EPIPHANY

Journal of Transdisciplinary Studies

Journal of Transdisciplinary Studies

EPIPHANY

ABOUT THE JOURNAL

Epiphany (p-ISSN 2303-6850, e-ISSN 1840-3719), Journal of Transdisciplinary Studies is a double-blind peer-reviewed journal dedicated to the promotion of scholarly publication in humanities and social sciences. Epiphany is a semiannual publication affiliated to the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences, at the International University of Sarajevo in Bosnia and Herzegovina. The journal aims to promote transdisciplinary studies that cross many disciplinary boundaries to create a holistic approach. It refers to concepts or field research methods originally developed in one discipline, but now widely used by other disciplines in the area of humanities and social sciences including anthropology, philosophy, economics, media studies, history, psychology, sociology, visual and performing arts, literature, technology and cultural studies. We invite scholars interested in transcending classical scholarship to submit their manuscripts to Epiphany.

The journal is currently indexed in EBSCO: Humanities International Complete, Humanities International Index, Humanities Source, ERIH-PLUS, Index Copernicus, DOAJ: Directory of Open Access Journals, CEEOL: Central and Eastern European Online Library, Journal TOCs, BASE: Bielefeld Academic Search Engine, OCLC WorldCat, Academic Journals Database, Advanced Science Index, Journalseek Genamics, Eurasian Scientific Journal Index, Google Scholar, InfoBase Index, J-GATE, OAJI: Open Academic Journals Index, ResearchBib Academic Resources Index, ROAD: Directory of Open Access Scholarly Resources, Scientific Indexing Services, Socolar, Turkish Education Index/Türk Eğitim İndeksi, ZBD, ZORA: Zurich Open Repository and Archive.

Journal of Transdisciplinary Studies

EPIPHANY

TABLE OF CONTENTS:

THE PITFALLS OF MORAL RESPONSIBILITY IN TWO SHORT STORIES BY FLANNERY O'CONNOR AND KATHERINE ANN PORTER

Mahdi Teimouri

Khayyam University

Abstract

Theories of morality have warned us about the possibility of power-wielding in caregiving situations. They argue that moral decisions are often slippery slopes that can easily—unbeknownst to those involved—lead to oppression. One reason for the degeneration of care into power can be explained in terms of the solipsistic interpretation of the care-receiver's needs. It is not simply the question of the language barrier. The problem is the nature of the care relationship itself which concerns the authority either granted or assumed by the caregiver. Also, in caregiving situations, the caregiver might use care as a smokescreen to hide their self-serving intentions. To further elaborate, I will draw on Zygmunt Bauman's ideas about care and moral responsibility. His exploration of the problem of care and moral responsibility constitutes the theoretical premise on which I will build my argument using two examples from literature to show how care can lapse into power. I have chosen these two short stories to demonstrate the way caregiving situations are potential mine-fields where a misstep can result in unintended deleterious consequences. Porter's "He" and O'Connor's "The Life You Save May Be Your Own" perfectly illustrate this point.

Keywords: moral responsibility, Bauman, disability, care, power

Introduction

While preparing for a short story course, I came across two short stories, which in some ways, bore an uncanny resemblance to one another. The two short stories are concerned with parental care for their offspring. In both stories, there are mothers who apparently do what they can to protect their mentally disabled children. O'Connor's story published in 1953 is concerned with the life of a mother and her mentally disabled daughter, Lucynell, who because of her mother's gullibility is left high and dry at the end of the story. "He" (1927) is also about the unfortunate fate of an un-named boy called 'He' who suffers from speech impediments and some abnormalities. Like Lucynell, 'He' also falls victim to her mother's miscalculation and inanities. The physical and mental conditions of the two children have made them helpless creatures at the mercy of their parent's decisions. The children's inability to communicate their needs, at least in a common and perceptible way, compounds further the complexity of the care situation. Having some familiarity with the problematics of moral responsibility and the ethics of care explored by Zygmunt Bauman in his seminal book, *The Postmodern Ethics* (1993), I believe that the two stories might serve as concrete examples for demonstrating the difficulty of negotiating one's moral responsibility toward the other. In the following sections, I will first explain the theoretical framework using Bauman's ideas. Then, I will offer my reflections on the stories using Bauman's thoughts. To prevent my analysis from being a mere facile illustration of the notion of ethics of care, I would like to propose that the reason behind the lapse behind the moral responsibility of the two mothers and the subsequent degeneration of care into power and manipulation can be attributed to a biased attitude toward the disabled and the abnormal promoted by the politics of ableism.

Impediments and Challenges to Moral Responsibility

In *Postmodern Ethics* (1993), Bauman warns against the complexity and aporia of moral responsibility for the other. Responsibility generates ambivalence because it is almost impossible to determine when one is overstepping limits or falling short of fulfilling one's obligations. Maintaining the balance is a challenge that is not entirely resolvable. Decisions made with the best of intentions can cause unforeseen and far-reaching ramifications which are not necessarily in the best interest of everyone. Generally, decisions made under such circumstances are always based on one's knowledge of the other. The more one familiarizes oneself with the needs of the other, the easier it is to eliminate risk or reduce unintended injury. Awareness of the demands of the other is an indispensable part of any caregiving initiative. When the care-receiver fails to make their needs and demands understood, the caregiving process or procedure becomes problematized. Faced with the triple task of establishing, construing and meeting the needs of their object of care, the caregiver can be easily overwhelmed by their solipsistic interpretations.

In a similar way, the two short stories under study here reveal that misconceptions about the needs of the two children and a blinkered view are the root causes of the caregivers' failure. In both "He" and "The Life You Save May Be Your Own" (henceforth "The Life"), mothers in the name of maternal care and motherly affection delude themselves and others into believing that they hold the unalienable right to decide for their children. This is clearly reflected in the comportments of both mothers who unilaterally delineate what is right and wrong for their children, often dismissing the objections of others who question their commonsensical authority (which is particularly more noticeable in "He"). The children's inability to voice their concerns or express themselves in a straightforward way and the mothers' reluctance or inability to reconsider their behavioral pattern vis-à-vis their kids aggravates the already subtle nature of moral

responsibility.

According to Bauman, whether the other communicates their needs clearly or is silent, the moral self has to represent the content of the message as its knowledge (p. 90). Because the self's representation of the other's demand is indeed a re-presentation of it and thus not completely identifiable with it, a distance opens "between the Other as she-may-be-for-herself and the other I am for—the distance which was not there before" (p. 90). It is on the basis of this re-presented demand that the self (read the care-giver) acts. The result is that the other's demand is likely to be misrepresented and tampered with. In such a situation, 'the other' might either remain silent or voice their disagreement. At any rate, the self as the authorized agency feels obliged to overcome what it sees as the other's "ignorance or mis-interpretation of her own best interest" (Bauman, 1993, p. 91). This is clearly true for the present short stories in which both mentally disabled kids, as care-receivers, are almost literally ignored as no attempt is made to mitigate their speech disorder. As such, their emotional responses manifest themselves in facial expressions or postures and gestures which often go unnoticed, ignored or are likely to be misapprehended by their immediate caregivers, that is, their mothers.

Maternal Care in "He" and "The Life"

"He" is about the poor family of the Whipples who have a "simple-minded" (Porter, 1979, p. 49) unnamed son. Mrs. Whipples, the mother of the family, misses no opportunity to boastfully brag about how much she loves her second son, particularly in the presence of neighbors. She is obsessed with keeping up appearances in every possible way. Intolerant of the neighbors' sympathetic words, she feels strongly obligated to exaggerate the son's strength, stamina and fearlessness in order to give an appearance of normalcy to her family. She is happy that nothing can hurt him like when "a plank blew off the chicken house and struck Him on the head and He never seemed to know it" (Porter, 1979, p. 50). 'He' would never complain

about the food or "mind the cold" (p. 49). When the neighbors admonished Mrs. Whipples for letting the son climb up the tree, she took their remarks as insinuations about the abnormal condition of her son. Enraged by their intrusive comments, Mrs. Whipples "could hardly keep her hands off Him for acting like that before people, a grin all over His face and her worried sick about Him all the time" (p. 51). The son's inability to express discontent, fear or pain emboldened Mrs. Whipples to choose him for carrying out ever more daunting tasks such as sneaking into the pigsty to snatch the piglet or pasturing a temperamental bull. Finally, the mother's desire for maintaining the appearance of normalcy in her family catches up with her. One winter morning when her son is working on the farm, he slips on the ice, hurting himself so badly that for the first time in his life 'He' starts wriggling uncontrollably with pain on the ground and is inconsolably restless. After this incident, 'He' is bedridden for four months until the doctor convinces Mrs. Whipples that her son needs to be hospitalized. The epiphanic climax of the story occurs on the day of departure when 'He' is about to be carted way to the hospital. It is at this moment that Mrs. Whipples sees the reality of her relationship with her son: "Mrs. Whipples couldn't believe what she saw; He was scrubbing away big tears that rolled out of the corners of His eyes. He sniveled and made a gulping noise" (p. 58). The child's demonstration of his feelings comes as a shocking revelation to Mrs. Whipples:

> Maybe He remembered that time she boxed His ears, maybe He had been scared that day with the bull, maybe He had slept cold and couldn't tell her about it; maybe He knew they were sending Him away for good and all because they were too poor to keep Him. . . She had loved Him as much as she possibly could, there were Adna and Emly who had to be thought of too, there was nothing she could do to make up to Him for His life. Oh, what a mortal pity He was ever born (p. 58).

The story ends on this revelatory and contrite note, leaving the reader astounded by the complexity of human relationships and lack of foresight. The ending clearly corroborates the dubious and ambivalent position the mother is stuck in. What was obvious to the readers now dawns on the mother who has been turning a blind eye and a deaf ear to the reality of her child's mental and physical conditions. The repetition of 'maybe' is noteworthy. Even at this point in the story, Porter leaves a narrow margin for uncertainty. The paragraph is also remarkable in that it grants a rare glimpse into the mind of the alleged caregiver, the mother, who seems to reevaluate her earlier position vis-à-vis her child and by professing her love perhaps she wants to calm her troubled conscience. This declaration of love is immediately undercut by a deep sense of regret for his ever being born. I think this last statement speaks volumes for the emotional ambivalence that imbues the life of those who are in close contact with a congenitally disabled child. O'Connor's "The Life", like the previous story, points to the predicament of moral responsibility. The story concerns the life of Mrs. Crater, a widow, and her mute and mentally challenged daughter, Lucynell. Their life changes with the arrival of a tramp named Mr. Shiftlet who, as his name indicates, tends to be shifty and deceitful. A close reading of the first paragraphs of the story reveals the confrontational approach of the two adults to one another. O'Connor jumps back and forth between descriptive snapshots of the one-armed Mr. Shiftlet and the toothless old woman in a cinematic style. This is, I believe, important, as the silent Lucynell later becomes the object of a bargain. Shiftlet is bent on impressing the old woman with his world-weariness and intellectual maturity. At the same time, the old woman appraises him based on his dexterity and skillfulness which can be helpful on a farm that has fallen into disrepair after her husband's death. Each sees in the other something they need to have. Each recognizes the weak spot of the other and proceeds in accordance with this knowledge to reach the desired goal. Mrs. Crater wants to have a son-in-law who can both look after the place and her daughter. As a tramp, Mr. Shiftlet's attention is drawn to the

dilapidated car collecting dust in the shed. The stage is set for the bargain. Mr. Shiftlet starts mending and repairing here and there:

> He had not been around a week before the change he had made in the place was apparent. He had patched the front and back steps, built a new hog pen, restored a fence, and taught Lucynell, who was completely deaf and had never said a word in her life, to say the word 'bird.' The big rosy-faced girl followed him everywhere, saying 'Burrttddt ddbirrrttdt,' and clapping her hands. The old woman watched from a distance, secretly pleased. She was ravenous for a son-in-law. (O'Connor, 1971, p. 150)

The next thing to do is "to make the automobile run" (p. 150). It is at this point in the story that the old woman suggests the possibility of marriage between Mr. Shiftlet and Lucynell:

> That night, rocking on the porch, the old woman began her business, at once. 'You want you an innocent woman, don't you?' she asked sympathetically. 'You don't want none of this trash.' 'No', I don't,' Mr. Shiftlet said.
> 'One that can't talk,' she continued, 'can't sass you back or use foul language. That's the kind for you to have. Right there,' and she pointed to Lucynell sitting cross-legged in her chair, holding both feet in her hands.
> "That's right," he admitted. "She wouldn't give me any trouble."
> "Saturday," the old woman said, "you and her and me can drive into town and get married." (pp. 151-152)

The marriage proposal makes him uneasy. He does not have money and marriage needs money. Mrs. Crater assures him that Lucynell is a content girl who knows nothing about hotels or honeymoons. Desperate for a son-in-law and knowing that Mr. Shiftlet is a footloose and fancy-free person, she tries to make the conjugal affair as materially appealing as possible. She reminds him that by marrying her daughter he would "be getting a permanent house and a deep well and the most innocent girl in the world', that in addition, he would have a farm with a well 'that never goes dry' and a house that 'is always warm in the winter and there's no mortgage on a thing about this place. And yonder under that shed is a fine automobile" (p.

152). All can be acquired if he agreed to marry her legally and properly. Finally, Mr. Shiftlet acquiesces to her plan on the condition that he can take Lucynell on a short honeymoon by the newly repaired car. The story ends with Mr. Shiftlet heading west after he has dumped his mentally disabled bride in a diner.

Like the previous story, Mrs. Crater is concerned about the life of her child. Her actions and decisions are naturally out of goodwill and are justifiably so. Being a decrepit and aging mother, she must be apprehensive of a future when she will not be available for her disabled child. Yet, we can blame her for not seeing through Mr. Shiftlet's humbuggery and guilefulness or having let herself believe in the uprightness of Mr. Shiftlet.

If Mrs. Whipples' self-deluding tendency is created by the obsession with normalcy, Mrs. Crater, in a similar vein, strives to compensate for her daughter's disability through material palliatives such as the automobile and a permanent residence. Their blinkered visions preclude them from seeing the reality of their children's condition. Both mothers are also blameworthy because they blindly adhere to a self-serving idea of the truth about their offspring.

The endings of both stories are similar in that they perfectly illustrate the unpredictability of care situations and the difficulty of achieving the desired outcome. Despite differences between the two stories, they both depict the complexity of moral decisions concerning the other. The problem with moral situations is that the self has no yardstick with which to assess the soundness of moral actions. The non-existence of any touchstone for evaluating the validity and fruitfulness of decisions is the core argument of recent studies which emphasize the indeterminacy and ambivalence of moral responsibility. The stories also corroborate the postmodern stance explicated by Bauman in *Postmodern Ethics* according to which morality cannot be formulated in terms of non-aporetic and universalizable ethical codes. This postmodern approach rejects the previously trusted foundations

of morality best formulated as prescriptive laws premised on reason and commonsense. The definitiveness and conclusiveness that characterize prescriptive moral codes can be considered as their strength and weakness. Strength, because the self acts as an agent discharging pre-defined duties. As a result, the self cannot be held accountable for the success or failure of the situation. The weakness is that every moral situation is taken as a specimen of a general model and is, by default, treated universally in a similar way. Thus, no room is left for exceptions. The postmodern conception of morality stresses the exceptionality of every moral encounter. In this way, it emphasizes on the fact that responsibility is not transferrable or negotiable. In other words, "the substitution of heteronomous, enforced-from-outside, ethical rules for the autonomous responsibility of the moral self can lead to the incapacitation, even destruction, of the moral self" (Bauman, 1993, p. 12).

The problem facing the two mothers or any moral self is two-fold: assessing the situation and responding based on that assessment. In both steps, there is the likelihood of having one's judgment impaired through misapprehension or misconception. Hence the self as the caregiver is entangled in the difficulty of establishing a relationship with the other in a meaningful and constructive way. This creates a double bind because, as I said earlier, the degree to which the self is willing to relinquish part of its proverbial authority or retain it as an indispensable part of any caregiving situation. Thus, for Bauman (1993) "morality is incurably *aporetic*" (p. 11, emphasis in original). The aporia becomes particularly noticeable in caregiving situations where the complete implementation of the moral impulse requires the total commitment of "the moral actor" to seriously try "to stretch the effort to the limit" (p. 11). It is in this "context of ambivalence . . . shot through with uncertainty" that every "moral impulse . . . taken to its extreme leads . . . to domination and oppression" (p. 11). Pitfalls of moral responsibility become visible as we realize how care situations are volatile and can precipitate a crisis.

Disability and Care

My analysis would be incomplete if I did not investigate one possible reason behind the mothers' failure. Here I am specifically referring to a possible external factor that could have shaped the mothers' perspective. There is no denying that if the kids did not have a disability they would have been treated differently. Rather than seeing disability as an intrinsic factor, it is, as suggested in disability studies, an extrinsic element created part by ableist ideologies: "Disability is not just a bodily category, but instead and also a social category shaped by changing social factors—just as is able-bodiedness" (Nielsen, 2013, p. 12). It is argued that ableist views arise from a tendency to equate able-bodiedness with normalcy devaluing thus difference and abnormality (Campbell, 2009, p. 5). What follows from these statements is that disability is not a fixed and unchanging category but what is generated in a discursive and contextual way. The disabled are those who deviate from the same. The preponderance of the able-bodied is a determinant that throws the disabled into stark relief. The abnormal is seen as a problem only because of an intolerance of the deviant. "The seduction of sameness" (Campbell, 2009, p. 4) as Campbell puts it, might be responsible for the lapse in parental responsibility. The mothers in both stories either long for creating the illusion of normalcy or tap into cultural and social expectations to gloss over their child's disability. This results from a vision that considers normalcy as a fixed category not as relational and functional. Thus, what is to blame is a set of beliefs and values that permeate society and inculcate a worldview according to which normality is perennial and ineluctably given. Everyone raised within the parameter of such conceptual and cultural economy would tend to construe normalcy as a preexisting and stable condition while disability as secondary and deviant.

To clarify the point, let us look at both stories in light of the argument mentioned above. For instance, let us review the way Lucynell's mother

intended to marry off her daughter. To compensate for her child's domestic abilities, Lucynell's mother capitalizes on her innocence, docility and reticence as good virtues likely to be valued in a patriarchal society: "You want you an innocent woman, don't you?. . . One that can't talk," she continued, "can't sass you back or use foul language. That's the kind for you to have. Right there," and she pointed to Lucynell sitting cross-legged in her chair, holding both feet in her hands" (O'Connor, 1971, p. 151). This way of characterizing betrays a general tendency to see 'the different' as tractable and thus relationally acceptable. The desire for sameness cuts both ways: it can end in the marginalization of the other or its subsumption into the same. Both trends happen here. Despite Mr. Shiftlet's pretensions to be morally intelligent as reflected in his pontification about society being indifferent or not caring to take any trouble (p. 150), he leaves his bride high and dry. In doing so, he shows his moral depravity and duplicity by not upholding ethical values whose absence he diagnoses in society. By teaching the girl the word 'bird' he also confirms what was said earlier about the need to see disability contextually and relationally: "Lucynell's inability to speak is a social problem, not an individual's personal tragedy. Her muteness has at least as much to do with how society treats her as it does with what abilities she was born with or without" (Basselin, 2013, p. 61).

The penchant for masking deficiencies under the veneer of normalcy is overwhelmingly robust in Mrs. Whipples. It reaches the highest point concerning her son and grows into an obsession. She is obviously under tremendous pressure to maintain the semblance of normalcy at the cost of jeopardizing her son's well-being. Instead of improving her son's living conditions, she assigned him tasks which were pretty daring and risky just to prove he was a normal kid. Thus, she succumbs to the community's expectations of ordinary non-disabled kids. In her insistence on treating her child as a regular kid with concomitant capabilities, she betrays her being in a state of denial. Instead of accepting the reality about her kid, she deliberately turns a blind eye to the status quo, resorting to a policy that

aims to iron out the difficulty rather than address it. Both mothers' claim to maternal love seems to be sheer pretense which the more overblown the more self-deluding it becomes. The fact that neither mother ever attempted to improve their child's social and intellectual skills using an educational program or plan indicates their indifference to or acceptance of their child's situation. For example, in "He", Mrs. Whipples takes advantage of her child's physical strength aided by his unmindfulness to run household chores. He is not given any education to improve his cognitive and mental function. To conclude this section, I believe Pushkin's maxim summarizes both mothers' attitudes beautifully: "dearer to us the falsehood that exalts than hosts of baser truths" (as cited in Chekhov, 2006, p. 209).

Conclusion

The two short stories perfectly illustrate the difficulty of attaining the desired outcome in caregiving situations and fulfilling one's responsibility. The two mothers faced with the daunting task of providing care and protection for their children inadvertently bring harm to them. Deluded by their idea of protectiveness and care for their kids, they fail to see that their decisions are sometimes tainted by self-interest and are therefore self-serving. For example, Mrs. Whipples seems to be more concerned with keeping up appearances and maintaining a public impression of normality than being genuinely worried about the wellbeing of her son. Similarly, Mrs. Crater appears to be willing to marry her daughter off to any man in order to have some able-bodied person to see to the maintenance of the farm and the house. All in all, caregiving situations call for an unwavering vigilance on the caregiver's part to forestall any lapsing into complacency. At the same time, one needs to be able to distinguish the truth of the other's demand from one's interpretation of that truth. To what extent one is reading meaning into the other's demand or command is that which separates power from care.

References

Basselin, T. J. (2013). *Writing a Theology of Disabled Humanity*. Baylor University Press.

Bauman, Z. (1993). *Postmodern Ethics*. Blackwell.

Campbell, F. K. (2009). *Contours of Ableism: The Production of Disability and Abledness*. Palgrave Macmillan.

Chekhov, A. (2006). Goosberries. In T. R. Arp & G. Johnson (Eds.), Perrine's *Literature: Structure, Sound and Sense* (pp. 202-212). Thomson Wadsworth.

Nielsen, K. E. (2013). *A Disability History of the United States*. Beacon Press.

O'Connor, F. (1971). *The Complete Stories*. Farrar, Straus and Giroux.

Porter, K. A. (1979). *The Complete Stories*. Harvest.

POSSIBLE ANALOGUES OF INVENTED PLANT SPECIES OF TOLKIEN'S MIDDLE-EARTH IN EARTH'S CURRENT FLORA

Elçin Parçaoğlu

Kocaeli University

Arda Acemi

Kocaeli University

Abstract

Tolkien's mythology of Middle-earth is a highly studied corpus in ecology and environmental studies. Due to the cosmogonic nature of this mythology, ecological patterns are both similar and different to our world. Especially in terms of biodiversity, the flora and fauna we encounter in the corpus are at the centre of ecological and environmental approaches. Plant biodiversity supports the unique habitat formation of many regions in the history of this mythology. Being interested in botany, Tolkien paid particular attention to plants' geographical distribution and location and broke new ground in terms of diversity. In this diversity, there are also some plants that he invented. The purpose of this paper is to compare some plants Tolkien invented – athelas, mallorn, elanor, niphredil, and simbelmynë – with their companion plants in Earth's current flora. In addition, these plants' geographic locations in Middle-earth will also be revealed in terms of climate and vegetation diversity.

Keywords: flora, *The Lord of the Rings*, Middle-earth, plants, J. R. R. Tolkien

Introduction

Middle-earth mythology, designed by the British writer J. R. R. Tolkien (1892-1973) in almost 60 years, has a dynamic content in terms of ecology. In this mythology, in which the formation process of the universe named Eä is explained, and the continuity of the formation is emphasized, biodiversity and ecosystems change considerably over the ages and are remarkable. It is observed that ecological and cosmological formations act together and affect each other, resulting in the diversification of plant species. This interaction is hidden within the purpose of the creation of the universe. Ilúvatar's designation of the universe and Valar's creation of it serve this purpose: the beauty and goodness of the universe itself. When these concepts are examined a little more, how biodiversity and ecosystems support these concepts can be understood.

Biodiversity – especially plant biodiversity – created for the good and beauty of the universe contributes significantly to the universe's cosmology. Some of the plants, especially in *The Lord of the Rings*, make an outstanding contribution to the book's plot. Although some of these species are found in the Earth's existing flora as widely distributed cosmopolitan plants, Tolkien imagined others as unique and native species for Middle-earth as well.

Since ancient times, plants have been used for various purposes, such as foods, natural sources for medicinal treatments, wooden buildings and furniture materials, and natural fiber sources for clothing (Christenhusz et al., 2017). These multi-purpose benefits of plants make them one of the essential natural resources in human life. To date, around 390,000 different plant species in 452 families have been identified in Earth's flora (Willis, 2017). In the taxonomical classification of plant species, very detailed identification keys are used. These keys include morphological data from various organs and parts of plants. Scientists examine whether the plant under investigation fits in the descriptions given in the keys and identify plant

species. Even changes in the millimetric scale might lead to a difference in the identification. With the enhancement in molecular biology techniques, these identifications are now being made at the DNA level (Bog et al., 2019). Therefore, Tolkien's narrowed descriptions of the plants make it difficult to use these scientific techniques to precisely identify the correct names of the species. However, the limited descriptions in *The Lord of the Rings* allow assuming the analogue species. Thus, this study aims to discuss these species' analogues, which are specially invented and appear in *The Lord of the Rings*, correspond to in Earth's flora. In this context, the five plants – athelas, mallorn, elanor, niphredil, and simbelmynë - will be discussed from botanical, medical, and literary perspectives.

Athelas

Where to Find: The athelas plant appears in Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings*. Leaving Bree to reach Rivendell under Aragorn's leadership, the hobbits arrive at the ruins of the Arnor Kingdom tower built by Elendil on Amon Sûl. Searching for Gandalf's trace at Weathertop, where the watchtower was located, the company is met by the Ringwraiths instead of Gandalf, and Frodo is mortally wounded. This wound instantly paralyzes Frodo's arm: "Frodo dozed, though the pain of his wound was slowly growing, and a deadly chill was spreading from his shoulder to his arm and side" (Tolkien, 2004, p. 198). Aragorn then leaves Frodo with the other hobbits. When he returns, Aragorn explains why he left with these sentences: "'These leaves,' he said, 'I have walked far to find; for this plant does not grow in the bare hills; but in the thickets away south of the Road I found it in the dark by the scent of its leaves.'" (Tolkien, 2004, p. 198). This plant that Aragorn found is athelas. The geographical location, climate, and vegetation of the place where this plant grows will help us understand which plant species it is a reference to in Earth's current flora. Weathertop is in

the region of Middle-earth called Eriador, which lies to the north of Middle-earth. Located on a hill, Weathertop is surrounded by undulating plains. In terms of climatic conditions, it is seen that winters are cold and summers are mild. This region receives a warm and moist wind from the southwest, during a cold and dry wind from the north. In terms of vegetation, it is a place full of scrub and thickets (Fonstad, 1991, pp. 180-185).

Botanical Characteristics: The species is an evergreen herb with long leaves. These are the only known botanical and morphologic characteristics of the species. To expand the identification of the plant, the illustrations on the internet have been searched. However, it is seen that most of them are wrongly illustrated from a botanical perspective. For example, in one of the illustrations, the species is drawn with five petals (the colourful part of a flower) – a property of dicotyledonous plants – with pale white or whitish colour, and long leaves with parallel veins, which is a property of most monocotyledonous plants (Phelan, 2011). Also, based on the drawings of the plant on the internet, the species morphologically looks similar to *Lysimachia* sp. (Loosestrife) from the Primulaceae (Primrose) family. However, leaves of *Lysimachia* species have no such medicinal properties as described below. The long leaves of the species might correspond to the botanical terms "linear" or "lanceolate" that defines its morphological characteristics. As mentioned before, the habitat of Athelas is designated as woodlands and dense forests.

Medicinal Properties: According to Tolkien, the species' leaves have analgesic properties when applied as an infusion to cure "Black Breath." Also, this medicinal property of the species might be a sign of its restoring activity on the nervous system. The fresh scent arising from the infusion of the leaves should be a sign of the rich essential oil (volatile oils) content of the leaves, a general property of the species from the Lamiaceae (Mint; Labiatae) family known for its aromatic herbs and shrubs (Karpiński, 2020).

Possible Analogue Species: Tolkien's description of the plant's botanical and medicinal properties should be taken into account to find the analogue of the species from today's flora. This hypothesis suggests species of six potential genera of the Lamiaceae family, namely *Mentha* sp. (Mint; herb), *Salvia* sp. (Sage; herb), *Rosmarinus* sp. (Rosemary; shrub), *Ocimum* sp. (Basil; herb), *Thymus* sp. (Thyme; herb), and *Laurus* sp. (Laurel; shrub). However, *Thymus*, *Rosmarinus*, *Ocimum*, and *Laurus* species should be discarded since they do not have many long-leaved individuals. Also, *Laurus* and *Rosmarinus* species are in shrub form but not an herb. Considering their scents of leaves, medicinal uses, and healing effects on the nervous system *Mentha* and *Salvia* species with longer leaves might have better possibilities than the other species. Mint species have rich menthol and menthone contents in their leaves, which are volatile oils with strong analgesic properties and fresh scents (Singh e al., 2005). In contrast, *Salvia* species' leaves have camphor, cineole, and thujone as volatile oils with similar medicinal properties and anti-cancer activities (Kammoun El Euch et al., 2019). On the other hand, there are other species from different plant families that include species with such medicinal properties as *Foeniculum* sp. (Fennel) from Apiaceae (Carrot) family (Rahimi & Ardekani, 2013). However, these species do not fit into the botanical characteristics narrowly described by Tolkien. As mentioned before, in botanical identification keys of plant species, definitions of the morphologic characteristics of plant species are given in full detail with precise descriptions, measurements in numbers, and colours. Thus, to the best of our conclusion, the species with healing effects and long leaves found among trees should be one of the *Mentha* or *Salvia* species. The meaning of the Latin name "Salvia" was derived from "salvus, salus, salutis," which means "healthy, health, heal" in English, which is in line with its medicinal uses. However, the members of this genus prefer dry habitats and mostly grow on limestones, calcareous rocks, and rocky slopes, which makes it incompatible with Tolkien's habitat description. In contrast, Mentha species are found near streams and other wet areas, and also they can grow both in partial shade, the ambient created by surrounding trees (Davis, 1982). In conclusion, *Mentha* species are the only remaining possible options to define the botanical name of Athelas.

Mallorn

Where to Find: Mallorns are the golden trees of Lórien. Lórien, a realm ruled in the Third Age by Galadriel, one of the Noldor elves, is like a reflection of Valinor in the West. Galadriel, a horticulturist, has a unique soil and plant species in her garden, Lórien. Mallorns are the most spectacular of these types, as they are also home to the Galadhrim elves. Lothlórien provides a rest for the Fellowship of the Ring who escaped from the Moria mines. It is a region that should be examined in terms of plant diversity. Legolas says the following about the most famous trees of this region, which allows resting to the Fellowship of the Ring, members of whom were in grave danger: "[I]n the autumn their leaves fall not, but turn to gold. Not till the spring comes and the new green opens do they fall, and then the boughs are laden with yellow flowers; and the floor of the wood is golden, and golden is the roof, and its pillars are of silver, for the bark of the trees is smooth and grey" (Tolkien, 2004, p. 335). The most prominent feature of the Galadhrim elves is that they live on these trees. This region is in the middle of Middle-earth. It consists of undulating lowlands. In the region where Lothlórien is located, the climate is cold in winters and warm in summers, but since Lothlórien is ruled by Galadriel, the climate and vegetation vary in their own way. In terms of vegetation, it has a dense forest area.

Botanical Characteristics: The species is a tree with leaves that do not fall in autumn but turn yellow in the season. When the spring comes, and fresh green leaves occur, its yellow leaves fall, and the tree flowers are yellow. The bark of the tree is grey. No further descriptions are found about the tree

in *The Lord of the Rings*.

Medicinal Characteristics: There is no medicinal property of the plant indicated in *The Lord of the Rings*.

Possible Analogue Species: The fallen yellow leaves on the ground and yellow flowers on their branches in spring give a golden look to the tree. Also, the tree is expected to have strong branches since sheds are built on them. Upon the limited information given, the species might be *Eucalyptus* sp. (Eucalyptus or Blue gum) from Myrtaceae (Myrtle) family with yellowish-white flowers and grey bark. Also, the species is considered to be an evergreen tree.

Elanor

Where to Find: The two flowers (Elanor and Niphredil), like Mallorns, are exclusive to Lothlórien, the realm of Galadriel. Haldir talks about these flowers as follows: "Here ever bloom the winter flowers in the unfading grass: the yellow elanor, and the pale niphredil" (Tolkien, 2004, p. 350). However, they could have originated in the Elder Days since they bloomed in the Northern Beleriand.

Botanical Characteristics: The species is an herb with star-shaped yellow petals. No further descriptions of the plant in *The Lord of the Rings* are found.

Medicinal Characteristics: There is no medicinal property of the plant indicated in *The Lord of the Rings*.

Possible Analogue Species: The shallow and minimal information about the species make it hard to associate with a good plant. However, in the light of illustrations found on the internet, the species seems like *Lysimachia* sp. (Primulaceae), *Hypoxis* sp. (Common goldstar) from Hypoxidaceae (Star-grass family), and *Zephyranthes* sp. (Rain Lily) from Amaryllidaceae (Amaryllis family) with yellow petals.

Niphredil

Where to Find: Niphredil is an ancient flower. Niphredil and Elanor could be found in Doriath, the north of Beleriand, in the First Age of Middle-earth. Galadriel may have kept their seeds for ages since she dwelt in Doriath with Elven-king Thingol and Maia Melian in the First Age. In the poem "The Lay of Leithian," the flowers are mentioned as follows: "There mirth there was and voices bright / there eve was peace and morn was light / there jewel gleamed and silver wan / and red gold on white fingers shone / and elanor and niphredil / bloomed in the grass unfading still" (Tolkien, 2015, p. 333). In addition, these flowers are associated with Lúthien, daughter of King Thingol: "In the forest of Neldoreth it is said that she was born and cradled under the stars of heaven, and the white flowers of niphredil came forth to greet her, as stars from the earth" (Tolkien, 1994, p. 10).[1]

Botanical Characteristics: The species is an herb with pale-coloured white petals. It blooms during winter. No further descriptions of the plant in *The Lord of the Rings* are found.

Medicinal Characteristics: There is no medicinal property of the plant indicated in *The Lord of the Rings*.

Possible Analogue Species: The winter-blooming flowers with white petals limit the possible species to *Galanthus* sp. (Snowdrop) and *Leucojum* sp. (Snowbell) from Amaryllidaceae family, *Cyclamen* sp. (Alpine violet) from Primulaceae family, and *Crocus* sp. (possibly *Crocus vernus*; Dutch crocus) from Iridaceae (Iris family). Considering drawings of the species on the internet, the species might be one of the *Galanthus* or *Leucojum* species since these plants flower during the winter season. Especially, *Galanthus* sp. prefers snowy and cold weather to bloom.

---

1 Our pagination.

Simbelmynë

Where to Find: It means "ever-mind," and it is a "small white flower in Rohan, growing thickly on the burial mounds of the kings of the Mark" (Drout, 2007, p. 513). The land of Rohan is located in the south of Middle-earth. While there are plains and bottomlands on its northern border, the White Mountains draw its southern border. The winters are mild, and the summers are warm. While the warm and moist wind blows from the west, the cold and dry wind blows from the east. There are tall grasslands (Fonstad, 1991, pp. 180-185). Additionally, this flower is mentioned in the city of Gondolin, the Hidden City, in the First Age. When Tuor reaches the city under the guidance of Voronwë, he sees these flowers before the Gate of Silver: "like stars bloomed the white flowers of uilos, the Evermind that knows no season and withers not" (Tolkien, 2014, p. 64). "Uilos" is the Elven name of Simbelmynë. It is understood that this flower's origin is based on Elder days when the Elves ruled in a large area such as Beleriand of Middle-earth.

Botanical Characteristics: The species is considered a shrub with a thick stem. It grows on the burial mounds and has small white flowers. No further descriptions of the plant in *The Lord of the Rings* are found.

Medicinal Characteristics: There is no medicinal property of the plant indicated in *The Lord of the Rings*.

Possible Analogue Species: The thick stem, small white flowers, and its shrub nature might be the indicators. However, these are minimal descriptions. It might be evergreen and flowers often. These properties of the plant might be associated either with *Nerium* sp. (Oleander) from Apocynaceae (Dogbane family) or *Jasminum* sp. from Oleaceae (Olives family) with white flowers. However, the thicker stems of *Nerium* sp. increase the possibility of analogism.

Conclusion

As seen in the analogues, these invented plants of Tolkien are distributed in a wide range of families. Thus, it is undeniable how wide the limits of Tolkien's imagination are, although he was not a botanist. In particular, the analogue species given for the two plants, athelas, and mallorn, have a much higher rate than the others in terms of accuracy. In addition, their presence in Middle-earth cosmology reflects Tolkien's ecological perspective, especially as seen in the athelas plant. It can be emphasized that Middle-earth mythology, in addition to its contributions to literature with ecocritical theory, may also prioritize contemporary interdisciplinary studies in terms of offering fields of study that include many scientific fields, including botanical science.

References

Bog, M., Appenroth, K. J., & Sree, K. S. (2019). Duckweed (Lemnaceae): its molecular taxonomy. *Frontiers in Sustainable Food Systems*, 3, 117.

Christenhusz, M. J. M., Fay, M. F., & Chase, M. W. (2017). *Plants of the World: An Illustrated Encyclopedia of Vascular Plants.* University of Chicago Press.

Davis, P. H. (1982). *Flora of Turkey and The East Aegean Islands*, (Vol. 7). Edinburgh University Press.

Drout, M. D. C. (Ed.), (2007). *J. R. R. Tolkien Encyclopedia: Scholarship and Critical Assessment.* Routledge.

El Euch, S. K., Hassine, D. B., Cazaux, S., Bouzouita, N., & Bouajila, J. (2019). Salvia officinalis essential oil: Chemical analysis and evaluation of anti-enzymatic and antioxidant bioactivities. *South African Journal of Botany, 120*, 253-260.

Fonstad, K. W. (1991). *The Atlas of Middle-earth.* Houghton Mifflin Company.

Karpiński, T. M. (2020). Essential oils of Lamiaceae family plants as antifungals. *Biomolecules, 10*(1), 103.

Phelan, J. (2011). *What Is Life? A Guide to Biology with Physiology*. W.H. Freeman Custom Publishing.

Rahimi, R., & Ardekani, M. R. S. (2013). Medicinal properties of Foeniculum vulgare Mill. in traditional Iranian medicine and modern phytotherapy. *Chinese Journal of Integrative Medicine, 19*(1), 73-79.

Singh, A. K., Raina, V. K., Naqvi, A. A., Patra, N. K., Kumar, B., Ram, P., & Khanuja, S. P. S. (2005). Essential oil composition and chemoarrays of menthol mint (Mentha arvensis L. f. piperascens Malinvaud ex. Holmes) cultivars. *Flavour and Fragrance Journal, 20*(3), 302-305.

Tolkien, C. (Ed.) (2015). *The Lays of Beleriand (The History of Middle-Earth)* (Vol. 3). Harper Colins Publishers.

Tolkien, J. R. R. (2012). *Unfinished tales of Númenor and Middle-earth.* Houghton Mifflin Harcourt.

Tolkien, J. R. R. (2004). *The Lord of the Rings.* HarperCollins Publishers.

Tolkien, C., & Tolkien, J. R. R. (1994). *The War of the Jewels: The Later Silmarillion, Part Two (The History of Middle-Earth)* (Vol. 11). Houghton Mifflin Harcout.

Willis, K. J. (ed.) 2017. *State of the World's Plants 2017*. Report. Royal Botanic Gardens, Kew.

Epiphany

THE ABSENCE OF PANDEMIC LITERATURE: RE-EX-PERIENCING THE PANDEMIC IN KERR'S UNITY (1918) AND IN CONTEMPORARY TIME

Safaa Falah Hasan Alsaranga

Istanbul Gelişim University

Introduction

In the last few decades, the term "pandemic" was not sufficiently expressed by the literary and historical mediums. Instead, "pandemic" remained a classical term that was always associated with the 1918 Spanish flu until the occurrence of the COVID-19 virus and its assessment as a pandemic. When performing research on pandemics, historical archives and historical encyclopedias are consistently the first major sources to be relied upon. However, literature has its own realistic reflection of some major aspects of the 1918 pandemic, nonetheless, that reflection was not thoroughly examined. Modernist writers echoed the pandemic very briefly as their main focus was poured into World War I. The Spanish flu pandemic occurred towards the end of the notorious First World War, at a time in which the public's attention was completely drawn to war and its long-awaited outcome. As a result, no immediate measures were taken against the Spanish flu pandemic upon its spread, which would later record significantly more fatalities than that of the two world wars combined. The main issue back then was the war as it was more urging and demanding than the pandemic. On the one hand, women waited for their recruited husbands while working in military industries. Soldiers, on the other hand, were huddled in bunkers, unaware of the virus' invisible threat. By the same token, in an attempt to mirror their society's reality, writers focused on the war rather than on the pandemic.

Abstract

Modernist literature had a strong potential for representation and embodiment. It vividly conveyed the reality of the two world wars and the views of the individuals who lived through them. However, there remained one missing chain in all of that representation: the pandemic. The impact of the 1918 Spanish flu pandemic on humans was greater than that of the two world wars combined. Yet, it was not highlighted by authors back then and was only briefly and indirectly represented due to its invisibility, unlike war. In later times, pandemic writing had slightly flourished and new works directly reflected the pandemic, such as Kevin Kerr's *Unity (1918).* The play seems to mimic our contemporary experience under COVID-19, although it portrays the Spanish flu pandemic of 1918. This means that the play shows many similarities and parallels to our life under the pandemic of today, as it demonstrates the similarities between the Spanish flu and COVID-19. This paper reveals part of the causes concealed behind the literary silence of the flu pandemic of 1918. Moreover, it provides a brief comparison between the pandemic in *Unity (1918)* and the pandemic of today asserting the significance of literary representation of these events.

Keywords: Spanish flu, COVID-19, pandemic literature, Kevin Kerr, Unity (1918)

From a literary aspect, *Unity (1918)* was one of the earliest works to provide a live and direct demonstration of the pandemic upon its first performance in the late nineties. The play explicitly embodies the struggle and devastation that people underwent during the Spanish flu pandemic in 1918. The scenes in the play that demonstrate life under the Spanish flu pandemic are similar to contemporary experiences of the COVID-19 pandemic. The play would seem uncanny and alien because of its action, but now appears as all too familiar. Kevin Kerr notes that *Unity (1918)*

has been steadily published for 20 years and did not become popular until the spring of 2020, when the COVID-19 pandemic started spreading (K. Kerr, personal communication, August 21, 2021). Kerr's play did not only convey people's life in the 1918 pandemic, but had to do so with all of the restrictions imposed that resemble those of today's pandemic. When combining historical archives with Kerr's play, one can notice that the literary representation in Kerr's play provides a more lively embodiment of the circumstances under the pandemic while history could only preserve events in the form of outlined records. This paper addresses pandemics in a literary context, questioning the reasons behind the literary silence over the Spanish flu pandemic of 1918. Furthermore, it draws parallels between the life under the pandemic in *Unity (1918)* and the life under the contemporary COVID-19 pandemic, highlighting challenges and restrictions.

Pandemic and Literature

Humanity's experience with the Spanish flu pandemic was unforgettable, "as globally, the pandemic killed between 50 and 100 million people, and the United States suffered more deaths in the pandemic than in World War I, World War II, and the conflicts in Korea, Vietnam, Afghanistan, and Iraq combined" (Outka, 2019, p. 1). The Spanish flu pandemic started spreading when the public was watching the end of World War I with anticipation, resulting in a total neglect of the invisible malicious enemy. Therefore, it is crucial to question the literary silence over such a catastrophe. Most of the modernist authors had atrocious experiences with the pandemic: D. H. Lawrence and Edvard Munch barely survived, Gustav Klimt died, W. B. Yeats' wife experienced a fatal case, Virginia Woolf had profound concerns about her illness, and T. S. Eliot was afraid of potential brain damage from his case of the Spanish flu (Outka, 2019, p. 1). Then, what could be behind this conspicuous silence and erasure of such a significant event in modernist literature? The tremendous numbers of deaths due to the Spanish flu were not considered as historical in the way war casualties were. The

majority of readers will fail to find pandemic narratives in general and of the 1918 pandemic in particular. This stems from the public, including the modernist writers, who prioritized military conflicts over the microscopic virus, allowing military conflicts to define history while reducing the significance of the pandemic's role. In addition, common traditions viewed deaths from illness "with seemingly less valiant, more feminine forms of death" (Outka, 2019, p. 2), providing another reason for the absence of pandemic writing. Moreover, illness and war are interpreted differently as they impact humans differently. Outka (2019) contends that the pandemic's effect was certainly sensual and pathological, and its danger was microscopic in the literal meaning. By contrast, the war was visible, easier to observe, and thus easier to take a stance on, it affected both civilians and soldiers with its events and outcomes, it was the males' race for power and strength and thus, literature would make it its focal point. Writers mostly associate their writing with events with considerable importance for others; such events are assumed to be touching human sentiments and having imageries of grief and loss, often present in wars which most of the modernist authors preferred.

Despite the seeming disappearance of a direct reference to the Spanish flu pandemic, its traces can still be noticed within a few major literary works of the modern era. Within the lens of the pandemic, *The Waste Land* and *Mrs. Dalloway* reflect in their modernist metaphors shocking scenes of fragmentation and signs of shrapnel and severe dementia which are qualities shared by both war and the pandemic. Moreover, "invasions become ones of microbes and not only men; postwar ennui reveals a brooding fear of an invisible enemy" (Outka, 2019, p. 3). Writers such as T. S. Eliot and Woolf did not intend to include the pandemic in their writing, but as it existed in their unconsciousness, it eventually transferred itself into their narratives. One of the primary topics highlighted in modernist literature was violence. While the forms of violence could alter, they shared the same fundamentals. In terms of violence, the war and the pandemic are alike as

they both cause severe harm and damage.

Unlike war, a pandemic is very delocalized and has no location or borders limitations, it is not biased towards any country and it consumes the body from within. In her book *At the Violet Hour*, Cole (2014) assures that modernist literature is "profoundly shaped by the call of violence" (pp. 5-6) in both form and theme. She also argues that if the body was violated by a non-sentient external agent (the virus), it will unmistakably corrupt the internal organs of the body and even cause bleeding in some cases (Cole, 2014, pp. 5-6). Modernism's narratives depicted violence not only as an element of war but also as an abstract idea that covers illness. The picture of the pandemic resides in the indirect qualities of modernism, including violence. On the surface it appears to readers as a chronology of suffering during the war; yet, in its deep interpretation, the elements of the pandemic are apparent to some extent. Therefore, modern literature's characteristics emerge as subterranean echoes of the pandemic's horrors and the very ways these horrors go underground as the pandemic has always been "a hidden force that has been there all along, exerting weight and influence" (Outka, 2019, p. 3). The pandemic is not only invisible for people in real life, but it is also invisible in their imagination, as it is literally microscopic.

Experiencing the Pandemic in *Unity (1918)* and in Contemporary Time

As the war and the pandemic's imminent risks faded and fears of their return receded, authors grew more eager to revive the pandemic: to express its harm directly, explain its significance, and forecast its long-term ramifications. Through his play *Unity (1918),* Kevin Kerr resembled such authors that embodied the pandemic from numerous aspects. The play chronicles the progress of the Spanish flu pandemic in the Canadian city of Unity, while also exploring the public's attitudes towards both war and the pandemic. Unity is hit by a mysterious fatal pandemic affecting old and young people, and eventually leads to rapid deaths. At the initial outbreak of the

pandemic, strict measures are enforced and the community is isolated to keep the virus away, as social distancing becomes a must. Moreover, the people of Unity become paranoid and residents turn on each other trying to find a scapegoat for the problem.

In *Unity (1918)*, although the proposed "enemy" is not fully present in Unity until the second act, Kerr places some signs that predict a coming disaster. In the prologue's opening, there is a sound of a threshing machine described as a "distant horrible roar" (p. 11) dominating the atmosphere. When considering the historical context of the year 1918, this puzzling and enigmatic sound takes on a dual meaning: first as a reference to the mechanized First World War and second as foreshadowing of the upcoming virus.

As explained before, people back home were in a state of anticipation about the war as they waited for soldiers to come home from the battlefield. This is reflected earlier in the play before the arrival of the virus to Unity when Bea, a young civilian woman who has always been curious about the soldiers' circumstances in the trenches, is stunned by what she has been told by a returning soldier:

Bea: (aside) A soldier. A wounded soldier. … we all wanted from him something we had been waiting so long for, contact with that other world. A story. A war story. But instead he just talked about how everyone in Halifax had the flu. (Kerr, 2002, p. 37)

This excerpt depicts the beginning of people's confusion following the arrival of the virus. Bea is shocked hearing soldiers' stories about how the virus spread rather than the awaited stories of their battlefield heroism. Furthermore, this demonstrates the perplexity of soldiers who have been exposed to the virus before the people back home. Seeing soldiers returning with stories about illness rather than those of the battlefield made people anguished and frustrated, contributing to the overall dark and existential atmosphere of the era. Simultaneously, modernist writers were puzzled witnessing a major event like the First World War becoming intertwined

with the unknown pandemic that spread vastly, threatening people's lives.

The play's depiction of life during the Spanish flu and the COVID-19 pandemic seems uncannily similar. The Canadian performer Danny Saretsky, who played Stan, is surprised by the similarities between the play and the current situation, stating "There is a lot of similarities" (**Toben, 2015**) and that the play was "disturbingly parallel" (**Toben, 2015**) to our reality nowadays. Besides, the two pandemics are "eerily similar" from various aspects according to WCNC news channel report (Ruffes, 2021). Because of these many similarities of the life represented in *Unity (1918)* and our lives today, it became vital to uncover and build on these parallels. The most obvious one is the governmental role for mandatory restrictions for the sake of reducing the spread of the virus. In an interview with the Swiss news agency SDA, historian Kaspar Staub stated that "It's remarkable how ever-greater similarities are emerging in the actions of the government and the authorities during the pandemics in 1918 and 2020" (Swiss note many parallels between Covid-19 and Spanish flu, 2021). In the play, the government had to enforce new restrictions on people, such as social distancing, no spitting cautions, and mandatory quarantine for those infected, in order to reduce the damage of the virus. Anyone not to abiding these laws will be fined:

Rose: ... No spitting in public.
Doris: If you have it [the virus] they put a notice on your door. You're quarantined.
Rose: I know, but it's a twenty-five dollars fine. (p. 51)

Within the climate of restrictions, a new law in Unity that designates the flu pandemic as a "reportable disease" (p. 51). And such a law, Doris explains, "means you have to report / occurrences of . . . [influenza] to the health authorities" (p. 51). McNulty, who asks Doris about the new pandemic-control policies, questions "why you'd report the flu in your house if it means that suddenly everyone avoids you like you have the plague" (p. 52). Furthermore, Bea reports that "the town has been quarantined. Not because

of illness, but because of fear of illness. No one is allowed to enter or leave. . . . Trains have been ordered not to stop. No pick ups or deliveries. The mail is piled outside of town and will be burned later" (p. 72). It seems that the government of Unity is bewildered by the idea of a new coming virus that has unknown consequences.

In the case of the recent virus, the governments have taken similar precautions to stop its spreading; the WHO issued a quarantine guideline to be relied on worldwide. The guidelines state that not only the infected ought to quarantine but also any other possible contacts (Considerations for quarantine of contacts of COVID-19 cases, 2021). Wearing masks was also one of the main precautions paralleled between the play and reality. In the play, citizens were not allowed to leave their place without wearing masks as masks were counted as the first defense line against the virus:

Rose: Mask. That's also the law... You can buy them or make them, but you can't go without one. (p. 52)

A close reading of the extract above reveals that almost every word and expression is relatable to the situation during COVID-19. Concerning masks, the WHO states on its website that "Masks are a key measure to suppress transmission and save lives" (When and how to use masks, 2021).

The simultaneous occurrence of both war and the pandemic put both people at home and soldiers on the battlefield in a state of defense against the unknown. While soldiers fought against human enemies, people back home fought against the pandemic, the similarity between the both creates a shift in the use of martial language which started to be used in describing the practices of nurses and health workers. While soldiers encourage each other, Bea encourages her friend Mary to "[turn] . . . defeat into victory" and to preserve her "Canadian Bravery" (p. 49). Then she approaches Mary, saying "we just have to be brave like a soldier" (p. 50). Likewise, during the COVID-19 pandemic, martial language is present, as health workers

who look after COVID-19 patients are referred to as "frontline fighters" or "frontline heroes".

The play does not only reflect the similarities between the Spanish flu in 1918 and the COVID-19 pandemic in terms of governmental restrictions but also mentions further social issues, such as the spread of misinformation in society. The spread of misinformation posed a serious problem even before the spread of the Spanish flu since propaganda and various rumors circulated in almost all the countries participating in the war. Upon the arrival of the Spanish flu in 1918, another wave of misinformation was emerging, in which the people associated the sudden spread of the pandemic with the First World War, subsequently blaming their rivals of developing the virus in a biological laboratory and using it as a biological weapon. The global health specialist Dr. Jonathan Quick emphasized three dynamic parallels of every pandemic, including the 1918 flu and the COVID-19 pandemic which are "blame, conspiracy, misinformation" (Ruffes, 2021). The virus had different names in each nation, thus "with the pandemic in 1918, the Spanish got blamed, and each nationality blamed another nationality or another group" (Ruffes, 2021). The 1918 virus was named the French Flu by the Spaniards, and the German Virus by the French, while Germans hypothesized that the virus originated in Russia (**Toben, 2015**). The virus had caused tremendous turmoil due to misinformation, and *Unity (1918)* has succinctly touched upon this notable side. In the play, the people of Unity believe that the virus might have been developed by the Germans as a secret weapon:

Man 2: I read that this flu is uh...might be the Germans. ... Some secret weapon they planted on the coast. (p. 85)

The anonymous Man 2 stands for the public's opinion in the city. He also claims that he has "read" that it might be the Germans. This gives the impression that the media back then contributed in popularizing misinformation. Back in the First World War, Canada fought against the Germans

and the spread of misinformation targeting the enemy was not new in comparison to other nations. In reply to Man 2, Man 1 sarcastically replies "is that right. I thought it might be the germs" (p. 85). The public of Unity has formed a single picture of both the pandemic (germs) and the Germans and categorized them both as an existential enemy. This is similar in nature to the recent claims that COVID-19 was developed in Wuhan and was intended as a biological weapon in the middle of hate and racism against the Asian race.

The most critical pandemic facet that directly impacted people is the psychological one. Being surrounded by an invisible virus that has no track or treatment was bewildering back then. The civilians suffered psychologically from the virus as much as the soldiers did on the battlefield. Consequently, the fierce attack of the pandemic and the continuous death incidents left great psychological damage within people's minds. The psychological impacts caused by the current pandemic are diverse, such as "anxiety, depression, PTSD, alcohol misuse, obsessive-compulsive behaviors, panic and paranoia" (Pedrosa et al., 2020, p. 4). In *Unity (1918),* similar impacts can be noticed in the people of the city:

Mary: Beatrice, I'm so scared. What if the flu comes here? And we get it. I get it ... and die. / And then Richard (p. 50)

As the pandemic progresses, the characters in the play start to suffer from an existential crisis similar to that of war. Characters are afraid that the pandemic could mean the end of the world. Stan says that "This might be our last days on earth" (Kerr, 2002, p. 49) after the situation starts to deteriorate in Unity. Bea also starts thinking that the "world will come to an end this year!" (Kerr, 2002, p. 13). The same feeling has afflicted people during the COVID-19 pandemic as it was "a deeply existential issue that fundamentally changes people" (Van Tongeren et al., 2021, p. 1). To sum up, Kevin Kerr believes that the life under the pandemic depicted in *Unity (1918)* "such as government mandated health orders, mask controversies, social distancing,

the spread of misinformation, and of course the familiar emotional terrain of anxiety, fear, and even the fatigue of what seems to be a never ending war" (K. Kerr, personal communication, August 21, 2021) is relatively aligned with the life under the contemporary COVID-19 pandemic.

Conclusion

In the interwar period, modern literature has not focused much on the Spanish flu pnademic in 1918, nevertheless, its traces can be found in almost every work. Despair, emptiness, and gloominess were expressed in modernist writing not just as a result of the war, but also as a result of the pandemic. The pandemic's representation within interwar literature was indirect and vague. In the late nineties, Kevin Kerr published *Unity (1918)* and its uniqueness stemmed from the fact that it addressed the reality of people under the flu pandemic in a detailed way. *Unity (1918)* gained popularity recently during the COVID-19 crisis because of its striking resemblance to life under COVID-19, despite the fact that *Unity (1918)* is about a pandemic that occurred more than a century ago. Almost every aspect of COVID-19 can be compared with other ones found in the play. Kevin Kerr's *Unity (1918)* can be more elaborative and more attractive in describing the pandemic flu than history books.

References

Cole, S. (2014). *At the Violet Hour: Modernism and Violence in England and Ireland*. Oxford University Press.

Considerations for quarantine of contacts of COVID-19 cases. (Jun 25, 2021). *World Health Organization*. https://www.who.int/publications-detail-redirect/WHO-2019-nCoV-IHR-Quarantine-2021.1

Kerr, K. (2002). *Unity (1918)*. Talonbooks.

Outka, E. (2019). *Viral Modernism*. Columbia University Press.

Pedrosa, A. L., Bitencourt, L., Fróes, A. C. F., Cazumbá, M. L. B., Campos, R. G. B., de Brito, S. B. C. S., & Silva, A. C. S. (2020). Emotional, behavioral, and psychological impact of the COVID-19 pandemic. *Frontiers in Psychology*, *11*.

Ruffes, V. (Oct 11. 2021). "Masking, protests, multiple waves: How the 1918 flu pandemic is eerily similar to and alarmingly different than the COVID-19 pandemic" *WCNC Charlotte*. https://www.wcnc.com/article/news/health/coronavirus/1918-flu-pandemicsimilar-different-covid-19-pandemic-duke-health-institute/275-deb940c3-d66e-4119-8b88-2badbde2c17f

Swiss note many parallels between Covid-19 and Spanish flu. (Feb 9, 2021). *Swissinfo*. https://www.swissinfo.ch/eng/swiss-note-many-parallels-between-covid-19-and-spanish-flu/46356364

Toben, B. (2015). **"**Another drama about another pandemic" *Westmount Magazine*. https://www.westmountmag.ca/unity-1918/

Van Tongeren, D. R., & Van Tongeren, S. A. S. (2021). Finding Meaning Amidst COVID-19: An Existential Positive Psychology Model of Suffering. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 12.

When and how to use masks. (Dec 1, 2020). *World Health Organization*. https://www.who.int/emergencies/diseases/novel-coronavirus-2019/advice-for-public/when-and-how-to-use-masks

BALANCE OF FREEDOM AND SECURITY IN GHANA'S DEMOCRACY DURING COVID-19 PANDEMIC: ANALYSIS OF PRESIDENT NANA AKUFO ADDO'S NATIONAL BRIEFINGS

Sufyan Musah

International University of Sarajevo

Abstract

The purpose of this research is to evaluate the balance of freedom and security in Ghana's democracy during the Covid-19 pandemic via the precautionary measures announced by the government. Ghana is considered as one of the most stable democracies in Africa. Considering the Covid-19 health crisis, via the periodic briefings of the President, this research seeks to find out if and how the President tried to strike a balance between keeping Ghanaians safe and maintaining basic freedoms. Content analysis is used to analyze the 20 speeches given by the President of the Republic of Ghana, Nana Akufo Addo, from March 2020 to March 2021 to assess the President's choice of words regarding freedom and security. The findings indicate that, in times of the heightened security threat posed by the Covid-19 pandemic, the President's speeches included plentiful words of securitization. However, with the help of a detailed analysis and contextualization of the words used, the paper concludes that the President's initiatives and directives were geared towards striking a balance between keeping Ghanaians safe and maintaining basic freedoms.

Keywords: freedom, security, democracy, Covid-19 pandemic, balance

Introduction

Freedom and security are two concepts that live side by side. The availability of security provides the atmosphere in which freedom flourishes. People from all walks of lives can freely live their lives the way they are accustomed to in an atmosphere free of threat to such lifestyles. Therefore, an ideal situation is where balance is achieved regarding freedom and security. One political, philosophical and social concepts that suits this explanation is the response communitarianism, which basically draws its prime tenet on the thought that a good society is the one that carefully balances freedom and security (social order). This is achieved when pluralistic societal interests are prioritized. Even liberalism adheres to this concept regarding liberty and social order (Etzioni, 2005). Specifically, people should be free to go about their personal businesses, however that does not mean that they have the right to harm others (Gordon, 1993). With this, freedom and security are being put to use concurrently, which is how it is often harnessed within a given society.

Both freedom and security are mostly associated with the state in terms of applicability and maintenance because it is the state that possesses the authority and capacity to uphold them. Dinh (2001) relates the state to the concept by saying that "in the same way that an individual's moral right to property would be meaningless unless the government establishes courts of law in which those rights can be declared and enforced so too…. Civil liberties would be a nullity unless they are protected" (p. 400). The protection and enforcement here are rendered by the state. Therefore, although it is possible to discuss freedom and security at individual and organizational levels, it is important to point out that the freedom and security being discussed in this research is located at the state level.

This research examines how the President of Ghana, Nana Akufu-Addo, tried to balance security and freedom during the Covid-19 pandemic through his speeches to his country. Civil libertarians often claim that

governments that seek to limit freedoms take the opportunity to securitize gradually whenever an extraordinary event arises, until people's liberty has decreased significantly (Etzioni, 2005). The President's speeches offer an indication whether an attempt has been made to use the extraordinary event (Covid-19) to securitize or not. Extraordinary events are useful as a measure in this respect due to their rare occurrence. Additionally, this research serves as one test of the reputation Ghana has attained as one of the most democratic and stable countries in Africa (Australian Trade & Investment Commission, 2017). Numerous African countries, including Ivory Coast and Mali, have lost the democratic gains they have achieved over the years and are sliding back into chaos and dictatorship. Irregularities in elections, power struggles, and the Covid-19 pandemic were some of the key factors leading to securitization in those countries, consequently resulting in the loss of some basic freedoms (Campbell & Nolan, 2021; Smith , 2013; Whitehouse, 2012).Comparatively, this research helps to determine whether Ghana continues to be a beacon of democracy in Africa in such extraordinary times. Especially in a time where the strength and tolerance of democracies of the world is being tested by the Covid-19 Pandemic.

Literature

Many authors have written about the balance of security and freedoms in democratic societies. After 9/11, numerous scholars have argued that, in times of perceived extraordinary security crises, governments use these circumstances as an excuse to curtail freedoms (Baker, 2003; Bunyan, 2002; Charles, 2020; Cole, 2003; Haubrich, 2014; Silberstein, 2004). Benkler's (2013) argument highlights how freedom is curbed easily by excessive security measures in times of perceived heightened security threat. He uses the case of the U.S. government's extended surveillance programs on virtually all Americans following the 9/11 terrorist attacks which effectively curtailed the freedom to privacy. Likewise, others have cited a lack of oversight by the judiciary as an enabler for governments to securitize more in times of perceived security threats (Aberbach, 2008; Johnson, 2008; Ornstein and Mann, 2006; Owens, 2006). Others, however, have argued that in times of extraordinary security threats, conventional security mechanisms may not address the crises at hand, thereby justifying a government's imposition of stricter measurers (Gorman, 2002; Price, as cited in Cuomo, 2016; Mooney, 2020). In relation to health crises, Mooney (2020) argues for adopting strict measures if these safeguarded the interest of the public, even if some members of society disagree. In an article in May 2020, Mooney utilizes a narrative/interpretive approach to equate the anti-Covid-19 restrictions movement of today with those of 1832 in Liverpool and 1890 in Nottingham (Mooney, 2020). Analyzing English newspaper contents from that time period, he showed that the contemporary and past anti-pandemic restrictions adherents use a similar language in arguing that the government would take away their freedoms with those restrictions.

Another academic area focuses on the struggle to balance freedom and security (Huysmans, 2010; Ovadia, 2006; Wagner and Kneip, 2018; Waldron, 2017). In a conference titled "Media freedom and independence in times of COVID-19", organized by the UN in May 2020 to tackle disinformation and aid press freedom, UN High Commissioner for Human Rights Michelle Bachelet emphasized that "under international law restrictions on civil liberties in times of crisis should be demonstrated as necessary, appropriate and proportionate" (Bachelet, 2020). Similarly, the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) in May 2020 reiterated that civil liberties curtailment during the pandemic must be "limited to the extent strictly required by the exigencies of the situation" (OSCE, 2020).

Most research conducted about Ghana and the Covid-19 pandemic assessed the pandemic's impact on education due to school closures (Adarkwah, 2021; Amanor-Mfoafo et al., 2020; Agormeda et al., 2020; Owusu-Fordjour et al., 2020; Sabates, Carter & Stern, 2021; Upoalkpajor & Upoalkpajor, 2020). Others have focused on the socio-economic impact of the pandemic on the country (Asante & Mills, 2020; Bukari, et al., 2020; Nakouwo & Akplehey, 2020; Obese et al., 2021; Owusu, Frimpong-Manso, & Kwabena, 2020; Saire & Panford-Quainoo, 2020). Closely related to democratic governance, freedom, and security, some have discussed the

legislative response of the Ghanaian government in the wake of the pandemic (Addadzi-Koom, 2020), the politicization of the pandemic lockdown (Braimah, 2020), and the effect of elections on the easing of the Covid-19 restrictions (Pulejo & Querubín, 2020). Evidently, only little research in Ghana has directed attention towards assessing freedom and security via content analysing of the President's speeches.

More closely related to freedom and security, and as part of the group of scholars arguing that governments tend to use extraordinary crises to curtail freedoms in times of heightened security threat to the public welfare, Charles (2020) argues that the Ghanaian government was setting a dangerous precedent by using the Covid-19 pandemic to curtail the freedom of religion. Using critical analysis of electronics and social media reports, the author stated that, due to the huge impact of religious establishments, they should have been spared closure. Furthermore, the government needed the religious establishments to fill the spiritual and logistical gap the country required most in such difficult times. Therefore, not only was imposing a lockdown on religious establishments detrimental to the people, but it was also not in the best interest of the government.

This paper explores whether Ghana falls within the category of democracies curtailing freedoms in times of extraordinary crises or whether they attempt to balance freedom and security. With the Covid-19 pandemic as the most significant health crisis threating the Ghanaian public since the country's democratic transition in 1992, this paper illuminates where the country stands in terms of balancing security and freedom in times of extraordinary crisis, testing Ghana's quality of democracy and governance by analyzing the balance of freedom and security in these exceptional times.

Definitions of Freedom and Security

The concept of security is broad, and there has been no single definition that fits all situations. Scholars have, however, developed parameters with-

in which definitions of the term may fall. Smith and Brooks (2013) define security as "an outcome of risk" (p. 10) to suggest that the need to securitize is propelled by a presence of perceived danger. Manunta (1999) gives a broader definition of security to equal the availability of assets, with individuals, groups, or nation-states wishing to protect assets against a perceived threat. Security is also defined as "being without unacceptable risk when restricting the concept of risk to intentional unwanted acts by intelligent actors" (Amundrud, Aven & Flage, 2017). Other scholars have associated security with safety, an absence of threat, and the presence of a promise of protection from danger (Jarvis & Holland, 2015). All these definitions share the negation of risk. This research adopts Manunta's (1999) definition due to its broad and encompassing nature, including the nation-state as a protector of assets against a perceived threat. Defining the concept of freedom also requires context, as a "naked" definition of the term would not facilitate the intended purpose in a particular instance. Agamben's (1999) context-less definition of freedom, for instance, states that "Freedom is freedom for both good and evil" (p. 183). The question then is, should people be free to commit evil and illegal acts as an exercise of freedom? Obviously, no society would accept the practicality and eventuality of such a definition. According to Prozorov (2007), "freedom is a priori linked to a form of order as the only possible locus for its practice and, moreover, becomes an attribute of that order" (p. 3). If freedom is not viewed as an embodiment of a particular order, then its parameters and constitutions would be chaotic, and could be subjected to abuse. In relation to freedom as an embodiment of a particular system, Petit (2000) asserts that the restraints by a lawful and fair regime "does not make you unfree" (p. 5). Not only does this indicate that a meaningful definition of freedom is only achieved when the term is associated with a particular order, but it also illustrates a real and legitimate parameter within which it can actually be exercised. Therefore, as far as this research is concerned, Prozorov's definition is adopted to conceptualize and operationalize freedom. Thus,

the freedom of Ghanaians in relation to the Covid-19 pandemic restrictions is defined within the parameters of the laws of Ghana.

Can there be an equilibrium of freedom and security?

The definition of freedom above implies that whenever the need for tighter security arises, some freedoms can be curtailed, or at least perceived to be curtailed by those who overly support freedom. For instance, the frequent killing of black people by police in the U.S. has led to a growing call for defunding and abolishing the police (Davis, 2020; Loader, 2020; O'Rourke, Su & Binder, 2021). These demands partly stem from the fear of a loss of freedom and were not only uttered by ordinary citizens but also by prominent figures, including famous public office holders (Davis, 2020). It has always seemed that for security to be upheld in a society, there must be a compromise regarding some freedoms. Which freedoms ought to be curbed and to what extent usually divide societies. Historically, while Benjamin Franklin proclaimed that "they that can give up essential liberty to obtain a little temporary safety deserve neither liberty nor safety" (Franklin, 1759, as cited in Dinh, 2001, p. 399), Abraham Lincoln, after unilaterally suspending the writ of *habeas corpus* in 1861, maintained that liberty could be an impediment to proper functioning of the government, and a threat to its existence (Dinh, 2001).

Benjamin Franklin's view applies to this research and to modern discussions regarding freedom and security. Essential liberties, such as freedom of movement, to choose what to eat, to own property, to speak one's opinion, could be a good measurement to judge whether freedoms are being curtailed. When these essential liberties are compromised for the sake of a looming security threat, freedom is lost, unless the circumstances are extraordinary, and a reversal to normalcy when the perceived threat has vanished is guaranteed. However, the latter is rarely attained. For example, since the 9/11 terrorist attacks, freedom and liberty have never reversed

to the level they were before the attack (Bigo & Tsoukala, 2008; Bird & Brandt, 2010; Shaheen, 2008). Similarly, the Covid-19 pandemic might equally lead to a long-term curtailment of freedom and liberty (Bauer et al., 2021; Brown et al., 2020; Mayer, Schintler & Bledsoe, 2020; Repucci & Slipowitz, 2020).

Overall, there should be a balance regarding freedom and security if society is to function orderly. While this equilibrium may be easily achieved and held in times free of crisis, the difficulty arises in extraordinary times with a need of and resort to securitization. The definitions of both freedom and security show that excess of either one of them could be a dangerous slope towards a disorderly society. Commenting on the balance of security and freedom, Edmond Burke emphasized that "the only liberty I mean is a liberty connected with order; that not only exists along with order and virtue, but which cannot exist at all without them" (Burke, 1774, as cited in Bork, 1996). This research determines whether the President of Ghana achieved a balance of security and freedom from his numerous speeches regarding the Covid-19 measures, taking into consideration the above definitions and comparisons.

Methodology

This research collected primary data in form of 20 speeches made by the President of Ghana, Nana Akufo Addo, in addressing the Covid-19 pandemic, available on the government of Ghana's official website. This research covers the time span of one year (March 2020 – March 2021). The President's speeches and addresses to the nation regarding the formulation and implementation of the Covid-19 pandemic measures were analyzed qualitatively since they serve as directives and orders for the entire country. Therefore, assessing the balance of freedom and security via this data provides insight into democracy and governance in extraordinary times in Ghana.

Through the use of content analysis, I analyzed the balance between security and freedom based on word frequencies and their contextual usage throughout the 20 speeches of the President. After adopting a definition of security and freedom, the keywords were then categorized into the groups "freedom," "security," and other categories relevant to democracy and governance in Ghana. Words related to precautionary measures were categorized under "security," while words indicating a lack or easing of restrictions were categorized under "freedom." Content analysis is not only applicable in both qualitative and quantitative research (Elo & Kyngäs, 2008; Johnson, Reynolds & Mycoff, 2016) but also aims explicitly for external validity, unlike strictly qualitative research designs (Downe□ Wamboldt, 1992). The reliability of this approach lies in clearly laid out definitions, categorizations, coding of key terms, and procedures used. They should be clear enough to promote inter-coder reliability (Johnson & Mycoff, 2016). To attain reliability, this research has not only categorized freedom related words on one side and security related words on another, but also observed the contextual usage of these words to achieve accuracy in the categorization. For example, if a security related word was used in a context that denotes non-security measures, it was not categorized under "security." Therefore, the measurement and coding of words is based on the observation of both word frequency and contextual usage.

Theoretical and conceptual framework

Securitization theory is used to explain the relationship between the two elements of securitizing political agents and the audience, as well as the third element, the context that enabled the political agents to securitize. According to Buzan and Wæver (2009) of the Copenhagen School, the securitizing agents include state and non-state actors, individuals, and groups, while the referent objects can also consist of individuals, groups, or pressing issue(s) of national interest, including sovereignty, environment, economy, public health, and political crises. The speech act is considered a vital component of the concept because the political agents can accomplish an objective via their discourse rather than report an incident. Ever since its inception, securitization theory has been developed further so that it can be applied widely, since even Wæver admitted to its inherent limitations to explain broader security phenomena (as cited in Stritzel, 2014, p. 12).

As a result, securitization theory has been explicated and applied to various security related areas, including climate change and security (Busby, 2020; Corry, 2011; Lucke, 2020; Mayer, 2012), security and immigration (Bigo, 2002; Huysmans, 2006; Ceyhan & Tsoukala, 2002; Wæver & Carlton, 1993), while others have criticized the theory (Ciută, 2009; Floyd, 2007; Leonard & Kaunert, 2011; McSweeney, 1996; Williams, 2003). One of the most recent criticisms sees securitization theory as racist (Howell & Richter-Montpetit, 2020). Although the authors admit that securitization theory can be applied to non-Western societies, it was nonetheless developed with elements of racial political thought, since the categorization into normal and extraordinary times veils racial violence in "normal" times. Therefore, building on previous critiques of the theory, Howell and Richter-Montpetit argue that securitization theory produces a racist, civilizationist and political imaginary. Moreover, securitization would also violate liberal political order, threatening to erase liberal progress worldwide. While this premise is relevant, it does not affect the extensive applicability of securitization theory, even in non-Western societies, as this research shows.

Balzacq (2005) criticizes the overreliance on speech act of securitization which leaves out the social consequences associated with it. However, he admits "that an effective securitization is audience-centered." Thus, I draw from this to say that the emphasis on the speech act is paramount since the agent's speech is the means by which the audience appreciates and assents to securitization. Moreover, this paper employs this concept because it is useful to explain the Ghanaian President's speeches to the nation in which he announced securitization, using the Covid-19 pandemic as the refer-

ent object. By analysing word choice and frequency, content analysis as a method provides the detail and rigor with which one can conclude as to whether or not Ghana balanced the maintenance of freedom and protection of citizens.

Findings

The table below contains the findings of the research. In the 20 speeches examined, the President used words related to securitization more frequently than words related to freedom. Another aspect of the findings, and relevant to democracy and governance, is the President's use of religious related words, in some cases more often than words in the categories of "freedom" and "security." One such case is the frequent usage of the word 'God' (44 times), in each case to invoke God's blessings on the nation, as shown in the table below. Regarding the pandemic, he mentions that "This too shall pass, because the Battle is still the Lord's", and "May God bless us all and our homeland Ghana and make her great and strong" (Akufo-Addo, 2021). In fact, all the speeches ended with such a sentence, next to the other instances where the President mentioned God.

'Restrictions' is the most frequently used word among all the categories, usually referring to the strict Covid-19 pandemic measures imposed by the government. 'Protect' was used 37 times and was in all cases followed by the mentioning of lives of healthcare personnel, school children, and the nation. The President used 'protect' to justify the securitization, as evident in "It is my job to protect you", "it is very important that we protect all healthcare providers", "we will…. protect people's lives, then their livelihoods" (Akufo-Addo, 2021). Public places that were ordered to close per the President's speeches included schools, nightclubs, beaches, places of worship, as well as the land, sea and air borders of the country, although air traveling was resumed later on. The President mentions that "all Universities, Senior High Schools, and basic schools, i.e., public and private schools, will be closed Monday, 16th March, 2020, till further notice" and "our borders, by air, land and sea, remain closed until further notice" (Akufo-Addo, 2021).

Words Category	Frequency
Freedom:	
Free	17
Easing	20
Permitted	9
Operate	4
Democratic	4
Democracy	1
Freedom	7
Security:	
Lockdown	3
Limited	3
Closed	24
Restrictions	54
Protect	37
Security	26
Law	14
Others:	
Parliament	10
God	44
Prophet Muhammad	2
Jesus Christ	1
Muslims	5
Christians	2

Table 1: Key Words Category Table (created from Presidency of the Republic of Ghana, 2021)

Discussion

The President used security related words more often than freedom related words. However, a closer analysis reveals that, given the magnitude of the Covid-19 pandemic, which has claimed millions of lives (WHO, 2020) worldwide at this point, it can be argued that the measures were not stringent and excessive. This could also be measured by the fact that the general public, which was also the President's audience, overwhelmingly followed the Covid-19 pandemic measures. While other countries, including Finland, France, Denmark, Norway, Romania, and Austria (Euronews, 2021), had anti-Covid-19 pandemic measures protests, Ghana had none. It is important to reiterate that the lack of anti-Covid-19 pandemic protests in Ghana is not because citizens are not free to protest, as can be seen by the numerous post-election protests held in the country in 2020 (Ghanaweb, 2020). Rather, the absence of protests against Covid-19 restrictions is an indication that the President's speeches resonated with his audience. The magnitude of the securitization object (Covid-19 pandemic) to the Ghanaian public does not necessarily negate the possibility that the President has securitized to achieve a political goal (Osei-Appiah, 2021; Nugent, Asiamah, Molony, & Selorme, 2020). Further analysis below will give a clearer indication whether the President's frequent use of securitizing words means that he ordered stringent restrictions on the Ghanaian public.

1. Does the President's Securitizing Language Equal Curbing of Freedoms?

The frequency of some words in the President's speeches does not necessarily imply a stringent imposition of security measures against freedoms. For example, of the 54 times the President mentioned the word 'restrictions,' almost half of the time the word is preceded by 'easing' to announce lifting of restrictions, for instance: "fellow Ghanaians, in Update No.15, I announced the easing of restrictions in some areas of national life" (Akufo-Addo, 2020). Moreover, 'lockdown' and 'limited,' indicators of restrictions associated with the Covid-19 pandemic, are only mentioned 3

times respectively throughout the 20 speeches. 'Limited' shows limitations to normal life, including the number of people allowed on vehicles and public transportation, the number of people allowed in stadiums, at burial sites, and at political rallies throughout the country. The word 'security' was used 26 times, usually referring to the involvement of security forces by the President, to shoulder the extra burden placed on health officials during the Covid-19 pandemic. The word was also used to describe the role of security officials, which is to enforce the laws and Covid-19 related measures. As he mentions in one speech: "should anyone be arrested by the security agencies disregarding this directive, that person will be dealt with strictly in accordance with law" (Akufo-Addo, 2021).

'Protect' was used frequently to refer to the objects the President deems worth protecting against the ramifications of the Covid-19 pandemic, including human lives, property, and health personnel, as well as the country as such. Consistent with securitization theory, the President's use of speech can legitimize securitization of the nation by constantly referring to protection of the nation as his ultimate goal. In this respect, he tried to convince his audience that securitization serves to safeguard their individual interest and that of the nation. He went further to engage the audience by saying, "Protect yourself. Protect each other. Protect your teachers. Protect your parents" (Akufo-Addo, 2021). Likewise, he mentions 'law' frequently, to inform the nation that the measures are in accordance with Ghana's law, and that citizens are to follow them in order for the country to overcome the common enemy, the Covid-19 pandemic. The public places that the President ordered to be closed, as part of the measures to contain the Covid-19 pandemic, were considered breeding grounds for spreading the disease, even by world standards. These public places include markets, malls, schools, mosques, churches, beaches, night clubs, and pubs. Since some have criticized the closure of religious places (Charles, 2020), does that mean that Ghana is curbing the freedom of religion during the Covid-19 pandemic? After all, many other democracies, including more advanced ones like the USA, the UK, Canada, and Germa-

ny, have instituted similar, or even more stringent measures, to contain the Covid-19 pandemic (BBC, 2020). Some see the imposition of measures as curtailing freedom, while others see it as a worthy trade off to secure a safer society (Viscusi, 2021). The widespread jubilation that ensued after the announcement of the relaxation of the Covid-19 pandemic measures in Ghana could indicate that a significant number of the population perceived the measures as a curtailment of freedom. It could also mean that even those who supported the restrictive measures became discontented.

2. Is There an Attempt to Balance Freedom and Security via the Speech Act of the President?

'Easing' is the most frequent word in the "freedom" category and was always followed by the word 'restrictions' to inform the audience about the content and time of the Covid-19 pandemic measures' lifting. For instance, the President stated "I am now in a position to outline the road map for easing safely the restrictions" (Akufo-Addo, 2020). In the context of freedom and security one could infer that the President attempted to balance the two. Another indication of this is the systematic procedure of the easing of restrictions, where the easing of the measures followed a decrease of infection rates. Only so much can be inferred here about the genuineness of the President's initiative, since Ghana's capacity for mass testing of the population is limited due to financial and logistical constraint. Therefore, the number of infections to justify the President's securitization may not be accurate, further solidifying the claim that the Covid-19 pandemic could have been used to curtail freedoms.

'Free' was used 17 times, the second most frequently used word in the "freedom" category. Contextually, the word is often used to convey to the citizens that Ghana is a free country, and that the forefathers envisioned it this way. For example, in one frequency the President mentioned that "with the help of the Almighty, we are, today, building a free, independent State, a State that, despite the urgency of the crisis, is governed by democratic institutions" (Akufo-Addo, 2021). The word is also used to convey the generosity of the government during the Covid-19 pandemic by stressing that

citizens received free Covid-19 tests, electricity, and water, as well as the use of a popular money transfer service (Akufo-Addo, 2021).

Thus, not only did the President constantly remind his audience that the country is free despite the strict measures, but he also announced stimulus packages to compensate for the hardship from the restrictions. Thus, one could infer that freedom and security were balanced. However, one may also interpret this generosity as not only means for the President to securitize more but also to self-promote or gain a political base, especially since 2020 was an election year. Ghanaian electorates perceive their government as especially generous in election years. Thus, the President may have capitalized on the Covid-19 pandemic to champion his re-election bid. The President's audience seem to have accepted his call, further legitimizing his securitization. Acceptance of the measures by the citizens is paramount, since it could be inferred to as a key measure of what democracy is about (Horowitz, 1991). Likewise, in reference to an important democratic governance principle, the President mentions 'Parliament' 10 times; it is one of the frequently used words in the "other" category. The President mentioned the Parliament to demonstrate the legislature's involvement in the decision-making process of pandemic measures. For example, the President mentioned that "the Minister for Finance has been directed by me to prepare, for approval by Parliament, a Coronavirus Alleviation Programme to address the disruption in economic activities, the hardship of our people, and to rescue and revitalize our industries" (Akufo-Addo, 2020). This indicates that even in extraordinary times, the President was willing to cooperate with the people's representatives systematically, to find a solution to the looming public threat of Covid-19 pandemic. It could also mean that it is an act of balancing, keeping the citizens of Ghana safe and maintaining freedoms, since the people's legislative representatives' approval was sought in the decision-making process.

3. Religion as a Key Reference Point in the President's Speeches

One needs to recognize the religious composition of Ghana in order to fully grasp why the President referred to God in all of his speeches. Nearly 71% of Ghana's population identifies as Christian, 18% as Muslim, and 5% as belonging to traditional African religion, while 6% identify as non-religious (U.S. Department of State, 2019). The magnitude of religiosity in Ghana also partly explains how Ghana's first President, Kwame Nkrumah, rose to power: "his early success as a political leader was due to his ability to resymbolize Ghanaian politics through religious symbols" (Addo, 1999, p. 2).

It thus becomes evident why Akufo Addo mentioned the word 'God' 44 times throughout his Covid-19 pandemic speeches, so much that it is the second most mentioned word among all the words categorized under freedom and security. With it, the President related to his audience, and appealed to deeply held beliefs, to gain the audience's cooperation. The President goes as deep as mentioning the names of the two most revered figures in the two largest religions in Ghana, respectively, as shown in the table above. Not only does this reaffirm the importance of the relationship between the political actor and his audience, according to speech act theory, but it also shows the deep understanding and recognition of the citizens' freedom of religion. Regarding the relationship between the political actor and his audience in the speech act, Leonard and Kaunert (2011), in reconceptualization of the audience in securitization theory, stressed the need to understand the composition of the audience and deduct a logic of persuasion therefrom (Leonard & Kaunert, 2011, p. 58). In this situation, the Ghanaian President has effectively utilized the speech act of the securitization theory to further his goal.

Furthermore, the President has recognized the religious composition of his audience and sought their respective cooperation through systematic appeals by referring to their collective reverence figure, God. He also appeals to them by referring to their respective most revered figures and what those figures teach their followers during difficult times, like the Covid-19 pandemic. For example, the President cited a prophetic saying (Hadith) of the Muslim religion in which their prophet directed his followers to stay home and perform prayers there instead of congregating in a mosque because of the hazard of a heavy rain (Akufo-Addo, 2021). President Akufo Addo cited this to persuade his Muslim audience to follow the prophetic tradition by staying home to pray, and to avoid the usual Muslim practice of congregating in mosques in order to curb the spread of the Covid-19 virus across the country.

Conclusion

The attempt to balance maintenance of basic freedoms, which is one of the canonical hallmarks of democracy, and providing security would always be an ongoing debate, especially among democratic societies. This is in part due to advanced technological development and the emergence of public health hazards, like the Covid-19 pandemic. The response of the President of Ghana in the wake of the Covid-19 pandemic to effect a balance by keeping Ghanaians safe and maintaining their basic freedoms illustrates an apparent continuation of this wider debate. It also depicts the relevance of securitization theory in modern political discourses, especially in the areas of liberty and security. The results of this research validate the theory and its contextual applicability. With the Covid-19 global health pandemic providing a legitimate reason to securitize, the government could have carried out excesses with minimal scrutiny. However, this did not happen, underlining the democratic quality of the country in this regard. Yet, there is not only one interpretation of the President's speech and intentions. While some perceive that the President used the Covid-19 pandemic as an excuse to securitize, others see it as a trade-off that is necessary to protect the

greater good of the Ghanaian society. This also crystalizes the division within the Ghanaian society, as far as this issue is concerned, and therefore, helps in exploring prospective mechanisms that can bridge the gap in such division.

References

Aberbach, J. D. (1990). *Keeping a Watchful Eye: The Politics of Congressional Oversight.* Brookings Institute Press.

Adarkwah, M. A. (2021). "I'm not against online teaching, but what about us?": ICT in Ghana post Covid-19. *Education and Information Technologies, 26*(2), 1665-1685.

Addadzi-Koom, M. E. (2020). Quasi-state of emergency: assessing the constitutionality of Ghana's legislative response to Covid-19. *The Theory and Practice of Legislation, 8*(3), 311-327.

Addo, E. (1999). *Kwame Nkrumah: A Case Study of Religion and Politics in Ghana.* University Press of America.

Agamben, G. (1999). *Potentialities: Selected Essays in Philosophy.* Stanford University Press.

Agormedah, E. K., Henaku, E. A., Ayite, D. M. K., & Ansah, E. A. (2020). Online learning in higher education during COVID-19 pandemic: A case of Ghana. J*ournal of Educational Technology and Online Learning, 3*(3), 183-210.

Akufo-Addo, A. D. (2021, February 28). Measures Taken To Combat Spread Of Coronavirus. *Address To The Nation By The President Of The Republic, Nana Addo Dankwa Akufo-Addo, On Updates To Ghana's Enhanced Response To The Coronavirus Pandemic, On Sunday, 28th February 2021.* Accra, Greater Accra, Ghana: Communications Bureau, Presidency Republic of Ghana.

Akufo-Addo, A. D. (2021, April 13). *Measures Taken To Combat Spread Of Coronavirus.* Retrieved from The Presidency Republic of Ghana: https://presidency.gov.gh/index.php/briefing-room/speeches

Amanor-Mfoafo, N. K., Akrofi, O., Edonu, K. K., & Dowuona, E. N. (2020). Investigating the e-learning readiness of Ghanaian parents during COVID-19. *European*

Journal of Education Studies, 7(10), 39-56.

Amundrud, Ø., Aven, T., & Flage, R. (2017). How the definition of security risk can be made compatible with safety definitions. *Proceedings of the Institution of Mechanical Engineers, Part O: Journal of Risk and Reliability, 231*(3), 286-294.

Asante, L. A., & Mills, R. O. (2020). Exploring the socio-economic impact of COVID-19 pandemic in marketplaces in urban Ghana. *Africa Spectrum, 55*(2), 170-181.

Australian Trade & Investment Commission. (2017). *Exports Market.* Sydney: Australian Government.

Bachelet, M. (2020, May 04). *Building peace in the minds of men and women*. Retrieved from UNESCO website: https://en.unesco.org/news/media-freedom-and-independence-times-covid-19

Baker, N. V. (2003). National security versus civil liberties. *Presidential Studies Quarterly, 33*(3), 547-567.

Balzacq, T. (2005). The three faces of securitization: Political agency, audience and context. *European Journal of International Relations, 11*(2), 171-201.

Bauer, S., Contreras, S., Dehning, J., Linden, M., Iftekhar, E., Mohr,, S. B., . . . Priesemann, V. (2021). Relaxing restrictions at the pace of vaccination increases freedom and guards against further COVID-19 waves. *PLOS Computational Biology*.

BBC. (2020, April 07). *Coronavirus: The world in lockdown in maps and charts*. Retrieved from BBC official website: https://www.bbc.com/news/world-52103747

Benkler, Y. (2013, December 05). *NSA Surveillance, Snowden, and Freedom*. Retrieved from: https://www.harvardmagazine.com/2013/12/security-versus-freedom

Bigo, D. (2002). Security and immigration: Toward a critique of the governmentality of unease. *Alternatives, 27*, 63-92.

Bigo, D., & Tsoukala, A. (2008). *Terror, Insecurity and Liberty: Illiberal Practices of Liberal Regimes After 9/11.* Routledge.

Bird, R. K., & Brandt, E. B. (2002). Academic freedom and 9/11: How the war on terrorism threatens free speech on campus. *Communication Law & Policy, 7*(4), 431-459.

Bork, R. H. (1996). *Slouching Towards Gomorrah.* Regan Books.

Braimah, A. I. (2020). On the politics of lockdown and lockdown politics in Africa: COVID-19 and partisan expedition in Ghana. *Journal of Political Science and International Relations, 3*(3), 44-55.

Brown, R. C., Savulescu, J., Williams, B., & Wilkinson, D. (2020). Passport to freedom? Immunity passports for COVID-19. *Journal of Medical Ethics, 46*(10), 652-659.

Bukari, C., Essilfie, G., Aning-Agyei, M. A., Otoo, I. C., Kyeremeh, C., Owusu, A. A., ... & Bukari, K. I. (2021). Impact of COVID-19 on poverty and living standards in Ghana: A micro-perspective. *Cogent Economics & Finance, 9*(1), 1879716.

Bunyan, T. (2002). *The "war on freedom and democracy".* Retrieved from: https://www.statewatch.org/media/documents/news/2002/sep/analy13.pdf

Busby, J. W. (2021). Beyond internal conflict: The emergent practice of climate security. *Journal of Peace Research, 58*(1), 186-194.

Buzan, B., & Wæver, O. (2009). Macrosecuritisation and security constellations: reconsidering scale in securitisation theory. *Review of international studies, 35*(2), 253-276.

Campbell, J., & Nolan, Q. (2021, May 26). *What's Happening to Democracy in Africa?* Retrieved from Council on Foreign Relations: https://www.cfr.org/article/

whats-happening-democracy-africa

Ceyhan, A., & Tsoukala, A. (2002). The securitization of migration in western societies: Ambivalent discourses and policies. *Alternatives, 27*, 21-39.

Charles, P. (2020, June 30). *Religion and the State in an Episodic Moment of COVID-19 in Ghana*. Retrieved from Social Science and Humanities Open: https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=3637825

Ciută, F. (2009). Security and the problem of context: a hermeneutical critique of securitisation theory. *Review of International Studies, 35*(2), 301-326.

Cole, D. D. (2003). Security and freedom - are the governments' efforts to deal with terrorism violative of our freedoms. *Canada-United States Law Journal, 29*, 339-349.

Corry, O. (2012). Securitisation and 'riskification': Second-order security and the politics of climate change. *Millennium, 40*(2), 235-258.

Davis, J. (2020, June 05). *United States Representative Calls for Disbanding of Police Department*. Retrieved from The Western Journal: https://www.westernjournal.com/united-states-representative-calls-disbanding-police-department/

Dinh, V. D. (2001). Freedom and Security after September 11. *Harvard Journal of Law & Public Policy*, *25*, 399-406.

Downe Wamboldt, B. (1992). Content analysis: method, applications, and issues. *Health care for women international, 13*(3), 313-321.

Elo, S., & Kyngäs, H. (2008). The qualitative content analysis process. *Journal of Advanced Nursing, 62*(1), 107-115.

Etzioni, A. (2005). *How Patriotic is the Patriot Act?: Freedom Versus Security in the Age of Terrorism.* Routledge.

Euronews. (2021, April 04). *Arrests across Europe as people flout or protest COVID-19 restrictions*. Retrieved from Euronews official Website: https://www.euronews.com/2021/04/11/covid-19-20-arrested-in-anti-measures-protests-in-finland-denmark-norway

Floyd, R. (2007). Towards a consequentialist evaluation of security: bringing together the Copenhagen and the Welsh Schools of security studies. *Review of International Studies, 33*(2), 327-350.

Ghanaweb. (2020, December 20). *Election 2020: NDC supporters protest in Takoradi*. Retrieved from Ghanaweb official website: https://www.ghanaweb.com/GhanaHomePage/NewsArchive/Election-2020-NDC-supporters-protest-in-Takoradi-1137635

Gordon, W. J. (1993). A property right in self-expression: Equality and individualism in the natural law of intellectual property. *The Yale Law Journal, 102*(7), 1533-1609.

Gorman, S. (2002). The Ashcroft Doctrine. *National Journal, 12*, 3712-3719.

Haubrich, D. (2003). September 11, Anti-Terror Laws and Civil Liberties: Britain, France and Germany Compared. *Government and Opposition, 38*(1), 3-28.

Horowitz, D. (1991). *A Democratic South Africa?: Constitutional Engineering in a Divided Society.* Oxford University Press.

Howell, A., & Richter-Montpetit, M. (2020). Is securitization theory racist? Civilizationism, methodological whiteness, and antiblack thought in the Copenhagen School. *Security Dialogue, 51*(1), 3-22.

HRW. (2018, January 8). *"No Choice but to Deny Who I Am" Violence and Discrimination against LGBT People in Ghana.* Retrieved from Human Right Watch official website: https://www.hrw.org/report/2018/01/08/no-choice-deny-who-i-am/violence-and-discrimination-against-lgbt-people-ghana

Huysmans, J. (2010). *Security and Freedom, Paper presented at the Second Meeting of the UACES study group onthe 'Evolving European Law and Policy'.* University of Manchester.

Huysmans, J. (2006). *The Politics of Insecurity: Fear, Migration and Asylum in the EU.* Routledge.

Jarvis, L., & Holland, J. (2015). *Security: A Critical Introduction.* Palgrave Macmillan.

Johnson, J., & Mycoff, J. (2016). *Political Science Research Methods.* SAGE Publications Ltd.

Johnson, L. K. (2008). Ostriches, Cheerleaders, Skeptics, and Guardians. T*he SAIS Review of International Affairs, 28*(1), 93-108.

Kneip, A. W. (2018). Democratic Danger for Democracy? The Precarious Balance Between Security and Freedom. In A. W. Kneip (Ed.), *Democracy and Crisis* (pp. 273-298). Springer.

Leonard, S., & Kaunert, C. (2011). Reconceptualizing the Audience in Securitization Theory. In T. Balzacq (Ed.), *Understanding Securitisation Theory: How Security Problems Emerge and Dissolve* (pp. 57-70). Routledge.

Loader, I. (2020). To reduce the harm: on defunding the police. *Times Literary Supplement, 6124*, 10-12.

Lucke, F. (2020). Germany: Climate Change, Human Security and Southern Populations. In: *The Securitisation of Climate Change and the Governmentalisation of Security. New Security Challenges*. Palgrave Macmillan.

Mann, N. O. (2006). When Congress Checks Out. *Foreign Affairs, 85*(6), 67-82.

Manunta, G. (1999). What is security? *Security Journal, 12*(3), 57-66.

Mayer, J. D., Schintler, L. A., & Bledsoe, S. (2020). Culture, Freedom, and the Spread of Covid - 19: Do Some Societies and Political Systems Have National Anti - Bodies? *World Medical & Health Policy, 12*(4), 498-511.

Mayer, M. (2012). Chaotic climate change and security. *International Political Sociology, 6*(2), 165-185.

McSweeney, B. (1996). Identity and security: Buzan and the Copenhagen school. *Review of International Studies, 22*(1), 81-93.

Mooney, G. (2020, May 19). *Ideas*. Retrieved from The Atlantic: https://www.theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2020/05/freedom-pandemic-19th-century/611800/

Nakouwo, S. N., & Akplehey, F. N. (2020). Covid-19 and Mobile Money Agents in Ghana. *African Journal of Emerging Issues, 2*(12), 75-85.

Nugent, P., Asiamah, G., Molony, T., & Selorme, E. (2020). *eisa.org.* Retrieved from Covid-19 and Ghana's 2020 Elections: https://www.eisa.org/pdf/gha2020election-covid.pdf

O'Rourke, A., Su, R., & Binder, G. (2021). Disbanding Police Agencies. *Columbia Law Review Association Inc.*, 1327-1404.

Obese, F. Y., Osei-Amponsah, R., Timpong-Jones, E., & Bekoe, E. (2021). Impact of COVID-19 on animal production in Ghana. *Animal Frontiers, 11*(1), 43-46.

OSCE. (2020, May 12). Human Rights and Democracy in a Time of Pandemic. Retrieved from OSCE website: https://www.csce.gov/international-impact/publications/human-rights-and-democracy-time-pandemic

Osei - Appiah, S. (2021). *Political Expediency or Competent Leadership?* Routledge.

Ovadia, E. (2006). Public Security vs the Right to be Let Alone. In E. Ovadia (Ed.), *Moral Dilemmas in Real Life* (pp. 26-36). Springer.

Owens, J. E. (2006). Presidential power and congressional acquiescence in the "War" on Terrorism: a new constitutional equilibrium? *Politics & Policy, 34*(2), 258-303.

Owusu, L. D., & Frimpong-Manso, K. (2020). The impact of COVID-19 on children from poor families in Ghana and the role of welfare institutions. *Journal of Children's Services, 15*(4), 185-190.

Owusu-Fordjour, C., Koomson, C. K., & Hanson, D. (2020). The Impact of Covid-19 on learning-the perspective of the Ghanaian student. *European Journal of Education Studies, 7*(3), 88-101.

Petit, P. (2000). *Republicanism: A Theory of Freedom and Government.* Oxford University Press.

Price, M. (2016). Freedom vs. Security. *Scholarly Commons*, 1-5.

Prozorov, S. (2007). *Foucault, Freedom and Sovereignty.* Hampshire: Ashgate.

Pulejo, M., & Querubín, P. (2020). Electoral Concerns Reduce Restrictive Measures During the COVID-19 Pandemic. *National Bureau of Economic Research.* Working Paper 27498.

Repucci, S., & Slipowitz, A. (2020). Democracy under lockdown: the impact of COVID-19 on the global struggle for freedom. *Analysis and Policy Observatory*.

Sabates, R., Carter, E., & Stern, J. M. (2021). Using educational transitions to estimate learning loss due to COVID-19 school closures: The case of Complementary Basic *Education in Ghana. International Journal of Educational Development, 82*, 102377.

Saire, J. C., & Panford-Quainoo, K. (2020). Twitter Interaction to Analyze Covid-19 Impact in Ghana, Africa from March to July. *Social and Information Networks*, 2.

Shaheen, J. G. (2008). *Guilty: Hollywood's Verdict on Arabs after 9/11.* Olive Branch Press.

Silberstein, S. (2004). *War of Words: Language, Politics and 9/11.* Routledge.

Smith, L. C., & Brooks, J. D. (2013). *Security Science: The Theory and Practice of Security.* Elsevier.

Smith, S. W. (2013). France in Africa: A New Chapter? *Current History, 112*(754), 163-168.

Stritzel, H. (2014). Securitization Theory and the Copenhagen School. In: *Security in Translation. New Security Challenges Series.* Palgrave Macmillan.

U.S. Department of State. (2019, May). *Ghana 2018 International Religious Freedom Report.* Retrieved from U.S. Department of State official website: https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/GHANA-2018-INTERNATIONAL-RELIGIOUS-FREEDOM-REPORT.pdf

Upoalkpajor, J.-L. N., & Upoalkpajor, C. B. (2020). The Impact of COVID-19 on Education in Ghana. *Asian Journal of Education and Social Studies, 9*(1), 23-33.

Viscusi, W. K. (2021). Economic lessons for COVID - 19 pandemic policies. *Southern Economic Journal, 87*(4), 1064-1089.

Wæver, O., & Carlton, D. (1993). *Identity, migration and the new security agenda in Europe.* Pinter Publishers.

Waldron, J. (2017). Security and liberty: The image of balance. In D. Dyzenhaus (Ed.), *Civil Rights and Security* (pp. 3-22). Routledge.

Whitehouse, B. (2012). What went wrong in Mali. *London Review of Books, 34*(16), 17-18.

Williams, M. C. (2003). Words, images, enemies: Securitization and international politics. *International Studies Quarterly, 47*(4), 511-531.

World Health Organization (2020, April 11). *WHO Coronavirus (COVID-19) Dashboard*. Retrieved from World Health Organization official website: https://covid19.who.int/

TRUST AND HOPE AS A MANAGEMENT APPROACH DURING TIMES OF UNCERTAINTY

Vitor de Passos

University of Bath

Abstract

The leadership team of an international school decided to recall staff members to China during the early stages of a pandemic. This study begins with a literature review of some of the overarching concepts of psychodynamics while applying this methodology to the analysis of a critical incident. The emotional effects that contradictory messages on behalf of the school leadership team had on the faculty are theorised by looking at the correlation between stress and anxiety felt by teachers experiencing higher levels of scrutiny at the time of the transition to e-learning. An alternative management strategy for school leaders is put forward based on Mishra's Theory of Trust (1996) to encourage collaborative autonomy in schools during periods of great uncertainty.

Keywords: psychodynamics, crisis, anxiety, stress, leadership, trust, hope, collaborative autonomy

Introduction

Teaching is a profession that causes great levels of stress and anxiety and often leads to burnout even under normal circumstances (Kyriacou & Sutcliffe, 1978; Kyriacou, 1987). Educators are familiar with heavy workloads, complex work relationships, excessive bureaucracy, an eroding professional status, and a constant need for emotional labour unique to the profession (Hedge & Mackenzie, 2012, p. 196) though rarely taken into account by school leaders and policymakers.

This is no less the case during a pandemic when most educators around the globe were quite suddenly instructed to provide lessons through online platforms. This unprecedented migration to e-learning created several challenges for teachers, lacking not only the technical and pedagogical training necessary to deliver high-quality lessons but also the coping mechanisms required to handle a barrage of negative emotions and feelings, with stress chief amongst these (MacIntyre, Gregersen & Mercer, 2020, p. 2). The working hypothesis guiding this study is that during periods of great uncertainty, such as a pandemic, an overreliance on traditional management approaches and responsive models of leadership can prove ineffective and produce undesirable emotional outcomes (Dale & James, 2013, p. 93). An alternative framework is put forward, finding purchase on trust (Mishra, 1996) as a management approach to foster hope and lead to collaborative autonomy. When empowered with more say on pedagogical choices, teachers are more likely to manage negative emotions while also exhibiting and maintaining higher levels of professionalism and greater levels of collaborative autonomy (Pearson & Moomaw, 2005, p. 42).

A causal relationship between stress, work satisfaction, and professionalism is widely accepted among clinicians, meaning that leaders should place greater importance on the building of a positive environment that can foster collaborative autonomy to help alleviate negative emotions and

tension within an organisation. Hope can be the means to achieve such an outcome. This is perhaps even more prescient during a pandemic as there is an undeniable link between autonomy and teacher motivation which also interfaces with student outcomes (Khmelkov, 2000, Losos, 2000, White, 1992 as cited in Pearson & Moowaw, 2005). As for the role that hope plays within psychoanalysis, it is a much-debated one. Some scholars within the Freudian school of thought reduce the construct to an illusion or simple wish-fulfillment or *Wunscherfüllung* (Groarke, 2018, p. 365) or as another obstacle for the psychoanalyst to demystify and *cure*. However, such a perspective overlooks the constructive aspect of hope that translates into a wistful state of waiting for an envisioned future. Later in the study, I draw from the works of Melanie Klein (1946) and Steven Groake (2018) to expand on an alternative interpretation of hope.

Managing emotions is an important test for the leaders of an organisation. Competent leaders strike a balance, fostering trust among their followers while avoiding a scenario of complete lack of monitoring whereby employees become complacent and shirk from the primary task of the organisation (Lewicki, Tomlinson & Gillespie, 2006, p. 1006). Trust and hope act as vehicles to collaborative autonomy, a term that is somewhat paradoxical in nature and not to be mistaken for the separated classrooms we find in most schools, nor the lack of scheduled common time and the "live-and-let-live" mantra that many educators uphold on account of fears of losing their independence (Vangrieken et al., 2017, p. 302).

This study brings to light a more recent definition of the term that includes collaborative decision-making and the freedom to make prescriptive professional choices (Pearson & Moonwaw, 2005). Studies such as that of Vangrieken et al. (2017) provide evidence that collaborative autonomy leads to better acceptance of innovation in schools, better performance by teachers, and thus better student outcomes all of which are essential to schools during a time of transition to e-learning. We begin by employing a

framework of trust to analyse a critical incident involving an international school as well as the decisions taken by the senior leadership team (SLT) during the early stages of the pandemic, as well as the emotional effects on the faculty members. The sources of data used for this study were summaries of online correspondence and conversations as well as school documents that are publicly available online. A psychodynamic methodological approach is appropriate to carry out such an analysis as this study deals in emotions, and their effects on the performance of individuals. Where measurement-oriented approaches often fail to consider the person's interior phenomenological life, psychodynamics possesses the ability to explain the primitive domain of the unconscious and the resolution of internal conflicts (Taylor, 2009, p. 12).

Early authors such as Freud (1923) or Le Bon (1895) agree that unconscious processes are often more relevant than conscious processes in determining the actions of any given individual, especially when operating within group settings. Another important consideration is the stripping of individuals' identity when belonging to a group which according to Freud (1923) stirs up instinctive reflexes, or defences including denial, projection, and others and their role in stifling meaningful change, are best uncovered via psychoanalytical approaches (p. 33). In the subsequent section, the main terminology used throughout this study will be explained.

Terminology

Wilfred Bion's Basic-Assumption Group and Narcissistic Leadership.

In *Experiences in Groups*, Wilfred Bion (1961) refers to Freud's failure in acknowledging the importance of observing the individual within a group but also clarifies that all of us are intrinsically a part of a group whether willingly or unwillingly (p. 134). The author postulates how fundamental it is for psychoanalysts to study the individual and the development of personality within group settings as opposed to studying personality devel-

opment in isolation. The book identifies different kinds of groups and goes into detail on some of their idiosyncrasies within organisations providing definitions and examples of pairing groups, workgroups, specialised workgroups (for instance the Church or the Army) as well as basic assumption groups; the last of which will be of particular interest to this study as the school featured in the critical incident falls under this category.

Basic assumption groups often experience an inversion of roles, whereby a selected group of loyal subordinates with a direct avenue to the leader withhold or gloss over information. This originates from a narcissistic leadership model which often fuels basic assumption groups; leaders often become trapped in their own delusions of grandeur and omnipotence (Zaleznik, 1989; Schwartz, 1990; Hirschhorn, as cited in Gabriel, 1991). Another example that points to a basic-assumption state is the scarce examples of collaboration and poor organisation plaguing the institution; (Bion, 1961, p. 136) This was particularly evident in the early stages of the transition to e-learning. There is also the tendency of the basic assumption group to disregard the welfare of its members prioritising the survival of the group at all costs (even at the cost of reality). This basic assumption took form when the school's Senior Leadership Team (SLT) handling of the crisis during the early stages of the pandemic and will be analysed in more depth at a later stage.

According to Freud (as cited in Taylor, 2009) narcissism is a kind of self-infatuation that stems from one's obsession with their own sexual organs and is a common characteristic of "schizophrenics who have withdrawn from reality" (p. 63). Other definitions have been offered by researchers that looked at narcissistic personalities from a psychodynamic lens including Kohut and Jung although all these authors all seem to agree that denial of reality is a common feature of the narcissist. Every leader possesses narcissistic desires and motivations as there is a balance that must be reached. The signs of narcissistic leadership include the inversion of the primary

task of the organization where protecting the leader from reality overtakes the primary task itself (Gabriel, 1999).

A clear sign of narcissistic leadership within the school was the way both the principal and vice-principal often seemed caught off guard during whole-staff meetings when questions regarding the poor technical support provided to teachers during the e-learning phase were put forward, or when the many obstacles to those who were trying to head back to China at the outset of the pandemic were raised. There are also numerous cases of contradicting information being provided and a lack of creative solutions to the many issues that were also evident throughout that period time. This will be readdressed in more detail under section *the Case*.

The narcissistic approach to leadership in this organisation did not begin with this fresh crisis, but its detrimental effects were only exacerbated by the pandemic. In many cases, communication between the SLT and the faculty members was absent or became distorted as shown by the contradictory emails sent by the principal and vice principal. This often results from the transference of frustration, anxiety, and stress that have gone, originating from a search for self-idealisation within the organisation itself. Such a *dead-end* is defined as a paranoid-schizoid projective system that can cripple an organization (Obholzer & Roberts, 1994, p. 14) and stifle cooperation and collaboration thus giving way to self-preservation.

Transference, Introjection, Projection, Splitting, Denial, and Avoidance

Extensive reading on psychodynamics shows that there is little consensus regarding the definitions of transference, introjection, projection, and splitting; these unconscious processes have definitions that have evolved significantly over time. Introjection, for instance, was initially described as the process of absorbing positive experiences into one's own self, while projection was once labelled as the process of wishing bad experiences away (De Board, 1978, p. 14). In the context of this study, a more holistic

and modern definition is proposed. Introjection stands as the process of incorporating someone else's feelings into ourselves as if they were our own, and projection is the locating of one's feelings onto someone else (Dale & James, 2015, p. 12). These processes are essential mechanisms of personality-building, studied in the field of psychodynamics to explain group and organisational behaviour while also exceptionally relevant to measure the efficacy of leadership approaches.

One of Freud's contemporaries, Melanie Klein, identified a fourth phenomenon after decades studying toddlers: splitting which first takes place during the child's interaction with the mother's breast (De Board, 1978, p. 26). Splitting consists of the categorising of different emotions into *good* and *bad* (Obholzer & Roberts, 1994, p. 13). This process is of particular interest within organisational settings during periods of change/crisis as employees tend to use splitting as an instinctive response to new expectations placed upon them. Denial and avoidance are both common characteristics of a basic assumption group (Obholzer & Roberts, 1994). In such groups, leaders focus on trivial matters and prefer quick solutions that require minimal effort. A basic assumption group is also one where employees are often demoralised and doubtful of their own agency and ability to enact change (p. 43). The aforementioned processes can be interpreted as pain avoidance/deflection strategies used in our daily lives. Throughout the critical incident, there will be examples of such strategies being put into place by both the faculty and SLT.

Stress, Anxiety, and Fear

Stress is a "psychological reaction to certain factors perceived as threats to one's wellbeing" (Lazarus 1996; 2006 as cited in MacIntyre, Gregersen & Mercer, 2020, p. 2). A sample of over 600 language teachers working in different points of the globe took an online survey during the outset of the pandemic, in April 2020. The resulting data reveal an alarming increase

in work-related stress; below are the primary triggers of stress (stressors) measured as part of the study:

-      Difficulty in balancing one's personal life with professional re-quirements as teaching from home means less defined barriers between work and home life.

-      Scarcity of time with significant others and dependents; longer working hours—which in the case of international teachers was exacer-bated by teaching students living in different time zones.

-      Uncertainty regarding existing and future job postings— interna-tional teachers stand here also as a particularly disadvantaged group because of the absence of certain entitlements such as unemployment benefits and few legal defences against layoff or furlough.

-      Adding to these, we have the nonspecific stressors that any given individual experiences during long periods of lockdown, for example *cabin fever*.

Uncertain times tend to lead to negative emotions, including anxi-ety and fear. As relates to the former, the definition provided by Dale and James (2015) seems most appropriate, defining anxiety as "a response to an internal and unknown threat" (p. 95). The authors contrast anxiety with fear, labelling the latter emotion as a "response to a known and external danger." Failing to recognise the adaptative attributes that even seemingly negative emotions such as anxiety and fear can have by alerting individuals to potential dangers and spurring them into taking action (Reeve, 2015 as cited in MacIntyre, Gregersen & Mercer, 2020, p. 6). Within the context of this study, the adaptative nature of these two negative emotions is to be defined as self-preservation (Freud, 1923). A response that can prove beneficial to the individual but often detrimental to the organisation. When acting out of instinct to ensure one's survival, the employee is very unlikely

to collaborate and prioritise the broader interests of the organisation.

Trust, Hope, and Collaborative Autonomy

Trust is widely accepted as a synonym of vulnerability, or "the willingness of a party to be vulnerable to the actions of another party based on the expectation that the other will perform a particular action important to the trustor, irrespective of the ability to monitor or control that other party" (Mayer, Davis & Schoorman, 1995, p. 712 as cited in Mishra, 1996, p. 220). The concept has also been defined as holding "positive expectations regarding another's conduct" (Lewicki, Tomlinson & Gillespie, 2006, p. 442)

From an organisational standpoint, trust can be looked at from four differ-ent dimensions: competence, openness, concern, and reliability (Mishra, 1996, p. 1). All the aforementioned authors acknowledge the beneficial ef-fects of trust on collaboration and employee performance either explicitly or tacitly. The premise of this study is that trust is essential for any sustain-able form of collaboration to take place and thus for the normal functioning of the organisation itself. In the context of this critical incident, we seek to illustrate how examples of mismanagement from the school leadership encouraged feelings of distrust and betrayal. The intention is not to critique for the sake of critiquing but to highlight how decisions born of a reaction-ary approach to leadership can stifle trust and exacerbate adversity felt by individuals during times of great uncertainty.

Bion (1961) defined hope as a *Messianic* and naïve emotion often appearing in *pairing* groups (p. 151), going on to say that hope is the expectation of a leader arriving to place the fears and anxieties of the group at rest (as cited in De Board, 1978, p. 40). This definition reduces hope to an idealistic state, a feeling that undoubtedly ends up in disappointment and disenchantment. When a leader finally emerges within the organisation, the enormity of the expectations placed upon their shoulders might prove too much to bear.

This postulation is not new, as Freud (1923,) also referred to the *supernatural power* which *illusions* and *phantasies* have over a group (p. 16). Freud (1923) is referring to a kind of collective obsessional neurosis, meaning that the group itself cannot last long without said illusions. Although this interpretation holds merit in the context of this organisation, mapping out how school leaders may attempt to deny or evade the difficult prospects brought by an unforeseen catastrophic event such as a pandemic is based on the assumption that all hope is utopian, which is not always the case.

Klein (1946) suggests a broader definition of hope, defining the term as an emotion led by the super-ego and driven from an inward desire to "repair or regain something that was lost" (p. 20) This definition is more suitable to become a management approach as it makes it incumbent on managers to trust their subordinates in times of great anxiety, thus making it easier to cope with anxiety and fear. Such a *healing* definition of hope holds greater merit. There is ample evidence that teachers who are trusted to make their own pedagogical choices are less likely to withdraw into a state of self-preservation and instead experience hope even during times of great uncertainty. From an organisational perspective, hope acts as a vehicle to a concept that Pearson and Moowaw (2005) labelled as collaborative autonomy.

Incidentally, hope is scarcely mentioned within the context of psychodynamics (Groarke, 2018, p. 366) and when it does get mentioned, authors tend to reduce the construct to wish-fulfilment (Freud, 1923) or mistake it for the act of *narcissistic waiting*, a hasty and common misconception as more can be said of the psychodynamics of hope and its merit to organisational theory. The construct of hope can be interpreted as a commitment to the value of the future, a pledge to wait for an envisioned future. Waiting thus opens the possibility of the impossible in terms of "a gift that cannot make itself (a) present [un don qui ne peut pas se faire preˊsent]" (Derrida, 1992a, p. 29 as cited in Groarke, 2018, p. 368). Everything has to begin again, as if for the first time, on the primordial grounds of love and hope. As such, the new beginning operates at the interface of primary love and infinite hope – that is, according to 'the measureless measure [mesure sans mesure] of the impossible" (Derrida, 1968, p. 29 as cited in Groarke, 2018, p. 368).

Autonomy can be born of hope although it is a construct that also invites different interpretations. Some researchers denounce it as a way for leaders to shirk responsibility as opposed to delegate authority. Within the context of this study, autonomy stands as the opposite of self-preservation, a process leading the individual to reflect on the needs of the entire community as opposed to simply their own. Further research is warranted on autonomy especially on how collaborative autonomy manifests within educational/ school settings. This is likely because it is a difficult construct to operationalise and measure autonomy although there seems to be a consensus that this is one of the keys to enact valuable education reform and improve teacher motivation (Erpelding, 1999; Jones, 2000; Wilson, 1993 as cited in Pearson & Moomaw, 2005, p. 37).

Successful Examples of Trust as a Management Approach Across Other Fields

Trust is a broad concept that is difficult to be measured and with an ever-changing definition. Within organisational settings, Radomska et al. (2019) defined trust as "an alternative mechanism for controlling collective organizational activities, especially in environments with a growing level of uncertainty and complexity" (p. 2). In that study, the authors analysed and compare ten companies across Portugal and Poland using a mixed-method approach, including a large number of interviews, concluding that organisations operating with lower levels of trust often burden the company leader and senior employees with more accountability which has obvious, negative effects on mental health and the overall working atmo-

sphere of the organisation (p. 16). Trust can also be used by leaders to help their organisations change and adapt their business models and create new partnerships in an ever more globalised world. By intersecting a framework of collaboration with trust, Belkadi et al. (2017) propose a suite of collaborative approaches to manufacturing enterprises and provide evidence that through such a process, even small organisations in the field are able to innovate and stay afloat in a very competitive market (p. 1038).

The Case

Context- The school and its faculty

The international school which was the object of this study is located in Shanghai. It markets itself as one of the leading international schools in China, offering bilingual education in Chinese and English to students ranging from ages two to eighteen. The student population is around four hundred students, primarily from an East Asian ethnic background. Forty international teachers work at the Secondary Campus of primarily Chinese, British, Canadian, American, and Australian backgrounds, but also a small minority of European and Indian teachers. At the time of the original Covid-19 outbreak in China, one third of the teaching staff had been at the school for over fifteen years. Among this group of seasoned teachers, there was a strong perception that the organisation was gradually becoming more profit-driven despite continuing to promote itself as a nonprofit foundation.

This state of prolonged discontentment can be attributed to the teachers' lack of awareness of their own agency to enact change while also raising important questions about a possible loss of the organisation's primary task and would help explain the declining number of student enrollment and high turnover in the leadership team. Such a possibility deserves a rigorous, separate study, although it is also an essential consideration to provide context for many of the controversial decisions taken during that period. The prevalence of economic motives for the school was evident in the poor

condition of the secondary campus, which was lacking in logistical and technological resources (poor Wi-Fi connection, dated, and faulty desktops, old projectors and printers dating back to over fifteen years). Such poor infrastructure was not only confined to the classrooms, but also the building itself (infiltrations, no heating in many classrooms, insufficient lockers, and no changing rooms provided). Establishing the organisation's priorities before the critical incident is crucial; it will help contextualise some of the decisions taken during the lockdown period and immediately after the school's reopening.

Context- Timeline

There is generalised agreement that the Covid-19 pandemic created unprecedented challenges to schools in China, be they state, public, domestic, or international. This school was no different. During the first weeks of lockdown in Shanghai during the Spring of 2020, the school leadership team found itself in a difficult position as close to half of the international teaching staff were scattered around the globe with progressively harder prospects of returning. The Chinese authorities decided to close the country's borders to all foreign passport holders on March 26th, which only made matters worse concerning the school's staffing prospects (Palmer, 2020). The data collection for this study was conducted via the examining of messages from social media forums where teachers shared their views, student feedback surveys, and emails sent by the leadership team. Their consent was provided, and their identities will not be disclosed at any point of the study. The critical incident spans from late January to March 2020—the month when the lockdown restrictions were lifted in Shanghai, and the school was allowed to reopen all its campuses.

Methodology

A healing, restorative nature drives the field of psychodynamics; Psycho-analysts are expected to analyse complex problems deeply rotted in the unconscious by looking at an organisation through the lens of truthfulness and honesty (Gabriel, 1999, p. 232). They also preoccupy themselves with the multitudinal concept of personality, postulating that it is controlled mainly by a vast interior, and the more primitive, unconscious domain. Through psychodynamics, researchers can better track fluctuations in personality based on the resolution of unconscious conflicts and better grasp the evolution of organisations and individuals operating within them (Taylor, 2009, p. 12). In the post-Covid-19 world, the boundaries between one's professional and personal life became blurrier than ever before. It is, therefore, appropriate to choose a psychodynamic approach when analysing the effects of managerial decisions in this modern context.

Psychoanalysts defend that human behaviour largely results from unconscious elements such as the battle between the ego and the superego. As a result, the same action from any given individual can be subject to multiple interpretations. The same can be said of organisations, standing as more than simple collective systems of action communication, hierarchy, and economic goals, but as products of one's idiosyncratic, daily experiences, and character (p. 66). Different individuals experience and perceive institutions in different ways. In this context, psychodynamics is a powerful instrument that sheds light on the human nature of organisations, driven by unconscious concepts that are very much still taboo in organisational studies, including the roles that sexuality, social dysfunctions, symbolism, and aesthetics play in the construction of the self.

Ontological Considerations

As a member of the school at the time of this critical incident, it is important to recognise that our perspective might be skewed. Much like our colleagues, we experienced the same anxieties and exhibited some of the same instinctive defences that come during times of great uncertainty. Some might argue that a researcher from outside the organisation would be a more suitable candidate to conduct psychoanalytic research as the observations produced would potentially prove more transparent and less affected by one's anxieties and assumptions.

Though as researchers, we can strive for self-disclosure, reflect on our own biases, anxieties, and fears while acknowledging the immensely complex challenge that the early stages of the pandemic posed for the school administrators and faculty. Navigating through a largely unforeseen event left the Senior Leadership Team (SLT) with little to no room for planning and required quick and effective responses. We seek principally to provide one possible alternative or lens to look at this particular critical incident. However, it is not our conviction that a purely psychoanalytical approach could have warranted a different outcome. Neither is our goal to engage in *character assassination* and indict a given individual or group of individuals. The premise of this study is to question whether traditional management responses to crises are effective during a pandemic.

The works of the Tavistock clinical school (Obhlozer & Roberts, 1994) showed us that to enact meaningful change at an organisational level, psychoanalysis should be applied in conjunction with social analysis. Researchers must also not disregard imperatives such as systemic elements that affect the individual's experiences within the organisation including racism, chauvinism, homophobia, and other pervasive factors and the role these play in conditioning organisational outcomes and the behaviour of employees.

The Approach of the Senior Leadership Team to the Pandemic

Even before the beginning of the pandemic, the school was experiencing a crisis related to the high turnover of leaders across half a decade. The former principal, on many accounts popular amongst Western staff members, had a short tenure of only two years. The vice-principal left the school shortly after for undisclosed reasons. These premature departures remain a mystery to the broader school community. Silence seems to be the organisational policy for resignations, though it is thought that pressures from the school's owner to perform better financially were behind these decisions. A preexisting crisis within the leadership team is an important factor to consider when looking at the nature of the school's approach to leadership if management would perhaps be the most appropriate term.

The two concepts are often used interchangeably but stand as entirely different insofar management is the ability to run a budget, cut costs, increase earnings, and address the more pragmatic everyday aspects of governance. Leadership belongs in the emotional, psychological realm. A leader is often capable of management, but managers are not always capable of leadership. Burns (1978 as cited in Gabriel, 1999) elaborates on this point, stating that leaders hold the potential to inspire the members of an organisation to share a collective dream and put in the overtime and effort they otherwise would not have. Because the future holds uncertainties and no person is guaranteed a return on their efforts, individuals invest their energy, attention, and feelings in an undertaking because they believe in the leader's fantasy and ability to turn it into reality. This is the power that hope has over each of us.

Gabriel (1999) wrote extensively on what can be defined as the ability of a leader to gain the trust of his employees. Leaders able to gain the trust of their employees often bear the brunt of most risks and uncertainties during a crisis, allowing their followers to focus on activities that relate to the organisation's primary task. The failure to gain the trust of one's employ-

ees has grave implications; distrust leads to a state of hopelessness where individuals are more likely to forget their loyalties, acting from self-preservation, and prioritise their individual needs to those of the organisation.

Hope, which can enact both effective and affective change, can only result from a symbiotic relationship between leaders and followers. When hope originates only in the leader, it can be read as self-idealisation. Although it stems from the followers, it can be interpreted as a state of basic assumption (Bion, 1961) whereby employees hold on to a vain sense of future hope, in the unlikely scenario that organizational problems will be solved with very little agency on their part.

The first Covid-19 outbreak in China would prove a paramount test on the ability of the SLT to gain the faculty members' trust. During the first weeks of lockdown in Shanghai, with close to half of the international teaching staff outside of the country, the first emails from the leadership team arrived as a response to maintain legitimacy and consolidate power. The principal wrote to the entire school community on the twenty-third of January, stressing the need for all staff members to return by the second of February while urging everyone to be available online during regular hours of operation and probably beyond. Another expectation was that careful consideration was to be placed on students' and parents' requests, thus entirely leaving the needs of staff members out of the equation. Returning to China at that time was a challenge if not impossible as most Western nations discouraged travelling to that country (and continue doing so to the present day), and flight tickets grew dearer and more expensive owing to the decreased transit in flights.

By failing to address the considerable risks that a flight back to China entailed, the leadership team stoked anxiety among teachers, which was only exacerbated by the seemingly more reasonable approaches taken by other international schools operating in the city of Shanghai. One such school

took no time in providing emergency flight stipends and reimbursements while arranging for accommodation within a neighbouring East Asian country thus ensuring that the teaching staff and respective families had their needs looked after. Other education organisations of similar size went as far as delaying the return date to the Spring break holiday by reshuffling their school calendar.

The email that followed a week later did acknowledge these efforts by other organisations and attributed the lack of flexibility to the school's governing board, reiterating that until instructed otherwise, the return date remained the second of February. The principal's decision supports the theory of behavioural rigidity (Staw, Sandelands & Dutton, 1981 as cited in Misha, 1996, p. 2), a typical response from organisations in crisis that often is accompanied by a consolidation of resources. It is also a typical sign of a basic assumption group where lack of creativity is apparent, and preference is placed upon quick, effortless solutions that often prove ineffective. From a psychodynamic perspective, the principal had projected his uncertainties onto the school community while leaving out the means to alleviate the emotional and financial stress felt by teachers and families alike. Many of the parents relied on their businesses as a source of income and saw these shut down during the pandemic.

Reactions from Staff Members and the School Community

It did not take long for the teachers themselves to introject the uncertainties from SLT, and for rumours to begin spreading regarding possible layoffs and salary cuts. The human resources team later announced that the school would be withholding salary bonuses and freezing the pay scale of those misfortunate enough not to be able to return by the assigned date. The parents' initial reaction to e-learning was also not a positive one. An alarming number were unhappy from the outset as the burden of catering for their children's educational needs fell on their shoulders while seeing to profes-

sional responsibilities at the same time. The parents' displeasure proved costly to the organisation, as only a month after eLearning had begun, survey data revealed that some one hundred students would not be rejoining even the school even after the pandemic was under control. The majority of departing families pointed to financial difficulties in paying the over forty thousand pounds of yearly tuition fees, although were also mounting accusations of poor teaching practices that could not solely be attributed to the transition to e-learning.

Adding to these pressures, the issue of the return date remained. Many staff members at this point had grown disenchanted with SLT on account of what they perceived as having to choose between their safety and wellbeing as well as their families, stacked against the school's expectations. Some of the remarks by teachers on social media forums included complaints that it was unreasonable to ask teachers to return to China without providing a reopening date and this at a time when many Western governments advised against travelling to China. Others chorused this same refrain which can be seen as both an example of introjection and denial. It also did not help that the vice-principal evaded questions about a specific day and plan for the school's reopening but remained intransigent that everyone should make plans to return by the third of February.

Narcissistic Leadership and the Failure to address the Crisis

Some psychoanalysts define leaders as salesmen of fantasies (Gabriel, 1991). Such fantasies are an essential part of organisations, acting as a way for employees to tie in their futures with that of the organisation while devoting time and effort they otherwise would not have. In other words, gaining the trust of employees is at the crux of leadership. Therefore, leaders must take stock in how employees perceive their abilities, benevolence, and integrity so as to inspire trust (Mayer et al., 1995 as cited in Priem & Nystrom, 2011, p. 777). It could also be relevant to determine whether it is

necessary for the leaders to believe the phantasies they are *selling*. Le Bon (1895 as cited in Freud, 1923, p. 134) advocates that the most significant means leaders possess to make their presence felt within an organisation is through the fantasies they themselves are fanatical believers in.

An example of narcissistic leadership in the context of the school was when a teaching couple who had between them worked for the institution for twenty-five years and found themselves laid off with little over a month's notice. The official reason provided by the school was that the couple's visas could not be renewed given that they were outside of the country, but the same could be said of the other two dozen staff members stranded outside of China's borders who did not lose their job.

Although the teaching couple was in good standing with both staff and students, they had also made a reputation for being outspoken during meetings with SLT and often asked the said *difficult* questions. One such example was when the female teacher asked whether there would be overtime payment for staff members on account of the school being virtually open during the Qingming national holiday. Chinese law stipulates that any individual working during a national holiday is entitled to three times the ordinary paying rate although the school did not comply with the law in this case.

> The leader becomes the most important reality; questioning the leader's vision or wisdom becomes tantamount to betrayal. In this manner, organizations may inoculate themselves against reality, disregarding all signs of imminent disaster and marching happily and blindly to their doom. (Gabriel, 1991, p. 245)

Two weeks later, the couple announced that they would be leaving the school in the middle of the academic year even though their child had studied at the school for fifteen years and was still in China, unable to reunite with his parents. However, no official announcement was made as the school kept to its policy of silence which may be interpreted as another sign of institutionalised denial.

At a later stage, the leadership team did give in on the issue of the return date but failed to inform staff members of the need for all lessons and

meetings to be held through zoom thereon. Mandating face-to-face learning time, while contradicting earlier communications, led to a loss of trust not simply in the capacity of school leaders to protect the faculty from outside pressures but also the trustworthiness of the leader was now being called into question. Many of the twenty-five staff members who could not return to China felt their job were at risk and would effectively see their contracts terminated one by one.

After a month and a half of uncertainty related to the school's reopening date, the principal moved the mandatory return date for all staff members to March fifteenth; The directive nature of the email caused great acrimony among staff members but the email from the vice principal the very next morning was received with confusion. The vice-principal effectively contradicted his superior, reportedly giving in to pressures from a growing number of concerned staff although there were rumours that he could not find a return flight for his family also. His email reassured the faculty that travelling back to China was simply an expectation by the school and not mandatory. Ultimately, the leadership team was willing to consider that some staff members experienced extraordinary circumstances in returning. This was received with confusion by staff members outside of China and led to a disastrous outcome of over a third of the teaching faculty losing their jobs.

The Role that Trust Could Have Played in the Recalling of Teachers

Trust is a fundamental element to maintain cohesiveness and ensure the viability of any group- this is especially true in times of great adversity. An example of how lack of trust in leadership can lead to catastrophic outcomes is the case study led by Priem and Nystrom (2014), which examines the failure of a recently formed workgroup of British soldiers attempting to traverse Borneo's infamous low gully. Adverse weather conditions and a series of miscalculations eventually separated the soldiers into two par-

ties. The less physically able soldiers were unable to find their way out of the gully, calling for an international rescue mission that drew enormous international media attention. Despite a happy ending for the lost soldiers, the failure of the low gully expedition group cannot solely be attributed to *force majeure* causes such as adverse weather. The inexperience of the leader, miscalculations, and the soldier's reluctance to follow instructions driven by a lack of trust in their leader's competence also played a pivotal role. The authors of this study conclude that trust and distrust can coexist in a complex interrelationship. Employees can trust their leader in some respects and less so in others, as was the case in the expedition (p. 789).

After the rescue mission had retrieved them, the soldiers reported to trust their leader's survival skills but took it upon themselves to chart and traverse the gully, ignoring the leader's directions to ensure their own self-preservation.

> The distrust between the reconnaissance party and the officers led the reconnaissance party to engage in constructive deviance (Warren, 2003) to complete the mission. They went against the principles taught during army training and socialization when they proceeded down the gully. Their decision to continue toward civilization after Neill's party did not arrive at the gully floor by the appointed time ultimately enabled them to raise the alarm that initiated the rescue of the main party. (p. 790)

It is equally important to define trust from an organisational lens. Trust is the process of undistorted communication and decentralised decision-making (Mishra, 1996, p. 3). In the case of the recalling of the staff members, trust could have materialized in a more honest and ample debate about the limitations of the school in ensuring a safe return and what further means of support could have been offered. The leadership team had extended concessions to individual teachers lacking in electronic devices to deliver virtual classes, ensuring funds were readily available. A similar decision would have guaranteed the timely return of teachers struggling to pay for the exorbitantly expensive flight tickets. Some international schools had gone as far as arranging charter flights for staff members and their families. Within this

context, trust and respect are not to be mistaken for prestige (Freud, 1923), a concept that translates into depositing blind faith upon a leader based on perceptions and assumptions of success.

Instead, the principal moved the return date to March 15th, but it was too late as flights were practically impossible to book at that time. To make matters worse, eleven days later, China closed its borders on all foreign passport holders (Politico, 2020) along with most of its consular offices and embassies as the first outbreak raged on in Europe, and the virus had reached the shores of the USA. It meant that thirty percent of staff members remained outside of the country with no chance to renew their yearly visas. A few weeks later, around five other teachers saw their contracts terminated upon the school's reopening. The process was perceived as arbitrary, and resentment grew towards the vice principal grew significantly. Incidentally, he himself was unable to return to China although his contract was not terminated until well into the following school year.

Transitioning to e-learning

One-third of the faculty had over twenty years of working experience and an average of ten years working at the school. This group consists of individuals whose professional identities stemmed from an earlier time when the school was regarded as a top-tier education establishment on account of external exam results and high enrolment numbers. Prestige (Le Bon, 1895 as cited in Freud, 1923) was like unto a badge of honour, worn by many of the senior teachers; acting as a kind of denial, a primitive defence that seeks to omit the role which they had played in the school's decline and eroding reputation. Leaders often use the unique ability that prestige holds to paralyze the individual's critical thinking ability and demand obedience, the caveat being that prestige is wholly dependent on the success and dissipates upon failure.

Groups are by nature conservative, bound by tradition, and highly suspi-

cious of any new advances and innovations (Freud, 1923, p. 15). Hence, it was no surprise that the faculty did not welcome the transition to e-learning. At first, the working group moved from a state of depressive anxiety to one of mistrust. This was made clear via official and unofficial channels such as private online forums; when told to deliver all scheduled lessons via the Zoom online platform, many of the longstanding staff took to make their positions clear.

Although some of this discontentment might be attributed to unwelcome change and the staff's reluctance to fully engage in the practice of teaching during a time of crisis (James, 2010 as cited in Dale & James, p. 43), the reasoning behind the complaints is no less sound; Teachers felt undertrained as relates to Zoom, an unfamiliar platform (one of three others mandated by the school for e-learning). In this regard, recent studies bring to light very many reports of hardware and software compatibility issues, a common problem for educators transitioning to e-learning worldwide (Aboagye et al., 2020, as cited in Akpinar, 2021). There was one specific challenge to this organisation: a vertiginous drop in student attendance though this problem was justified by educators and students operating under different time zones.

Much like in the case of sergeant Neill's party, the school's faculty was compliant at first with the higher levels of monitoring either under the guise of *drop-ins* (a minimum requirement of two lesson observations per week was set by the leadership team), and the expectation that every lesson required a granulated version of a written lesson plan. However, the distrust of the leadership team's ability to steer the school through the e-learning transition led teachers to adapt to the circumstances of each class. The expectation of delivering every lesson in its entirety via zoom proved unsustainable to many; thirty percent of students were outside of China at the time and required to attend classes under the China time zone. At the same time, many were also dealing with personal adversities of their, own

not least of which, depression which, according to some studies, was experienced by a third of students worldwide (Akpinar, 2021) as a normal consequence of uncertainty on when a return to school would be possible and being cut off from their schoolmates and friends for an extended period of time, and in the case of this school and other international schools, cut off from their family in many cases. The school performed well in this regard, providing a virtual space for mental health support, and having the full-time mental health counsellor to reach out to students who were alone in Shanghai. Unfortunately, the same support was not extended to the staff members.

Such feelings were projected onto the teachers and manifested during virtual classes in the form of switched-off cameras and very tepid participation during class activities. Another concerning trend was the percentage of lower school students producing and uploading any homework.

The expectation of having a written lesson plan for each virtual lesson added a voluminous bureaucratic layer to an already stressed and anxious workgroup experiencing a period of transition. Increases in bureaucratic workload and more scrutiny at work have been associated with increased stress and anxiety levels among teachers (Pearson & Moowaw, 2005, p. 49). To make matters worse, and to once again consolidate power, the principal announced that the monetary gratuity included in the school's contract for foreign teachers would be from then on tied in with e-learning performance and compliance with the new directives in what many teachers received as a clear breach of contract.

Trust and Hope as an alternative strategy

A way for leaders to build trust is to avoid using denial as an organisational defence (Obholzer & Roberts, 1994, p. 142) and recognise the limitations of their decisions and influence as opposed to enforcing further monitoring of their employees. An alternative strategy in the case of this school could have been outreaching to the middle managers and inviting teachers to partake in planning the transition to online lessons. Such a change in interaction would have likely created a healthier working culture and encouraged collaborative autonomy amongst teachers which in turn would help foster a more positive attitude from the students and parents.

Teacher autonomy is a direct result of a leader's trust and is closely linked to teacher motivation (Pearson & Moowaw, 2005; Vangrieken et al., 2017). Autonomy, alongside positive student behaviour and support from management, are effective counters to prevent stress and anxiety and promote teacher satisfaction. In addition, there could have been merit in reaching out to the school's parent association and providing a forum for teachers (Dale & James, 2005, p. 98; Obholzer & Roberts, 1994, p. 140), thus requiring the school community at large to actively partake in designing a curriculum that would best cater for the needs of the students. In addition, using strategies such as flipped classroom and blended learning (lessons to be delivered partially through face-to-face zoom sessions partly via other online platforms) were standard solutions adopted by many schools during the first lockdowns. Finally, providing staff with a space for reflection on the newly adopted measures could have also helped alleviate negative feelings such as anxiety or stress. It must also be acknowledged that most school leaders worldwide did not have to consider the added challenges of their faculty members finding themselves scattered around the globe nor having to weigh in the consequences of border closures, as was the case with international schools based in China. Although, ultimately, accountability must lie with school managers.

Conclusion

In this essay, we sought to illustrate how **c**ompetence, openness, concern, and reliability (Mishra, 1996, p. 2) act as the pillars of trust. To varying degrees, the leadership team of this international school failed to find purchase on all four; first by failing to show concern over its employees, neglecting to put systems in place such as a virtual space and allotted time for mental health guidance or offering relocation assistance to those stranded with their families in foreign countries. As a result, teachers were led to a state of self-preservation, ultimately hurting the organisation's interests in the medium- and long-term.

The decision on how to roll out e-learning was a top-down decision and these often fail to gain traction when those who are expected to implement these decisions disagree with the changes and are not invited to partake in the deliberation phase (Ingersoll Alsalam, p. 7 as cited in Pearson & Moowaw, 2005, p. 40). There is an intrinsic relationship between reliability and competence which partially unraveled during the school's handling of the pandemic. The contradictory emails from the principal and vice-principal confounded the faculty, leaving many confused on whether it was compulsory to return to China or not. Adding to this, the termination of contracts to a number of those who had, for one reason or another, failed to return a month later created a profound sense of betrayal (Webb, 1994 as cited in Mishra, 1996, p. 24) that remains to this day in the organisation. Such a perceived lack of trust in the school's leadership team posits the decision taken by the school's owner to terminate both the principal and the vice principal contracts only three months after the school reopening.

Some evident limitations of this study include its small sample size making it is difficult to draw generalisations. There was also the difficulty of gathering reliable data during that time as the onset of the pandemic posed an enormous challenge in maintaining consistent communication with both colleagues and students. A different psychodynamic approach could have

also been used to analyse this critical incident, for instance, a dual framework of group-work mentality versus basic-assumption mentality pivoted by Wilfred Bion (1961). This framework could potentially act as an alternative way to explain the low performance of the e-learning measures during the first weeks of the pandemic, stemming from increased levels of fear, anxiety, guilt, and anger felt by most teachers within the organisation.

References

Akpınar, E. (2021). The Effect of Online Learning on Tertiary Level Students Mental Health during the Covid-19 Lockdown. *The European Journal of Social & Behavioural Sciences, 30*(1), 52-62.

Belkadi, F., Messaadia, M., Bernard, A., & Baudry, D. (2017). Collaboration management framework for OEM–suppliers relationships: a trust-based conceptual approach. *Enterprise Information Systems, 11*(7), 1018-1042.

Bion, W. R. (1961). *Experiences in Groups, and other papers.* New York.

Dale, D., & James, C. (2015). The importance of affective containment during unwelcome educational change: The curious incident of the deer hut fire. *Educational Management Administration & Leadership, 43*(1), 92-106.

De Board, R. (1978). *The Psychoanalysis of Organizations: A Psychoanalytic Approach to Behaviour in Groups and Organizations.* Routledge.

French, R. B., & Simpson, P. (2010). The 'work group': Redressing the balance in Bion's Experiences in Groups. *Human Relations, 63*(12), 1859-1878.

Freud, S. (1923). *Group Psychology and The Analysis of The Ego.* Project Gutenberg.

Gabriel, Y. (1999). *Organisations in Depth.* Sage.

Groarke, S. (2018). Reflections on the psychoanalysis of hope. *Psychoanalysis, Culture & Society, 23*(4), 365-383.

Hayden, M., & Thompson, J. (2013). International Schools: Antecedents, Current Issues and Metaphors for the Future. In R. Pearce (Ed.), *International Education and Schools: Moving beyond the First 40 Years* (pp. 3–24). Bloomsbury.

Hedge, N., & Mackenzie, A. (2012). Beyond care? *Journal of Philosophy of Education, 46*(2), 192-206.

Kyriacou, C. (1987). Teacher stress and burnout: An international review. *Educational Research, 29*(2), 146-152.

Kyriacou, C., & Sutcliffe, J. (1978). A model of teacher stress. *Educational Studies, 4*(1), 1-6.

Le Bon, G. (1895). *The Crowd: A Study of the Popular Mind.* Gutenberg.

Lewicki, R. J., Tomlinson, E. C., & Gillespie, N. (2006). Models of interpersonal trust development: Theoretical approaches, empirical evidence, and future directions. *Journal of Management, 32*(6), 991-1022.

MacIntyre, P. D., Gregersen, T., & Mercer, S. (2020). Language teachers' coping strategies during the Covid-19 conversion to online teaching: Correlations with stress, wellbeing and negative emotions. *System, 94*, 1-13.

Mishra, A. K. (1996). Organizational responses to crisis. In R. D. Kramer & T. R. Tyler (Eds.), *Trust in Organizations: Frontiers of Theory and Research* (pp. 261-287). Sage.

Obhlozer, A., & Roberts, V. Z. (Eds.). (1994). *The Unconscious at Work: Individual and Organizational Stress in the Human Services.* Routledge.

Palmer, D. (2020, March 26). China closes border to foreign travelers. *Politco.* https://www.politico.com/news/2020/03/26/china-closes-border-150455

Pearson, L. C., & Moomaw, W. (2005). The relationship between teacher autonomy and stress, work satisfaction, empowerment, and professionalism. *Educational Research Quarterly, 29*(1), 38-54.

Priem, R. L., & Nystrom, P. C. (2014). Exploring the dynamics of workgroup fracture: Common ground, trust-with-trepidation, and warranted distrust. *Journal of Management, 40*(3), 764-795.

Radomska, J., Wołczek, P., Sołoducho-Pelc, L., & Silva, S. (2019). The impact of trust on the approach to management—A case study of creative industries. *Sustainability, 11*(3), 816.

Taylor, E. (2009). *The Mystery of Personality A History of Psychodynamic Theories.* Springer.

Vangrieken, K., Grosemans, I., Dochy, F., & Kyndt, E. (2017). Teacher autonomy and collaboration: A paradox? Conceptualising and measuring teachers' autonomy and collaborative attitude. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 67*, 302-315.

PERCEIVED RELATIONAL FACTORS IN MARITAL STABILITY AMONG MARRIED AND DIVORCED BOSNIANS: DO WE UNDERSTAND ONE ANOTHER?

Selvira Draganović
International University of Sarajevo

Abstract

With an increase in divorce rates worldwide, it seems that marriage loses its importance and popularity. Still, many people seek romantic partners and marry for many reasons. Research points to the beneficial effects of marital and romantic relationships. What factors make a good and successful marital and romantic relationship and why marriages and relationships fall apart remains to be answered. Since the divorce rates in Bosnia and Herzegovina increase, the purpose of this study was to explore factors in good and successful marriages and reasons for divorce. This is a qualitative study in which a survey with open-ended questions was used to explore participants' responses. With the help of convenience sampling technique, 366 participants, N= 167 married and N=199 divorced with a mean age M= 43±11 and M= 41±10 respectively were recruited. A content analysis of participants' responses shows that both a good and successful marriage and reasons for divorce are mostly related to relational interpersonal and intrapersonal factors while external, social factors play a less important role. Married and divorced participants named understanding, love, respect, trust, tolerance, communication skills, agreement and compromise as the top qualities for a successful marriage. As the leading reasons for divorce, divorced participants listed adultery or affairs and other women, alcoholism, violence and aggression, arguments and conflict, and misunderstanding.

Keywords: good and successful marriage, reasons for divorce, relational factors, Bosnia and Herzegovina

Introduction

Many individuals seek romantic relationship and a marriage. These usually start as a source of satisfaction and fulfillment. Research shows that psychological adjustment and physical health is better among married adults compared to separated, divorced, and never married individuals (Horn et al., 2013). Furthermore, healthy, stable and quality relationships are positively correlated with general wellbeing (Kansky, 2018; Robertson et al., 2018). It also seems that highly satisfying marriages may offer spouses opportunities to feel that they belong and that they are connected to others. Belonging and connection are important basic human needs (Baumeister and Leary, 1995, Ryan & Deci, 2000) which are successfully met in satisfying marriages and relationships. Healthy and quality relationships and marriages are positively correlated with happiness, wellbeing and life satisfaction (Lee & Ono, 2012; Luhmann et.al., 2012) as well as social support. A large body of research suggests that social support is beneficial for both physical health and subjective wellbeing (Cohen, 2004; Siedlecki et al., 2014). However, what seems to be positively correlated with wellbeing and health and starting off with plenty of love, affection, satisfaction, and fulfillment nevertheless frequently dissolves, resulting in significant individual and societal strains. The current high divorce and separation rates attract attention of researchers of different orientations studying marital and romantic relationships. Contrary to previous practices, individual interests take precedence over the interests, customs and expectations of the wider community in the current trends in romantic and marital relationships. Whilst sociologists focus on macro-behavioral forms of marital interaction, such as division of responsibilities and friendship, psychologists focus on micro-behavioral forms, trying to understand the interpersonal forms that lead to good and successful or quality and stable marriages or, respectively, dissolution, separation, distress or even divorce. Divorce is, in many cases, the culmination of a long process of spousal emotional distancing and growing individual independence. Divorce ranks high on the list of major

life stressors which often leads to psychological problems, consistent with studies in psychiatric epidemiology which report a relatively high rate of depression, depressive symptoms, and other psychological problems in separated divorced individuals in many epidemiological samples (Faye et al., 2013; McShall & Johnson, 2015; Slavich, 2016).

Even more, parental divorce is linked to psychopathology and behavioral problems in their offspring generations later (Jackson, Rogers & Sartor, 2016; Nederhof et al., 2012; Vousura et al., 2012). This proliferation of evidence suggests that divorce may contribute psychopathological risk in both spouses and their offspring. Scientists, researchers, and even therapists raise their concern related to marital stability and divorce rates which seem to increase (Draganovic, 2020). Likewise, the number of divorces in Bosnia and Herzegovina has increased for the past five years (Federalni zavod statistiku, as cited by Draganovic, 2020).

Studies until now indicate different intra-personal and interpersonal or relational factors associated with marital stability and instability or divorce range personality factors (Boertien & Mortelmans, 2018; Lee & Martin, 2019) and attachment factors (Diamond, Brimhall & Elliot, 2018) to individualization (Strandell, 2018), relationship factors (Finkel, 2018; Gottman, 2015) couples' communication and interaction factors (Afrasiabi & Jafarizadeh, 2015; Mohlatlole, Sithole & Shirindi, 2018; Zaheri et al., 2016), spousal similarities in health behaviors, gene expression, immune profiles and the gut (Kiecolt-Glaser, 2018), social media, (McDaniel, Drouin & Cravens, 2017) and the minding model of love (Boniwell, 2012). Even though love seems to be the number one factor in marriage (Boniwell, 2012), college students are ambivalent about love as necessary to maintain marriage (Sprecher & Hatfield, 2017), while young couples highly associate sudden character change, lack of and poor communication, financial problems, abuse and infidelity (Mohlatlole, Sithole & Shirindi, 2018) and infidelity related behaviors on social media (McDaniel, Drouin & Cravens,

2017) with divorce. To the best of our knowledge, there are no studies on intrapersonal or relational factors in marriage or reasons for divorce in Bosnia and Herzegovina so far, despite high divorce rates. In the light of the above discussion and highlighting psychological benefits of quality marriage and detrimental effects of divorce, we explore how Bosnian married people perceive good marital relationships and the reasons which prompted divorced individuals to dissolve their marriages.

Method

A qualitative research method in the form of a survey was used in this study. The survey contained a socio-demographic questionnaire followed by two open-ended questions (1.“*In your opinion what makes a good/successful marriage*”, posed to both married and divorced participants, and, 2.“*What is the reason for your divorce*”, posed to divorced participants only), which were posed in order to explore participants’ experiences. This was followed by an encouragement note to participants to express their opinion and response whilst their privacy is protected. Inclusion criteria for the study were: a) married or divorced and b) possession of competence necessary to give consent to participate in the study. Participation was voluntary and no material compensation was offered. The survey was distributed following the snow ball principle and data collection took part over several months.

Open-ended questions do not provide participants with a predetermined set of answer choices but allow participants to provide answers in their own words. This method allows researchers to gain a capacious look at the issue studied. In this particular case, I was interested in participants’ responses regarding their perception of good or successful marriage and reasons for divorce. Content analysis was used to analyze gathered data which was then coded into qualities/reasons which were then further quantified and ranked according to their order and occurrence in both groups (as presented in tables 2 and 3).

Sampling and sample

The convenience snow ball sampling method was used to recruit participants for this study which consists of two groups of participants, married and divorced. In total, 366 participants took part in this study, among which N= 167 were married and N=199 were divorced. The divorced participants’ age range was M= 41±10 and that of married participants was M= 43±11. Other important demographic characteristics of the participants are presented in the table below.

Table 1. Sample characteristics.

Sample's social demographics	Divorced N=199	Married N=167	Both groups 366	%
Age	(23-68) 41±10	(22 -78.) 43±11		
Education level				
Incomplete primary school	2	1	3	0.8
Primary school	7	9	16	4.4
High school	96	70	166	45.4
College degree	21	11	32	8.7
University degree	55	60	115	31.4
Masters or PhD degree	17	13	30	8.2
Employment/occupation				
Full time job position	98	94	192	52.5
Part time job position	38	22	60	16.4
Entrepreneur/craftsman	10	6	16	4.4
Unemployed	23	16	39	10.7
Self employed	4	3	7	1.9
Pension/disability	9	9	18	4.9
Housewife	7	11	18	4.9
Others	5	3	8	2.2
Monthly income				
No personal income	17	11	28	7.7
Less than 400 KM	11	2	13	3.6
400 KM – 800 KM	34	9	43	11.7
800 KM – 1200 KM	40	13	53	14.5
1200 KM – .1500KM	49	41	90	24.6
More than 1500 KM	48	89	137	37.4

Results

The analysis of participants' responses led to the conclusion that partici-
pants perceive relational factors to be leading factors in marital stability
and instability. This was also one of the most frequently named reasons
for divorce. Interestingly, both participant groups, married and divorced,
responded similarly, listing several individual interpersonal qualities like
understanding (divorced 46%, married 59.2%) as the top quality for a
good and successful marriage, then *love* (divorced 37.1%, married 43.1%),
respect (divorced 28.6%, married 28.7%), *trust* (divorced 17%, married
17.9%), *tolerance* (divorced 5%, married 17.3%), and *communication
skills* (divorced 15%, married 15.5%), as can be seen in the table below.

Table 2. *What makes a good/successful marriage?* in both participant
groups (N= 366).

What makes a good/suc-cessful marriage?	Married N=167	%	Divorced N=199	%
Understanding	99	59.2	92	46.2
Love	72	43.1	74	37.1
Respect	48	28.7	57	28.6
Trust	30	17.9	34	17.0
Tolerance	29	17.3	10	5.0
Talk and communication	26	15.5	30	15.0
Support	20	11.9	17	8.5
Compromise	15	8.9	9	4.5
Attention	16	9.5	15	7.5
Friendship			6	3.0
Finances/money			9	4.5
Agreement	5	2.9	16	8.0
Honesty	8	4.7	10	5.0
Harmony			16	8.0
Appreciation			9	4.5
Common interests and goals	7	4.1		

From the participants' responses it may be concluded that when the quality
which participants named as contributing to a good and successful marriage
are perceived to be missing, this is a reason to dissolve the marriage, as can
be seen in participants responses to the second open-ended question "what
is the reason for your divorce?" directed at divorced group of participants.

Table 3. Enlisted reasons for divorce (divorced participants, N=199)

Reasons for divorce	F	%
Adultery/infidelity	50	25.1
Alcoholism, drug use	33	16.5
Aggression, violence	31	15.5
Arguments, conflicts,	30	15.0
Jealousy	26	13.0
Misunderstanding	23	11.5
Finances, money, poverty	17	8.5
Discord	17	8.5
Lies, mistrust	16	8.0
Differences in personality, menta-lity, character, aims, ideas	15	7.5
Disrespect	13	6.5
The in-laws' influence	13	6.5
Lack of or poor communication	12	6.0
Not having children	10	5.0
No love, emotions, intimacy	9	4.5
Gambling	8	4.0
Irresponsibility	7	3.5
Separation, war, travel	6	3.0
Neglect, inattention	6	3.0
Cessation of love and connection	5	2.5
Stinginess	4	2.0
Differences in age, education	4	2.0
Becoming parents	1	0.5

As can be seen from the table above, divorced participants perceive *adultery* to be the leading reason for their divorce (25.1%), followed by *alcohol and drugs* (16.5%), *aggression and violence* (15.5%), *conflicts* (15%), *jealousy* (13%), and *misunderstanding* (11%). All these responses can be categorized as either individual or relational factors. Given the traditional Bosnian cultural habit of many couples to live together with the in-laws and low socio-economic status, we expected these external factors to be cited frequently. However, this was not the case, contrary to our expectations.

Discussion

As already noted in the method section, participants' answers to the open-ended questions can be categorized either as relational, interpersonal, or external factors. An interesting finding in this case is that *understanding*, as a very important individual and interpersonal variable, is regarded as the most frequently listed and leading factor or quality for a good and successful marriage among both married and divorced participants. At the same time, misunderstanding ranks high as the sixth perceived reason for divorce, after *adultery, alcoholism, aggression, conflicts and jealousy, among divorcees*. Since we do not know what participants mean by *understanding,* we asked them to further explain. These were their responses: *Understanding is respecting the partner, loving his / her flaws and tolerance, or adapting to each other, or making compromises, empathy directed at the spouse and suppression of one's own egoism, whims, and frustrations, which cause most conflicts and conflicts compassion for the other, the opposite of indifference and disregard for other people's feelings like sorrow, pain, happiness, needs, it is being tolerant, self-renunciation. Understanding is when two people are on approximately the same or similar intellectual level, and misunderstanding is, of course, the opposite.* Participants also elaborated more on what do they mean by misunderstanding, and this is their response: misunderstanding refers to *disrespect for a relationship or marriage. Understanding is actually a resemblance, insight into the*

soul of another person or "wearing other person's shoes", and depends on emotional intelligence, etc., while misunderstanding is the inability to penetrate other people's needs or lack of desire for that insight. Since each man is a separate person, understanding is to accept him differently and love him with all his flaws and virtues.

Hence, understanding is respecting each other's individuality while respecting the institution of marriage and all that comes along with it and simply minding one another. What seems to be reflected in the participants' responses regarding understanding and the lack of it, as an important relational and personal variable, can be explained by the *minding model of love* (Boniwell, 2012). According to this model, minding means knowing and being known, attribution, acceptance and respect, reciprocity and continuity.

The "knowing and being known" component of love in the minding love model includes behaviors aimed at learning about each other: questioning and disclosing, knowing about thoughts, feelings, attitudes and past history. "Attributions" are the explanations we have about our partner's behavior. "Acceptance and respect" relate to accepting the partner for who she/he is and respecting him/her for that. "Reciprocity" relates to a sense of equality, when one's gains are approximately equal to one's investments. This is exactly what our participants reported. Finally, "continuity" refers to the need to continue the first four elements as indicated in the term "minding", which is a process rather than a destination, thus also requiring time, continuity, and interpersonal skills.

Gottman (2015), one of the most prominent relationships experts, suggests a marriage works when spouses can enhance their love through several interpersonal skills like nurturing their fondness and admiration, turning towards each other instead of away, letting their spouse influence them, solving their solvable problems, overcoming gridlock, and creating a shared

sense of meaning. Again, going back over participants' explanation of understanding, these interpersonal skills are reflected there, so our findings are in line with Gottman's conclusions. Contrary to having understanding, the lack of it might be related to the individualization factor which shapes peoples' perceptions and understandings of the world, including their expectations of marriage and close relationships (Strandell, 2018). The factor of understanding from our study findings conforms to nurturing fondness and admiration, turning towards one another instead of away, overcoming gridlock, and creating a shared sense of meaning (Finkel, 2018; Gottman, 2015). Similar to our findings, an Iranian study's findings also points to factors like "understanding the spouse" and "understanding the spouse's situation" to be positively correlated with marital stability and satisfaction (Afrasiabi & Jafarizadeh, 2015). Looking at participants' responses, we can see that enlisted relational factors in both, good and successful marriages and reasons for divorce, fit this minding theory of love, particularly respect, reciprocity and continuity, interpersonal skills while the lack of it could be linked to the individualization factor.

However, lots of these relational factors are related to a spouse's personality traits. Gottman's studies (2011; 2012) discuss how negative personality traits have a detrimental effect on a relationship. Conflicts and arguments impair marital satisfaction and marital quality. Conflicts and arguments usually cause emotional injuries by unkind words and behavior which in turn impairs marital stability and affects marital satisfaction negatively. Some research into these issues points to the importance of the presence and nurturing of kindness in intimate and marital relationships, which acts as psychological glue and offers an important form of social support (Gable et al., 2006; Gottman 2011; Gottman 2012; Maisel and Gable, 2008). Independent of Gottman's studies, research shows that kindness, along with emotional stability, is the most important predictor of satisfaction and stability in marriage as it makes each partner feel that the other cares for him or her, that he or she understands, confirms, validates and loves them

(Aloni, 2010; Fredrickson et al, 2008; Pressman, Kraft & Cross, 2015).

It is important to note that kindness does not mean that one should not express anger (Gottman 2011, 2012), but actually know how to express it. There are two ways to do this: by attacking or by explaining why you are hurt and angry which is the better way. When people talk about kindness, they often think of small acts of generosity, but kindness can be the backbone of a relationship/marriage, through daily interaction, with or without gifts. One way to practice kindness is to follow your partner's intentions. Because, even in relationships in which partners are frustrated, there are almost always some positive things and people often try to do the right thing and not hurt one another intentionally. Gottman's research indicates that a lack of interest in a partner's joy alienates the partners. Although it is known that partners should be there for each other when things are not going well, research (Gable and Gonzaga, 2006) confirms that being there for each other when things are going well is actually much more important for relationship quality, and that inadequate reacting to someone's good news can have dramatic consequences for a relationship.

In both groups, participants ranked love as the second quality for a good and successful marriage. Many people claim that love is an indescribable emotion. Maslow and later Rogers claimed that the need for love and belonging is at the bottom of the pyramid of basic needs immediately after physiological or biological needs and the need for security, pointing to its importance. The need for love and belonging includes the need for close intimate relationships and admiration. Love and belonging to people help to overcome feelings of loneliness and alienation, and the very idea of love is a need that drives us to look for partners and commit to them. Every living being wants to be loved, except for people suffering from psychopathy. Love is essential in all close or intimate relations and relationships, such as marriage. The importance and connection of love with marriage has been shown by the results of a large international survey conducted in eleven

countries, on four continents. To the question "If you met a partner who meets all your criteria, would you marry him/her if you are not in love?" over 80% of participants responded negatively (Levine et al., 1995, as cited by Čudina-Obradović, 2006).

However, despite this importance of love for marriage, little is known about love in marriage. Although our participants point out the importance of it, we know little about what they think about love, whether they think that love changes over time and how, what are the determinants, types and especially what is the intensity of love in marital periods before and after childbirth, the child's departure to school or the child's departure from the family. Unrealistic expectations and misconceptions about love, intimacy and sexual behavior, i.e. expectations called *romantic myth*, also distort the perception. In addition, we must point out that infatuation and love, although both imply strong feelings for the other person, are often two terms that differ qualitatively. Infatuation rests on a distorted, unrealistic image of the other person because we still do not know them completely. This is characteristic of the initial phase of the relationship or marriage. Love is based on knowing the reality, i.e. positive and negative sides or characteristics, of another person and is found in longer relationships/marriages. Unrealistic expectations are formed in the phase of falling in love when the partner still sees things through the infamous pink glasses. These expectations are also related to conflicts and quarrels later, expressed through the complaint "you were not like that at the beginning of the relationship/marriage", or "why can't you be like at the beginning of the relationship/marriage". Of course, a person is constantly changing, they will never be the same as at the beginning of a relationship/marriage, through aging and different life experiences in the course of the relationship/marriage, especially after major life events, such as the transition to a parental role and/or personal losses.

Research on romantic relationship discusses passionate and compassionate love (Boniwell, 2012; Fehr, Harasymchuk & Sprecher, 2014; Hendrick & Hendrick 2006). Passionate love (PL) is equivalent to a state of infatuation: an intense desire for another person, which can be completely possessing. PL is often characterized by excitement, moments of exultation, feeling accepted, safe and even a sense of union and transcendence, but also by mood swings, anxiety, despair and jealousy. It is commonly believed that falling in love cannot be helped. However, it is usually triggered by identifying fulfilment of one's needs and desires with another person, or simply projecting one's ideal onto the other. PL is temporary, because sooner or later, inevitable differences between the idealized and the actual other become so prominent that they can no longer be ignored. Compassionate love reflects a deep affection that people feel for each other. Love that begins with the uncontrollable and unpredictable fire of passion usually quietens into a beautiful glow of compassion, provided it survives the first stage.

Compassionate love may be less intense but is lasting and involves being, doing, staying and growing with the other person (Popovic, 2005). *Being with the other* refers to acceptance, care, respect (including self-respect) and mutual equality. *Doing with the other* means having shared goals or activities and mutual interests, alongside and in addition to the individual ones. Doing sometimes involves helping, comforting, and protecting the other. *Staying with the other* is based on commitment between people. It is assisted by intimacy and closeness. *Growing with the other* involves transcending one's own interests and a willingness to change. It is a common wisdom that everyone changes in his or her lifetime. Change, therefore, is an essential element of life and relationships. In a partnership, it is important that the rates and directions of change in individuals are, to some extent, compatible. This benefits the relationship and enhances its growth.

Our participants also consider respect, trust, tolerance, communication, and conversation as other frequently and highly ranked qualities for a good and successful marriage following love. Similar results were found in Iran and Lebowakgomo (Mohlatlole, Sithole, & Shirindi, 2018; Zaheri et, al., 2016). If we go back to how our respondents explained understanding, we can see that these qualities can be viewed both individually but also as a part of different love and also as part of the quality of understanding, which we have already elaborated. Interestingly, our respondents also mentioned the following relational factors or qualities as factors or qualities necessary for a successful or good marriage: growing together, partner compatibility, sharing responsibilities, joint decisions, perseverance and persistence or courage, mutuality, equality, selflessness, mutual adjustment, partner's separation, maturity or readiness for marriage. However, these were listed less frequently and were ranked lower on the list. Given the traditional Bosnian society and contrary to our expectations, factors like living arrangement, the in-laws, parental roles or not having children were not mentioned as often as reasons for divorce in our study. Of course, this could be related to the participants' socio-demographic characteristics since most of them were fully employed, with an average or higher income than the national average, and have at least a high school or higher degree.

Next to understanding and love, an Iranian study suggests communication to have a positive impact on marital satisfaction (Zaheri et al., 2016) and sudden character change, lack of and poor communication, financial problems, abuse and infidelity were associated with divorce among young couples (Mohlatlole, Sithole, & Shirindi, 2018). Our findings correspond with these findings. We also notice that divorced individuals enlisted adultery/infidelity as the first and most frequent reason for divorce but also named finances, discord/conflict and poor communication.

Conclusion

Bosnians consider good and successful marriage a constant and committed effort requiring both spouses to show understanding, love empathy, respect, communication and similar relational and intrapersonal factors. Understanding makes marriage last and successful while the luck of it, next to the adultery, violence and aggression and alcohol are most commonly enlisted reasons for divorce among Bosnian divorcees. Our study findings go in line with other similar studies so Bosnian married and divorced individuals consider common positive relational factors in stable marriage and in divorce, just like their contemporaries Word wide. Good and successful marriage requires lots of mutual work and effort, nurturing kindness, attention, selflessness, kindness, reciprocity, activity and agility, whilst the lack of such qualities or their opposite might be the reason why people decide to end a marriage, which seems to be true no matter who you are and where you live. This study has some limitations primarily related to the method part, convinience sampling and snow ball recruitment technique. So, generalization is not possible. Our findings provide some guidance in regards to relational factors in quality marriage and reasons for divorce. Also, variables like personality, attachment style, marital longevity, compatibility and/or sexual satisfaction or marriage/divorce longevity, vital factors in marital stability and divorce were not explored. So, it is recommended that future study be of mixed-method design, consider present study's missing factors and even perhaps include married and divorced couples instead of individuals.

References

Afrasiabi, F., & Jafarizadeh, M. R. (2015). Study of the relationship between personal factors and emotional divorce. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, *6*(6 S6), 406.

Agencija za Statistiku (2020). Women and Man in Bosnia and Herzegovina, *Thematic Bulletin*, Retrieved from https://bhas.gov.ba/data/Publikacije/Bilteni/2020/FAM_00_2019_TB_0_BS.pdf

Aloni, M. (2010). *Are all acts of kindness created equally? Understanding relationship maintenance behaviors from a motivational perspective*. State University of New York.

Baumeister, R. F., & Leary, M. R. (1995). The need to belong: Desire for interpersonal attachments as a fundamental human motivation. *Psychological Bulletin*, 117, 497-529.

Boertien, D., & Mortelmans, D. (2018). Does the relationship between personality and divorce change over time? A cross-country comparison of marriage cohorts. *Acta Sociologica*, *61*(3), 300-316.

Boniwell, I. (2012). *Positive Psychology In A Nutshell: The Science Of Happiness: The Science of Happiness*. McGraw-Hill Education.

Cohen, S. (2004). Social relationships and health. *American Psychologist*, 59, 676-684.

Čudina-Obradović, M., & Obradović, J. (2006). Psihologija braka i obitelji, Zagreb, Golden Marketing -Tehnicka knjiga.

Diamond, R. M., Brimhall, A. S., & Elliott, M. (2018). Attachment and relationship satisfaction among first married, remarried, and post☐divorce relationships. *Journal of Family Therapy*, *40*, S111-S127.

Draganović S. (2020). Psihosocijalni izazovi za budućnost braka i porodice. CNS.

Faye, A., Kalra, G., Subramanyam, A., Shah, H., Kamath, R., & Pakhare, A. (2013). Study of marital adjustment, mechanisms of coping and psychopathology in couples seeking divorce in India. *Sexual and Relationship Therapy*, *28*(3), 257-269.

Fehr, B., Harasymchuk, C., & Sprecher, S. (2014). Compassionate love in romantic relationships: A review and some new findings. *Journal of Social and Personal Relationships*, *31*(5), 575-600.

Finkel, E. J. (2018). *The all-or-nothing marriage: How the best marriages work*. Dutton.

Fredrickson, B. L., Cohn, M. A., Coffey, K. A., Pek, J., & Finkel, S. M. (2008). Open hearts build lives: positive emotions, induced through loving-kindness meditation, build consequential personal resources. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, *95*(5), 1045.

Gable, S. L., Gonzaga, G. C., & Strachman, A. (2006). Will you be there for me when things go right? Supportive responses to positive event disclosures. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, *91*(5), 904.

Gottman, J. M. (2012). Reliability and validity of the sound relationship house scales introduction.

Gottman, J. M. (2011). *The science of trust: Emotional attunement for couples*. WW Norton & Company.

Gottman, J., & Silver, N. (2012). *What makes love last?: How to build trust and avoid betrayal*. Simon and Schuster.

Gottman, J. M., & Silver, N. (2015). *The seven principles for making marriage work: A practical guide from the country's foremost relationship expert*. Harmony.

Hendrick, C., & Hendrick, S. S. (2006). Styles of romantic love. *The New Psychology of Love*, 149-170.

Horn, E. E., Xu, Y., Beam, C. R., Turkheimer, E., & Emery, R. E. (2013). Accounting for the physical and mental health benefits of entry into marriage: a genetically informed study of selection and causation. *Journal of Family Psychology*, *27*(1), 30.

Jackson, K. M., Rogers, M. L., & Sartor, C. E. (2016). Parental divorce and initiation of alcohol use in early adolescence. *Psychology of addictive behaviors*, *30*(4), 450.

Kansky, J. (2018). What's love got to do with it?: Romantic relationships and well-being. *Handbook of well-being.* DEF Publishers.

Kiecolt-Glaser, J. K. (2018). Marriage, divorce, and the immune system. *American Psychologist*, *73*(9), 1098.

Lee, K. S., & Ono, H. (2012). Marriage, cohabitation, and happiness: A cross-national analysis of 27 countries. *Journal of Marriage and Family, 74*, 953-972.

Lee, K., & Martin, P. (2019). Who gives and receives more? Older couples' personality and spousal support. *Personal Relationships*, *26*(3), 429-447.

Luhmann, M., Hofmann, W., Eid, M., & Lucas, R. E. (2012). Subjective well-being and adaptation to life events: A meta-analysis. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 102*, 592-615.

Maisel, N. C., & Gable, S. L. (2009). The paradox of received social support: The importance of responsiveness. *Psychological Science*, *20*(8), 928-932.

McDaniel, B. T., Drouin, M., & Cravens, J. D. (2017). Do you have anything to hide? Infidelity-related behaviors on social media sites and marital satisfaction. *Computers in Human Behavior*, *66*, 88-95.

McShall, J. R., & Johnson, M. D. (2015). The association between relationship distress and psychopathology is consistent across racial and ethnic groups. *Journal of Abnormal Psychology*, *124*(1), 226.

Mohlatlole, N. E., Sithole, S., & Shirindi, M. L. (2018). Factors contributing to divorce among young couples in Lebowakgomo. *Social Work*, *54*(2), 256-274.

Nederhof, E., Belsky, J., Ormel, J., & Oldehinkel, A. J. (2012). Effects of divorce on Dutch boys' and girls' externalizing behavior in Gene x Environment perspective: Diathesis stress or differential susceptibility in the Dutch Tracking Adolescents' Individual Lives Survey study?. *Development and Psychopathology*, *24*(3), 929-939.

Popovic, N. (2005). *Personal synthesis*. PWBC.

Pressman, S. D., Kraft, T. L., & Cross, M. P. (2015). It's good to do good and receive good: The impact of a 'pay it forward'style kindness intervention on giver and receiver well-being. *The Journal of Positive Psychology*, *10*(4), 293-302.

Roberson, P. N., Norona, J. C., Lenger, K. A., & Olmstead, S. B. (2018). How do relationship stability and quality affect wellbeing?: Romantic relationship trajectories, depressive symptoms, and life satisfaction across 30 years. *Journal of Child and Family Studies*, *27*(7), 2171-2184.

Ryan, R. M., & Deci, E. L. (2000). Self-determination theory and the facilitation of intrinsic motivation, social development, and well-being. *American Psychologist, 55*, 68-78.

Siedlecki, K. L., Salthouse, T. A., Oishi, S., & Jeswani, S. (2014). The relationship between social support and subjective well-being across age. *Social Indicators Research, 117*, 561-576.

Slavich, G. M. (2016). Psychopathology and stress. *The SAGE Encyclopedia of Theory in Psychology*, 762-764.

Sprecher, S., & Hatfield, E. (2017). The importance of love as a basis of marriage: Revisiting Kephart (1967). *Journal of Family Issues*, *38*(3), 312-335.

Strandell, J. (2018). Increasing marriage rates despite high individualization: Under-

standing the role of internal reference in Swedish marriage discourse. *Cultural Sociology*, *12*(1), 75-95

Vousoura, E., Verdeli, H., Warner, V., Wickramaratne, P., & Baily, C. D. R. (2012). Parental divorce, familial risk for depression, and psychopathology in offspring: A three-generation study. *Journal of Child and Family Studies*, *21*(5), 718-725.

Zaheri, F., Dolatian, M., Shariati, M., Simbar, M., Ebadi, A., & Azghadi, S. B. H. (2016). Effective factors in marital satisfaction in perspective of Iranian women and men: A systematic review. *Electronic Physician*, *8*(12), 3369.

Epiphany

A CHALLENGE TO THE CONTEMPORARY MULTI-CULTURALISM FROM A HISTORICAL PERSPEC-TIVE: THE EARLY ABBASID ERA

Emel Topçu

International University of Sarajevo

Ibrahim Halil Menek

Hasan Kalyoncu University

Abstract

This study examines the early multiculturalism of the Abbasid Empire. The purpose is to demonstrate the significance of historical multiculturalism in building a governmental-social system. The analysis of the early Abbasid multiculturalism also integrates Persian and Greco-Roman multicultural models. The study argues that the Abbasid Dynasty, which succeeded the Umayyad Dynasty after a revolution, had introduced a unique multicultural model by establishing a tolerant and libertarian imperial structure. In effect, the Abbasid Dynasty rejected the Umayyad emphasis on the so-called Arab nationalism in its early period (750-833). This study employs a comparative analysis of the early multiculturalism of the Abbasid Empire and modern practices of multiculturalism for textual analysis and conclusions. It is significant to demonstrate how the early multiculturalism of the Abbasid Empire could be correlated to modern multicultural practices. In this regard, the policy of support and encouragement of translation activities by the early Abbasid caliphs, rulers and intellectuals had strengthened this multicultural system, which was inclusive regardless of ethnicity, religion, and race.

Keywords: multiculturalism; historical multiculturalism; early Abbasid era; scientific-translation activities

Introduction

Although multiculturalism only emerged in scholarly works in the twentieth century, multicultural structures existed in the ancient world (Foster, 2016). For instance, Schumann (2010) notes that multicultural empires existed from ancient times until the fall of the Ottoman Empire. In addition, he states that multiculturalism cannot be exclusively considered as a concept unique to the modern period. Moreover, Fay (2001) emphasizes that multiculturalism, from historical and global perspectives, was a general way in which cultures, societies, and civilizations flourished. In this regard, the purpose of this study is to examine the early Abbasid period (750-833) as a case study to show that multiculturalism is a concept known long before the modern period. Multiculturalism challenges the nation-state relationship, which adopts the principle of a nation based on a common history, ethnicity, language, and culture. Thus, multiculturalism inherently prioritizes diversity against all forms of uniformity (Kymlicka, 1998). The debate about multiculturalism has become especially intense in recent years, leading to the dominating idea that multicultural societies have only recently emerged. From a historical point of view, the possibility of accepting the nation-state as a relatively new concept also supports the belief that multiculturalism is likewise a new phenomenon (Schumann, 2010). Therefore, another goal of this study is to create a counterpoint to this perception, utilizing a specific historical period as a case study.

A thorough literature review shows the multicultural character of the ancient empires and civilizations. Pingree (1973) notes that as a result of the success of the Abbasid Revolution, a new multicultural model emerged which was based on the demographic combination of different social groups in the cities, especially in Baghdad. Similarly, Gutas (2003) states that the early caliphs of the Abbasid Empire formed a multicultural society by overthrowing the exclusionary Umayyad policies. In addition, Endress and Kruk (1997) argue that the atmosphere allowing different societies to

come together within the borders of the Islamic State was established in the early Abbasid Empire. Likewise, Vatandaş (2015) states that classical Islamic Civilization consists of a mosaic consisting of differences, beliefs, traditions, cultures and values, which coexist in a multicultural environment. One of the important examples of this multicultural unity was established in the early Abbasid period.

The above studies on multiculturalism do not specifically examine the early Abbasid period from the perspective of multiculturalism. Therefore, this study examines the multiculturalism of the early Abbasid period within the framework of the parameters of modern multiculturalism. Although the literature seems to be dominated by the idea that each system should be examined in its own social and historical reality, some studies contain conceptual transitions between periods.

Various societies and civilizations in the past assumed a multicultural role thanks to some of their features. Modood (2014) emphasizes that in the past many multicultural societies existed, especially outside the nation-states of Europe (p. 18). While there is a dominant culture in these civilizations, a tolerant environment was established by the leaders of the dominant culture so that other cultures could protect themselves and survive together with their differences (Momin, 2010). In this way, the Abbasid Empire, in its early period (750-833), established a multicultural and pluralistic model of society, which was unprecedented in the history of Islam. Furthermore, the Abbasid multicultural model strongly rejected the tribal logic of the Umayyad Dynasty and supported translation activities that in turn aided the spreading of multiculturalism throughout the empire.

Method

This study was designed as qualitative research, which is commonly used for the understanding of social systems. Qualitative methods offer flexibility to the researchers and lead to the development of new methods and approaches at every stage of the study. They also allow for fictional changes according to the course of the study. The qualitative studies then help the researchers to discover new findings. Through this feature, qualitative methods are practical and useful in approaching rarely studied topics from different perspectives (Neuman, 2006). Strauss & Corbin (1998) define qualitative research as one of the stages of knowledge production to make sense of organizational structures and social changes. Therefore, this study employs a qualitative analysis and literature review of the early Abbasid period from the perspective of historical multiculturalism. Moreover, the parameter method was used to determine whether the relevant society retains certain qualities of multiculturalism.

From a historical research perspective, empires, uniting different communities through conquests under a single administration, possess unique multicultural elements. These multicultural elements have been studied for the Achaemenid (Persian) Empire (Daryaee, Mousavi & Deckhani, 2014), Hellenistic period (Grazulis & Mockiene, 2017), Ottoman "millet sistemi" (nations system) (Braude & Lewis, 1982), and for the Habsburg monarchy (Griesser, 2012). By considering these studies, parameters of multiculturalism were developed by combining these historical multicultural examples with modern multiculturalism theorists, such as Fleras (2009), Benet (2012), Parekh (2000), Kymlicka (2010), and Modood (2014). The early Abbasid multiculturalism was studied by matching modern parameters with the multicultural characteristics of the related period. Therefore, the opinions of the relevant theorists and the parameters related were purposefully selected and examined. The parameters listed below will be discussed within the framework of the social and political applications:

- Modood (2014) states that "the existence of multiethnic dynamics that are perceived as different in a society and remain existing without causing conflict in the society" is one important indicator of multiculturalism (p. 19). Accordingly, the first parameter is: *In multicultural societies, members of different languages, religions, and cultures should coexist without conflict*;

- According to Kymlicka (2001), states are not "neutral." States are given an identity by cultures and peoples. However, this identity should be used not as an element of uniformization, but as a means of developing positive relationships with different groups (p. 18). Accordingly, the second parameter is: *Multicultural societies should not have a superior cultural structure. Even if there is a dominant culture in these societies, the people of this culture should use their power not as an element of oppression, but as a tool to ensure the preservation of differences and make it a state policy to benefit from the accumulation of different cultures*;

- According to Fleras (2009), there should be no restrictions on people not belonging to the dominant culture in multicultural societies in terms of their political rights and their election to decision-making mechanisms (p. 25). Accordingly, the third parameter is: *In multicultural societies, it should be possible for members of different cultures outside the dominant culture to participate in the management and decision-making mechanisms*;

- According to Parekh (2002), many common requirements that people have been defined in different ways by different cultures (p. 306). Therefore, differences in a society should be approached with an egalitarian idea, taking into account their differences while taking advantage of various opportunities. Accordingly, the fourth parameter is stated as such: *In multicultural societies, members of different cultures outside the dominant culture should be able to benefit from public and private opportunities without being exposed to any discrimination*.

This study's scope and limitations are due to certain historical limitations because of the concept of the early Abbasid period. The early Abbasid period begins in 750 when the Abbasids succeeded the Umayyad Dynasty after a revolution. This period lasted until 833, when the rule of Mamun began, one of the caliphs who made the highest contribution to scientific-transla-

tion activities. The two periods in which the socio-political structures of the early Abbasid period were shaped, were named "late Antiquity" and "early Islam."

Due to the different ethnicities (Greek, Indian, and Sasanians) and different languages (Sanskrit, Persian, Greek, Pahlavi) (Clot, 2007; Lyons, 2009), early Abbasid society gave their scientific works in late antiquity. These activities also supported the flourishing of multiculturalism and translation activities. Yet, the preparatory stage of translations and the origins of cultural and multiethnic demographic diversity were laid in the early Islamic period (Cameron, 1992; Gutas, 2003). Therefore, these two historical periods are of key importance for the multiculturalism of the early Abbasid period.

Historical Background

Historical multiculturalism flourished in Asia Minor, Mesopotamia, the Mediterranean basin, and the Persian Gulf. These regions remained within the borders of the Abbasid Empire and the first multicultural contacts appeared and developed in these regions (Foster, 2016). Moreover, the communities that migrated to these regions integrated into the new cultural structures, thus creating hybrid cultures by combining multicultural values (Mieroop, 2004). Thus, the traditional way of life and cultural values of the region remained alive constantly. These migrations formed a permanent environment of cultural contact. Therefore, the common culture that shaped human relations and social structure in these regions has an ancient history (Lendering, 2009). But some administrations in these geographical areas were sceptical towards differences outside the dominant ethnic and cultural structure, believing that they could damage the dominant culture (Aktay, 2003). As a reflection of this sceptical approach, many societies and civilizations followed the policy of integrating minorities into the mainstream culture through oppression to preserve their dominant culture (Momin, 2010).

The ancient artefacts and archaeological figures depicted the perceived hostile civilization in a derogatory way, which shows that assimilation policies were applied intensively throughout history (Foster, 2016). However, numerous examples show the failure of assimilation policies (Cassin, 1966). Religious, sectarian, cultural, and racial communities that were subjected to assimilation had adhered more tightly to their differences by resisting policies of uniformization. Despite the overwhelming implementation of assimilation policies, communities within the dominant culture managed to preserve their cultural values and pass them on to future generations (Lendering, 2009).

The Achaemenid Empire, which established a new ruling style on the Iranian Plateau in the sixth century B.C.E., is considered the first multicultural empire in history (Daryaee, Mousavi & Rezakhani, 2014) because of its religious diversity and freedom of belief. Moreover, the first declaration of human rights in history was written during the rule of Achaemenid Empire. Its political system introduced a sociologically multicultural structure based on the administrative, economic, and cultural system developed as a state policy by rejecting the aforementioned assimilation policies (Waters, 2014). Thus, it can be argued that the multicultural model of governance originated in the Achaemenid Empire. However, during these periods, multiculturalism was limited and the dominant culture positioned itself over other cultures. A multicultural state mechanism adopting multiculturalism as a state policy had to cope with numerous challenges (Foster, 2016). Subsequently, the Abbasids, influenced by the Achaemenid socio-political system, restored the multicultural environment in these regions after about a thousand years (Rosenthal, 1995).

In the seventh century, when Muslims established their rule and bureaucracy, ancient scientific and cultural centers continued to flourish in the Middle East, Western Asia, and in the Fertile Crescent region (Wujastyk, 2016). In addition, the same intellectual environment was prominent in monasteries

and religious centers belonging to Eastern Christianity, which were widespread in the Fertile Crescent region (Lyons, 2009). The multicultural social structure that has emerged in the early Abbasid period was established due to the unification, preservation, and continuity of these scientific and cultural centers (Pingree, 1973). A few decades after the death of Prophet Muhammad, Arab armies annexed Southwest Asia and Northeast Africa, which Alexander the Great had conquered a thousand years earlier (Cameron, 1992; Nicolle, 1994). They annihilated the Sassanid Empire (224-651), the continuation of the Persian Empire, and united the centers of ancient civilizations under their rule by capturing Central Asia, the Indian subcontinent, Egypt, and the Fertile Crescent region. These centers had been strongly influenced by Greek, Hellenic, Roman, and Byzantine culture and intellect (Clot, 2007; Robinson, 2005). The Muslims, with the enthusiasm brought by their newly found religion with a universal message, began to transform these centers. By gathering people of different faiths, creeds, cultures, and ethnicities they established a multicultural structure (Graham, 2006).

The unification of ancient centers under Muslim rule also effectively ended the rule of oppressive governments and established safety within their borders. Consequently, these developments contributed to scientific activities which were now carried out in a libertarian environment in which scientists now could disseminate and freely share scientific knowledge (Adamson & Taylor, 2005; Kramers, 1934). After becoming Abbasid citizens, many scientists also learned Arabic, the language of the dominant culture, and translated works into Arabic (Van Bladel, 2012).

As a result of Arab conquests, Egypt and the Fertile Crescent were politically, administratively, and economically (re)united with Iran and India for nearly a thousand years after Alexander the Great (Gutas, 2003). Moreover, two major rivers were separating the civilized world and the ancient centers of civilization before the rise of Islam. However, this boundary disap-

peared, thus allowing free movement of products and raw materials as well as of ideas and technical skills (Adamson & Taylor, 2005; Lewis, 2002). This contributed to free movement and the beginnings of challenging the dominant Umayyad rule. Subsequently, the demographic diversity in the early Abbasid society was laid during and before the Abbasid Revolution (Barthold, 1984) which took place after a long period of propaganda by the leaders of various groups that were unsatisfied with the Umayyad Dynasty. The policies and political practices of the Umayyad caliphs during their nearly century-long reign had provoked negative reactions of various groups within Islamic society, which spread across wide borders, and became a harbinger of the fall of the dynasty (Van Bladel, 2012).

The Abbasid Revolution, as mentioned above, was waged against the increasingly autocratic Umayyad Dynasty by a coalition of various groups and different ethnicities. Therefore, this revolution, which succeeded due to rejection of the Umayyad nationalistic logic, gave birth to a multicultural Abbasid model of society (Robinson, 2005). According to Kennedy (1981), after the Abbasids came to power, calls for an egalitarian society as an alternative to Umayyad nationalism grew. Thus, Islam, under the early Abbasid rule, became a universal religion, treating Arabs and non-Arabs equally. Although class differences were strongly felt within society, ethnicity was not ground for discrimination (Harman, 2008).

After the Abbasid Revolution, the *Fatah*, the elite groups which participated in the conquests and subsequently controlled the state in remote geographical areas in the Umayyad period, disappeared. Consequently, a new political structure emerged (Lewis, 2002), but ethnic, social, and cultural differences that already existed in the Middle East endured within the Muslim community. Therefore, the need arose for a new imperial structure based on different ethnicities (Robinson, 2005). Military and political elites of the Abbasids were formed by different ethnicities that were later integrated into the Abbasid Revolutionary Army (Gutas, 2003). The polit-

ical elites from different ethnicities successfully abolished the Umayyad's fixed social hierarchy and hereditary nobility. Hence, they eliminated the Umayyad system of military and political elites based on a tribality. The abolition of the tribal policies paved the way for the formation of the multicultural structure and its strengthening thereafter (Robinson, 2005).

The Muslim conquests spread to the ancient Sassanid lands where schools preserved the ancient Persian heritage. These various centers enlivened Persian-Zoroastrian culture by combining it with Indian culture and Hellenism. Moreover, besides the temples located in Urfa and Harran, which fiercely defended paganism, scientific activities were implemented on the Indian side of Central Asia within the framework of Buddhism (Nacmabadi, 2017). The presence of a similar scientific environment was noticed in other Monophysite and Nasturi centers, which were also characterized by a unique cultural mosaic (Rosenthal, 1995).

Following the decision to translate these scientific works into Arabic and to support translation activities after the Abbasid Revolution, a large number of scientists, who could carry out these translation activities, appeared overnight in Baghdad, the newly established Abbasid capital (Clot, 2007). Scientific infrastructure and economic power were combined as part of incentive policies, which encouraged unprecedented translation activities from various languages, especially Greek. Wujastyk (2016) notes that almost all scientific works, except literature and history which can be found in the Near East and Anatolia, were translated into Arabic during the Abbasid period. Compilations by Karl Gottlob Kühn, based on the Arabic translations of Galenos, are collected in twenty large volumes and Greek commentaries written on Aristotle and translated into Arabic in the Abbasid period cover fifty-four volumes. This example testifies how far-reaching the translation activities were during this period. It should be noted that these constitute only a small part of the translated works (Endress & Kruk, 1997). Scientific translation activities covered other works whose origi-

nals have not survived despite their large numbers in addition to works in Greek, Aramaic, Syriac, and Latin, which have survived until today from the ancient Greek, Hellenistic, Persian, Egyptian, Roman and Mesopotamian civilizations (Cameron, 2009).

Findings

This study suggests that the most important factor that led to the emergence and strengthening of a multicultural system in the early Abbasid period was the translation activities. The Islamic state became acquainted with translation activities (from Greek, Persian and Sanskrit to Arabic) following the conquest movements towards distant lands after it united in Arabia and the consequent various contacts with different societies. Moreover, translation activities arose for practical and utilitarian reasons, including the translation of political texts and works in the field of health. It should be noted, however, that these translation activities were not systematic nor covered scientific works (Hitti, 1980). Although the expansion of the territory of the state during the first four caliphs and contacts with different cultural communities intensified, translation activities still did not go beyond partial efforts. Yet, these translation activities were a precursor to those in the early Abbasid period. As the open-mindedness of the respective managers and overall society began to blend with this background, systematic translation activities and a multicultural environment emerged in its their meaning (Huart, 2010).

Kramers (1934) claims that during the first 150 years of Islamic history, Muslims were not scientifically superior to the Christian world. According to him, the rise of science among Muslims began with the early Abbasid period, especially with the translation of works of the Ancient Greek civilization, and these scientific developments continued to increase with the translation of works of various civilizations. Thus, the systematic transformation of translation activities was the most important factor that fed

scientific advancement and multiculturalism.

The translation activities brought scholars from different ethnicities, faiths, and cultures together in Abbasid cities, especially in Baghdad. Before the Islamic conquests, ancient Greek heritage combined with ancient Hellenistic culture was alive in scientific centers and monasteries in the Fertile Crescent, Mesopotamia, Western Iran, and the west of Central Asia. The ancient heritage of Hellenism and ancient Greek culture, despite being considered enemies by the Byzantine orthodoxy, nonetheless survived in the centers of Eastern Christianity in these regions since the Hellenistic period. Some settlements in the area also contained scientific centers with a Hellenic culture blended with the polytheistic beliefs of Mesopotamia. Scholars who possess these differences, in the early Abbasid period, found a common denominator in translation activities and formed a multicultural interaction with each other in constant communication (Adamson & Taylor, 2005).

Moreover, translation activities were responsible for the preservation of the literary culture of different civilizations before the early Abbasid period. Thus, the various ancient cultures, medieval and Islamic ones could be transferred to future generations within a multicultural environment. Arabic versions of the seven volumes of Galenos's Anatomy and almost all of Aristotle's works help us understand the role of translation activities in the early Abbasid period, which enabled the preservation of ancient cultural accumulations until today. Moreover, when considering that Galenos's Anatomy was largely based on the writings of the Ionian physician Hippocrates, it can be seen how rich the cultural mosaics were and what a great multicultural environment emerged thanks to these translation activities (Nacmabadi, 2017).

Due to its facilitating effect on the translation activities, the introduction of paper to the Islamic world provided great convenience in terms of scientific

and translation activities, making an important contribution to the establishment and strengthening of the multicultural system, albeit indirectly. No writing material had as much influence on scientific revolutions as paper and the Arabs began a new era in the history of civilization by spreading paper-making techniques around the world after learning them from the Chinese (Clot, 2007). During the early Abbasid period, paper, whose raw material was much easier and more abundant to find, quickly began to replace other writing materials. The quick spread of paper led to a rapid spread of translation activities in the early Abbasid period. For this reason, paper should be considered as one of the important factors that indirectly triggered the multiculturalism of the early Abbasid period due to its effect on popularizing translation activities (Cameron, 2009).

Another factor that allows the social system of the relevant period to be characterized as multicultural is the structure within the governance. In this social system, members of various ethnicities and beliefs took part in management and decision-making mechanisms and were able to benefit from public and private opportunities. Thus, the multicultural structure of society was grounded and strengthened. The architect of this social system was the people of the dominant Arabic-Islam culture. Therefore, it can be argued that the multicultural environment in early Abbasid society was established as a state policy (Nacmabadi, 2017).

Religious freedom was another indicator of multiculturalism in the early Abbasid period. For many years, these regions were under religious and sectarian pressure from the Byzantine and Sassanid Empires. However, the libertarian policies opened the door to a multicultural atmosphere because different religions were united under an administration that established religious freedom. Religious debate assemblies, especially held during the early Abbasid period, impressively demonstrate the high level of religious freedom and tolerance provided to members of different faiths. Thanks to these assemblies, in which the caliph participated occasionally, religious

freedom prevailed in all cities of the early Abbasid period (Graham, 2006).

Another indicator of multiculturalism is the state system that incorporated the cultural influences of different civilizations. The Abbasids' system of administration combined the Sassanid and Persian style of administration with the Byzantine system where Greek was the administrative language. Contrary to the Abbasids, the Umayyad took and applied the Byzantine system almost completely. Furthermore, the Abbasid administrative system enabled talented bureaucrats of different languages to rise through the ranks regardless of their ethnicity or beliefs. In addition to civilian managers and officers, military cadres also included people of different ethnicities, beliefs, and sectarian groups. The commanders and soldiers were ensured that the military structure of the empire took a multicultural form. In this system, where communities belonging to different sects, beliefs, and cultures were present at almost all levels, a multicultural public and social system emerged in all respects (Mesudi, 2004).

The multilingual atmosphere in the empire was another indicator of multiculturalism. Vatandaş (2015) states that Muslims, as a result of conquests, came across civilizations and cultures with histories spanning thousands of years and over ten spoken languages. Muslims found themselves in a dominant cultural position, as rulers of multilingual and multicultural lands. Merging different languages strengthened the interaction and the cosmopolitan structure of early Abbasid cities. The interaction of different languages was publicly supported and encouraged. In this way, a multilingual and multicultural society emerged with a wide variety of languages freely spoken and translated (Gutas, 2003).

Discussion

Modern age multiculturalism practices were used as parameters in this study. The traces of multicultural practices associated with the modern period can also be found in different historical periods. For instance, in the

Ottoman Empire multicultural practices were regulated through tolerance and granting autonomy to recognized Jewish and Christian communities (Kymlicka, 1995, p. 156) since the citizenship ties between people and the state were not rights-based. This represents the most important difference between the modern period and historical multiculturalism. Different congregations were not subjected to religious coercion in the Islamic administrations that ruled before the early Abbasid period (Huart, 2010).

Unlike the modern standards of multiculturalism, there were not any intermediary elements that would allow the peoples living in that period to claim rights and freedoms in the early Abbasid period. Therefore, when examining societies from the perspective of historical multiculturalism, it is necessary to determine whether they had basic characteristics of multiculturalism without looking for intermediary elements. Based on the considerations above our analysis will be conducted within the framework of the parameters of multiculturalism determined by the main theme of the study to answer whether the relevant period has the qualities of multiculturalism.

The first multiculturalism parameter states that "*the members of different languages, religions and cultures must coexist under the same roof without any conflict in multicultural societies*." First, the Abbasid Revolution was conducted against the Arab-based tribal Umayyad rule. Various groups, which had familiarized themsleves with one another during the Abbasid revolution and shared a common denominator, continued their alliances after the successful revolution, forming the founding element of the early Abbasid society. This consensus was based on convincing various people to believe that their interests and demands were in the continuity of the Abbasid state, which was another factor that complemented the demographic unification (Kennedy, 1981). No member of any culture was dominant in the early Abbasid society which was built on these dynamics. According to Pingree (1973), a new multicultural model of society emerged in the Abbasid capital Baghdad, which overthrew the exclusionary policies of Da-

mascus and ensured the demographic unification of different social groups in Iraq.

Kymlicka (2010) notes that differences in a society cannot originate from a single sending element, but from a combination of a wide range of ethnic, racial, religious, and cultural elements, in a real sense, multiculturalism. This is exactly how the social system of the early Abbasids was established by the dominant powers. Aramaic-speaking Christians and Jews, who were the majority of the resident population in Iraq (Lyons, 2009), Iranian people leading settled lives in the city centers, Zoroastrian communities from Central Asia, who resided in the area (Nacmabadi, 2017), Muslim Arabs, who partially settled and came to these geographies with conquests, non-Muslims of different ethnicities, Turks, who were among the main actors of the revolution, other Muslims of a wide variety of ethnicities, who were called Mawali, and various peoples of Eastern Christianity (Endress & Kruk, 1997) were included within this multicultural social system.

Harman (2008) describes this multicultural social atmosphere in the early Abbasid Empire as follows:

> A multicultural social order, which was based on merchants of different ethnicities, bankers and ulema consisting of religious scholars, teachers, judges and cosmopolitan ruling class, peaceful agricultural and commercial economy, emerged in the newly established Abbasid Empire, especially in Baghdad. (p. 134)

The second multiculturalism parameter states that "*multicultural societies should not have a superior (dominant) cultural structure. Although there is a dominant culture in these societies, the men of this culture should use their power not as an element of oppression, but as a tool to ensure the preservation of differences and they should make it a state policy to benefit from the accumulation of different cultures.*"

There is no consensus among experts on whether there was a superior cultural structure in the early Abbasid period. However, it can be inferred

from the social conditions of the time that the Caliph, his family, and the administrative staff were in a superior position. However, since this dominant position did not develop within the framework of any racial, ethnic, religious, or sectarian superiority, it did not result in damaging the multicultural system because many early Abbasid caliphs did not even belong to the pure Arab lineage (Huart, 2010) and the foundations the early Abbasid society was formed on were at a level that was not able to handle a social stratification based on nationalism. In the early Abbasid period, it was not necessary to adhere to Arab ethnicity, as during the Umayyad, or to possess Orthodox Christian faith, as in Byzantium, in order to achieve a high-level administrative position. Moreover, there was no social stratification, as during the Sassanids, where the transition between classes was almost impossible (Christensen, 1939).

The third multiculturalism parameter states that "*it should be possible for members of different cultures outside the dominant culture to participate in the management and decision-making mechanisms in multicultural societies.*" The Umayyad administration and decision-making mechanisms were dominated by a system based on nobility and centered around ethnicity. Within this system, Arabs were in a dominant position and used bureaucrats and civil servants trained under the influence of Byzantine Orthodoxy to carry out their public affairs (Kennedy, 1981). These bureaucrats and officers were brought up under the influence of Byzantine Orthodoxy, known for its uniformization policies on people belonging to Eastern Christianity (Cameron, 1992). In other words, by bringing these bureaucrats and civil servants into the Umayyad cadres another elitist group was brought into an elitist system (Kennedy, 1981).

The public system of the new caliphate was completely overhauled, and the mechanisms of governance and with the Abbasid Revolution and the subsequent relocation of the capital to Baghdad, decision-making in the new social system were opened to various peoples belonging to different ethnic-

ities (Huart, 2010). The names of these bureaucrats and officers of different ethnicities who served in the Abbasid bureaucracy and decision-making mechanisms are still present in primary sources. Numerous studies on this issue prove this situation (Mesudi, 2005). Therefore, in the early Abbasid period, people outside the dominant culture could participate in management and decision-making mechanisms.

The fourth multiculturalism parameter states that "*in multicultural societies, members of different cultures outside the dominant culture should be able to benefit from public and private opportunities without any discrimination. However, this opportunity should be provided by the men of the dominant culture.*" Cameron (1992) states that during the early Abbasid period, experts in translation activities were supported by large public and private funds. Most primary protectors who provided these funds were the caliphs and senior bureaucrats. Moreover, patronage of translation activities by the protectors and their large financial investment to fund these translators indicates respect for these activities. Caliphs and senior bureaucrats, who were the representatives of the dominant culture, supported these translators, most of whom belonged to ethnicities outside the dominant culture, which qualifies the early Abbasid society as multicultural. Given these parameters, the early Abbasid society fulfils the conditions necessary to consider a society multicultural; a multicultural way of life that marked history emerged during this period. Supporting, encouraging and funding these translation activities played a key role in the emergence of such an environment.

Conclusion

This study examined whether social groups with racial, ethnic, cultural, and religious differences could coexist in certain historical periods just as in today's world based on the example of the early Abbasid period. Although the social system of the early Abbasid period was based on a multicultural

character, it did not possess the modern intermediary elements of universal human rights and democratic practices. However, this past society had advanced libertarian practices. In this structure, communities from various ethnicities, beliefs, and cultures lived together with their differences; an environment that was established by the people of the dominant culture.

Besides the people of the dominant culture, the tradition of tolerance and acceptance of each other along with their differences was also formed in other groups in society. Tolerance for differences entrenched in this way in society is an important social orientation. For this reason, the early Abbasid society, which was formed as a result of merging various peoples who were subjected to sectarian oppression and assimilation policies for many years before with the Arabs as members of the dominant culture, is a crucial example of historical multiculturalism and provides an important model that can be presented to today's societies as it involves a culture of coexistence without any control or assurance mechanisms.

In this sense, historical multiculturalism research examining the multicultural aspects of other civilizations that have reigned in history can and should be done thereafter. Understanding the multiculturalism of Islamic cultures that developed as a mosaic of Greco-Roman and Persian-Sassanid cultures has implications not only for history but also the presence, as these are the two ancient civilizational traditions that have influenced a large part of historical and today's social and political systems. Thus, this study, which examined historical multiculturalism, showed that the early Abbasid period is one of the most important examples of multiculturalism in history. Although it is not based on the intermediary elements that existed in the modern era, the multicultural social system of the early Abbasid period is notable in many respects and can provide important lessons for today's pluralistic and multicultural societies.

References

Adamson, P., & Taylor, R. C. (2005). *The Cambridge Companion to Arabic Philosophy.* Cambridge University Press.

Aktay, Y. (2003). Küreselleşme ve çokkültürlülük. *Tezkire Dergisi, 1*(35).

Barthold, V. V. (1963). İslam Medeniyeti Tarihi, bs. 2 (Çev. M. Fuad Köprülü). *Diyanet İşleri Başkanlığı Yay*. Ankara.

Benet, V. (2012). Multiculturalism: Cultural, social, and personality processes. In K. Deaux & M. Snyder (Eds.), *The Oxford Handbook of Personality and Social Psychology* (pp. 623–648). Oxford University Press.

Braude, B., & Bernard, L. (1982). *Christians and Jews in the Ottoman Empire: The functioning of a plural society.* Holmes & Meier.

Cameron A. (1992). *New Themes and Styles in Greek Literature: Seventh-Eight Centuries, The Byzantine and Early Islamic Near East.* Princeton, Darwin Press.

Cassin, E., Bottéro, J., & Vercoutter, J. (1965). *Die Altorientalischen Reiche II*. Fischer.

Christensen A. (1939). *Sassanid Persia: The Imperial Crisis and Recovery.* (Vol. XII). Cambridge University Press.

Clot, A. (2007). *Harun Reşid ve Abbasiler Dönemi.* Tarih Vakfı Yurt Yayınları.

Daryaee, T., Mousavi, A., & Rezakhani, K. (Eds.). (2014). *Excavating an Empire: Achaemenid Persia in Longue Durée*. Mazda Publishers.

Endress, G., & Kruk Remke (Eds.) (1997). The ancient tradition in Christian and Islamic Hellenism: studies on the transmission of Greek philosophy and sciences. *Proceedings of the Third Symposium Graeco-Arabicum, held at the University of Leiden on March 26-28, 1991.* Research School CNWS, School of Asian, African, and

Amerindian Studies.

Fay, B. (2001). *Çağdaş Sosyal Bilimler Felsefesi: Çokkültürlü Bir Yaklaşım*. Ayrıntı.

Fleras, A. (2009). *The politics of Multiculturalism: Multicultural Governance in Comparative Perspective*. Springer.

Foster, B. R. (2015). *The Age of Agade: Inventing Empire in Ancient Mesopotamia*. Routledge.

Graham, M. A. (2006). *How Islam Created the Modern World*. Amana Publications.

Gražulis, V., & Mockiené, V. (2017). Multiculturalism Through The Prism of History: Experiences And Perspectives And Lessons To Learn. *Human Resources Management & Ergonomics, 11*(1), 33-49.

Griesser D. (2012, July 3). Denkanstöße aus der Multikulti-Monarchie. *Der Standard.*

Gutas, D. (2003). *Yunanca Düşünce Arapça Kültür, Bağdat'ta Yunanca-Arapça Çeviri Hareketi ve Erken Abbasi Toplumu,* (Lütfü Şimşek, Ed.) Kitap Yayınevi. 48-86.

Harman, C. (2008). *A People's History of the World: From the Stone Age to the New Millennium*. Verso Books.

Hitti, P. K. (1980). *Siyasi ve Kültürel İslam Tarih*i, çev. Salih Tuğ, İstanbul, 621-622.

Huart, C. (2010). *A History of Arabic Literature.* Nabu Press.

Kennedy, H. (1981). *The Early Abbasid Caliphate.* Croom Helm.

Kramers, J. H., & Doğrul, Ö. R. (1934). *İslam medeniyeti tarihinde coğrafya ve ticaret.* Türkiye Matbaası.

Kymlicka, W. (2010). The rise and fall of multiculturalism? New debates on inclusion and accommodation in diverse societies. *International Social Science Journal, 61*(199), 97-112.

Kymlicka W. (2001). Western Political Theory and Ethnic Relations in Eastern Europe. In W. Kymlicka & M. Opalski (Eds.), *Can Liberal Pluralism be Exported?* (pp. 13-105) Oxford University Press.

Kymlicka, W. (1998). *Çokkültürlü Yurttaşlık: Azınlık Haklarının Liberal Teorisi.* Ayrıntı Yayınları.

Kymlicka, W. (1995). *Multicultural Citizenship: A Liberal Theory of Minority Rights.* Clarendon Press.

Lendering J. (2009). *Büyük İskender.* Kitap Yayınevi.

Lewis, B. (2002). *The Arabs in History.* Oxford University Press.

Lyons, J. (2011). *The House of Wisdom; How the Arabs Transformed Western Civilization.* Bloomsbury Publishing.

Mesudi, M. E. Z. (2004). *Ez-Zeheb: Altın Bozkırlar*. Selenge Yayınları

Mieroop, M. V. D. (2007). *A History of the Ancient Near East*: *Ca. 3000-323 BC*. Blackwell Publishing.

Modood, T. (2014). *Çokkültürcülük: Bir yurttaşlık tasarımı.* Phoenix Yayınevi.

Momin, A. (2010). Çoğulculuk ve çokkültürcülük: islami bir bakış açısı. *Marmara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi,* (38), 203-230.

Nacmabadi M. (2017). Sasaniler Dönemi Tıbbı. *Oğuz-Türkmen Araştırmaları Dergisi, 1*, 190-266.

Nicolle, D. (1994). *Yarmuk 636AD. The Muslim Conquest of Syria.* Osprey Military Campaign Series.

Parekh B. (2002). *Çokkültürlülüğü Yeniden Düşünmek, Kültürel* Çeşitlilik *ve Siyasi Teori,* Phoenix Yayınevi.

Pingree, D. (1973). The Greek influence on early Islamic mathematical astronomy. *Journal of the American Oriental Society*, 32-43.

Robinson, F. (2005). *Cambridge Resimli İslam Ülkeleri Tarihi* (Vol. 84). Kitap Yayinevi Ltd..

Rosenthal, F. (1995). From Arabic Books and Manuscripts, XVI: As-Sarakhsī on the Appropriate Behavior for Kings. *Journal of the American Oriental Society*, 105-109.

Schumann, C. (Ed.). (2010). *Nationalism and Liberal Thought in the Arab East: Ideology and Practice*. Routledge.

Strauss, A., & Corbin, J. (1998). *Basics of Qualitative Research Techniques and Procedures for Developing Grounded Theory.* Sage Publications.

Van Bladel, K. (2012) *Barmakids, Encyclopaedia of Islam Three*. Routledge.

Vatandaş, C. (2015). *Vahiyden kültüre*. Pınar Yayınları.

Waters, M. (2014). *Ancient Persia: A concise history of the Achaemenid Empire, 550–330 BCE*. Cambridge University Press.

Wujastyk, D. (2016). *From Balkh to Baghdad: Indian Science and the Birth of the Islamic Golden Age in the Eighth Century*.

SIMILITUDE THROUGH METONYMY: FOUCAULT, MAGRITTE AND THAT PIPE

Carl Haddrell

International University of Sarajevo

Abstract

This article explores our understanding of visual imagery through an analysis of Foucault's examination of Magritte's famous painting *Les deux Mystères*. Foucault details how the interplay between word and image are firstly perceived and then understood by the viewer. This analysis of Foucault's text, serves to illuminate and hopefully clarify the often ambiguous relationship between image and text, whilst at the same time demonstrate that the vary same ambiguity is revelled in by those creating and those words and images.

Keywords: metonymy**,** similitude

Using Magritte's painting *Les deux Mystères* and Michel Foucault's accompanying text, *This is not a Pipe*, the nature of the visual image can be examined. It can be demonstrated that the distance created by critical theory, between the object and the image and resemblance is replaced by similitude in a world where "truth" is a concept beyond the reach of human visual representation. Foucault's text introduces us to a complex interpretation of the text uncovering labyrinthine paths of interconnectedness between the languages of the visual image and written word. His aim, it seems, is to uncover how, as he said "a whole complex network of uncertainties, exchanges and feints" (Foucault, 1970, p. 4), that allow us to revel in a potential multiplicity of meanings.

Magritte's picture comprises a framed drawing of a pipe, together with its rebellious subscripted caption, resting upon an easel. This appears to be located within a classroom, although there are no substantive clues to authenticate this, other than the well-worn floor of a possible schoolroom.[1] Above the easel, floating, is the form of another pipe, apparently, the same pipe as in the framed picture. The picture appears to invite the philosopher to unravel the riddle located deep within it (Shapiro, 1997, pp. 69-76). It attracted Foucault to the extent that he produced an accompanying text, which shed light on his personal view of Magritte's provocative painting. The supposed directive of the schoolmaster is at the heart of the riddle. What is it that he is indicating? Pointing to the framed drawing he pronounces, "This is a pipe", instantly realising the falsity of those words. The image of the pipe and the sentence uttered refer to the concept of an original pipe. What was present was no original. No sooner than the schoolmaster utters the words, does the reality of what is before him manifest itself in the now clear caption, "This is not a Pipe". In addition, there appeared, in almost ethereal form, a pipe floating over the easel and his head; out of reach, perhaps signifying the elusiveness of true knowledge.

---

1 Foucault suggests the location of a schoolroom in his accompanying text (Foucault, 1983, p. 16)

Both Magritte's image and Foucault's text explore the nature of what is depicted. Two contrasting concepts emerge from the examination: resemblance and similitude. Both Foucault and Magritte recognise that resemblance and similitude are different entities (Levy, 1990, pp. 50-56). For Foucault, resemblance makes reference to, and is a derivation from, an original which is simulated but never equalled. As Harkness (1983) notes in his introductory text, for Foucault, resemblance presumes a primary reference that prescribes and classes (p. 9). As such we have a mimetic process of hierarchy, the resemblance being a derivative of an original. Thus, a portrait would be said to be a resemblance of its model by virtue of the fact that it relates back to that model (Levy, 1990, p. 51). By contrast, similitude conforms to no hierarchical order. Never derived from an original, similitude is described as a process of equation, a recurrence of autonomous phenomena, which are not linked by a hierarchical dependency (Levy, 1990, p. 51). What is produced is a reversible series of images with no origin and no end. Thus, we are invited to interpret the two pipes as a series of similitude, neither originates, neither is a derivative.

Levy (1990) expounds upon this notion (p. 51) by reiterating that for Foucault the image is one of similitude, drawn from the lateral relationship between the two pipes, which oscillate within the painting alone, multiplying different affirmations, which dance together, tilting and tumbling over one another (Foucault, 1983, p. 46). Foucault (1983) asserts that through similitude, resemblance is hounded from the space of the painting (p. 46). This point is illustrated by Levy (1990) with reference to Magritte's twined image of Paul Nougé, which being a portrait originated as a resemblance, being derived from the original model. However, it is the twinned images that now reciprocated within the space of the picture, forming a relationship of similitude to the exclusion of the original model; resemblance is superseded by similitude (p. 51).

We have replaced the reference to a possible original with similitude

in the form of a series of two pipes. Foucault invites us to consider the consequences: Magritte has provided us with a drawing of two pipes which bear striking resemblance to a real pipe, together with a written text which, similarly, bears strong resemblance to the drawing of written text. Resemblance is initially inherent in the composition. However, it is this composition and juxtaposition that opens up a network of similitudes to the eventual exclusion of resemblance. The real pipe is now absent from both words and drawing, we are left with copies without an original: simulacrum (Foucault, 1983, p. 47).

Durham (1993) explains that Foucault's schoolmaster has unwittingly taught us that the indefinite and reversible movement, in sequential similitude, which subverts the hierarchical relation of model to copy and suspends the identity of the original within and between its repetitions, constitutes the formation of a simulacrum. Shapiro draws attention to Foucault's closing words: "A day will come when, by means of similitude relayed indefinitely along the length of a series, the image itself, along with the name it bears, will lose its identity. Campbell, Campbell, Campbell, Campbell" (Foucault, 1983, p. 54) In so doing, he reminds us of the Nietzschean resonance of the *Seven Seals of Affirmation*, and that themes of similitude, simulacrum, eternal recurrence and affirmation are constant within the works of Nietzsche.

Magritte's image has been transformed; through the process of examination it no longer resides in the solely visual. Foucault's ekphrasis is testament to the fact that imagery belongs to and is part of language. As such, it too, along with all forms of language, written or spoken, is mistrusted by Nietzsche. With the removal of resemblance and subsequently the removal of the presence of an original form, we remove ourselves from the original truth. This assumes that there *was* a representable truth, a view challenged by Jean Baudrillard. This is illustrated by his idea that the image is composed of four successive phases:

This would be the successive phases of the image:

- it is the reflection of basic reality

- it masks and perverts a basic reality

- it masks absence of a basic reality

- it bears no relation to any reality whatever: it is its own pure simulacrum (Baudrillard as cited in Boulter, 2001, p. 356).

Boulter (2001) explains how Baudrillard's idea of the simulacrum ultimately confuses the distinction between the real and its illusion, its representation (pp. 356-357). However, the inference remains that there is a reality that can be accessed and in some form represented. Nietzsche's mistrust of language precludes the attainment of any such truth, prior to any attempt to represent it. Our attempts to represent it are rendered futile by the inadequacy and insidious nature of language. Nietzsche argued that language was like an umbrella: we hold it up to shield ourselves from awareness that the universe is at best indifferent and at worst hostile (Hayman, 1997, p. 20). He saw language as an artifice created to provide us with palatable truths. As such it could not be relied upon to provide us with an understanding or representation of the truth. For Nietzsche words can never be transparent:

> for between two utterly different spheres, as between, subject and object, there is no causality, no accuracy, no expression, but at the utmost an aesthetical relation, I mean a suggestive metamorphosis, a stammering translation into quite a distinct foreign language, for which purpose however there is needed at any rate an intermediate sphere, an intermediate force, freely composing and freely inventing. (Levy, 1911, p. 184)

Furthermore, Nietzsche expounds that *The Thing In Itself* (it is just this which would be the pure ineffective truth) is seen first as nerve stimulus, then as percept, then as sound (Levy, 1991, p. 179), at which time it is constructed in terms of language, firstly audible, and then written. These transitions are referred to as metaphors, each one forming a link in a chain

of metonymy, removing the perceiver further from the thing in itself. A similar chain would be required for communication of this *truth*. By the formation of these metaphors, Nietzsche claims that man stands alone. Our concept of the world is shaped around our acceptance of these linkages. He submits his actions to the sway of abstractions. Initial sensations or impressions are disregarded in favour of attaching a considered rational to that which surrounds him.[2]

Nietzsche defines truth as:

> a mobile army of metaphors, metonymies, anthropomorphisms: in short a sum of human relations which became poetically and rhetorically intensified, metamorphosed, adorned, and after long usage seem to a nation fixed, canonic and binding; truths are illusions of which one has for- gotten that they are illusions; worn-out metaphors which have become powerless to affect the senses. (Levy, 1911, p. 180)

The stronghold for such mediated truths is, for Nietzsche, to be found in the world of art. Here we find the continual construction of metaphors and metonymies, shaping the world into a conglomeration of images made palatable by the use of language. Art survives on the precept that mankind, even if aware of its misrepresentation, still allows itself to be deceived. Artist and viewer are both active participants in these acts of deception. Nietzsche attacks the mimetic arts, and in the midst of the discourse of modern art there is created an opening for the Nietzschean project, for "to reverse Platonism" means to make the simulacra rise and to affirm their rights amongst icons and copies (Shapiro, 1997, p. 70).

As the schoolmaster stands before the drawing, he expounds "This is a pipe." Durham makes reference to the chain of metonymy that has just taken place: from painting to image, from image to text, from text to voice. A sort of imaginary pointer indicates, shows, fixes, locates, imposes a system of references, tries to stabilize a single space. The unravelled calligram that forms Magritte's picture represents the chain of linguistic

---

2 Phenomenology espouses a return to the initial state of receptive impression.

metonymy, which removes the viewer from the truth. The recognition that what is present is a simulacrum acknowledges the fact that no original is present. The referential relationship between the two pipes removes the need for an original, which is thus removed from the space of the picture. In accepting this, one is removing one link in the chain of metonymy. The assumption that we had perceptive access to the *Thing In Itself* is removed.

Magritte's picture, one form of language, invites interpretation from another form of language. The infinite variety of metaphorical interplay is at its most active. Yet through this analysis comes the realisation that the search for truth is futile. To suggest we have access to it is overly optimistic. To suggest we can then represent it is unreasonable. Foucault's text does not search for truth. Consistent with his previous line of thinking Foucault merely examines the possibilities inherent within the image. He espouses the adoption of *grey anonymous language* (Foucault, 1970, p. 10) for such analysis.

Magritte's picture can be seen as an exercise in forgetting or deprogramming a set of habits, which have become second nature. As a result, the picture is not aimed at the overtly ignorant but at the fundamental issue of the relation between pictures and texts and those who believe they know what the relation is (Mitchell, 1994, pp. 66-67). However, what is achieved is the subversion of preconceived ideas. We are not to read things at face value. What is being represented may take many forms, resemblance, similitude or simulacrum, but their claim to represent the truth is a very tenuous one.

References

Boulter, J. S. (2001). Partial glimpses of the infinite: Borges and the simulacrum. *Hispanic Review*, *69*(3), 355-377.

Durham, S. (1993). From Magritte to Klossowski: the simulacrum, between painting and narrative. *October*, 64, 17-33.

Foucault M. (1983). *This is not a Pipe* (J. Harkness, Trans.). University of California Press.

Foucault, M. (1970). *The Order of Things*. Pantheon.

Harkness J. (1983). Translator's Introduction to Michel Foucault's This is not a Pipe. In *This is not a Pipe* (pp. 1-14). University of California Press.

Hayman R. (1997). *Nietzsche*. Phoenix.

Levy, O. (Ed.) (1911). *The Complete Works of Friedrich Nietzsche*. (1st ed.,Vol. 2). The Macmillan Company.

Levy, S. (1990). Foucault on Magritte on Resemblance. *The Modern Language Review*, *85*(1), 50-56.

Mitchell W. J. T. (1994). *Picture Theory*. University of Chicago Press.

Shapiro, G. (1997). Pipe dreams: Eternal recurrence and simulacrum in Foucault's ekphrasis of Magritte. *Word & Image*, *13*(1), 69-76.