, 2000: 9).” For Verhey this myth was perpetuated by conservatives who sought to romanticize the war and foster national pride and a sense of ethnic solidarity. Verhey’s argument makes sense considering the fact that the Germans went to such great efforts to produce highly visible war propaganda posters. If the German public truly were ‘unanimous,’ as the spirit of 1914 hypothesis suggests, why would such efforts be made to convince the public, via propaganda to support the war effort?

From the very beginning of WWI, the German state already had multiple agencies in charge of disseminating propaganda.

Official German propaganda at the outbreak of the war was conducted by the press bureau of the imperial foreign office, the public relations officers of the army and navy intelligence services, the affiliated telegraph agencies, and certain foreign press bureaus. (Lutz, 1933: 498)

The German poster, *Kriegsanleihe, hilft den Hütern eures Glückes*, makes an appeal to the family, and more specifically, traditional German family life. One cannot help but notice the sword that the muscular young father is holding as he caresses his wife’s shoulder and newborn baby’s back. Another interesting thing to observe in this poster is the exaggerated size of father’s hand that is caressing his wife and baby. Exaggerated masculinity permeates much of the propaganda posters utilized by the Germans during WWI. The text says, “War loans help the guardians of your happiness.” We can see an appeal to patriotism and the duty of the citizen in this particular image.

The highly patriarchal nature of the German family was explored in detail by the prominent Frankfurt School scholar Eric Fromm in his book, *The Working Class in Weimar Germany: A Psychological and Sociological Study* (Harvard Press, 1984). The research for this work began in 1929 at the now legendary Institute of Social Research (*Institut für Sozialforschung*) at Frankfurt-au-Maim, the namesake of what would become known as the *Frankfurt School* of thought.

Even though this project began prior to the rise of Hitler, it remained unpublished until the 1980's. Fromm's findings were based on a 271 open ended questionnaire that he used qualitative and quantitative techniques to evaluate. In this work, Fromm concludes that there is an inherent authoritarianism, specifically within the working class German family, that ultimately facilitated to the rise of Hitler and the politics of the 3rd Reich. (Fromm, 1984) While at first many of those being questioned in the survey expressed less reactionary views, after utilizing less overtly-political and more opaque questioning, even those who initially expressed leftist political belief systems, revealed themselves to possess many of the same reactionary attitudes towards contemporary social norms and mores as those on the right and even extreme right possessed.



In another powerful appeal to German patriotism, *Bauern, tut eurer Pflicht! Die Städte hungern*, portrays a desperate looking German family. If one looks closely, the will notice the faces of the mother and older child in the back both appear to be in crying. Once again, we see a simple, powerful image that appeals to the basest emotions of the 'true German patriot.' As mentioned above the German propaganda apparatus framed the war as a defensive effort in which victory was certain. According to Ralph Lutz in 1933; All these [state sponsored German] publications throw light on the chief themes of the home propaganda, which were: the war of self-defense against the encircling policy of the Entente, the certainty of victory and the consequent necessity of fortitude, the violations of the laws of land

and naval warfare by all the enemies, the historic mission and high culture of Germans, the need for national expansion, and the proclamation that a German victory would be for the good of the world. (Lutz, 1933: 500)

The self-aggrandizement of German culture and its contributions to world culture, more specifically the belief in the unique role of German culture in spiritual world development, or what G.W.F Hegel called, *Geist*, would be an even more prominent theme during the reign of the 3rd Reich. The need for national expansion was transformed into an all encompassing ideology in WWII. The notion of *lebensraum*, or that of ‘living space’ for Germanic peoples was canonized as not only an ideology, but a scientific law of nature; those peoples who are superior have not only a right, but a duty to conquer less civilized people. (Lee, 2003) This image does an effective job of showing how ‘cramped’ and ‘uncomfortable’ the German family is, and how without territorial expansion, it would be doomed.

The Germans also used images of women to promote the war effort. This image in many ways is similar to the American images of females patriotically contributing to the general war effort. *Weihnachts Sammlung des bayerischen Roten Kreuzes für die Feldgrauen* shows a young, physically fit German female pulling a sleigh, handing a bundle of provisions to a male German soldier. One’s attention is immediately drawn to the bright gold and pink colors in the woman’s dress. She has a determined and confident look on her face. If one looks really closely the will notice that the female is significantly smaller and frailer than the tall, burly male soldier. This is another example of the exaggeration of masculinity that can be seen in German propaganda.

The overall larger-scale, long term, sociological ramifications for German women were also similar to American women during the war; continued reinforcement of certain gender stereotypes, exploitation at the hands of male workers, limited upward career mobility, and no real concrete progress in gaining rights. In the words of Ute Daniel, the war in Germany was nothing more than, “an emancipation on loan (Daniel, 1997: 283).” The biggest outcome of WWI in regards to women in Germany was the ‘horizontal’ shifting of working women from one sector to another. (Daniel, 1997) Women in Germany were also under extra scrutiny if they engaged in adultery or prostitution. Despite the fact that any sexual encounter requires two people, the female participants in extra-marital liaisons with male soldiers were demonized by the state and public as being unpatriotic and of poor moral character, while the male participants, though discouraged by those in command, largely got a free pass.



Dein Vaterland ist in Gefahr, melde dich! & *Join the Air Service: "Give 'er the Gun,"* offer a side by side comparison of a German recruitment poster and an American recruitment poster. The poster on the left shows a German soldier with a rifle in one hand and fire and barbed wire behind him. The message is simple. Like the previous images, one sees appeals to patriotism and heroism. The words written are bold and clear; *dein vaterland ist in gefahr melde dich*, which translates into English as "Your fatherland is in danger." Anyone with even the most minimal patriotic tendencies would understand the meaning of this poster. Like the previous image, this is meant to appeal to raw emotion. The desperation can be readily felt in this particular poster. The world is literally on fire and the brave German soldier is the only thing that can save *Dein Vaterland*.

Unlike the darker imagery coupled with an appeal to selfless patriotism as seen in, *Dein Vaterland ist in Gefahr, melde dich!*, the American poster utilizes brighter colors, offers an appeal to personal gain, and shows a similar young recruit, except this one with a big smile on his face. 'Learn' and 'Earn' are meant to appeal to the individual's self-centered interests of learning a useful skill and making money so they can live comfortable after the war. The entrepreneurial theme has long been a staple of American efforts to get people to join the services. Even today, one can regularly see commercials on American television that talk about the immediate financial and educational benefits of being a new enlistee in the US Armed Forces.

Going back to Chambers rubric, thus far we have appeals to patriotism and the family in the German World War I Propaganda posters, but we have yet to see the 3rd element; that of demonizing the enemy being fought on the ground or scenes of violence or carnage. *Bolschewismus heisst die Welt im Blut ersäufen* references a specific *ideological threat* as opposed to a specific physical military force such as the British or Americans. The ideological threat to German culture that is often repeated in German propaganda art is that of Bolshevism. The words on the poster translate in English to, "Bolshevism means the world will drown in blood."

Indeed, German Nationalists and Social Democrats alike were already concerned with the rise Bolshevism in Russia before Lenin ever assumed formal power. In 1918, Social Democratic Party of Germany (*Sozialdemokratische Partei Deutschlands*) member and future Prime Minister of Prussia from 1920-1932, Otto Braun, argued that socialism must be achieved via democratic means and not through violence, and that since the Bolshevik revolution in Russia had become so violent, the German left must make it clear that Bolshevism and German socialism were not one in the same. (Schulze, 1982) The Bolsheviks were seen by many wealthier Germans as dangerous Atheist Jewish radicals whose national loyalty could not be trusted, and whose goal was to destroy civilization as they have come to know it. Here we can see the image of the wolf, a very powerful figure in Germanic culture, representing the looming threat of Bolshevism.

The murderous wolf's paws are covered in blood as it overlooks a man drowning in a pool of brightly colored red blood. Throughout northeastern Europe, tales of men who transform into wolves, or *werewolves*, have been present since the middle ages. In the 19th century the famous German academics and folklore enthusiasts, Jacob and Wilhelm Grimm, also known the 'the brothers Grimm,' retold the story of *Little Red Riding Hood*, the story of a young girl confronted by a wolf, in their 1812, *Kinder- und Hausmärchen* (Children's and Household Tales). The imagery of the wolf would be regularly utilized in propaganda in WWII by the Nazi's. Hitler's own Eastern-Front military headquarters was called the *Wolfsschanze*, or 'Wolf's Lair.'

The poster, *Kohle ist Brot*, is another subtle appeal to the threat of Bolshevism. Here we see another grim German poster showing an image of a skeleton that obviously resembles the face of the Bolshevik leader, Vladimir Lenin. This picture shows Lenin, or at least an obviously 'Lenin-like' caricature reaching across the German industrial skyline from the great beyond stealing precious wheat as 3 German workers hopelessly idly look on. The phrase, *Kohle ist Brot*, translates in English to 'Coal is Bread.'

At one level, this clearly is an appeal to the German workers to do their patriotic duty to work and not strike or engage in any other subversive activities that might disrupt in the war effort. If coal is not being mined and refined, then there will be no bread. While this is obvious, the poster clearly is also insinuating that there exists a Bolshevik threat from beyond. This poster effectively conveys 2 separate messages; the importance of not engaging in labor stoppages and the dangers of the new emerging foreign ideology of Bolshevism. If the workers do not produce enough coal and remain patriotic, the evil new political movement from Russia will steal all the food and leave the German people starving.

Conclusion

The function of art has been debated amongst cultural critics and scholars pre-dating

Aristotle and Plato. (Wrigley, 1993, and Elkins, 1996) As mentioned in the introduction, while some critics would never accept that war propaganda art, is in fact, *art*, one cannot deny its practical importance in shaping norms and mores. This is especially true in the 20th and into the 21st centuries. According to Howard Lutz, “War-time propaganda obviously implies national education with an ulterior motive: the creation of new desires, group hypnosis, and isolation of counter propaganda, saturation of the public with selected and biased information (Lutz, 1933: 497).” As means of communication have advanced, so too has the implementation of propaganda.

This paper concludes that U.S. and German WWI propaganda art had some obvious similarities, but even more important differences. It is important to note that this paper is not meant to be an ‘exhaustive study’ of *every* image of propaganda that ever appeared in the US and Germany during WWI. Such an endeavor would most certainly be a very long book. However this paper did seek to offer a broad set of general hypotheses that can later be tested in future research projects by other scholars.

In regard to similarities; both nations sought to create posters that would appeal to emotion over reason. Each side utilized powerful imagery, often of women and children. These images were then coupled with short and simple instructions, such as ‘buy war bonds’ or ‘serve your country bravely.’ Some of the techniques used by the US in WWI, especially in regards to food rationing, were so successful, they were almost directly recycled in the posters the US used in WWII. “The same slogans – ‘Food will win the war; don’t waste it’, ‘Plant victory gardens to ensure victory’, and ‘Only buy what you can eat’ – can also be found on posters from the early 1940s. These posters employ the same iconography, colour palette, and themes, and substitute one German leader for another (Hitler for the Kaiser) (Tunc, 2012: 216).” The Germans also recycled many of the same themes utilized in their WWI posters in their WWII posters.

Both sides also followed Chambers 3 main areas of content in regards to war propaganda art, not just in posters, but in other mediums of propaganda art as well. The 3 themes mentioned by Chambers were; 1) appeals to the patriotism in an attempt to motivate civilians to contribute to the war effort by joining the military; 2) Appeals to civilian-orientated activities, emphasizing the civilian/military inter relationship and the role citizens can play at home to contribute to the war effort, and; 3) efforts to demonize the enemy in with the intent of instill hate and fear for the enemy in the citizens. (Chambers, 1983) The US utilized the newly emerging film industry to demonize the German enemy, while as shown in this article; the German’s demonized Bolshevism in numerous different posters.

This paper has shown some important thematic and stylistic difference between German and US propaganda posters. In the American case, *The Great War*, was framed in

a way that not only appealed to American patriotism, but also to individual self-interest. Many of the American posters sought to make the connection between military training and learning a skill or trade that could make money when the war was over. The colors used in the posters also differed. Many American posters utilized brighter colors than did the Germans, and regularly utilized smiling faces of children and images of industrious, happy women.

The image of Uncle Sam also became a useful marketing tool for the military during this time. Uncle Sam was an easily identifiable cartoonish figure that anyone; literate or illiterate; educated or uneducated; black or white; male or female could understand. The war was not as existentially dangerous to the United States as it was for Germany; even if the US lost, it would still most certainly maintain its sovereignty and freedom, even though its global aspirations of hegemonic power may have been temporarily halted. Once again, the fact that this war was not a matter of life or death for the nation as a whole, made convincing American's to fight even more difficult. Lutz quotes early 20th century Canadian novelist and British politician, Sir Gilbert Parker as saying, "[The Americans] have nothing to gain by success in this war except something spiritual, mental, manly, national, and human. They are in this war because they believe German policy is a betrayal of civilization (Lutz, 1933: 514)." With this in mind, it is no surprise why American propaganda art sought to make the war experience seem less miserable and more hopeful.

In regards to the German case, the artwork in the posters is much more ominous and foreboding. The war was viewed by many Germans as a matter of life or death for the nation. This is reflected in the artwork. Perhaps the poster of distraught family best exemplifies the state of mind in Germany when the war broke out in 1914. The general color scheme of the German posters was much darker, and the themes were less hopeful than those utilized by the Americans. References to personal self-gain after the war were generally absent from German WWI propaganda artwork. As mentioned above, the German poster art seemed to focus more on demonizing enemies than American poster art. A common leitmotif that was often demonized was the threat of Bolshevism. This interesting to note because the Bolsheviks did not formally assume power in Russia until well after the war had ended. The threat of Bolshevism would be a central theme in World War II in German propaganda as well.

References

- Adie, Katie. 2013. *Fighting on the Home Front: The Legacy of Women in World War One*. London: Hodder & Stoughton.
- Adorno, Theodor. 2004. *Aesthetic Theory*. Ed. Gretel Adorno and Rolf Tiedemann. Translated by Robert Hullot-Kentor. New York: Continuum.
- Banta, M. 1987. *Imaging American Women: Idea and Ideals in Cultural History*. New York: Columbia

- University Press.
- Chambers, R. 1983. "Art and Propaganda in an Age of War: The Role of Posters." *Scientia Militaria, South African Journal of Military Studies*, 13(4): 54-59.
- Daniel, U. 1997. *The War from Within: German Working-Class Women in the First World War*. New York: Berg Publishers.
- DeBauche, L.M. 1997. *Reel Patriotism: The Movies and World War I*. Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press.
- Dewey, D. 2007. *The Art of Ill Will: The Story of American Political Cartoons*. New York: NYU Press.
- Dumenil, L. 2002. "Women and the Great War." *OAH Magazine of History*, 17(1): 35-39.
- Elkins, James 1996. "Art Criticism," In, Jane Turner (ed.), *Grove Dictionary of Art*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Fowle, Gates, et. al. 1918. "Extracts from Constantinople Committee's Report dated June 30, 1918," In, *The American Committee for Relief in the Near East, its history, its work and the need for support as outlined by President Wilson and others (1918)*. Accessed Online, <https://archive.org/details/1123893upenn>
- Fromm, E. 1984. *The Working Class in Weimar Germany: a Psychological and Sociological Study*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Press.
- Gordon, M. 1999. 'Onward Kitchen Soldiers: Mobilizing the Domestic during WWI,' *Canadian Review of American Studies*, 29: 61-87.
- Harrison, M. 1995. "The British Army and the problem of venereal disease in France and Egypt during the First World War." *Medical History*. 39(2): 133-158.
- Houston, K. 2012. *An Introduction to Art Criticism: Histories, Strategies, and Voices*. New York: Pearson.
- Hartcup, G. 1988. *The War of Invention; Scientific Developments, 1914-18*. London: Brassey's Defence Publishers.
- Jones, Howard. 2001. *Crucible of Power: A History of U.S. Foreign Relations Since 1897*. New York: Rowman & Littlefield.
- Jünger, Ernst. 2004. *Storm of Steel*. Translated by Michael Hofmann. New York: Penguin Books.
- Kingsbury, C. 2008. "'Food Will Win the War': Food and Social Control in World War I Propaganda," In, K. LeBesco and P. Naccarato (eds.), *Edible Ideologies: Representing Food and Meaning*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press. pp. 37-52.
- Kellner, Doug 2005. "Western Marxism," In, Austin Harrington (Ed.), *Modern Social Theory: An Introduction*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press. pp. 154-174.
- Keith, J. 2004. *Rich Man's War, Poor Man's Fight: Race, Class, and Power in the Rural South during the First World War I*. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press.
- Paul A. Kramer. 2011. "The Military-Sexual Complex: Prostitution, Disease and the Boundaries of Empire during the Philippine-American War." *The Asia-Pacific Journal*. 9(30) No. 2: 1-17. Accessed Online, http://japanfocus.org/-Paul_A_-Kramer/3574
- Latham, J. 2006. "Technology and 'Reel Patriotism,' in American Film Advertising of the World War I Era." *Film and History*, 34: 36-43.
- Lawrence, E.A. 1990. "Symbol of a Nation: The Bald Eagle in American Culture." *The Journal of American Culture*. 13(1): 63-69.

- Library of Congress Archives. "The Most Famous Poster." *American Treasures of the Library of Congress*. Accessed Online, <http://www.loc.gov/exhibits/treasures/trm015.html>
- Lochimescu, O. and Tomford, J. 2014. "Tuberculosis," Cleveland Clinic Continuing Education Disease Management Project. Accessed Online, <http://www.clevelandclinicmeded.com/medicalpubs/diseasemanagement/infectious-disease/tuberculosis/>
- Lossing, B. 1850. *Pictorial Field Book of the Revolution*, Volume II, Supplement XIV.
- Lutz, R. H. 1933. "Studies of World War Propaganda, 1914-33," *The Journal of Modern History*, 5(4): 496-516.
- Parker, [Sir] G. 1918. "The United States and the War," *Harper's Magazine*, 138: 521-31.
- Randolph, T.J. 1830. "Jefferson's Memoirs: Memoirs, Correspondence, and Miscellanies from the Papers of Thomas Jefferson." *Southern Review*, 5(9): 100-138.
- Schulze, H. 1982. *Weimar. Deutschland 1917-1933*. Berlin: Severin u. Siedler.
- Skees, Murray. 2011. "Kant, Adorno and the Work of Art." *Philosophy and Social Criticism*. 37(8): 915-933.
- Stanley, P. 1983. *What Did You do in the War, Daddy? A Visual History of Propaganda Posters*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Tunc, T.E. 2012. "Less Sugar, More Warships: Food as American Propaganda in the First World War," *War in History*, 19(2) 193-216.
- Verhey, J. 2000. *The Spirit of 1914: Militarism, Myth and Mobilization in Germany*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Williamson, S.H. 2014. "Seven Ways to Compute the Relative Value of a U.S. Dollar Amount, 1774 to present," *MeasuringWorth.com*. Accessed Online, <http://www.measuringworth.com/uscompare/relativevalue.php>
- Wrigley, James. 1993. *The Origins of French Art Criticism: from the Ancien Régime to the Restoration*. Oxford, UK: Clarendon Press.

IMAGE OF THE OTTOMANS IN BOSNIAN TEXTBOOKS PUBLISHED AFTER 2007

Jahja Muhasilović*

Abstract

Division of historical consciousness in Bosnia and Herzegovina started before the Yugoslav Wars, but this division of historiographies and approaches towards the past resulted with more openly manifestation of the divisions to educational system and history textbooks during the wartime and post Dayton era. Even though International Community tried to change poisonous environment of ethnic hatred in which textbooks are produced, except few successes with Bosniak textbooks, not much positive development was achieved. Reform period which started in 1998 today is seen as an unfinished project. In Bosnia and Herzegovina three different versions of history with two of them having the focus point in neighboring Serbia and Croatia are taught to the students. Besides the fact that students are learning three different histories, there is a certain level of hatred and fear of others spreading through history textbooks. History textbooks became an important tool for poisoning the minds of the youth and building the barriers towards the others. This is the case especially with Serb and Croat textbooks in Bosnia and Herzegovina. Ottoman period in Balkans is mainly seen as a "dark age of the Balkans" as it is underlined in one Serbian textbook and to lesser extend in Croat ones. Even though Bosniaks see Ottoman period in more positive light than other two ethnic groups, there are certain topics and periods where it is possible to see romanticistic and nationalistic tone towards the Ottomans. History textbooks in Bosnia are having negative contribution for country's possible future dissolution and it is the one of the main source of stereotype engineering that country is passing in the last decades and which is one of the main reason of the recent wars. In the times where country is confronting with secessionist threat, it is highly important to start building Bosnian statehood and understanding of others through history textbooks, otherwise we can expect new turmoil in the region known for its sensitivity towards the ethnic conflicts.

Keywords: History Textbooks; Image; Ottomans; Historiography and Imagology

Introduction

For a very long time history textbooks in the Balkans region are the big matter of discussion and one of the most sensitive issues. Especially after the Yugoslav wars, history textbooks issue walks hand in hand with the local politics which is full of ethnic tensions. Almost in all countries of the Balkans region, there is an aim to effect and spread state agendas and deviated view of the past among younger generations through educational system and in this case through history textbooks. Textbooks became a tool for brainwashing and building the tensions between societies. Some history textbooks are more filled with the nationalism than others, but it is common to almost all of them to have nationalistic and

*Corresponding author: Jahja Muhasilović, Independent Scholar, Bosnia and Herzegovina, e-mail: jah-jam87@windowslive.com

ethnocentric approach to history.

After the collapse of Socialist Federative Republic of Yugoslavia some topics of history which were considered as taboo through the Socialist Period, few years before the war and during the war started entering the academical debates. Because historiography is one of the most sensitive areas this negative tone had a huge impact on the formation of new generation of history textbooks. People of ex-Yugoslavia were founding alibi in the past for the new ideas that were supposed to build new ethnocentric societies and nation states.

One ex Republic of Yugoslavia that was the most affected by this negative tone and still feels the pressure of romanticist ethnohistoriography certainly is Bosnia and Herzegovina. It is composed of three different ethnic groups Bosniaks, Serbs and Croats which are affiliated with three different religions, Islam, Orthodox Christianity and Catholicism. When the war broke out, these three ethnic groups found themselves on different sides of the trenches. During the war all this hatred that was accumulated through the horrors of the war and in the eras before, had a huge impact on history textbooks. Others who are not part of same ethnic group, were shown as a historical enemies and were blamed for all the horrors and sins of the past through textbooks.

But if we put internal hatred and internal stereotypes between these three ethnic societies build upon wrong interpretation of the past, what is common for the region as a whole is that they have "common historical enemy." Balkans are considered as a part of Ottoman legacy which automatically brings Ottoman Turks as a common enemy. It is important to mention that Ottomans are not seemed as a enemy on same level among all people in Bosnia and Herzegovina. For example Bosniaks are looking more favourably to Ottoman era, than Serbs or Croats.

After long period of not interfering by the western countries, in the winter of 1995 war in Bosnia and Herzegovina was stopped by US sponsored peace talks held in Dayton, Ohio. Clinton government succeed in bringing the peace to this war thorn country, which suffered huge humanitarian losses which took about 100.000 lives. So after this agreemeent country entered Post-Dayton era. By the agreemeent, country was separated into two entities. Larger part of the country was under the Bosniak-Croat Federation which formed about 51% of country's teritory. This entity is separeted between 10 Cantons which all to some extend have autonomy. Some of the Cantons have Bosniak and some Croat majority. On the other side about 49% of the country is run by Serbian entity called Republika Srpska, which also has huge autonomy, but still part of the Bosnia and Herzegovina. Small part of country which has specific nature of governance and is not dominated by neither of the ethnic groups is called Brcko District. Dayton peace accords left the country with the weak central authority. The situation with the education system and history textbooks

is not much different then the way how country is organized.

History textbooks that entered market during the war and immediatly after the war, were seemed as a threat to multicultural functioning of Bosnia by International community. Many institutions commonly called as a International Community, felt a need for history textbooks to be reformed.

Attempts to Reform History Textbooks

Organizations that took participation in the project and sponsored whole process were: Office of High Representative in Bosnia and Herzegovina, OSCE, Council of Europe, UNESCO and World Bank. Aim was to creat textbooks that was supposed to build a sense of common history. First step for the normalization of the textbooks was done in 1998. Sarajevo Canton was chosen as the first place where project was meant to be implemented. After project was successfully implemented in Canton of Sarajevo, plan was to do same in other places of Bosnia and Herzegovina. With the sponsorship of International Community representatives from Federation and Republika Srpska gathered and signed the *Agreement Regarding Textbook Review and Removal of Offensive Material*. This agreemeent was renewed in June. After the agreemeent was signed few more agreemeents came after. When Bosnia applied for membership in Council of Europe, there was a need to remove offensive materials from history textbooks, so meeting was organized in Mostar in 19th July 1999.

That year The Agreement on Removal of Objectionable Material from Textbooks to be used in Bosnia and Herzegovina in the 1999-2000 School Year was signed in Mostar. Probably becuase of various problems and attempts to evade the actions, Implementation of the Agreemeent of July 19th on the Removal of Objectionable Material from Textbooks to be used in Bosnia and Herzegovina in the 1999-2000 School Year, was signed in August in Banja Luka. Without loosing any speed in progress, there were attempts to write common curriculum. Agreement regarding the curriculum was signed in 2000 by ministers who gathered and joint declaration was published. Now was the time to write a textbook that everyone would be satisfied with. Before the starting to write a common textbook, first step was to define objectionable parts of the content. To do this work, committees from the two entities were selected. In parts were they disagree Independent Committees formed by OHR, UNESCO and Council of Europe was supposed to intervene. Objectionable passages were selected with two methods. First method was that the passages which are objectionable were to be blacked out and second method was to stamp objectionable passages. Stamped parts included this text: "The following passage contains material of which the truth has not been established, or that may be offensive or misleading; the material is currently under review."

There were many tries to evade reformation of the textbooks. In many schools

old textbooks were still in use. In some schools objectionable passages were hung on the bulletin boards, so the students could see those passages. Reforms were supposed to include not just history, but geography, language classes, visual culture, music, music culture, economy and society, and knowledge of the society. According to Ahmed Alibasić a professor at the Faculty of Islamic Studies in Sarajevo who researched Image of Ottomans in Bosnian history textbooks, even if he could not get hold of the reports on the revision of history textbooks, fragmentary reports that came to him pointed out that committees had more work to do with Serbian and Croatian textbooks than with the Bosniak ones (Moe, 2008, 4).

In May 2004 education ministers agreed to form a committee for the development of a guidelines for history and geography. So, year after in 2005 committee prepared "Guidelines for Writing and Evaluation of History Textbooks for Primary and Secondary Schools in Bosnia and Herzegovina." This guideline was accepted by all ministers of education in Bosnia and Herzegovina. According to the guidelines; 1) students should receive a basic understanding of the history and geography of all three constituent peoples and minorities in Bosnia and Herzegovina 2) Main reference point should be Bosnia and Herzegovina 3) the three constituent peoples and minorities should be represented in a way that doesn't hurt their feelings. One method to achieve this goal was to lower the level of political history in the textbooks. In 2006 all Bosnian education ministers signed this agreement. It was planned that all the proposals listed in guidelines were to be implemented in the new textbooks foreseen for the academic year 2007/2008.

After all these positive changes, in years to come expected success didn't occur. Reform was most successful with the Bosniak textbooks, but with them some other problems occurred. Bosniak textbooks entered into a period of hyperproduction. The biggest advance concerning Croat textbooks was that their publishing started in Bosnia. Serbian textbooks improved visual parts of the textbooks but not much improvement concerning the content occurred. So, problem of the textbooks in Bosnia and Herzegovina still is problem that remains to be solved.

Critical Analysis of History Textbooks

History textbooks is one of the most important topics for the historians in the region. First serious study about the image of the Ottomans in Bosnian textbooks was conducted by Ahmed Alibasić professor at the Faculty of Islamic Studies in Sarajevo. He researched the image of the Ottomans in the history textbooks. Alibasić analyzed textbooks of the three ethnic societies published before 2006. So these textbooks were still in use before the last guidelines were published. My work is the thesis that researches the textbooks that are in use after the 2007, where I tried to find out how much progress was done by bringing textbooks on the level foreseen by the guidelines.

Similar studies on history textbooks were conducted by Damir Agičić (2003) from Croatia who in the same time is writer of some of the history textbooks and Dubravka Stojanović from Serbia (see Pešić and Rosandić, 1994, 77-105). The International Institute that is very active not just in the fields of research but even is part of the textbooks reform in Western Balkans is George Eckert Institute for International Textbook Research from Braunschweig in Germany. OSCE mission in Bosnia relies on their service concerning the education of textbook authors. From international arena especially active researcher and writer in this field is Heike Karge from University of Regensburg.

One of the hardest things while researching the textbooks was the fact that in last years in Bosnia we witness a hypoproduction of the history textbooks which brings the number of textbooks to be researched to a several dozen of them. This is the case especially with Bosniak textbooks which are published by nine publishing houses. Bosniak textbooks are changed almost annually and it became source of money earning. Now we have a situation that publishing houses are lobbying in schools, so their textbooks could enter the curriculum. By doing little changes in the text new textbooks are published almost every year. When it comes to hyperproduction of the textbooks situation with Croat and Serbian textbooks is not as bad as Bosniak ones. Croat textbooks are published by three and Serbian by one publishing house.

But what is bigger problem with Croat and Serbian textbooks is content. After the guidelines were prepared by experts on this issue, little progress was achieved to change nationalistic content of Croat and Serbian textbooks. Only successful point about Croat textbooks is that they are not any more published in Zagreb, but in Bosnia, but content still is not on satisfactory level. When it comes to Serbian textbooks, which probably are the most ethnocentric, also not much progress is achieved. Just visual aspect of the textbooks were improved. When it comes to changing the content of textbooks the most successful are Bosniak history textbooks.

Problem of Approach to the Ottoman Period

Examining image of the Ottoman period in the Bosnia is a vast area by itself which includes many sensitive subtopics that have to be discussed in a very qualitative manner if goal is to get close to real picture about the textbooks issue. Some of the big number of subtopics that must be examined are Islamization process, Devşirme system, Janissary corps, treatment of non-Muslims, Ottoman border wars and the role of Akıncı troops, independence and autonomy movements and so many other topics. In this text particularly, intention was just to summaries overall approach and view of Ottoman period, without dealing with the subtopics already mentioned above. Ottoman period lasted for almost 700 years, so there are many processes and happenings, about which is almost impossible to write in a short text like this one was intended to be.

When reading history textbooks in Bosnia and Herzegovina, it is possible to see totally different approaches to Ottoman past between three ethnic groups. Generally speaking Serbian textbooks are the most critical about this period, while Bosniak one are looking more favourably. Survey conducted in Serbian school also proves this view from textbooks. When Ottoman Empire is mentioned two things that first comes to mind of Serbian students is occupier with 49% and enemy with 40% of the answers, compared to Bosniak schools where 66% of students thinks Ottomans were friendly and just 3% see Ottomans as a enemy. As it is said in the guideline, textbooks should focus on a common Bosnian history, but with the Serbian and Croat ones it is not the case. Serbian textbooks are totally focusing on Serbian ethnic history. In the research that was conducted, some questions were examined. One of them was to found out what is the most important historical happening during the Ottoman past. What came out was that even for the Serbian textbooks in Bosnia, that Battle of Kosovo plays crucial role for the Serbian past. Even in a survey conducted 81 % of Serbian kids in Eastern Sarajevo school answered Battle of Kosovo is the most important historical happening for them. Generally in Serbian textbooks Ottoman period is seen as a dark age. One title goes that far to say: "The worst of all periods" (Mihaljčić, 2009, 191). Ottoman Empire is seen as a state designed to be in state of constant war (Ibid., 188). One of the exemptions of the "dark period" is the case of Mehmet Paşa Sokollu, who is seen as a Serb who succeeded in the Empire's hierarchy and became a Grand Vizier.

But is not hard to guess why Sokollu is seen as a one bright example. Because he is a Serb and this goes hand in hand with the overall tone of the textbooks which glorifies the Serbian past. Mehmet Paşa Sokollu plays important role in Serbian history mainly for the reason because he was the the key figure behind the restoration of Pec Patriarchate.

When it comes to Croatian textbooks situation is not much better. Even if Ottomans are not that important part of the Croatian history as they are for Serbs or Bosniaks, they play important role in the Croatian past and the shaping of Croatian identity. Ottoman era for the big part of the Croats starts and finishes earlier then for the Bosniaks or Serbs. Ottoman history is observed from different angle then Bosniak or Serbian ones. Croats for big part of the Ottoman period were on two sides of the border between Ottoman and Habsburg Empires. This aspect plays important role for the formation of Croat perception of Ottoman period. Croatia is seen *Antemurale Christianitatis* which in Latin means bulwark of Christianity. Croat lands are seen as a last resort of Christendom, before the Islamic-Oriental lands starts. In the history textbooks important place is given to the Catholic dimension of Croat identity. Overallly looking this period is not perceived as a positive. When Ottomans are to be blamed for something in many parts of the Croat textbooks, then it is done from the Catholic point of view. For Croat textbooks, Ottomans were preferring Orthodox Serbs rather than Catholics, because Pope was the out of the reach for the Ottomans and was main promoter of the wars against the Ottomans (Bekavac, Kljajic

and Rozic, 2010, 48). For the Croat authors that is the reason why Ottomans preferred the Orthodox Christians even allowed them to collect tax from Catholics and take their churches (Birin, Rozic and Šarlija, 2012, 156-156). There is one picture given in textbooks where Orthodox priest and one Ottoman Muslim are collaborating and behind them is Catholic priest screaming and looking at the burning Catholic church. This picture shows us how Ottoman past is perceived by the Croatian nationalistic historiography. As it is the case with Serbian textbooks, Croat ones are also having main focus on ethnic Croat history, rather than Bosnian history. Bosniak textbooks generally speak positively about the first centuries of Ottoman rule.

Early Ottoman Empire is seen as one of the most advanced and well organized states of that period, which probably is not far from the truth. It is perceived as a civilization that brings city life to the region with sophisticated architecture, art and culture (Petković and Pocrnja, 2010, 124). With Ottoman advance into the Balkans multicultural and multireligious life was introduced. In Bosniak textbooks all these positive aspects of Ottoman civilization are described. Point that is the matter of disagreement between Bosniak on one side and Serbian and Croat textbooks on the other side is the nature of Islamization. By the Bosniak textbooks this process is seen mainly as a peaceful, which is not supported by the Serbian and Croat textbooks, which look at this process more negatively. In Serbian textbooks it is possible to see romantic approach to the problem where sometimes phenomena like Devşirme are described as a *Blood Tax* and perceived as an Islamization tool (Petković and Pocrnja, 2010, 189). But this interpretation of the first Ottoman centuries in positive manner in Bosniak textbooks suddenly starts to shift in seventeenth century. Fields of disagreement with Sublime Porte especially extend when reforms were tried to be implemented throughout the Empire. As reforms were opposed in eighteenth century by the Bosniak elite, textbooks are also defending this point of view. They are full of quotations from the past mainly said by the Husein Kapetan Gradasević which dwarfs Sultan and his reforms (Valenta, 2011, 111). This approach is due to romanticist and nationalistic approach by some authors in the history textbooks, which actually reveals when writing about the late Ottoman era starts. When Bosniaks became "endangered" by the central Ottoman government, actual approach and intentions in writing the textbooks became clear, which is hard to be observed when writing about the periods when "everything was all right" in Bosnia.

Different Approaches on Reform Period in Ottoman Empire

As it was mentioned above, between three ethnic societies in Bosnia, we have different approaches to Tanzimat reforms. In Bosniak textbooks where about early Ottoman centuries general approach is positive and writing mainly in objective manner, shift to opposing the Ottoman policy towards Bosnia in the last two centuries starts suddenly. Description of reform period in Bosniak textbooks reminds the tone which is found in Croat and Serbian textbooks about Ottoman period as a whole.

But what is to be seen is that especially in Serbian textbooks, because in Croatia it is not the important matter of discussion, probably for the reason Croatia was not part of the Empire in those times, is relatively positive approach to reforms. By the Serbian textbooks reforms are seen as a positive wind of change but unsuccessful project, which mainly failed because of the “domestic Turks” who opposed it. When writing about the reforms, Sultan is seen as a positive figure, compared to the local Bosniak Muslims who opposed the idea because they had a fear of losing privileges.

Reason why some Bosniaks at that time were in opposition for reforms is that they thought defence of Bosnia should be in their own hands and that governors sent by Sultan were not that adequate to defend the border province of the Empire. So they were asking for certain level of autonomy. That is the reason why this movement is called Autonomy movement and not the movement for independence of Bosnia. According to (Valenta, 2011) in Bosniak textbooks we can see subjective approach towards the movement and sometimes even exaggeration from the authors where they are giving quotations of Husein Kapetan himself where he tries to downgrade Sultan and his whole army. Romantically Husein is shown as a pious and religious person standing for the idea of Bosnia. This is mainly because of the reason during the war and post war period Bosniak historiography entered into the trap of romanticist interpretation of the past.

Also one of the important periods to examine is the Republican period, Turkish war of independence, Atatürk and his reforms. Relatively important place about this period is given in Croatian textbooks. Generally period that came after the dissolution of the Empire and Atatürk's fight for Turkish nation state and overallly his reforms are accepted as a positive change in Turkish society (Miloš, 2006/07, 46). He is seen as a modernist who introduced modernity and included Turkey into a modern civilized world. Even in Croatia majority schools Turkey is seen relatively as a positive. When students were asked what first comes to their mind when Turkey is mentioned, 46% of the students said Islamist, compared to Serbian students of whom 60% gave this answer, this result in Croatia schools has relatively low percentage. 24% of Croatia students first think of strong country when Turkey is mentioned. Percentage of Croatia students who see Turkey as a friend is 13%, compared to just 4% of Serbian students and very high 51% for Bosniak students who think Turkey is a friend. Croatia students who see Turkey as an enemy country is 14%, compared to 22% of Serbian students and less than 1% for Bosniak students. Similarly with the textbooks, when we look at the results of survey for Bosniak students we see totally different picture concerning Ottoman period and Turkey from the results in Croatia and Serbian schools. But not all about the last periods of the Empire is seen in a positive way in Croatia textbooks. For example in of the Croatia textbook, it is said that Turks committed atrocities of genocide towards Armenians.

Some organizations sponsored by the International Community tried in different

ways to change negative images that are found in the history textbooks. Not just image of Ottoman period is bad, but because of the reason textbooks are divided among the ethnic groups and their national histories, almost everyone who is from other community is target of demonization through the textbooks. Topic of researching the images in the textbooks is not just issue of imagology and political problems of today, but it should deal with the negative historiographical habits which are developing for a very long time and have their roots deeply in the past. Some are chronic problems for a long time and is impossible to explain them just from the aspect of the last war. Even building the negative image of others through teaching history and textbooks today is for big percentage guilty of separational tendencies and hatred among the ethnic societies of Bosnia and Herzegovina. International community understood the necessity of changing negative perceptions, for the sake of keeping Bosnia from the future separations and for the sake of peace. One organization which worked on the educating history teachers is EUROCLIO. What is seen from today's perspective is that all actions done by International Community didn't have deeper impact on the changing textbooks. Bosniak textbooks did the most to implement guidelines, but they finished in unhealthy hyperproduction of history textbooks. Serbian and Croat textbooks didn't change seriously after all these series of guidelines and the efforts of implementing changes.

Regarding Turkey and her role in changing negative image about Ottoman past, not much is done. Turkey should take initiative in this projects. As Turkey is looking forward to build soft power in the region and tries to change negative image about itself, demonizing her past in the textbooks is one of the main obstacles to achieve this goal. Turkey should work with European Union and other International Community organizations on this field very actively.

Center for the Balkans and Black Sea Studies which is part of Yıldız Technical University conducted a work sponsored by governmental institution TÜBİTAK, to explore history textbooks in the Balkans, Black Sea Region, Mediterranean and Caucasian countries (<http://bal-kar.org/>). This project finished successfully and book about the image of the Ottoman period in countries surrounds Turkey is going to be published very soon. Probably there are many more institutions in Turkey that can and should be included to cooperate with the local and international institutions already working on normalizing textbooks in Bosnia and Herzegovina. Otherwise we could have new conflicts in Bosnia, because of building the notion of separate past full of agony and constantly scaring and blaming the others for the horrors of the past to the students, in long terms could lead to dissolution of Bosnia and Herzegovina as we know. Ignoring national and common history is killing the feeling of Bosnian nation and community. To change this much more effort and pushing for reforms must be done, without losing the sensitivity for historical truth. So, with lack of this balance history teaching could finish in another negative extreme of ignoring the facts of the past.

References

- Bekavac Stjepan, Siniša Kljajić, Miroslav Rozić. 2010. *Povijest 7: udžbenik za 7. razred osnovne škole*. Alfa Mostar, Mostar.
- Birin, Ante, Miroslav Rozić, Tomislav Šarlija. 2012. *Povijest 6: udžbenika za šesti razred osnovne škole* – 1. Izdanje. Alfa Mostar, Mostar.
- Group Authors. 2003. *Zbornik radova: Historijski Mitovi na Balkanu*. Institut za Istoriju Sarajevo, Sarajevo. <http://bal-kar.org/>
- Mihaljčić Rade. 2009. *Istorija 7: za 7. razred osnovne škole*. Zavod za udžbenike i nastavna sredstva, Istočno Sarajevo.
- Miljenko Miloš. 2006/2007. *Povijest Novog doba*. Znanje, Mostar.
- Moe Christian. 2008. *Image of the Religious Others: Discourse and Distance in the Western Balkans*. Novi Sad CEIR.
- Petković, Aida, Marina Pocrnja. 2010. *Historija 7: za sedmi razred devetogodišnje osnovne škole*. Klett, Sarajevo.
- Pešić V. i Rosandić R. 1994. *Ratništvo, patriotizam, patrijarhalnost; Udžbenici istorije kao ogledalo vremena*. Beograd.
- Valenta Leonard. 2011. *Povijest 8: za devetogodišnje osnovne škole* – 1. izdanje, Dječija Knjiga/Bosanska Riječ, Sarajevo.

PATHS TO PARALYSIS: SYMBOLISM AND NARRATOLOGY IN JAMES JOYCE'S "ARABY" AND "EVELINE"

Golbarg Khorsand*

Abstract

There are three nets that shape the basic notions in Joyce's works: religion, language and nationality. The dilemma of his plots revolves around at least one of these issues. Joyce believes that for a man to seek and reach the true nature of freedom in his life, it is necessary to leave these boundaries behind. Usually in most cases, one of the characters in Joyce's writings is captive by those nets. They are put in a dramatic situation in which a revelation would lead him/her to an epiphany. Joyce's use of symbolism and realism and also his different layers of narration is what endow significance, life and glamour to the simple plots of his stories. The main point of concentration in this paper is to define the notion of paralysis in terms of symbolism and narratology, respectively in the two short stories "Araby" and "Eveline"; to show how different symbols and different voices draw upon the desired theme of the author; how religion, language and nationality are packed into variant symbols in order to enhance their significant function in issue of paralysis and how the various methods of narration can depict the nature of paralysis with which the characters struggle.

Keywords: Joyce; Paralysis; Symbolism; Narratology; Araby and Eveline

The "Dubliners" by James Joyce is a collection of fifteen short stories written between 1905 and 1907 and published in 1914. It summarizes the basic notions in Joyce's works. Among the stories are "Araby" and "Eveline"; the two short stories to be discussed in this paper. James Joyce enduring effect on the literature after him is undeniable. "He was a prominent symbolist, modernist, realist and formalist whose work have marked the beginning of an era in prose writing" (Goldman, 1968: 5). His innovative experimental mode of writing and presentation was his main point of discrimination from writers prior to him. "The unprecedented explicitness with which Joyce introduced the trivial details of ordinary life into the realm of art opened up a rich new territory for writers" (Attridge, 2004: 1). As Christopher mentions in Cambridge Companion to Joyce, "Joyce and many like him at this time (particularly Eliot) seemed to have favored relativist opposition to the beliefs of the past. He extricated himself from the prevailing faiths of his contemporaries (2004: 68).

By and large, there are three nets that shape the basic notions in Joyce's works: religion, language and nationality. The dilemma of his plots revolves around at least one of these issues. Joyce believes that for a man to seek and reach the true nature of freedom in his life, it is necessary to leave behind these. As "Stephan" mentions in "portrait of the

*Corresponding author: Golbarg Khorsand, Shiraz University, Iran; e-mail: golbarg_cm@yahoo.com

artist as a young man" "I shall try to fly by those nets". Usually in most cases, one of the characters in Joyce's writings is captive by those nets. They are put in a dramatic situation in which a revelation would lead him/her to an epiphany.

But apart from what the characters do and how they react, what is more essential to the flow of the story is what they are unable to do. Similarly, sometimes absent characters or abstract ideas have more contribution to the plot than present real characters; for example a mother who is dead, a brother who has left the city, a girl who lives across the street and doesn't have a name. as Leonard points out "what I have outlined so far offers a way to notice how the stories communicate significance through what the characters know or wish to know, but also what they are unable to see or are afraid to feel" (2003: 101).

Joyce's use of symbolism and realism and also his different layers of narration is what endow significance, life and glamour to the simple plots of his stories. He constructs the background of his stories in such a way that enables him to draw upon the utmost symbolic meaning of every single word. His symbolism goes beyond simple metaphor and demands both intellectual and emotional response from the reader. There are several layers of narratology each fitting and portraying a particular state of thought and characterization.

In a letter to his publisher Joyce noted: "my intention was to write the moral history of my country and I chose Dublin for the scene because that city seemed to be the center of paralysis" (Robert S Ryf, 1962: 59). So the main point of concentration in this paper is to define the notion of paralysis in terms of symbolism and narratology, respectively in the two short stories "Araby" and "Eveline"; to show how different symbols and different voices draw upon the desired theme of the author; how religion, language and nationality are packed into variant symbols in order to enhance their significant function in issue of paralysis and how the various methods of narration can depict the nature of paralysis with which the characters struggle.

While reading "Araby", the third story in "Dubliners" which "represents an attempted but frustrated escape in the form of a defeated quest" (Ryf, 1962: 63), we will be faced with an abundance of images and symbols and shift in narration. Immediately in the first paragraph a bleak atmosphere is established. The boy narrator, very symbolically, lives in a blind street. This blind street (repeated twice in the same paragraph) could be a symbol of the boy's character that is literally blind due to his young age and immaturity. The color brown which is used to describe the houses (and it's only one of its several appearances as an adjective) symbolizes decayed and spoiled lives of their inhabitants; that is Irish people. This image is used in the second paragraph of "Eveline" to serve exactly the same purpose.

There is a delicate paradox in the sentence: "... when the Christian Brothers' school set the boys free." (Dubliners: 27) The acute reader is asked to ask himself does the Christian Brothers' school actually set the boys free or it constrains and limits them so much the more with its didactic religious teachings?; A question that will be answered right in the next paragraph. The image of the priest who was a "former tenant" and who has died points to the death of religion as a motivating and ensuing element in people's lives.

The description of that "back drawing room" (Dubliners: 27) is telling enough in its own turn. Musty air from being enclosed for too long a time and the rooms behind the kitchen being littered with useless books and papers all contribute to this fact that religion, with its old trainings and didactic methods is no more of any use and benefit to the young Irish generation and it is actually being left behind. The description of the books found in the priest's room is all symbolic: "the curled and damp pages" along with their "yellow leaves" are symbols of death and decay. The title of the books reveals the romantic content of them: "Abbot by Sir Walter Scott", "Devout Communicant" and "the Memoirs of Vidocq" (Dubliners: 27). They are all yellowing and wasting away. It is a symbolic foreshadowing of what is going to happen to the boy's romantic image of the world. There is a "wild garden" and "an apple tree". An apple tree has always been a symbol of original sin which is supposedly the knowledge obtained by human being. And here this symbolic apple tree with its connotation of sin and knowledge could be a foreshadowing of boy's epiphany at the end of the story.

From the beginning of the next paragraph the dark and gloomy atmosphere is going to be shaped by phrases like "short days of winter", "cold air", "violet sky", "dusk",... The word "dark" is repeated three times in one rather long sentence: "dark muddy lanes", "dark dripping gardens" and "dark odorous stables". Notice how the "wild gardens" of previous paragraph changed into the "dark dripping gardens" where "odors arose from its ash pits". The word "ash pit" denoted a sense of uselessness and wasting away. However, there are certain references made to light, whether it's a "feeble lantern" of a street lamp or lights pouring from the "kitchen windows". This paragraph is altogether active in its tone with all the references to the games, shouts and glowing bodies.

There are two separate introduction made in this paragraph; First that of the uncle and next that of Mangan's sister; both characters of importance in the story. The boy's uncle here is the mitigated version of Eveline's father. Both characters have an authoritative role and suppressing function that makes them stand as a symbol for "England" along with its oppressive, superior role toward Ireland. Ian Almond suggests in his article "he represents another world in Joyce's story, a world juxtaposed to that of the narrator, one which does not hope and therefore doesn't suffer: a world of oblivious to life's tragic dimension." (2001: 375)

Second introduction is that of Mangan's sister who symbolizes Ireland itself. As Adam Sexton notes in the book "on Joyce's Dubliners" "the boy does not actually know Mangan's sister- she is more or less a fantasy to him" (2003: 15). The realism and objectivity of the author can be best traced in his introducing of these two characters, especially Mangan's sister. The narrator introduces her in the plain ordinary words and uses as few simple sentences as he does for the introduction of his uncle. There are no exaggerations toward either of the characters, nor his uncle nor Mangan's sister. No extra explanations or descriptions explicit feeling toward either of them is used.

Apart from what was just said, another noteworthy point in this paragraph is the shift in narration. The beginning of the story is narrated through the feelings and views points of a teenage boy who is energetic and active and this is evident in the way he narrates the sentences. But gradually, toward the end of the story, there is a change in the way he describes the scenes. The story starts with the child-like tone and with the change of his state of mind; the tone also changes, as if he is actually maturing.

Once again, in the next paragraph, the word blind is used. The narrator of the story insists on not giving any physical explanation about the girl. As if he is symbolically blind by her and cannot see her real existence. "I kept her brown figure always in my mind." There is a symbolic foreshadowing made in the next line which says "... the point at which our ways diverged..." (Dubliners: 28) Considering Mangan's sister as a symbol for Ireland, this divergence in the way could be applied to the split between a citizen and his country. The last sentence of the paragraph saying "...her name was like a summons to all my foolish blood." (Dubliners: 28) In these two examples, there is a sense of an omniscient narrator who knows everything about this relation as if long time has passed and the boy is now grown up. But even this state of mind is not constant and there are shifts in the process of narration.

The next paragraph starts with the romantic picture the boy has created of her. That is in a sense the romantic image that some poets have made out of Ireland. But it suddenly goes into the bare realism of street scenes with the "drunken men and bargaining women", "curses", "shrills" which is best conclude in the sentence "the troubles of our native land." (Dubliners: 28) And these two pictures are best symbolic paradox between an idealized Ireland as an evergreen promising country and the real face of that along with its harsh deficiencies. But, however, the boy narrator is not an intellectual contemplator of the situation in which his fellow citizens live; rather he is being soaked in his imagination and his dreams.

In a religious context, all these settings, as Attridge suggests, are a quest for "Holy Grail" in King Arthur to him. And he thinks of the ordinary people as a "throng of foes" and of himself as "Sir Lancelot". The "chalice" also symbolizes his undying love for

Mangan's sister. This shows the ultimate romantic passion that he has developed for her.

The language in the following sentences becomes so poetic that it is evidently detached from the simple teenage language with which the story started. The image of a "chalice" being safely carried, tears filling his eyes and flood, his bosom, and finally the image of him being a "harp" and "her words and gestures...fingers running upon the wires." All show a total development in the course of narration of the story. In the next paragraph, once again, there is the emphasis on death of religion in the unconscious part of the boy's mind. "The back drawing room" symbolizes the hidden or unconscious parts of a man's mind. The atmosphere is still thoroughly gloomy. The same symbolic elements used in the early paragraphs are repeated here along with the addition of "rain" that "impinge[s] upon the earth." (Dubliners: 29) The symbolic importance of this rainfall is that it is no romantic raindrop which softly touches the soft soil. The rain here symbolizes the whole bleak atmosphere of the story.

The sentence "I was thankful I could see so little" (Dubliners: 29) symbolically draws upon the true nature of the boys feeling. He is still as blind as he has been in the first paragraph. And he has this peculiar tendency to deny or at least hide his feeling. The word "Araby" is used for the first time in the story in the next paragraph. The name itself "casts an eastern enchantment over the boy". "It is an escape from the church" (Ryf, 1962: 64). It is a mixture of both Catholic Church and England and in fact an escape from both of them. As Malaganer and Kain wrote in their book "Joyce" "the romance that the name breathes is synonymous for him with the romantic dreams he harbors of his future with the girl" (1956: 78).

It might seem strange to John J. Brugaletta and Mary H. Hayden the way "Mangan's sister acts as she does while talking with the narrator" and "the nervous turning of her bracelet as she speaks betrays a lack of confidence in the young narrator's presence..." (1967: 13) to them, but what is of a higher degree of importance is the impressionistic attention that the narrator pays to each single details of her. Her physical image is more important to him than what she says. Out of the whole paragraph only about a sentence is given to what she speaks of; the rest are delicate explanation of her gesture and movements.

There is also another shift in the course of the narration where he says "her brother and two other boys were fighting for their caps and I was alone at the railings." He no more plays with his friends. It could be a sign of his maturity, or at least a development toward that. The word "railing" has its own symbolic importance in that according to the main notion of "quest" which is the main idea in the boy's unconscious, and the connotation of railing that is associated with a train's railing, it could be symbolize and support the idea of a certain object or idea; that is, the boy's journey to "Araby" and his literal journey from childhood to maturity and knowledge. As for the word "Araby",

Malaganer and Kain point out "the exotic oriental motif is deliberately employed so that it may be contrasted with the banal reality of salesgirl's flirtation interlude and bareness of the darkened suburban bazaar" (1956: 61)

Notice how the boy's aunt is frightened by the very possibility of "some Freemason [protestant] affair." It is an open criticism on the part of Joyce toward religious prejudice and absentmindedness of those people who subject themselves to such extremist acts. The whole paragraph shows a "willingness to overcome material obstacles for the joy of attaining [his] destination" (Malaganer and Kain, 1952: 79). The "raw and pitiless air" described in the next paragraph suitably stands for the harsh reality he is going to acknowledge. The indifferent manner in which the boy's uncle treats him is a symbolic example of how England reacts to the deep true demands and rights of Irish people. After that, the uncle's absence and then his ignoring presence is the cause of the boy's stress and lingering. The phrase "the high, cold, empty gloomy rooms" (*Dubliners*: 30) is at time a strong symbol and criticism of the lives that the Irish people are leading.

In the next sentence, the narrator completely detaches himself from his peers and says "I saw my companions playing below in the street." (*Dubliners*: 30) And assign to them a kind of inferiority and himself, superiority. What he sees is only a "dark house" and an imaginative "brown figure" of Mangan's sister. These two images symbolize the despairing conditions of the country (Ireland) and Her decaying and deteriorating conditions.

In the scene that follows, once again, we have the dominant and financially superior uncle, symbolizing England; it is the scene that precedes the realistic image of the city delivered by the use of phrases like "third class carriage", "ruinous houses", "crowds of people pressed to the carriage door". It is as if Joyce deliberately meant to juxtapose the two opposing images to show the adversity that Irish people deals with.

Finally he reaches his destination; Araby bazaar. But it is too late and "nearly all the stalls were closed and the greater part of the hall was in darkness." The narrator compares the darkness and silence of the bazaar to that of a "church after service". And since this bazaar was probably ordinate by the church "for some pious purposes", this darkness would symbolically stand for the "darkness of his religion" (Malaganer and Kain, 1952: 79). As Malaganer and Kain mention: In some ways, the Araby bazaar suggests the church and is its symbol. The narrator's quivering eagerness to reach it, his willingness to overcome material obstacles for the joy of attaining his destination, has religious fervor. But the worldly, the trivial, the gross awaits him at journey's end. The glowing colors with which idealists surround spiritual objects fail to appear. Again, Joyce seems to be saying, the quest for the father, for the Church, has been thwarted by reality. The bazaar turns out to be just as cold, as dark, and as man-made as the gloomy house of the dead priest on his

own street. It is almost empty, too, and only activity going on is the counting of the day's receipts. (1952:79)

The importance of the mini-drama in which the English salesgirl and her male companion are busy having a flirtatious chat lies in the revelation that it brings to the boy narrator. He finds himself faced up to a reality that is teasing; the fact that he has never had or can never have any such relation with Mangan's sister is insulting to him. As Malaganer and Kain underlie "[it] show[s] him the falsity of the entire situation in which he is involved" (1952: 79).

Symbolically speaking, the salesgirl with her English accent and her not encouraging tone resembles England's indifference toward Irish citizen (the way his uncle did). From now on the boy is absolutely aware of his useless attempt to continue what he thought of being a milestone in his life. At the end of his search for love and identity, he is lead toward darkness. At this moment "the lights are being out." This darkness symbolically represents the whole essence of his quest and his longing for a higher truth. As the boy narrator says "...the hall was now completely dark." (Dubliners: 33)

The epiphany comes at the close of the story where he says "gazing up into the darkness, I saw myself a creature driven and derided by vanity; and my eyes burned with anguish and anger." His eyes were once filled with romantic sentimental tears, but at the end of his quest, when he is faced up to reality of his existence; there are tears of anguish and fear that burn his eyes. Leonard notes "what makes such a moment a literary and stylistic masterstroke is Joyce's careful preparation for this moment..." (2003: 91) this epiphanic image symbolizes the actual vanity and meaninglessness of an Irish generation. As Sexton notes "the quest is ultimately in vain" (2003: 15). Since "the boy's quest is made on behalf of his native country" (Sexton, 2003: 15) so the vanity of this search goes to the people who are its citizens. Thus, if Mangan's sister, the boy narrator and Araby bazaar stand for Ireland, a typical Irish citizen, and church organization (or England), then this idealized (somewhat) romantic attempt of an Irishman to serve his country is hampered and stopped by the darkness of religion and superior power of England.

Strikingly similar in both theme and style to Araby, Eveline is the fourth story of "Dubliners". The point with "Eveline" is that in that story actually nothing happens. The character is inactive. She practically does nothing in the process of the story and her only action is a refusal to take an action: leaving the country. As it was mentioned in the very beginning, the story is very similar in its structure to "Araby". The pattern of symbolism, especially, is quite the same. In this story, too, there is a yellowing picture of a priest that signifies the decaying function of religion and the fact that the priest has left the country for Melbourne is an approval of the same notion. The color brown in "little brown houses" symbolizes the spoiled and wasted lives of the Irish people in that country

as it did in "Araby". And the "soldiers with brown baggage", too, brings the same image of decadence to the reader's mind.

Once again in this story, as in "Araby", we are faced with the two symbolic notions of mother and father (the character of uncle in the case of "Araby"), the former standing for Ireland and the latter, England. The character of mother, with its very short appearance in the story, only as a revived memory, creates a nostalgic feeling of the past and also an unknown fear of the future. Since Eveline is escaping a fate like that of her mother, so psychologically speaking, she identifies herself with her mother. An escape from home to whatever unknown destination would be an escape from Ireland, from her mother or in a sense from herself. That is why at the end of the story she is unable to step on her way. Practically, it is impossible to ignore one's own self and escape from it.

Character of the "father" whose presence is almost dominant from the very early paragraph of the story as well as very early stages of Eveline's life, and all the detailed financial squabbles that are associated with him, evokes an image of England in the mind of the reader. He is brutal, indifferent, authoritative and oppressive. Their relationship is that of a slave-master instead of being daughter-father one. There is still the character of Frank who is a symbol for freedom and liberty, but an idealized and unknown image of that; an image that cannot guarantee its outcome. But apart from its future possibilities, what Frank means to "Eveline" is a sense of freedom and a chance to live a happy life. As the narrator says "why should she be unhappy? She had a right to happiness" (Dubliners: 38).

Frank is an idealized symbol of a person who has broken the capturing nets of—at least- nationality, and probably religion and language as well. But the problem arises exactly from the same notion of idealizing. Reading carefully the description of Frank given by narrator would reveal to us that the mental image that Eveline has built into her mind is basically a romantic far-fetched one. And it is far from being real. As Attridge notes: What do we make of "his hair tumbled forward over a face of bronze"? (Dubliners: 36) This is no longer the way Eveline might speak, though its clichés are not characteristics of the narrator either. Perhaps we can read it as a faint echo of a story Eveline has read, and this too might set alarm bells ringing- is she interpreting her experience according to the norms of romantic fiction? (2004: 6)

Going a little further, we will see how she unconsciously compares herself to the "Bohemian Girl" and how "elated" and "unaccustomed" it sounds to her even to imagine such a different life with such romantic prospect. Frank himself is not the center of attention for her. The narrator deliberately avoids using the verb 'love' in mirroring Eveline's passion for him; rather prefers to use the verb 'like'. It shows the distance between what Eveline wants from her relationship with Frank and what Frank probably demands from her. She

is in a state of uncertainty and hesitation toward Frank. Her view of life with him is rather an exploration, an adventurous course of events rather than a comfort and solace for her future. All these explanations and analysis possess another layer of symbolic meaning which points to the present condition of Ireland (at that time era) represented by Eveline and the would be future of the country, the questions, hesitations and limitations that it might face in case it is exposed to Freedom.

However, the pattern of narratology of "Eveline" will be the main point of concentration in this second part of the essay. The narration of the story embodies the stream of consciousness method in which the reader has direct access to the mind of the main character and in a sense can read and hear her thoughts and feelings first handedly. The plot of the story is simple, straight lined. As it was mentioned earlier nothing practically happens .except for the two closing paragraphs, the rest of the story is the expression of the thoughts, dilemmas and speculations going on in Eveline's mind. The story begins with the past and remains in the past for too long a time. But there are many flashbacks and flash-forward in that part. Her mind repeatedly moves back and fro to the memories of her friends, her brothers and her mother and suddenly jumps to the future in which Frank is the only decisive element; Her past so crowded and her future so empty.

But there seem to be different narrators at one time. The short initiating paragraph of the story is so poetic that one would doubt Eveline as its narrator. "She sat at the window watching the evening invade the avenue. Her head wad leaned against the window curtain and in her nostrils was the odor of dusty cretonne. She was tired." Read in isolation, this paragraph could be a stanza in a piece of poetry. But in fact, there are parts in which the narration changes from that mature and poetic voice to a tone of ordinary every day speech; a tone that matches the content of the text. As in the fourth paragraph where she is reviewing the consequences of her decision, notice these two sentences "what would they say of her in the Stores when they found out that she had run away with a *fellow* [emphasis added]. Say she was a fool, perhaps..." (Dubliners: 35) the narrator of these sentences with their every day used language obviously is different from the narrator of the early paragraphs.

It happens no sooner than the fifth paragraph that we are told of the heroin's name. One can say with almost certitude that the narrator of this long paragraph is Eveline her self. The language, the subject matter and the overall sense created in the lines belong to her. All throughout the paragraph, she adopts a cynical outlook toward her status quo. She delivers a sad impression of her life with her father, of her attempts in meeting the ends of the family, of her financial distresses and of her heavy responsibilities as a young woman. But she suddenly finishes with a basically different image; that in spite of all the hardships in her life, she still finds it satisfactory or desirable to go on as it is.

She insists on using the verb 'would' whenever she talks about her future. This

could only be a sign of her hesitation. She is suspicious from the very beginning. This hesitation appears even in more subtle ways; in the next paragraph, the narrator starts talking about Frank. The first sentence reads as follows: "Frank was very kind, manly, open-hearted." (Dubliners: 36) Attridge correctly notes on this sentence that "[it] is not a discovery but a moment of self reassurance, belonging to the blend of pride, excitement and anxiety that comprises Eveline's complicated mental state" (2003: 6). Except for the first two lines, all over this paragraph, Frank is referred to as "he"; that is what he actually means to Eveline. It is not important to her who Frank really is, but the adventures and the new encounters in his life-things that she wishes most to experience in her own life- are what counts to her. The language of this paragraph is obviously "pleasantly confused". The manner in which she narrates all her new experiences is actually that of a young girl who is not certain about the feasibility her own feelings. The hesitation becomes more evident if we compare the present narration of the text with its alternative; "a clearly-identified narrator" as Attridge puts it: If a clearly-identified narrator commenting on Frank were to state that Buenos Ayres is where he had a home waiting for her,... we would take this as a fact, a given of the story; if a character *thinks* [emphasis added] it, however it has only as much validity as we feel we can ascribe to that thought. (2004: 5) He continues to say: ...We have to pick our way through continually shifting perspectives, relying as best we can on our sensitivity to individual words and turns of phrase. 'He was awfully fond of music': that 'awfully' could only be Eveline. The phrase 'see her home' followed immediately by 'He took her to *see*...' would be clumsy writing in novelistic prose but a natural repetition in thought or speech. (2004: 6)

As for the lines "when he sang about the lass that loves a sailor" (Dubliners: 36), Attridge believes that it is not the skillful way for an English speaker to use such sentence structure, but that is not what matters to Eveline; it doesn't matter to her whether it is a title of a song or a grammatically-based sentence; rather what is engaging her mind is the message that Frank means to convey through these lines in terms of her relation with him. The paradox suggested by the name "Frank" is significant in its own turn to the theme of the story. Ernest, her favorite brother, whose name is synonymous to that of Frank, is dead.

Could this be a deliberate choice of word on the part of the author to foreshadow what is the ultimate end of this relation? Or is he after all frank in his intentions? "Has Eveline found a rescuer or just another Dublin betrayer?" (Attridge, 2004, 5) And on a deeper level, is the freedom associated with the name of Frank supposed to be vanished, too? Considering Eveline as a symbol of Ireland, maybe Frank could, in being truly honest and frank to her, save the country with the air of freedom and fresh outlook that this liberty entails; a right and a chance at the same time, a possibility for a better future. There is no way to find the answer to this question. The evidences provided by the story are not sufficient. All what we have is Eveline's imaginations and hesitation.

In the next paragraph, we are back again to the present time for a short moment and as if automatically, the mind of the character again goes back to the old past days. Memories of her mother and all the sufferings and sacrifices that she endured come back to her. She remembers the promise she had made to her mother "to keep the home together as long as she could". Her mother is a symbol of her hometown, her country; Ireland. Eveline is a new version of her mother and that is what threatens her and puts a "sudden impulse of terror" on her; A fear from a future fate similar to that of her mother. Therefore in this paragraph, the tone of the narrator becomes more serious. There aren't any chances for the fancies of a young girl to develop in this part. The mode of the language becomes bleak and gloomy. As we approach the climax of the story, the flow of Eveline's mind also penetrates its deepest layer as to remember the exact words of her mother that says "Derevaun Seraun! Derevaun Seraun!" (Dubliners: 37). As W. Wawrzycka and G. Corcoran mention "the narrative tone changes when Eveline recalls her promise to her mother to keep the family together. It rises in pitch when the account of her mother's 'sacrifices closing in final craziness' culminates in her deathbed refrain, Derevaun Seraun" (1997: 96). In the next paragraph, although she seems so resolute and decisive, but the tenses in which she thinks, are still the same vulnerable 'would' tense; a fact that shows the degree of her uncertainty toward her 'escape' idea. The last sentence about Frank in the paragraph, with its emphatic repetitions is no more than a vain self reassurance. The remaining part of the story adopts a different set of imagery. Up to this point, there has been a static and stagnant situation. Prior to this paragraph, nothing has happened. The narrator has been sitting next to the window recalling and going through her feeling in an unconscious dialogue.

But the last part of the story, there are dynamic images used in order to show the perplexities and unrest inside of her. The colors also draw upon her mental status. At this point, the relation of the text to the reader becomes heavily mutual. There are moment of sympathy and empathy on the side of the reader with the heroine; her fervent prayers, her distress-created nausea and her cry of anguish. As in the first paragraph, this paragraph is also too poetic to be a creation of Eveline's unconscious mind. In previous sections, there was a certain honesty that compelled the reader that *this is really her*; but in this paragraph, there is this peculiar degree of exactitude replacing that honesty. Every single feelings of hers is reported in a poetic language and this goes beyond the viewpoint of Eveline who pays much of her attention on what she best likes to notice in things and people; rather on what is really noteworthy.

The impressionistic style of narration is used to show the utmost lack of concentration in Eveline's mind. "She knew he was speaking to her, saying something about the passage over and over.", "she caught a glimpse of the black mass of the boats... with illuminated potholes.", "she felt her cheek pale and cold... ." (Dubliners: 38). in a sense we are seeing and hearing and feeling with Eveline's eyes and ears and heart. There

is a sense of identification created through the use of impressionistic narratology method. The narration and the narrator have become one. They merged into each other due to the density of her feelings. Just as in Tennyson's *Eagle*, in spite of the entire dynamic and turbulent atmosphere, there is still a touch of static and stagnant mood in these lines. The narrator has left some traces of motionlessness every where: "brown baggages", "black boats", "iron railings" and "mournful whistle into the mist" (*Dubliners*: 38). They are all ideas that point to the stagnant situation in which she is trapped.

The conclusive section of the story is where the epiphany finally arrives. Although it is an exact report of her feelings, but it also seems that a meticulous observer is watching over her. In fact, it seems that her facial expression is so telling about her passiveness and helplessness that it automatically leads to such empty and absurd state of being. Accordingly, the whiteness in her face would compare her to a dead person with dead desires. The narrator suffices only to read from her face and her eyes how helpless and devastated she has become. Then it no more goes into her mind or reads her inner thoughts. Rather it stops at a very objective level.

Being two different stories at first glance, "Araby" and "Eveline" both share the same theme. "They are stories which, in essence, revolve around an imminent disappointment." (Almond, 2001: 368) The notion of paralysis, prevalent in Joyce's writing, is the domineering issue that brings all the elements to a conclusive, coherent union in the two short stories. The pattern of symbols in "Araby" is coherent, deep and literally and religiously built into the text, but they all together end in darkness. There are two phases of darkness in "Araby". As Almond point out: "The darkness with which the story begins- the winter darkness of streets where the children play, the "dark rainy evenings" when the boy avows his undying love to the image of the girl- is by no means the same darkness in which the story ends; The gloom of the empty bazaar... . On the contrary the first darkness in one of childish adventure, excitement and mystery.... (2001: 371)

The multiple narratology of "Eveline" with its flexible dialogic nature provides space for all kinds of voices to show up and demonstrates her various states of thought. The significance of the method of narratology in "Eveline" lies in the author's concentration to its form in comparison to its content. The language that the author uses is as Attridge mentions "normally excluded from literature, but function[s] here just as efficiently as the most elaborated of styles to suggest with immense precision a mind, a social milieu, a series of emotions. The pleasure is in precision; rather than what it is precise about." (2004: 6) But at the same time, it reveals and ends in certain hollowness. As Leonard notes: "Eveline, in the end, cannot leave Ireland...but to what, and to whom, is she returning? Nothing more or less than: an increasingly violent alcoholic father..., and a thankless exhausting job... ." (2004: 94). Eveline's paralysis and passiveness is fully demonstrated

in the story's narratology "because Eveline's mind is active chiefly when it paraphrases or responds to other people's thoughts" (W. Wawrzycka and G. Corcoran, 1997: 95). The two writers continue to say: Eveline's mind passes quickly through the three stages, woman not understanding man, child not obeying adult and passive animal not comprehending anything. Frank's male conversation about the voyage is unintelligible; as a woman, she is conflicted by terror; like a child, she is unable to decide for herself, and, finally, like a trapped animal, she gives no sign of human recognition or understanding. Her descent is swift, unexpected and overwhelming. (W. Wawrzycka and G. Corcoran, 1997: 96)

However different in personal backgrounds and reasons, the earlier mentioned 'hollowness' of "Eveline" corresponds in essence to the 'darkness' and 'emptiness' of "Araby" and that is what brings us back to the notion of paralysis. What is meant mainly by the author to his readers is that "people stay where they are in Dublin not because they discover the wisdom of doing so, but because they are trapped" (Leonard, 2004: 94). As it is exactly the case with "Eveline's" final scene in which "Eveline's response to Frank's departure is much more than a decision to sacrifice herself and honor her vow; It is the aversion reaction of one who is habituated to abuse" (W. Wawrzycka and G. Corcoran, 1997: 96-7). Both the male and the female protagonists of "Araby" and "Eveline" are typical examples of a captive Dubliner and their predicament as Attridge suggests "is understood as a version of a more general problem afflicting Dubliners of a certain class and this may reduce any tendency to pass judgment on her [/him] as an individual" (2004: 8).

References

- Almond, Ian. 2001. Chekhovian overtones in Early Joyce: Some Brief Remarks On "Araby" and "The Kiss". *Orbis litterarum* 51, 368-375.
- Attridge, Derek, Leonard, Garry. 2004. "Reading Joyce.", "Dubliners." *The Cambridge Companion to James Joyce*. Ed. Derek Attridge. New York, Cambridge University Press.
- Brugaletta, John. J., Hayden, Mary. H. 1978. The Motivation for Anguish in Joyce's "Araby". *Studies in Short Fiction* 15.
- Ehrich, Heyward. 1997. "Socialism, Gender, and Imagery in Dubliners." *Gender in Joyce*. Ed. Jolanta W. Wawrzycka and Marlena G. Corcoran. Gainesville, University Press of Florida. 89-96.
- Goldman, Arnold. 1968. "Dubliners." *James Joyce*. London, Routledge and Kegan Paul LTD.
- Magalaner, Marvin. and Kain, Richard M. 1956. "Dubliners." *Joyce*. New York, New York University Press.
- Ryf, Robert S. 1966. "The Portrat and Dubliners." *A New Approach To Joyce*. Berkeley and Los Angeles, University of California Press.
- Sexton, Adam. 2003. *Dubliners*. New York, Wiley Publishing.

LIGHT ! CAMERA! EDUCATION: THE USE OF CINEMA TO ENHANCE EDUCATION AND LEARNING

Alice Manuela Martins Guimares*

Abstract

In our time film making is regarded as a powerful teaching tool. Jean Mitry and Alain Bergala, amongst other filmmakers and writers associated with cinema, advocate that filmmaking is not just an art or a way to express culture, but it's also a way of acquiring knowledge. Bearing these thoughts in mind, we intend in this paper, to point out how learning and education come together in Willy Russell's film, *Educating Rita*. This film is based on the social constructivist notion advocated by Piaget (1896-1980) and Vygotsky (1896-1934), in which the determining factors for cognitive development interact with the physical and social environment, with human symbolism and with social interactions. *Educating Rita* refers to the social, historical and cultural context of the United Kingdom during the 70's, and conveys how the educational process turns out to be a social practice. In this film the student is given a primary role, namely he is responsible for his own learning and proves he can find ways to achieve his goals and being responsible for the consequences of his choices, in a process of experiencing, reflecting and transforming himself through and educational experience he undergoes in adult. In addition to the importance of social context in education, the film focuses on the affective and educational issues and calls up a reflection on the affective dimension during the teaching-learning process.

Keywords: Cinema; Media; Learning and Education.

Today we live an unprecedented audio visual culture, where images exert the role of mediator between subject and culture. Most of young people form their intelligibility of the world from images. Actually nowadays, children and adolescents deal much easier with imagery language than with writing. Thus in the current context of technological innovations produced by the revolution of computerization and the spread of audiovisual media, digital and electronic teaching materials have gained new dimensions in its form, in its content and in its use. In this regard, Mitry stated (2000) "it is our belief that cinema is not just an art, a culture, but a means to knowledge, i.e., not just a technique for disseminating facts but one capable of opening thought onto new horizons."

The inclusion of media instruments in different levels of education during the second half of the 20th century, was a necessary measure and tailored to students' cultural characteristics of modern society where the global communicative phenomenon took a huge social, cultural and educational relevance. In this context, cinema becomes a powerful teaching tool since it is a form of narrative that brings together a visual and auditory language whose connection provides a simultaneous dialogic and polyphonic

*Corresponding author: Alice Manuela Martins Guimares, Humanities Department, Open University, Portugal; e-mail: aligui2@hotmail.com

language. The spectator gets vocal inflections, facial expressions and sounds which contribute to enhance the narration of the story. The film provides us living details of settings and locations that we may never have experienced before and it shows us all this in few minutes. Therefore the use of cinema as a vehicle and tool for teaching and learning promotes the approach of cultural, historical, political and literary aspects, providing its integral vision as an educational media. Any film portrays the thought and the human creation of a specific social model and of a specific historical moment, therefore it educates who assists, giving rise to a reflection and a subjective impression on the world.

Several filmmakers and writers associated with film research have developed opinions about cinema advocating that filmmaking is not just an art or a way to express culture, but it's also a way of acquiring knowledge. In this context, they defend the insertion of cinematic art in the school space as a pedagogical practice. Among these stands Alain Bergala who defines cinema as creation of knowledge and not just as pure consumption oriented to a bare entertainment. One of his the main contributions in his work *The hypothesis – cinema* (2006), is the idea that this art is an encounter with alterity. Another great supporter of a partnership between pedagogy and cinema is Henry A. Giroux. According to Giroux, the popular movies are nothing but a “form of public pedagogy – a visual technology that works as a powerful teaching machine” (Giroux, 2002:6). He also stated that

(...) it is a view that seems particularly out of date, if not irrelevant, given the important role that popular culture, including film, now plays pedagogically and politically in shaping the identities, values and broader social practices that characterize an increasingly postmodern culture in which the electronic media and visual forms constitute the most powerful educational tools of the new millennium (p. 6).

For Giroux, the film exerts an important influence on the public's imagination, since it produces ideologies and shapes individual and national identities. Giroux, in its combination of narratives, metaphors and images from popular culture, focus on the use of movies, supporting their arguments in the use of film as “pedagogical text.”

The Italian researcher Pier Cesare Rivoltella, also adds that, once the cinema sets itself up as crossing of several socio-cultural practices, it becomes an “agent of socialization” that allows several and different meetings, such as: people with people into the cinema room; people with themselves; persons with the narratives of the movies; people with cultures within the various movie depictions; persons with multiple imaginaries, etc. (Rivoltella, 2008: 75). This “socialization agent” includes grown up population, in the context of lifelong learning.

Jean Mitry corroborates that “cinema is not just an art, a culture, but a means

to acquire knowledge, i.e., it is not just a technique for the dissemination of facts, but a technique able to broaden the thinking towards new horizons.” It is precisely through this technique of expanding knowledge and broadening our critical thinking that we can inscribe Willy Russell’s film *Educating Rita*.

In 1980, the play of the same name, originally written to be represented in the theatre, had won the Laurence Olivier Award for the best comedy. Three years after the debut in 1983, the text of Russell would be adapted for cinema. Willy Russell, author of the screenplay, highlights the importance of the social context in education, conveying the social constructivist perspective of learning as advocated by Piaget (1896-1980) and Vygotsky (1896-1934).

This theoretical current emphasizes that the development of human intelligence is determined by mutual actions between the individual and the environment. It also suggests that the student is part of a social group and must have initiative to question, to discover and to understand the world from the interactions with the other elements of the historical context he belongs to. The main goal of a teacher is to encourage social interaction, stimulating the exchange of information in the pursuit of a collective and shared knowledge construction.

In the socio-constructivist perspective, the individual responds to external *stimuli* acting on them to build and organize his own knowledge. The student builds his knowledge, acting, running, building it from his social environment and from his relationship with the teacher(s). In such a relationship (between student/teacher) both of them are able to learn. It is this socio-constructivist approach that pervades Rita’s learning and evolution in Russell’s film *Educating Rita*. In this film, Rita, the main character, builds her knowledge as an adult student. Here the focus is given to the student who is responsible for her own learning and is able to find the paths to realize her potential, becoming responsible for the consequences of her choices, in a process of experiencing, reflecting and transforming herself. The film celebrates the potential freedom of education, as a force that allows people to open the doors of reality and of the vitality, of the working class to rise socially. At the same time, as does the main character, it is as a vehicle to discover herself, evolve intellectually and learn to make her own decisions.

Michael Caine starred as Frank, the tutor of Rita. Julie Walters starred as Rita (or Susan, her real name) and she is a restless student, hairdresser by profession, a married woman with no children, whose dreams were to break free from her social environment, become educated in order to find herself in life and have the freedom to make her own choices. Rita also dreamed of becoming a refined person.

For this purpose, she renounced to her origins and adopted a different name (Rita

in honor to Rita Mae Brown). This change, displays the enormous admiration that Rita had for the author of the book she was reading at the moment. Rita Mae Brown, the famous American writer, was a feminist activist, a great and a tireless fighter for the civil rights, who took part of the movement against the Vietnam War during the 1960s. The choice of this name shows Rita's dream of becoming an educated woman traveling the same path as the writer.

In its multi-faceted features *Educating Rita* addresses the difficult social issues of traditional beliefs about gender, class system and education. In this context, it reflects some of the epistemological issues of education, such as: who is the real agent in the educational process; the student's autonomy; the relationship between student and teacher; the reproduction of social practices and the voices of the participants involved in the learning process. Another relevant issue is the importance of critical thinking and of self-respect as gateways to self-esteem and social acceptance.

Although *Educating Rita* is a fiction, it no longer provides us an authentic illustration of the English society of the 1970s. Nevertheless, the film has a gorgeous delicacy, dealing with the physical and spiritual desolation of Dr. Frank Bryant, the College Professor and with the vividness and intellectual curiosity of his student who made him rise out of a deeply decay and face the change as well.

The plot revolves around the relationship developed between Rita and Frank, the middle-aged college professor, during the school term, at the Open University. The action took place at Liverpool where Rita, dissatisfied with her working routine and social life, enrolled in the course of English Literature, searching for her inner growth. In this process, teacher and student developed an immediate understanding and the difference between their different worlds stimulated interest and mutual curiosity. Frank was a self-destructive teacher, a person who seemed to be unable to maintain relationships and whose frustrations in life were shown through his profound drunkenness and incapacity to write the poetry he would like to produce.

Nevertheless he was an experienced teacher, smart and so unconventional that Rita immediately found out a similarity with her irrepressible desire to study. Thus she didn't hesitate when, at the beginning of the film Frank suggested her to get another tutor. In fact, initially, the teacher did not accept to be her tutor, but soon he would become rendered to her insistence, determination, purity and sincerity.

These features were something that Frank wasn't being able to find anymore, even in his personal and professional life. Everything about Rita was genuine, beginning with her pronunciation that informed her social origin, her typical accent from Liverpool, the use of slang in her speech, her personal outpourings, her dreams, the naive way of writing and telling what she was thinking about, etc.

Her only trick was the nickname she used but that she explained naively. Susan, as it was her real Christian name, intended to become a counterpart of Rita Mae Brown. Suddenly the school started and sometimes Frank proved to be a much better teacher than he had ever thought. Rita's unassuming enthusiasm and honesty impressed him, making him (re-) examine his attitudes and positions in life. This enthusiasm of Rita would revitalize his numbed passion for teaching. On the other hand, the lessons with Frank opened Rita a new horizon, and she gradually acquired more self-esteem and self-confidence.

Socially, Rita represents the lower class – the mass - which culture influences society's operations. As a working-class woman, she was socially and sexually confined. Social origins limited her choice to work, as well as all the other things in life – friends, relationships, romance, language, etc. In addition, her biological gender subdued her to her husband's domination, whose social backgrounds required him a masculinity that resulted in occasional domestic violence.

Actually the first time her husband (Denny) was presented on screen, he was demolishing the house while Rita was trying to write an essay, unsuccessfully. These details can suggest his husband's objection to study as well as a somehow sexist domination that was prone to physical violence. This violence was confirmed when he burned Rita's book. Nevertheless, Rita refused to accept these limitations imposed by birth and education. She rebelled against the conventionality of her class and broke up with it. Instead of having babies and settling down, as the traditionalist behavior of her class required, she decided to get an education so that she could have the opportunity to discover herself, to grow inward, to "sing a better song" as she put it in the film.

So, she learnt to dress up and talk with the accurate pronunciation and proper language, she gave up using slang, she learnt not to speak everything she thought but to think before to speak. This was something that reminds us Eliza Doolittle, the main character of George Bernard Shaw's *Pygmalion*. Rita realized that certain members of society had to "act", to be in tune with their lifestyles. We realize Rita's transformation when she felt the need to dress up to go to Frank's house at his invitation, and felt absolutely intimidated when she looked inside and listened to educated people talking in the lobby. She told Frank that she hadn't been brave enough to come in because she wouldn't know what to speak. However, Frank just answered her: "Nobody asked you to play a role! I only wished to have you there, just the way you are."

In which concerns socio cultural contrast, the film confronts: on the one hand, the pleasures of Frank and his friends Brian, his girlfriend Julia, and Trish, Rita's roommate – as representatives of literature. Their academic formalities mask their social pretensions. On the other hand, Rita's natural liveliness dominates the representation of lower social

class. We need to point out her joy, enthusiasm and determination as opposed to the academic class that seduced Rita so much. Frank's contempt for the academic world is displayed through the bottles of whisky hidden behind the endless rows of literary books in his office – a place that scared Rita on her first visit.

To highlight these social contrasts, Russell uses both the Liverpool accent, used by Rita and her husband and the accent of London, used by Frank and his friends. Once Rita comes from the working class she uses heavy accent and colloquial speech continuously. In this film, Willy Russell explicitly wants to criticize the social representation that makes each individual, an actor on the stage of life. Here, people learn how to behave according to their social class, they also learn what to wear and what to buy (Rita: dresses, Frank: books) Everything seems to be written into the script of their social lives as if every individual had pre-written functions, dialogues, costumes and actions that are expected to be followed to keep on this performance until a possible resolution may be reached.

Rita and Frank descriptions are convincingly realistic and are portrayed subtly in such an idiosyncratic way. Russell emphasizes their psychological depth, imbuing them with peculiar features which are neither transparent nor predictable. The two characters remained complex and multifaceted along the plot. Rita is impetuous but very sensitive. Frank is tired of teaching and is cynical but sometimes is sincere and sentimental. He is disillusioned with his job because he sees students as mere apprentices of all what had already been proven, not possessing an original thought. He's also an alcoholic who, among other factors, causes problems in his relationship with Julia, the woman with whom he lived with and in his professional life as well.

Rita belongs to the working class and feels ashamed of her roots. In her own words, "the only way to improve her home is through bombing." She had to go through an arduous process of education, to achieve her goal, which was to be able to display the intelligent discourse of scholars and the culture and elegance of the upper classes. All she wanted was to escape the life of her trivial family, neighbors and colleagues. Once her husband disapproved her decision to acquire other options in life radically, he burned Rita's books when he discovered that she was taking contraceptives. Rita's determination in pursuing her studies would cost her marriage because Denny decided to leave her.

As Rita became more and more educated she also increased her confidence and Frank, ironically, felt increasingly insecure. When she acquired "other teachers", for example, her summer school tutors or Trish, her roommate, Frank felt shaken because Rita's devotion was divided by other educators. He then found out escape in the usual bottles of whiskey and one day, after a discussion with his colleagues in University, he decided to go away to Australia. Rita was improving academically; however, she would naturally lose her naturalness and spontaneity.

She learnt and adopted the necessary things that allowed her to “talk about things that really matter” — things than a cynic, even if a realistic one as Frank, would disdain. Frank witnessed Rita’s transformation with a sad repudiation. In the process of educating herself, she lost the exclusivity that Frank more admired - her genuineness. And, at the end, when Frank asked her to go to Australia with him, suggesting a fresh start for both, she was evasive about starting a new life with him. Now she is polite so, as she put it, she had already the ability to choose and decide: “I might go to France. I might go to my mother’s. I might even have a baby. I dunno. I’ll make a decision, I’ll chose. I dunno”(Russell, 1998:72-73) Throughout her learning process as an adult, Rita received guidance on literary theories and conventional critical thinking. She learnt to question and address literature objectively and critically. The ability to discuss and to argue gives her a broader view about her options in life and provides her what she had set out seeking - life choices.

This film explores much more than the simple matter of education. Relations between student-teacher and the common sharing of experiences and learning, which are assumptions from the socio-constructivist approach of education, are some of the matters the film informs. In fact, we realized the way Rita and Frank could influence each other. The relationship between Rita and Frank calls up towards, not only the mutual friendship, but also towards the mutual intellectual support. Frank learns much about Rita, as she learns from him.

While Rita gains self-confidence, through the awareness that her options are no longer limited, Frank gets his self-esteem back through the respect that Rita had for him. The teacher finally learnt to respect and to believe in himself. Furthermore, he learnt to respect his students when he realized that each ability to learn is unlimited, and that not all students were so terrible as he had thought. To sum up, *Educating Rita* explores the multiple issues relating to choices, relationships, social classes and education.

The main character of the film is an excellent example of a working-class citizen of the 70s society in the United Kingdom, living in a city with a huge level of unemployment and trying to make her choices in life through education. Rita figured out that only education would help her to raise socially and to have a better quality of life. She then tried to meet herself through Education. In the multitude of possible discussions due to the richness of Russell’s screenplay, this essay has chosen to explore the idea of liberal education designed by divergent views and the way in which this type of education can fulfill dreams and ensure changes in people’s lives. In addition, it focuses on the relationships of affectivity and complementarily between student and teacher which foster the evolution of each person and raise change. Maybe the specific topic of change is the one that most calls together both the student’s character within the plot, as the viewer, inside the cinema. In general the film *Educating Rita*, stresses the importance of critical

thinking and self-respect as gateways to self-esteem and social acceptance. The film displays how the way educational process turns out to be a social practice and how cinema and education can come together in the teaching process.

References:

- Bergala, Alain. 2006. *L'hypothèse - cinéma: petit traité de transmission du cinéma à l'école et ailleurs*. [*A hipótese-cinema: pequeno tratado de transmissão do cinema dentro e fora da escola*. Tradução: Mónica Costa Netto, Silvia Pimenta, Rio de Janeiro: Booklink; CINEAD-LISE/FE/UFRJ, 2008].
- Giroux, Henry, A. 2002. *Breaking In to the Movies: Film and the Culture of Politics*, Basil Blackwell Press, Oxford, UK.
- Mitry, Jean. 2000. *Semiotics and the Analysis of Film*, The Athlon Press, UK.
- Rivoltella, Pier Cesare. 2008. *A Formação da Consciência Civil entre o "real" e o "virtual"*, in: Girardello, Gilka e Fantin, Mónica, *Liga, roda, clica: Estudos em mídia, infância e cultura*, Campinas, Papirus.
- Russell, Willy. 1998. *Educating Rita* (film), Singapore: Longman Group Ltd.

THE GOOD, THE BAD, AND THE UGLY IN BOSNIAN CINEMA

Lejla Panjeta*

Abstract

The artistic attempt to convey the reality or the author's vision of the reality can be reduced to the simple communication process between the creator of the strategic artistic idea or message aimed at emotions of the recipient. Manipulation with the impact of the art work results in the stereotyped values on the matter presented in the art work. Such impact is vividly evident in the motion pictures. Ever since the beginning of the film exemplary influences of the film on its audience are enormous. It is the inherent feature of film to be convincing, because if it is not, the audience does not believe the interpreted reality or identify with the story, and thus the communication process is not working properly. Why are we watching movies? We do understand that the material before our eyes is not reality, but, nevertheless if it does not follow its own principles of reality that creates within, we do not believe in it. As communication in the art of film is based on the stories, and stories need heroes and enemies, the different parties in the war reality play roles in the film reality. In this reality the perception of what happened in one period of history is represented and interpreted in the movies. This perception depends on authors believes but also political adequacy at the time, place and origin of the finances for the moviemaking. The features of cinematography and storytelling, subjugated to the stereotypes along with the propaganda possibilities and impacts of film contents and contexts in reference to the war and after war reality are the main focuses of this essay.

Keywords: Film; Propaganda; Art Reality; Stereotypes; War; Good and Bad; Enemy and Savior

Introduction

The attempts to convey the reality or the author's vision of the reality can be reduced to the simple communication process between the creator of the strategic artistic idea or message aimed at emotions of the recipient. When looking at the simple Jacobson's (1966) explanation of communication process, one finds that it can be reduced to the simple equation consisting of sender, receiver and the message. The creator or sender of the message puts the information aimed at the receiver's or customer's response. This action produces the message that is received and perceived by the receiver based on his or hers cultural and social background and in doing so produces the reaction of the receiver. This reaction can be considered as immediate feedback to the sender, but also as a delayed outcome of the perceived information resulting in the receiver's beliefs, stands, emotions, behaviour, etc. This simplification of the human communication indicates that it can be of persuasive nature, because in any information that is put into the action by the receiver,

*Corresponding author: Lejla Panjeta, International University of Sarajevo, Bosnia and Herzegovina;
e-mail: lpanjeta@ius.edu.ba

there is some kind of goal, purpose, hidden agenda or strategy. Whether it's a simple statement that the weather today is bleak or the enchanted advertisement for the new Chevrolet, the sender of the message is sending his or hers own perception of the world towards the receiver and waiting for the response, that can, but does not always have to, qualify as the desired and strategically formed outcome. The impact that the message produces can be anticipated and premeditated by the creator of the communication process. The accuracy in achieving the goals in this persuasive communication is measured by propaganda experts, marketing tools, media and advertisement industry criteria. The sophisticated methods for the manipulation of the receiver's responses are within the realm of propaganda techniques, but we cannot neglect the basic principles of communication that can be of persuasive nature even if it is not conducted by propaganda experts.

The communication principles including sender, receiver and the message are applicable to the art communication and perception of the art work. One of the arts that contain the visual and kinaesthetic qualities that can penetrate psychologically into the receiver's mind is film. Some of the first theories in film at the beginning of the last century were based on psychological research. Psychologists were the first to recognize this fair attraction as something resembling the processes in which the human brain operates, which consists of the insight or replica of non-linear, visual, three-dimension nature of human thoughts.

Psychologist, Hugo Munsterberg, early film theoretic, indicated that film is closer to the mental processes of the individual than any other art (Butler, 2008, p. 14). As in all other human communication processes, here we encounter the Jacobson's principles. The sender or creator is the director of the film, receiver is the audience, and the message is the film itself, consisting of the artistic expression on the given subject it represents or the artistic message. It is evident that the message that is psychologically attuned with our mind has more power on the receiver and can produce greater impact, in co-ordinance with the desired goals of the creator of the film.

Simplifying some phenomenon or notions, for better understanding them and communicating easier in the same context, is what people do in everyday life communication. But, making these contexts become a value is the sure path to creation of the stereotyped versions of reality. According to Nichols (2010) an "ideology describes the lens through which individuals see and understand how they fit into the social world around them" (p. 287). Manipulation with these lenses can form stereotyped values on the matter presented in the art work. The impact it can have is vividly evident in the motion pictures. It can be in a form of bluntly selling the product or an idea (usually political) for the strategic purposes of the sender, but it can also be an indirect propaganda, where the real goal of the sender is not evident (maybe even unconscious for the sender) within the context of the narrative of the film, but can be perceived as general if somewhat elusive

idea (or ideology). Nevertheless, its very existence is possible by the fact that the creator comes from a formed background of ideas and certain cultural context.

The Possibilities of Film Influence in Reality

Ever since the beginnings of the film, influences of the celluloid narratives on its audience are registered and this new medium, at first considered nothing more than an entertainment tool, showed that the slights of hand can have considerable convincing power. After seeing, what's considered to be the first film, brother Lumière's *The Arrival of the Train at La Ciotat* in 1895 people jumped out of their seats believing that the train will enter the screening room when approaching in the close up shot to the camera. Broadcasting of the H. G. Wells's interpretation of *The War of the Worlds* in 1938 by Orson Wells, making people believe that the actual aliens are invading earth, caused mass hysteria in USA.

Internal Revenue Service noted the increased tax payments in 1943, after the mass distribution of the cartoon by Walt Disney, in which the famous children's character Donald Duck is portrayed as the conscious citizen and diligent tax payer. The summer film season in 1975 was marked by the box office success of *Jaws*, the film that is to be taken as one of the first blockbusters. The horror story of the giant shark attacking and killing swimmers and tourists at random in the quiet Amity Island, caused the same devastating effect in the real world of tourism. The summer season was nearly destroyed, because people were afraid to swim in the ocean. The vividly real and palpable fear of the giant aquatic monster was masterly directed by Steven Spielberg, and to this day has gone through so many sequels and different interpretations such as the latest *Piranha 3D* movie in 2010 (Panjeta, 2006, p. 278).

Brazilian newspaper headlines in December of 1992, covering the story of the murder of Daniela Perez revealed the shocking truth about the psychological process of actors' identification. The partner of this young actress brutally murdered her in real life, after staging and shooting a scene in the soap opera *De Corpo e Alma* produced by TV Globo. In the said love scene the character played by Daniela Perez states that she does not love her partner anymore. After the murder in real life, the actor surrendered himself claiming that he confused the reality and the fiction he was playing in. The production company was later announced to be the accomplice in this brutal act (Valenti, 1995).

Even in the prehistory of feature movies as artistic expression, but also as an entertainment industry, the extraordinary impact that film has on its users was registered. Becoming aware that there is a possibility to manipulate with these effects the censorship boards that control the content shown in the film are created even at the very early stage of film development. In 1917, the Government of the United States formed the Creel Committee, the authority that was entrusted to make the influence upon the public opinion on the American engagement in the First World War. One of the important media,

through which the Government infiltrated its messages, was feature movies. On the other continents as well as other historical and social poles, the similar thing happened with the birth of this new form of expression as soon as its massive influence as the new form of mass media with unique audio-visual language was discovered.

It is no secret that Goebbels and Stalin were sitting in the editing rooms along with the filmmakers whose work is today considered anthological and films classical. Leni von Riefenstahl work in propaganda documentaries and the father of the editing techniques, Sergei Eisenstein were closely connected to the men in power (Gregor, Patalas, 1998, p. 103 and Bergan, 2006, p. 291). At the Oscar Winner Award for 2013 there were the greetings from the White House for a film about USA-Iranian relations, praising America's freedom of speech, democracy and individualism, opposed to social and cultural values of Iran, and considering the current state of diplomatic and political relations between Iran and the United States, shows that the seemingly liberally organized film productions have relationships with their superior political and state apparatus. The film is now as it was since its beginnings used intentionally or unintentionally for propaganda purposes.

One of the inherent features of film, the psychological phenomenon of identification, can also be used as an asset in spreading premeditative messages. If considered from the semiotics point of view, the indexical quality of film image gives the fictional worlds the quality of real. The relationship between the image and what it represents is faithful and in the realm of reality, because of the mimetic embodiment characteristic for all the performing arts. The accuracy of the image with its referent in the real world is the characteristic of film language and kinaesthetic storytelling. The identification with this world for the recipients of the film as the message itself is just the result of this semiotic quality.

The above stated impacts that movies can have on the spectatorship are not always premeditated. These are rampant evidences and extreme examples of the influence the film can have and the consequences of the impact it conveys through the idea of the author (creator of the communication process) and the artistic message. It is an inherent feature of film to be convincing, because if it is not, the audience does not believe the interpreted reality or identify with the story, and thus the communication process is not working properly. Truthfulness and verisimilitude are the immanent features of narrative in film language. Riccioto Canudo's manifest *The Birth of the Sixth Art* from 1911 for the first time argued and proclaimed cinema as the new art and the synthesis of the five ancient arts: architecture, sculpture, painting, music, and poetry (Stojanović, 1978, pp. 51-53). Plato's mimetic art quality was immediately recognized among early film theorists.

Realism as the main style was implemented immediately in this new art. The main feature of realism is to present the world as the real one, in which all the narrative

elements (plot, situation, characters, conflicts, locations, etc.) stand on their own within the organized structure of the story conducted by that own world's rules. According to Nichols (2010) "realism as a self-effacing form of storytelling draws on the general tendency in much art to hide the process of its own making in favour of the impression that the world it represents exists on its own, autonomously" (p. 177).

Film Reality and Interpretation

Even latter stylistic features in film, such as modernism and postmodernism, are relating to one simple quality of film: it has to be real to be convincing. The pioneer in documentary Dziga Vertov experimented with the leftovers film stock in the editing room, making the new document of the already documented reality on the film reel. For him, the camera and editing are equal in the process of filmmaking and by reformulation of the reality; a new, more perfect reality is born, seen through the cinematic, as well as human lenses of the creator of the film. His famous statement: "Life caught unawares" refers to the ability of film to be perfect as opposed to the imperfections of human eyesight (Cook, 2007, pp. 203-207). This cinema-eye perfection enables the creator to reinvent the perfect reality (or a new one) according to his own ideas and the messages that he wants the audience to be focused on. Nevertheless, everything in this process of cutting and editing reality depends on the point of view of the author. Whether it's the fantasy world or the documentary, both of these genres are in the domain of mimetic and realistic qualities. The audience easily identifies with the reality on the screen. This reality can transfer the real reality, as the photograph does. The birth of cinema is characterized by this kind of mimesis.

Documentation of the train arrival to the station by brothers Lumière is copy pasting the real life. On the other hand *A Trip to the Moon* from 1902 makes its own reality. This first fantasy film, by George Méliès, draws the viewers into the fantasy travel to the space, but nonetheless very much real within its own made up narrative elements rules. This discrepancy between fantasy and realism is evident at the beginning of film, but also accurate and applicable today within the complex genre system of film storytelling. Both opposing styles have possibilities to be suggestive and persuasive, because both are real and we believe in them.

The story of President Abraham Lincoln can be told in a realistic manner as was done by Steven Spielberg in an Oscar awarded film *Lincoln* from 2012. In the same year *Abraham Lincoln: Vampire Hunter* a fantasy horror vampire movie was released, directed by Timur Bekmambetov and based on the novel by Seth Grahame-Smith. Both are indexical presentations of reality and mimetically interpret the made-up world of fiction based on the true events in history. One is a drama, and the other a vampire action. In both films we entrust our belief that the reality represented on screen is worth trusting and following. No other art has this trust issue with its recipients. For literature one does not need to trust, but imagine. When reading fiction or poetry imagination is the most important factor in the

communication process. For paintings and fine art, aesthetic components of admiration, not trust in the given reality, is what is important. For music, emotions and catharsis, but not trust, are the most inherent features of the artist – consumer process.

Through the specific performing, visual, audio, kinaesthetic, light, framing elements, this film language enables the indexing of one reality chosen by the creator of the media content that is the fixed image of the real; space taken in one moment of time with the narrative or plot filling the framed reality whose important feature is identification. Persuasive quality of this media can be found in the basic elements of its language, or code in which the message is transferred to the recipient. When we think that someone is a lousy actor, or that the film story is unconvincing, it is the viewers' trust that was betrayed in the communication with the filmic interpretation of the given reality.

Film is, therefore, mimetic interpretation of the creator's vision and presentation of some given reality. The story of Snow White is worldwide spread and known, and it can be interpreted like Disney's 1937 animation or 2012 gothic horror version of *Snow White and the Huntsmen*. But, in both versions the good guys and the bad guys are the same: wicked evil stepmother is the antagonist (the bad guy), and the beautiful, innocent Snow White is the protagonist (the good guy). Everything else can be interpreted according to the author's vision. War is similar to fairy tales. It is a story of two different sides; good and bad. How to portray the war in the fiction, and stay true to the reality of good and bad, as well as the victims and aggressors point of view? There be both in the real life, but is there room for both interpretations on one screen? If so, how is then possible to transfer such reality on screen without taking sides and producing further conflict. Is it possible for film to not use the above described persuasive techniques (intentionally or not) and stay true to reality? Which or whose interpretation of reality?

What if or when the reality is no longer to be trusted? What happens when the mainstream, official government or even oral history has lost its credibility? The media infiltrated messages of hate, that produced the conflict in the first place, are information covered in lies, aimed at the mass audience with the goal of making devastating war to be the final outcome of this propaganda communication. This communication coded in film language of close-up persuasiveness, depends on the audio-visual language of news, first invented on the silver screen as the film language. It uses identification as the tool for persuasive communication outcomes. If film can be used for purposes of creating bad in the real world, can it be also a tool for happy ending in reality? Bearing in mind the film persuasiveness; can film depict or reinvent the reality, for the benefits of future reconciliation of the sides in conflict?

The Origins of Bosnian Cinematic Sentiment

The cinema crisis today can be argued in two different opposing discourses. One is

mostly philosophical and the other of an entertainment origins. European film today is engaged elite cinema questioning the ordinary middle class people and styles of lives. It is somewhat a moral debating of present time and social connotations. Hollywood movies, on the other hand, are based on the traditional realistic and/or postmodern narratives wrapped in the often persuasive roller coaster spectacle of visual enchantment. Bosnian films, being of European origin, tend to incline to the more philosophical rather than entertainment styles. Although, one can argue that the majority of Bosnian after war films has humorous (black-humour) and absurdity note on the subject of national conflict and war. The absurdity of Bosnian war is very explicitly given in the last shoot of Oscar awarded feature film *No Man's Land* from 2001. A man is left on the ticking bomb by everyone (soldiers in conflict, journalists, European Community, United Nations official, etc.), after what's been rifling and an oral squabble of why and how the war started.

For Bosnia, the filmmakers stand as her best representatives, having gained international recognition in the film festivals around the globe and international audience interest.

According to Goulding (2002)

before the breakup of Yugoslavia, Sarajevo, the capital of Bosnia-Herzegovina, was a small but vital and lively centre of film production and film culture. In the late 1950s, the Sarajevo group of documentary filmmakers associated with Bosna film established a well-deserved domestic and international reputation for stylistic inventiveness and political boldness (p. 228).

The Bosnian cinema is not to be considered outside of Yugoslavian cinema, because its growth was directly related to the other republics in Ex-Yugoslavia and the same cinematic identity of realism is inherent for the films made from 1960s to the 1990s. Modern Bosnian films are not selling illusions but reality. Every since the beginnings of Bosnian film in the Yugoslavian Cinema in the 1960-s, the narratives represented in films depicted plots and life problems of the ordinary people lives and middle classes. As Goulding (2002) has stated “as in past periods, feature films (as well as short films, documentary films, and animated films) continue to be made that offer stylistically varied, non-genre-driven narratives and critical visions of an often tragic past and a complex, unpredictable, and volatile present” (p. 232).

Bosnian bleak reality is often so represented in the Yugoslavian cinema. The tradition of tragic stories in postmodern times, where tragedy is everyday life Bosnian war and after war experience continues in the modern Bosnian film. Having deficient public and government support for the movie production, Bosnian films (made by Bosnian authors and taking place in Bosnia) are often coproduced by European funds and state funds from the neighbouring countries Croatia, Serbia and Slovenia. Having the multicultural,

multi religious filmmakers, authors, producers and film crews working together on the film reality of war and after war reality, what would be the propaganda mechanisms for imposing the author's version of the war? Where to look for the suggested ideology and opinions of the author behind the film reality?

Representation of the reality that film is offering consists of the plot (usually conflict) based on the actions and motivations of the characters. The cultural background of the character can be presented (manipulated) in the behaviour, the lines and actions, and costume. The point of view of the camera (position of the camera), framing and editing within the constrictions of the genre or pure author style is imposing a certain idea on the reality represented in the movie. Looking at these parameters is it possible to determine how is the Bosnian reality propagated in the film?

Purgatory in Bosnian Film Realism

Film narrative originates from performing arts and literature. Drama and action between the characters is the essential narrative tool, and it cannot exist without a conflict. No one wants to see happy people being happy. A good story consists of the plot that indicates a conflict between the good guy and the bad guy. Using appropriate professional terminology, the story is based on the opposing interests of the protagonist and the antagonist. Propaganda of protagonist is the anti propaganda of the antagonist. The protagonist's existence is conditioned by the antagonist. In other words, if there is no one to fight with, and nothing to fight for, the protagonist cannot exist. Here lies the argument for close connection between propaganda and film; in order to have a protagonist, a bad guy must be created. Bad guy is the enemy, a good guy the saviour or the victim. Basically, and taken the dramaturgy in a very simplified manner, stories are the conflict between the good and the bad. As is the war. Or is it? Is there something more Ugly behind it?

For most stories in the official history the bad guy is stereotypically and ideologically detected and commonly accepted. In films stereotypes have to be created because it has to be clear who the good guy is. The film reality succumbs to the reality of good and bad. The battle between good and evil is an essential narrative for films. After the devastating war in Bosnia from 1992 to 1995, no winner is official proclaimed. The Dayton Accord signed in December 1995 stopped the killings and that's how the massacres in the centre of Europe in the 20th century were ended. No winner. The International Court of Justice in The Hague in 2007 delivered the decision on Genocide (not ethnic cleansing) committed in Srebrenica. Two entities: Serbian and Bosnian-Croat were created, as those were major two the sides in the conflict. Bosnian history now has the story with no winner that will always be subjected to the future interests of power. In this regard Goulding (2002) has stated that "while many cities may wish to boast of their multicultural tolerance, Sarajevo has lived it for several centuries. It is a tolerance that embraces and celebrates Moslem, Jewish and Orthodox religions and customs – a tolerance that embraces Bosnian Serbs,

Croats, Muslims, and other ethnic groups and nationalities“(p. 231). It is evident that so many Bosnian films are keeping and propagating this multiculturalism quality. Characters are of different national and religious backgrounds and not necessarily the bad guy is always the aggressor or soldier.

Whether it is *Nafaka*, that humorously depicts war and its aftermath, or *Turneja*, a Serbian movie that describes the beginning of the war from the point of view of the theatre group from Belgrade that happen to be in the wrong place at the wrong time, or Bosnian films, *Djeca*, *Ostavljeni*, *Grbavica*, stories about the post-war perspective of the younger generation, whose life is effected extremely by the past. All of these movies are not openly propagating either side in conflict, but rather sophisticated ideological opinions and views are subtly given through the characters' behaviours and actions. The bad guys are stated clearly, but not insisted upon. The memory of enemies and victims is changeable, as perceived in *Krugovi*, but one adamant position of authors of these films stands: war was unnecessary, there were no winners, and it was all for nothing.

Almost all the domestic film production in the ex-Yugoslav region inclines subtly to the ideological views of the country of origin. But, all the post-war films are coherent in one idea; the war was stupid and the consequences devastating. Traditionally depicting a Joe - the neighbour, and his life as the absurdity in tragedy with wider connotation on the present society, the contemporary Bosnian films are not bluntly propagating either side in conflict. Subtle offensive characterizations in lines or action of the antagonist are noticeable, but not adamantly claiming the rights of the winner and hero. Twenty years after the war one would expect to find at least one feature movie in the James Bond style, or at least following the Yugoslav cinema tradition of partisan action films. But, of all the films made, every one of them is related to the war and after war experience; and none of them is made in the style of action-hero-savour-of-the-day-propaganda. Sergei Lukyanenko in his bestselling gothic novel *Night Watch* stated: “Once you start understanding the enemy, you lost the war” (2008, p. 132)

The Bosnian understanding of what the war was like for a common citizen (ordinary film character) is best explained in the tragically ending comedy *Gori vatra* from 2003. Bosnian Muslim Hamdo and Bosnian Serb Stanko are having a drink and discussing the war and who started it referring to it as a “screw up.” Raising their voices in the conclusion that the problems in the whole story were the outsiders who came to save “me and you.” The conversation ends bleakly stating that the separation to each of its own ethnical groups was unnecessary. The film is not negating the fact that the Serbs were the bad guys in the war, but also portrays some Bosnian Muslims in the post-war period as corruptive and morally devastated.

Almost grotesquely comic are the Muslim, Serbian, Croatian and Albanian

characters in *Parada* from 2011. Ex war heroes (each on their own side) that are united as bodyguards of the gay pride procession in Belgrade against the almost neo fascist chauvinist youth. As much as the earlier work of Srdjan Dragojević can be considered ideological and provocative, this film is mocking the war conflict and even though the stereotypical characters are offensive cultural representation, the film ends in the bitter sentiment of the tragedy and absurdity of violence. The bad guys are defined, but do not bare the necessary mask of religion, ethnicity or nationality. Opposing to the bad guys in reality but also heroes of the film (war criminals) these violent filled with hatred antagonists are the really bad ones - ugly ones. This concept of someone outside being the Ugly one (international community or fate itself) is evident in the 2010 snuff Serbian film *Srpski film*. If the content of this film is reviewed as the metaphorical subtext, the context is connotative and applicable to the war and break off the Yugoslavia. Again, the man shooting, directing and producing the slaughter (gaining money on it) in the last scene of the movie is the Ugly one. It is an evil even greater than the bad for which Bosnians, Serbs and Muslims were capable of during the real war. No real propaganda on bad guys and heroes is given in these films. In this regard Goulding (2002) stated that

the nearly four years of war in Bosnia-Herzegovina, and the brutal forty-six-month siege on its capital, Sarajevo, had a devastating impact on all aspects of life and culture. Enduring the longest siege of a major city in modern history, Sarajevo was mercilessly subjected to months of terrifying shelling and sniping... What remained intact, however, was a small group of talented Sarajevo filmmakers who chose to remain in their city and to shoot back – not with bullets, but with expertly aimed cameras trained with unerring accuracy on the profoundly important human stories that were unfolding daily, and demanding to be told” (p. 229).

Who was telling these stories? The ones who were at the same time witnessing the horrors of war and devastation of their city; and not only documenting the reality on film, but putting it into the fictional reality in movies.

Masterly film essay from 2000, by Srdjan Vuletić, the short film *Hop, Skip, Jump*, as well as the brilliant sequence shot in Ahmed Imamović's *10 minuta*, point out that the bad guy behind the line is killing innocent civilians, children and women, but the idea behind it is not to propagate emotions of hatred, but of abhorrent disgust over what people are capable of and question the limits of humanity in general.

These films are capturing the Vertov's idea on cinematic perfection of the eye, accurately making a new reality as an interpretation of the real horror of war. Who started or won the war is present but diminished, because the Ugly truth has shown its real face, which is beyond the black and white fiction reality and is dragging the good guys into the grey monotony of Dante's purgatory. This is how most of the modern Bosnian cinema could

be described. It is a Purgatory for ordinary people that are heroically trying to overcome the tragedy that descended on them. The bulk of the Jean-Luc Godard's *Notre Musique* from 2004 takes place in the after war Bosnia, and is referred to as Dante's Purgatory. The film transcends the elusive idea about the collective conscience of humanity and hollowness of secularism as well as religious empathy that requires the good guy to be the victim for the system of our reality to be stable. Collectiveness represented and interpreted by the creator of the film through the individual strives, sacrifice, suffering, devastation, destruction, violence is not stereotyped, it's just unimaginable, as is something that could not happen even in the movies.

Savršeni krug, the first after war Bosnian film is a metaphor for the siege of Sarajevo in reality, but also the connotation of resistance and refusal to submit in the face of violence and surrender by dying. The idea of totally experiencing the opposing religions and multi culture by an individual becomes collective in the film reality. Shot on the real locations, devastated by the shelling; the set designs are ideological, because they become the witness of the certain historical reality. Thus, Nichols (2010) stated that „form, ideology, and politicizing effects enjoy a shifting, unstable relationship that is best understood when located in relation to a given historical moment and particular audience“(p. 324).

The truth caught in *Savršeni krug* is evident to the survivors. In the same way the fake set design of the fighting scene background in which the glass windows are intact can be easily detected in the 2011 *In the Land of Blood and Honey* by someone who has witnessed the siege of the European city at the end of 20th century. The indexical quality is an issue here, because it does not correspond with the referent, but also does not make its own references in the fictional world, making it believable. The film loses the viewers trust (especially survivors' attention) not just because the images aren't transcending the right message. The story is purely conceived as the romance between the victim of the rape and the rapist. It is rumoured that the film is inspired by the true story. The reality behind it is not questionable. The film reality is not holding well the strings and stretches of the narrative, performing and editing.

The reality in the Italian movie from 2012, *Venuto al Mondo*, that takes place in Sarajevo before, during and after the war, is much more convincing and true to the original referent in reality, even if it is pure fabricated image of reality that surpasses the indexical quality and passes beyond to the metaphorical symbols. Even if metaphorical and artistic, the reality is believable and the emotional impact gigantic in a still shoot of the two windows that are shattered and lighting subdued to the grey gloomy purgatorial colours of the war, during which the song by Nirvana is interrupted by the loud explosion, after which the window view becomes the war sight. One of the best foreign movies about the war that are indexical and symbolic at the same time to the referencing reality of war

is *Shoot through the Heart* from 1998. The twisted, almost surreal world of city during the siege and subtle explanatory features of the everyday life, are of the utmost importance for any study of the war. Good guys and bad guys are defined and their motives explained. As well as in *Welcome to Sarajevo*, by Michael Winterbottom from 1997, the set design in both movies is real and locations for shooting were devastated in reality, so this visual feature has noticeable impact.

Foreign movies are in need to determine who started the war, whereas domestic, including the Serbian films, are harsher and more realistic in depicting the horrors of war but not focusing so much on the bad guy. They also do not openly state that everybody is equally to blame. The general idea can be drawn as a conclusion that the war is stupid, and we did not need it. As the good story needs the dichotomy of good and evil, foreign understanding of Bosnian conflict has to be simplified and stereotyped. It is often given as a justification of the political silence at first and then the humanitarian or military intervention. The conflict between Hamdo and Stanko (the Bosnian pronunciation of the names sounds similar), both Caucasian, similarly dressed, visually from the shared social status, and judging by the eloquently delivered lines having the same background education, is an incomprehensible phenomenon to be solved unless one of them is on the side of evil completely. The complex social, cultural, religious, historical web of relationships that these imaginary guys have has been media manipulated to the conflict with desolate consequences for both sides.

That's why *The Hunting party*, directed by Richard Shepard in 2007, tells the story of the catching of the bad guy, the war criminal Radovan Karadžić. It is very clear who the good guys are. Although filled with stereotyped judgmental images, the impression of justification, remorse, and pay off for the actions international community and the USA were taking (not taking) concerning the war in Bosnia is the major idea behind the film. Opening scene shows the arrival of the plane to Sarajevo International Airport along with the collage of images associated with Bosnian. The background music is of oriental origin, as has nothing in common with the Bosnian musical heritage. The shoot of an old guy in the Old Town of Sarajevo that was constructed during the Ottoman rule in middle ages, shows the fez on his head that has not been worn in real life for a century. Incidentally that costume is also of the Ottoman origin, not Bosnian. The comparable referent this stereotyped image, would be if one expected a cowboy to greet him or her upon the arrival at the J.F. Kennedy Airport in USA. The final title card in the film justifies the international involvement in the conflict, pointing out the Bad guy:

In theory, the official hunt for war criminals, in Bosnia continues to this day. However, the two most wanted men – Radovan Karadžić and Ratko Mladić – continue to elude the US, the United Nations, the European Union, NATO, The Hague and all in the civilized world who claim to be looking for them. In the ten years, that Radovan Karadzic has been on the run, he has

published two books and one play. Perhaps, if the International Community opened summer stock theatre...

One year later the war criminal was caught. Still, the Bosnian and foreign cinema on matters presented about the war has not been able to catch the Ugly truth on how and why the conflict happened in the first place, and whether it is going to happen again. The brilliant Croatian film directed by Arsen Ostojić, *Halimin put* from 2012, taking place in Bosnia and based on the true events, covers the shocking story of an adopted child raised by the Muslim family and killed accidentally by the biological father in Serbian Army. Horror of the absurdity of life, powers beyond our reach, manipulation with the masses, the birth mark of an enemy for other religions and cultural groups, is what the real Ugly face looks like in Bosnian reality and cinema.

Imposing You with the Conclusions...

Film can be a persuasion tool, but is also a work of art and a testimony of the social context that it interprets. This interpretation might be intentionally stereotyped or unintentionally, ideologically driven point of view of the creator of the film idea and messages.

Subtle infiltration of ideas and reformulation of truth in the creation of the fictional truth is subjected to propaganda manoeuvres, that can have great impact on the audiences' ability to identify with the good and the bad represented in the film. The general impression of the Bosnian cinema after the war, given the argument that no James Bond feature was made, and the grey reality of war and after war purgatory places the characters as either antiheroes or victims, leaves the bitter taste of need to blame someone. If there is no explicit hero, is there an enemy? Is it possible that the Bosnian films, with all the propaganda impact film can manipulate with, are not capable of conducting a major propaganda effect after the Bosnian conflict? Was the conflict devastating and absurd to the point of numbness on the international scale of humanity? The Bosnian cinema becomes the memory of the culture in time and absurdity of conflict. The real bad guy is not propagated openly and the hatred is not heated up by the propaganda techniques that film could use to this purpose. For transgressing the etiquette of the bad guy to the metaphorically powerful and beyond comprehension Ugly one, maybe this cinema can have a reconciliatory outcome and warning effect for the future generations.

Analysing the Jacobson's communication process in the limelight of humanly inherent persuasiveness, every film with its powerful audio-visual identification feature can be considered propaganda. Any film critic or analysis as well. The film referencing done in this essay can be differently understood and interpreted. It is the author's wish to have it enlighten the new insights and arguments for further debate or persuasion.

References

- Bergan, Ronald. 2006. *Film*. Eyewitness Companions. London, New York: Dorling Kindersley Ltd..
- Butler, Andrew M. 2008. *Film Studies*. The Pocket Essential. Harpenden, London, UK: Pocket Essentials.
- Cook, David. 2007. *Istorija filma I, II, III*. (1981, 1990, 1981) (*A History of Narrative Film*). WW.Norton for Company Inc. Beograd: Clio.
- Goulding, Daniel J. 2002. *Liberated Cinema: The Yugoslav Experience, 1945-2001*. 2 ed. Bloomington & Indianapolis: Indiana University Press.
- Gregor, Ulrich, and Enno Patalas. 1977. *Istorija Filma*. 1960. *Gescihte des Films*. Munchen, Gutersloch, Wien: Verlagsgruppe Bertelsmann GmbH C. Bertelsmann Verlag. Beograd: Institut za film.
- Jakobson, Roman. 1966. *Lingvistika i poetika*. Beograd: Nolit.
- Lukyanenko, Sergei. 2008. *Noćna Straža*. 1998, *Noćnoi dozor*. Trans. Nikolić, Nataša. *Noćna Straža*. Vol. 1. 4 vols. Beograd: Alinari.
- Nichols, Bill. 2010. *Engaging Cinema: An Introduction to Film Studies*. New York, London: W.W. Norton & Company Inc.
- Panjeta, Lejla. 2006. *Potreba za smislom: Mit, manipulacija i film*. Sarajevo: Svjetlost.
- Stojanović, Dušan. 1978. *Teorija filma*. Beograd: Nolit.

Films

- 10 minuta* (10 Minutes), 2002, Ahmed Imamović
- Abraham Lincoln: Vampire Hunter*, 2012, Timur Bekmambetov
- A Trip to the Moon*, 1902, George Méliès
- Djeca*, 2012, Aida Begić
- De Corpo e Alma*, 1992, TV Globo
- Gori vatra* (Fuse), 2003, Pjer **Žalica**
- Grbavica* (Esma's Secret – Grbavica), 2006, Jasmila **Žbanić**
- Halimin put* (Halima's Path), 2012, Arsen Ostojić
- In the Land of Blood and Honey*, 2011, Angelina Jolie
- Jaws*, 1975, Steven Spielberg
- Krugovi* (Circles), 2013, Srdjan Golubović
- Lincoln*, 2012, Steven Spielberg
- Nafaka*, 2006, Jasmin Duraković
- No Man's Land*, 2001, Danis Tanović
- Notre Musique*, 2004, Jean-Luc Godard
- Ostavljeni* (The Abandoned), 2010, Adis Bakrač
- Parada* (The Parade), 2011, Srdjan Dragojević
- Savršeni krug* (The Perfect Circle), 1997, Ademir Kenović
- Shot through the Heart*, 1998, David Attwood
- Snow White and the Huntsmen*, 2012, Rupert Sannders
- Snow White and the Seven Dwarfs*, 1937, William Cottrell, David Hand, Wilfred Jackson, Larry Morey, Perce Pearce, Ben Sharpsteen
- Srpski film* (A Serbian Film), 2010, Srdjan Spasojević

Telenovelas: BBC, 1995, Alexandre Valenti

The Hunting Party, 2007, Richard Shepard

The War of the Worlds, 1983, Orson Wells, Radio drama

Turneja (The Tour), 2008, Goran Marković

Venuto al Mondo (Twice Born), 2012, Sergio Castellitto

Welcome to Sarajevo, 1997, Michael Winterbottom

The Arrival of the Train at La Ciotat, 1985, Auguste Lumiere and Louis Lumiere.

EXPLORING THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN TURKISH AND BOSNIAN STUDENTS IN TRIANGULAR LOVE SCALE

Selvira Drahanović*

Anela Hasanagić*

Abstract

Numerous studies show that different cultures experience and express emotions in different ways. Some cultures tend to express emotions without restrictions while some others try to suppress the overt expression of emotions. These differences are particularly more manifest when Eastern and Western cultures are compared. Defining love differs between different cultures what makes it difficult to determine cultural differences in the concept of love. This might serve as a basis of prejudices about some nations in relation to how they perceive love. The main aim of this study is to explore differences between Turkish and Bosnian students on triangular love scale. The term love is operationalized by Sternberg's triangular theory of love scale which includes intimacy, passion and commitment component of love. Using quasi-experimental design we tested gender differences, the length of current relationship and correlation between them on overall scale and individual subscales. The sample consisted of 87 Turkish (22 males and 65 females) and 64 Bosnian students (23 males and 41 females) total 151 students (N=151). Results of the study show statistically significant differences between Turkish and Bosnian students on two dimensions in Sternberg Triangular Love Scale, Intimacy and Passion. Bosnian students scored higher on these subscales. Study results suggest that there are no statistically significant differences between males and females in any subscale. The length of love relationship is positively correlated with intimacy, which indicates that the length of connections weakly associated with intimacy, and that is not associated with the passion and the decision of commitment, suggesting longer relationship does not mean more romantic relationship, and vice versa.

Keywords: Love; Relationship; Theories of Love; Triangular Theory of Love and Culture

Introduction

While discussing emotions, psychologist often talk about subjective relations toward things, people, events and own behaviors (Rot, 2004). Human beings have some sort of emotions towards almost everything and anything, even a state of not caring for or neutrality reflects an emotion. Thus, there is an emotional relation towards everyone and everything constantly. According to Corsini and Aurebach (1998) "emotions are strong mental states, usually involving excitement or high energy, that give rise to feeling and passion" (p. 260). Emotions can be positive and negative, with different intensity ranging from mild excitement to the eruption of emotion.

All emotions consists of cognitive, physiological and behavior components (Rathus, 2000). Cognitive components means that people perceive some source toward which they develop certain emotion, physiological component is the reaction of body, like

*Corresponding author: Selvira Draganović, Anela Hasanagić, International University of Sarajevo, Bosnia and Herzegovina; e-mail: sdraganovic@ius.edu.ba

reaction of sympathetic or parasympathetic, while behavior comes as the reaction, and according to which environment becomes aware of the emotion of human being.

Emotions are many and that is why the number and definitions of emotions differ from theorist to theorist, and varies from time to time. Carlson and Hatfield (1992) state that in Ancient China, there was a belief that there are four basic emotions: happiness, anger, sadness and fear (stated in Rathus, 2000). Watson (1924) initially thought that there are only three basic emotions: fear, rage and love (Rathus, 2000), while Paul Eckman (1992) and Robert Plutchik (1984) maintained that, besides those emotions, there are many more (Rathus, 2000). Those disparities originated a need to define universality in developing emotions.

In 1932, Bridges defined universality in developing of emotions as arousal (which begins to develop at the beginning of children's life), from which other emotions are developed (satisfaction and dissatisfaction firstly, and later on, other emotions like rage, proud, love, fear develop (Rot 2004). Even though there are several classifications of emotions, most of the researchers consent about two basic categories: basic, or primary and complex, or secondary emotions. Primary emotions are emotions which develop early in life, such as: fear, anger, happiness and grief or sorrow. Some researchers add pleasure into this group. Complex emotions developed later in life and, as stated by some, (Plutchik for example) are emotions which develop as a result of combination of some basic/primary emotions. Secondary or complex emotions are the ones which are directed to other people (love, hate, jealousy, envy, compassion), toward own personality (success, pride, shame, guilt) and esthetic emotions (respect, awe, veneration) (Rot, 2004).

Scientists exploring emotions offer a few approaches or theories of emotions. Each theory is a unique approach in explaining development of emotions and emotional differentiation. Hence, in order to operationally define or measure and study emotions, it is important to consider one approach or theoretical perspective. James- Lange, Cannon-Bard and Cognitive and Attribution theories of emotions are the most influential theories of emotions often cited in literature.

- a) The James-Lange Theory: according to which, stimuli produces bodily changes that in turn generate emotions. This theory suggests that stimuli are keys to physical reactions as well as for emotions.
- b) The Cannon-Bard Theory: according to this theory, when emotion-producing stimulus is received in brain, centers in the thalamus and hypothalamus send out simultaneous signals to both external muscles and internal organs and back to the cortex. The muscles and organs make the physiological reactions causing emotions, while the cortex interprets the signal as emotion. According to Cannon, events that caused emotions give rise to arousal of the sympathetic nervous system, and this arousal regulates and prepares organism to fight or flee reaction.
- c) Cognitive and Attribution Theories of Emotion. These theories support interaction between cognitive (intellectual) and physiological (bodily) influences. Every emotion is aroused by acknowledging/knowing something and appraising it.

Just like in any psychological process, genetic and environmental factors are important factors in emotions as well. On one hand, theories which focus on impact of genetics factors find their evidences in research about neurological basis of emotions, genetics, and universal emotional development of human being. On the other hand, theories that support environmental factors point out to the research findings about impact of learning process in developing emotions, as well as cultural diversity in expressing emotions. In this research, we take the stand and go in line with the second theorists and explore the cultural differences in love among Turkish and Bosnian students.

Cultural Differences in Emotions

Although emotions are universal phenomena, culture plays important role in expression of emotions. Bridges (1932, as cited in Rot 2004), shows that emotions are developed in the same way in all human beings. Firstly arousal begins which later turns into the feeling of satisfaction or dissatisfaction followed by emergence of basic emotions like fear, happiness, disgust etc. This process is universal. However, with some emotional states, different cultures point to different antecedent situations (the way they are versed in, the reactions they agitate and the way they are perceived by the society, for example).

Different cultures have different ways of expressing their emotions. Cultural difference in displaying emotions comes from differences in emotional display rules which are “specific cultural norms or rules that regulate how, when and where a person expresses emotions and how much emotional expression is appropriate” (Plotnik & Kouyoumdjian 2011, p. 367). Some cultures tend to express their emotions freely, while others tend to hold their emotions back (Niedenthal, et al. 2006, p. 306). This difference is very prominent when we compare Eastern and Western cultures.

Plotnik & Kouyoumdjian (2011) cite several researches about cultural differences in emotional expression. For example, Americans generally display rules which encourage free emotional expression. Eastern cultures, on the other hand, like Japanese or Russians, do not show emotions as freely as Westerners. Japanese for example, cover their mouth when laughing, while Russians rarely laugh in public, only in private gatherings. Eastern cultures are usually perceived as more introverted and collectivistic. Therefore they tend to show less emotion in order to keep the well-being of the group intact. Members of Western cultures express their emotions in order to help themselves even if that requires negative emotions towards the others. These significant diverse types of emotional expression based on culture symbolize the opposite in ways of emotional expression which seem to serve and function well in own cultures. Nevertheless, just because Eastern cultures tend to be more collectivistic in nature does not mean they do not express their emotions at all. It is more that expression of emotions in Eastern cultures is less explicit and obvious and restrained to a more personal and private settings.

The importance and impact of romantic/love relationships evidently differs from culture to culture. Each culture manifestly and latently prescribes “expected time for” and “appropriate characteristics” of romantic relationships. The so called free love practiced with precautionary measures in Eastern cultures is often viewed as an inappropriate

behavior by parents and teachers and is subject to parental discipline. Adolescents are habitually faced with significant restrictions and preventive measure from parents and society at large for early dating. Therefore romantic involvement for Eastern adolescents appears discouraged and less prevalent compared to those in Western cultures, especially, in countries where Islamic values dominate. Islam restricts sexual contacts and pleasures to spouses in marriage only and forbids pre-marital relations involving physical contact. However, contrary to the western countries, early marriages are favored and quite common in Eastern cultures. Nonetheless, this practice frequently criticized by Westerners, it has some positive impacts as well (less sexual partners and thus less risks for STDs for example).

Theories of Love

One of the most important and significant emotions, which also represents one of the basic needs of all humans is love. However, explaining and understanding how and why love happens and occurs, is not easy. Brown (1987) says, emotions as current mental states are “abnormal bodily changes caused by the agent’s evaluation or appraisal of some object or situation that the agent believes to be of concern to him or her” (p. 14.). Badhwar (2003) similarly understands love to be a matter of “one’s overall emotional orientation towards a person, the complex of perceptions, thoughts, and feelings”; as such, love is a matter of having a certain “character structure” (p. 46). Central to this complex emotional orientation, as Badhwar argues, is what she calls the “look of love”: “an ongoing [emotional] affirmation of the loved object as worthy of existence...for her own sake” (p. 44), an affirmation that involves taking pleasure in your beloved’s well-being, providing to the beloved reliable testimony concerning the quality of the beloved’s character and actions (p. 57).

The term „love,, is so frequent and common in use everywhere around us, in movies, soap operas, advertisements and real life situations and personal stories. Love is an emotion of strong affection and personal/intimate attachment. Love is also said to be a virtue representing all human kindness, compassion and affection, or the unselfish loyal and benevolent concern for the good of another (family, friends, and humankind in general (characteristic to human beings). Love may also be described as compassionate and affectionate deeds and care shown towards other humans, one’s self or animals.

The term “love” can have a variety of related but distinct meanings within different contexts. Different languages often use multiple terms to express some of the different concepts. Thus, universal conceptualization of love is complicated, what has lead to emergence of numerous theories of love such as: the color wheel, romantic love, compassionate/passionate love, triangular theory of love.

The color wheel model of love, developed by Lee who maintains that love styles are similar to the primary colors red, blue and yellow, whose mix creates the secondary colors like orange, green and purple. Lee (1973) proposed three primary styles of loving, *eros*, *ludos* and *storge*. The *eros* kind of love, usually portrayed by media in romantic novels and movies, usually is somehow one sided and generally means hopeless romantic

loving the ideal person. One sided love usually leads to disappoints. *Ludos* type of love refers to the love as a play/game (Casanova for example, whose aim is to have many partners. Lee's last type of love is *storge* which refers to love build on friendship. This type of love started gradually as friendship which later on turned into intimate relationship. Compared the *eros* and *ludos* type of love, *storge* tends to endure the longest.

Color wheel model of love, as proposed by Lee, occurs by mixing the primary styles. For example, mixing of *eros* and *ludos* creates manic or obsessive love, which can be the source of jealousy and possessiveness. On the other hand mixing the *ludos* and *storge* type of love brings *pragma* love. *Pragma* love is realistic and practical love based on choosing a partner for practical reason, 'good on paper'. Mixing of *eros* and *storge* leads to *agape* type of love which is often experienced as a spiritual, selfless love for the sake of God and not the other person.

Trying to explain the difference between liking and loving, Rubin (1970, 1973) proposes romantic love to be composed of attachment, caring and intimacy. Attachment (primal, very strong emotional bond developed early in childhood between a baby and primary care giver transferred into adult relationships) is the need to receive care, approval and physical contact with the other person (desired and beloved). Caring involves esteeming the other persons' needs and happiness as much as your own. Intimacy refers to the sharing of thoughts, desires, and feelings with the other, cherished and beloved person.

Hatfield's (1993) compassionate versus passionate theory of love tries to explain that how people's feelings towards each other are different in allusion to different types of love. Theorists point to the two fundamental types of love, passionate and compassionate. While compassionate love develops from the mutual feelings of respect and understanding between the couple, passionate love refers to the state of intense longing for a union with another, involving subjective feelings, expressions, patterned physiological process, inclined deeds and active behaviors (Hatfield, 1994). This love can be reciprocated (resulting in union with the other) or unrequited (resulting in separation followed by emptiness, anxiety or despair (Hatfield, 1994). Unlike compassionate love, the passionate love does not last for long. Factors like similarity, readiness, deep and secure attachment are important in development of these two types of love.

The Reiss's (1960) Wheel Theory is a sociological theory of love proposing that love develops in stages: rapport, self evaluation, mutual dependency and personality need fulfillment. Rapport emerges when people develop rapport with each other based upon their cultural backgrounds of similar upbringing, social class, religion and education. Rapport is fundamental because without it, as love theory thinkers believe, would-be lovers do not have enough in common to establish even the first spark of an interest in each other. The second, self-revelation stage helps a couple grow closer together. Love is possible because while growing closer each person feels more at ease he or she is more likely to discuss hopes, desires, fears, ambitions and even might engage in sexual activities during this stage. Becoming closer leads to more intimate what may develop into a mutual dependency upon each other leading to exchange of ideas, jokes, and sexual desires. Stage they the couple begins to experience personality need fulfillment, when

partners confide in one another, make mutual decisions, support each other's ambitions and boost each other's self-confidence is Reiss's last stage of love.

Borland (1975) modified Reiss's theory suggesting love to be viewed as *clock springs*, suggesting the stages can be repeated throughout the relationship. This means the stages can be repeated more times, mistakes can be reduced and the relationship can be improved. Hence, as Borland (1975) states, relationships can wind up and unwind several times as love grows and progresses or declines and deteriorates.

Sternberg (1986) in a form of a triangle, pictures three important components in love, intimacy, passion and commitment. The intimacy encompasses feelings of attachment, closeness, connectedness and bonding in intimate relationship. Passion on the other hand generally includes motivation and consists of the drives connected to sexual attraction and limerence. The component in Sternberg's triangular theory of love is commitment. At short term level, commitment encompasses the decision to remain with a person and the shared achievements and plans made at the long term level.

The elements of intimacy and commitment are usually seen as a stable in a relationship which passion is the quite different and it is not stable as the intimacy and commitment. Intimacy and passionate occur in a relationship when people show patience with each which serves as foundation for long term relationship. On the other hand, lone passion creates infatuation, what puts a relationship at risk. In terms of passion in triangular theory of love, it is important to point out that even though people commit to their feelings at the beginning of their relationship, having passion for each other only does not mean the relationship will survive and succeed.

Nevertheless it is important to note that people differ in experiencing and perceiving these three components. A person can be aware of a passion towards somebody but the intimacy and commitment might be lacking because they require time and other variables. These components are often combined and result in different types of love. Different combination of intimacy, passion and commitment may lead to following types of love: liking, infatuation, empty love, romantic love, companionate love, fatuous love and consummate love and non-love.

As Sternberg says, liking characterizes true friendships, in which a person feels a bonding, warmth, and closeness with another person without intense passion or long-term commitment. Infatuated love refers to feelings or the "love at first sight." This type of love requires no intimacy and the commitment therefore it may suddenly disappear. Strong love might sometimes, deteriorate into an empty love in which commitment remains, but the intimacy and passion have died. This is particularly common in cultures which practice arranged marriages where relationships often begin as empty love. When couples are involved romantically and bonded emotionally and physically through passionate arousal, then we speak about romantic love. Companionate love, on the other hand, is often found in marriages in which the passion faded but a deep affection and commitment still remain. Companionate love is characteristic to a relationship build with someone you share your life with, but sexual or physical desire towards the person are absent. This type

of love is stronger than friendship because of the extra element of commitment. The love ideally shared between family members is a form of companionate love, as is the love between deep friends or those who spend a lot of time together in any asexual but friendly relationship. Fatuous love can be exemplified by a whirlwind courtship and marriage in which a commitment is motivated largely by passion, without the stabilizing influence of intimacy. Aside from these types of love there is also consummate love. Representing the ideal relationship many people strive for but only a few achieve, consummate love is the complete form of love. However, as Sternberg cautions, maintaining consummate love may be even harder than achieving it. He accentuates the importance of converting the components of love into action, because “without expression even the greatest of loves can die” (1988, p. 341). Also, consummate love may not be permanent because if passion dies over time, this love may change into companionate love. Finally, when there is no intimacy, passion, or decision/commitment, then we speak about no love (feelings about a stranger on the bus sitting or standing next to us).

The triangular theory of love helps to explain and understand how interpersonal relationships develop. It is important to mention that relationships based on multiple components of love are more likely to survive compared to those based on a single element.

Research Goals and Hypothesis

Goals:

1. To investigate the differences between Turkish and Bosnian students on Triangular scale of Love
2. To explore the gender differences in Triangular Scale of Love.
3. To explore correlation between the length of relationship and three dimension of love according to Triangular Theory of love

Hypothesis:

1. There are no statistically significant differences between Turkish and Bosnian students in three aspects of Triangular Theory of Love.
2. There are no statistically significant differences between males and females in results on Triangular Scale of Love.
3. There is no statistically significant correlation between length of relationship and three aspects of Triangular Theory of Love.

Methodology

Participants

For the purpose of this research, we have used students from International University of Sarajevo (IUS) and University in Zenica. All participants were informed about the purpose of the research. Participation was voluntary, students were asked to volunteer to fill the questionnaires distributed to them, ensuring the privacy of their data and using results for research purpose only. Using convenient sampling method, some students participated in the study at University premises, after classes, in canteen, at cafe, some in boys and girls dormitories, and some took the questionnaire home. In the end, as pointed in table below we had 151 participants in total.

Table 1. The table about the number of participants according to the two independent variables

		gender		Total
		male	female	
nationality	Turkish	22	65	87
	Bosnian	23	41	64
Total		45	106	151

Instruments used

- Socio-demographic questionnaire – which gives main information about gender, nationality, religiosity, number of romantic relationships, the length of romantic relationships
- Triangular Love Scale (TTLS) (Sternberg, 1988). TTLS is a 45-items scale measuring the three components of love, intimacy, passion and commitment. Each component is measured by a 15 item subscale. Each scale is rated on 9-point Likert scales (1 = “not at all,” 5 = “moderately,” and 9 = “extremely“). TTLS is reported with high internal consistency, alpha coefficients for three subscales are above 0.90 (Tzeng, 1993.).

Procedure

Well trained students did field research. Participants were asked to be honest and volunteer to fill the questionnaire. Research took place at university premises, participants were given the questionnaire to take home or to dormitory, fill and return to researcher. The same procedure was used for Turkish and Bosnian students.

Results and Discussion

1. Cultural and gender differences in three aspects of Triangular Scale of Love

For testing the first two hypotheses, we used multivariate ANOVA with fixed factors Nationality and Gender, and dependent variables: Intimacy, Passion and Commitment. Results are presented in table below.

Table 2. Group Statistics for Nationality

nationality		N	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
intimacy	Turkish	87	7,0755	1,37665	,14759
	Bosnian	64	7,6083	1,29601	,16200
passion	Turkish	87	6,0032	1,79287	,19222
	Bosnian	64	6,9566	1,57167	,19646
commitment	Turkish	87	7,8210	8,43975	,90484
	Bosnian	64	7,8002	1,55950	,19494

Table 3. Group Statistics for Gender

	gender	N	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
intimacy	male	45	7,1808	1,43753	,21429
	female	105	7,3801	1,31180	,12802
passion	male	45	6,0918	1,82978	,27277
	female	105	6,5585	1,72247	,16810
commitment	male	45	7,1982	1,84960	,27572
	female	105	8,0970	7,65716	,74726

Table 4. Tests of Between-Subjects Effects

Source	Dependent Variable	Type III Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Corrected Model	intimacy	15,370 ^a	3	5,123	2,925	,036
	passion	50,373 ^b	3	16,791	5,945	,001
	commitment	45,407 ^c	3	15,136	,355	,786
Intercept	intimacy	6628,681	1	6628,681	3,784E3	,000
	passion	5016,425	1	5016,425	1,776E3	,000
	commitment	7181,166	1	7181,166	168,336	,000
nationality	intimacy	9,853	1	9,853	5,624	,019
	passion	43,036	1	43,036	15,237	,000
	commitment	5,340	1	5,340	,125	,724
gender	intimacy	2,547	1	2,547	1,454	,230
	passion	10,580	1	10,580	3,746	,055
	commitment	23,267	1	23,267	,545	,461
nationality * gender	intimacy	,542	1	,542	,309	,579
	passion	3,324	1	3,324	1,177	,280
	commitment	19,460	1	19,460	,456	,500
Error	intimacy	255,770	146	1,752		
	passion	412,364	146	2,824		
	commitment	6228,307	146	42,660		
Total	intimacy	8309,127	150			
	passion	6642,245	150			
	commitment	15463,943	150			
Corrected Total	intimacy	271,140	149			
	passion	462,737	149			
	commitment	6273,715	149			

a. R Squared = ,057 (Adjusted R Squared = ,037)

b. R Squared = ,109 (Adjusted R Squared = ,091)

c. R Squared = ,007 (Adjusted R Squared = -,013)

These hypotheses were also tested using simple ANOVA, and results are the same. Results show there is statistically significant difference on Intimacy and Passion subscales of love between Turkish and Bosnian students. Bosnian students have higher results in subscales of Intimacy and Passion. There is no statistically significant difference in subscale of Commitment.

This means that Bosnian students evaluate their relationships like more intimate and passionate than Turkish students. This is probably due to the impact of western culture in Bosnian society. Bosnia and Herzegovina is in between, the East and West and is influenced by both (where the West influence is more manifest in terms of clothing, fashion, music, but also identification systems. In Bosnia and Herzegovina people strive more towards Western values than to Eastern. Therefore, Bosnian culture can be observed as more Western.

Also, it is important to mention that Bosnian participants are students of Islamic Pedagogical Faculty (where most girls practice Islamic clothing-wear hijab), just like participants from IUS (of Turkish origin), so both groups share religious beliefs and attitudes toward religion obligations.

Western cultures are more open towards love and intimate/romantic relationship apparently and their practices are observed differently than in Eastern cultures (especially Middle East cultures which is more Islamic). In Islam it is forbidden to have intimate relationship before marriage and outside the wedlock. Since most of our participants are not married, this had impact on results and on participant's perception of love in general. Having romantic relationship in Islam allowed as far as it does not involve physical contact of any kind. Islam strictly forbids physical involvement with the opposite sex before the marriage and outside the wedlock. Even though Bosnian students are Muslims, and studying at Islamic Pedagogical Faculty, it seems that living in Bosnia (being a part of Europe and European culture) "melted" their perception of what their religion forbids and they do not observe these rules in the same way the Turks do. It seems that Turkish students adhere to religious rules more, are more traditional hence their relationships are less intimate and passionate than Bosnian students' relationships.

Bosnian culture seems to be more influenced by Western culture. Unlike some Muslim societies (whose cultures seem more strict in following religious rules, i.e., in terms of dress code, Islamic clothing or clear and strict rules on man-women relationships), Western culture is more liberal. Western culture is more lenient accepting and even encouraging romantic/intimate and passionate relationship. However, we did not investigate whether Bosnian students have had physical contact or intimate relationship with the opposite sex, but our results show that Bosnian students have more free and expressive attitudes towards romantic love. Still, in depth investigation would be worthwhile and would give us more conclusive data.

Kin Ng and Cheng (2010), also found some cultural impact on love, operationalized with Triangular Scale of Love. They found that in western cultures, satisfaction with

romantic relationship was mediated with intimacy and passion, while in research made on Chinese people, satisfaction with relationship was mediated with intimacy and commitment.

Another goal of this research was to investigate eventual gender differences in Triangular Scale of love results. According to the table 4 there are no statistically significant differences between male and female on any of the three components of Triangular scale. It would be logical to assume that there would be some differences, since male and female have different needs and attitudes when it comes about a lot of things, especially about love. It would be logical to suppose that male will evaluate higher passion, while female will strive for commitment and intimacy. Also, there results were checked by one – way ANOVA, and results show that there are no gender differences.

Sternberg (1997) found in his research that woman had higher intimacy ratings, while on other components there were no statistically significant difference. It might be that male and female really do not have different needs and perception of love, but it is just a prejudice that male are more addicted to physical component which is related to passion, while female look for more intimacy in term of psychological support. It would be worth to check it with some similar research, are male really more directed to fulfilling physical needs in romantic relationship.

2. Correlation between the length of relationship and three aspects of Triangular Scale of Love and Close Relationship Emotion Questionnaire.

The length of relationship was measured in months and it is correlated with three dependent variables: Intimacy, Passion and Commitment.

Table 5. Correlations between length of relationship and three components of TLS

		length of current relationship	intimacy	passion	commitment
length of current relationship	Pearson Correlation	1	,190*	,137	,057
	Sig. (2-tailed)		,029	,116	,516
	N	132	132	132	132
intimacy	Pearson Correlation	,190*	1	,669**	,250**
	Sig. (2-tailed)	,029		,000	,002
	N	132	151	151	151
passion	Pearson Correlation	,137	,669**	1	,290**
	Sig. (2-tailed)	,116	,000		,000
	N	132	151	151	151
commitment	Pearson Correlation	,057	,250**	,290**	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	,516	,002	,000	
	N	132	151	151	151

*. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

From the table 5, it can be seen that high and statistically significant correlations are found only between three components of Triangular Scale of Love: intimacy, passion and commitment. These results completely support findings from Sternberg (1997), where he found that three components covariate, instead of being independent. Results of this study also point to significant and positive correlations between intimacy and passion (,669**), and also intimacy and commitment (,250**), and commitment and passion (,290**). First correlation is significantly high which means that if the couple is more intimate, if it shares more psychological support, that passion will also be higher, and vice and versa. Two other correlations have the same direction.

Length of the current relationship is correlated with intimacy, but quite correlation, which is positive (,190*). This means that the longer the relationship is, it is related to more intimate relationship and vice and versa. Sternberg (1986.) claims that these components may be used independently to examine their association to individual (e.g., psychological well-being) and relationship (e.g., satisfaction and quality) outcomes. For example, Overbeek, Ha, Scholte, de Kemp, and Engels (2007) found that each TLS construct was positively associated with the satisfaction and longevity of heterosexual adolescents' romantic relationships. And the area of the love triangle, representing the intensity of intimacy, passion, and commitment experienced by a person, is positively related to his or her perceived relationship quality.

It has also been documented that the triangular love components are associated with other measures of relationship quality. Whitley's (1993) study with a sample of female college students revealed that the levels of the love components were related to actual stability and expected stability. The studies of Hendrick and Hendrick (1988) found moderate correlations between the love components and the relationship quality factors such as viability, caring, global satisfaction, and conflict.

This research though found that length of relationship is correlated with intimacy, as the only dimension of Triangular Scale of Love, while other correlations were not found. Therefore, it would be worthy of further investigation and exploring other, related aspects, including adults who are in relationship for longer period of time besides students.

Conclusions

This study shows that there are statistically significant differences between Turkish and Bosnian students in Intimacy and Passion subscales on Triangular Scale of Love, with Bosnian students having higher results in subscales of Intimacy and Passion. At the same time, results point to no statistically significant difference in subscale of Commitment. This might be due to the cultural differences between Bosnian and Turkish students. Our results show that while there are no significant differences on Commitment on triangular love scale, the two groups have significantly different results in subscales of Intimacy and Passion. This might be explained by likely influence of cultural background, Western in terms of Bosnian or Eastern in terms of Turkish students, which might have an impact on students' perception of love, especially perception of Intimacy and Passion. The so called free love practiced with precautionary measures, type of behavior disapproved by

parents and teachers and subjected to parental discipline in Turkish (Eastern) culture, seems more acceptable in Bosnian (European) culture. It seems that Bosnian students, although by religious orientation closer to Eastern culture, being a part of Europe and European culture, adjusted their perception of what their religion states, to the main stream (Western) attitudes towards intimate relationships. Practicing Muslims (strictly adhering to religious rules) are minority in Bosnia thus adolescents find it difficult to adhere and observe all religious practices especially in intimate relationships.

Also, despite the overall gender differences in terms of emotions, we found no significant differences between males and females on any of the three components of Triangular love Scale. This means that males and females do not differ in terms of perceiving Love, Intimacy, Passion and Commitment. Adolescence is turbulent time, time for testing and experiencing many things, time for looking for approval and giving in to peer pressure, what makes it equally challenging for girls and for boys.

Finally, as stated in the third goal of this research, we explored correlation between the length of relationship and results on subscales of TLS. Results show that the length of the current relationship is correlated with Intimacy, but correlation which is positive is low. Therefore, we can conclude that longer relationship is related to more intimate relationship, and vice versa.

References

- Badhwar, N., K., (2003). "Love", in H. La Follette (ed.), *Practical Ethics*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 42–69.
- Borland, Dolores M., (1975). „An Alternative Model of the Wheel Theory.“ *The Family Coordinator* 24(3): 289-292.
- Brown, R., (1987). *Analyzing Love*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Corsini R. J. and Auerbach A. J. (1998). *Concise Encyclopedia of Psychology*, John Wiley and Sons, INC, USA.
- Feldman, Robert S., (2006). *Human Development across the Lifespan* (4th ed). New Jersey: Pearson Education.
- Hatfield, E., & Rapson, R. L., (1993). *Love, sex, and intimacy: Their psychology, biology, and history*. New York: Harper and Collins.
- Hatfield, E., & Rapson, R. L. (1994). *Love and intimacy. Encyclopedia of Mental Health*. 2. New York: Academic Press.
- Hendrick, S. S., Hendrick, C., & Adler, N. L. (1988). "Romantic relationships: Love, satisfaction, and staying together." *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 54(6), 980-988.
- Kin Ng T. & Cheng K.,H.K., (2010). "The Effects of Intimacy, Passion, and Commitment on Satisfaction in Romantic Relationships among Hong Kong Chinese People." *Journal of Psychology in Chinese Societies* Vol. 11, No. 2, 123-146.
- Lee, J. A., (1973). *The colors of love: An exploration of the ways of loving*. Toronto: New Press.
- Niedenthal, Paula M., Silvia Krauth-Gruber, Francois R., (2006). *Psychology of Emotion Interpersonal, Experimental, and Cognitive Approaches*. New York, NY: Psychology Press.
- Overbeek, G., Ha, T., Scholte, R., de Kemp, R., & Engels, R., (2007). Brief report: Intimacy, passion, and commitment in romantic relationships—Validation of a 'triangular love scale' for adolescents. *Journal of Adolescence*, 30, 523–528.
- Plotnik R. & Kouyoumdjian H., (2011). *Introduction to Psychology*. Wadsworth Cengage Learning, USA.
- Rathus, S. A., (2000). *Temelji psihologije*. Naklada Slap, Jastrebarsko.
- Reiss, Ira L., (1960). *Premarital Sexual Standards in America: a sociological investigation of the relative*

- social and cultural integration of American sexual standards. The Free Press.
- Rot, N., (2004). *Opšta psihologija*, Zavod za udžbenike i nastavna sredstva, Beograd.
- Rubin, Z., (1973). *Liking and loving: An invitation to social psychology*. New York, Holt, Rinehart and Winston.
- Rubin, Z. (1970) Measurement of romantic love. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 16, 265-273.
- Sternberg, R. J., (1997). Construct Validation of a triangular love scale, *European Journal of Social Psychology*, Vol. 27, 313-335
- Sternberg, R. J., (1986). A triangular theory of love, *Psychological Review*, 93, 119-135.
- Sternberg, R. J., & Barnes, M. L., (Eds.). (1988). *The psychology of love*. New Haven, Yale University Press.
- Whitley, B. E., (1993). Reliability and aspects of the construct validity of Sternberg's triangular love scale. *Journal of Social & Personal Relationships*, 10(3), 475-480.
- Wittig A. F., (2001). *Introduction to Psychology*. New York, McGraw-Hill.